

Improvement of cardiovascular risk factors after adrenalectomy in patients with adrenal tumors and Subclinical Cushing Syndrome

Bancos, Irina; Alahdab, Fares; Crowley, Rachel; Chortis, Vasileios; Delivanis, Danae; Erickson, Dana; Natt, Neena; Terzolo, Massimo; Arlt, Wiebke; Young Jr, William; Murad, M. Hassan

DOI:
[10.1530/EJE-16-0465](https://doi.org/10.1530/EJE-16-0465)

License:
None: All rights reserved

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):
Bancos, I, Alahdab, F, Crowley, R, Chortis, V, Delivanis, D, Erickson, D, Natt, N, Terzolo, M, Arlt, W, Young Jr, W & Murad, MH 2016, 'Improvement of cardiovascular risk factors after adrenalectomy in patients with adrenal tumors and Subclinical Cushing Syndrome: a systematic review and meta-analysis', *European Journal of Endocrinology*, vol. 175, no. 6, pp. R283-R295. <https://doi.org/10.1530/EJE-16-0465>

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](#)

Publisher Rights Statement:
Verified 8/11/2016

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

1 Improvement of cardiovascular risk factors after adrenalectomy in patients with adrenal tumors and
2 Subclinical Cushing Syndrome: a systematic review and meta-analysis

3

4 Irina Bancos¹, Fares Alahdab², Rachel K. Crowley³, Vasileios Chortis^{4,5}, Danae Delivanis¹, Dana
5 Erickson¹, Neena Natt¹, Massimo Terzolo⁶, Wiebke Arlt^{4,5}, William F. Young, Jr.¹, M. Hassan Murad²

6

7 ¹Division of Endocrinology, Diabetes, Metabolism and Nutrition, Mayo Clinic Rochester, MN

8 ²Evidence-based Practice Center, Mayo Clinic, Rochester, MN

9 ³St Vincent's University Hospital & University College Dublin, Ireland

10 ⁴ Institute of Metabolism and Systems Research, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, B15 2TT, UK

11 ⁵ Centre for Endocrinology, Diabetes and Metabolism, Birmingham Health Partners, Birmingham, B15
12 2TH, UK

13 ⁶ Internal Medicine 1, Department of Clinical and Biological Sciences, University of Turin, Italy

14 *Corresponding author and person to whom reprint request should be addressed:*

15 Irina Bancos, M.D.

16 Division of Endocrinology, Metabolism, and Nutrition, Mayo Clinic

17 200 First Street SW, Rochester, MN 55905

18 (507)266-1387

19 Bancos.Irina@mayo.edu

20

21 **Brief Title:** Adrenalectomy in Subclinical Cushing

22 **Key terms:** Cushing, Hypercortisolism, Hypertension, Adrenal, Adrenalectomy, Cardiovascular

23 **Word count:** 3226

24 **Disclosure Statements:** The authors have no disclosures relevant to this work

25 **Abstract**

26 **Objective:** Beneficial effects of adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with Subclinical
27 Cushing Syndrome (SCS) are uncertain. We sought to conduct a systematic review and meta-analysis
28 with the following objectives: 1) determine the effect of adrenalectomy compared to conservative
29 management on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS and 2) compare the effect of
30 adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS versus those with a non-functioning
31 (NF) adrenal tumor.

32 **Methods:** Medline In-Process & Other Non-Indexed Citations, MEDLINE, EMBASE, and Cochrane
33 Central Register of Controlled Trial were searched on November 17th, 2015. Reviewers extracted data and
34 assessed methodological quality in duplicate.

35 **Results:** We included 26 studies reporting on 584 patients with SCS and 457 patients with NF adrenal
36 tumors. Studies used different definitions of SCS. Patients with SCS undergoing adrenalectomy
37 demonstrated an overall improvement in cardiovascular risk factors (61% for hypertension, 52% for
38 diabetes mellitus, 45% for obesity and 24% for dyslipidemia). When compared to conservative
39 management, patients with SCS undergoing adrenalectomy experienced improvement in hypertension
40 (RR 11, 95% CI 4.3 - 27.8) and diabetes mellitus (RR 3.9, 95%CI 1.5- 9.9), but not dyslipidemia (RR 2.6,
41 95%CI 0.97 -7.2) or obesity (RR 3.4 (95%CI 0.95-12)). Patients with NF adrenal tumors experienced
42 improvement in hypertension (21/54 patients), however, insufficient data exist for comparison to patients
43 with SCS.

44 **Conclusions:** Available low to moderate quality evidence from heterogeneous studies suggests a
45 beneficial effect of adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS overall and as
46 compared to conservative management.

47

48

49 **Introduction**

50 Subclinical Cushing syndrome (SCS) is a controversial disorder in name, definition, and management¹⁻⁶
51 but is currently diagnosed in at least a third of patients with incidentally discovered adrenal masses^{7, 8} and
52 therefore could affect up to 2% of the general population. SCS is most commonly described as the
53 presence of inappropriate cortisol production as defined by insufficient suppressibility with
54 dexamethasone and/or subsequent alterations of the hypothalamic pituitary adrenal (HPA) axis without
55 classic, clinically overt signs and symptoms of cortisol excess, such as proximal myopathy, striae, adipose
56 redistribution, and cortisol-induced metabolic abnormalities.^{9, 10} Numerous definitions have been applied
57 to characterize HPA axis alteration, and even when the same diagnostic cutoff criteria are used,
58 interpretation of results is complicated by differences in assay methodology and individual patient factors
59 such as co-morbid depression and obesity.¹

60 Patients with an adrenal mass associated with SCS present with an increased prevalence of several
61 cardiovascular risk factors such as hypertension (HTN), diabetes mellitus type 2 (DM2), dyslipidemia,
62 and obesity.¹¹⁻¹³ Previous studies suggest that patients with SCS are at higher risk for developing
63 cardiovascular events¹⁴⁻¹⁶ and experience an increased cardiovascular mortality.^{17, 18} However, studies
64 attempting to investigate the beneficial effect of adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients
65 with SCS are characterized by small sample sizes and have generated inconsistent results. While several
66 authors reported various degrees of improvement in metabolic parameters¹⁹⁻²¹, others showed no
67 significant metabolic effect of adrenalectomy^{22, 23} in patients with autonomous glucocorticoid production.
68 Moreover, several studies have reported a degree of improvement in cardiovascular risk factors after
69 adrenalectomy in patients with so called non-functioning (NF) adrenal tumors; whether this could be due
70 to mild autonomous glucocorticoid production from an adrenal tumor without resultant detectable
71 abnormality of the HPA axis or, possibly, an intrinsic effect of adrenalectomy per se is unknown.^{11, 19}

72

73 Insecurity of diagnosis and unclear surgical benefit to patients with SCS leads to delaying adrenalectomy
74 until the associated comorbidities develop or progress. Conversely, certain patients undergo a potentially
75 unnecessary surgery, as evidenced by the lack of post-surgical adrenal insufficiency in at least a third of
76 patients with SCS.²⁴ Until the dilemma of SCS is solved, patients risk progression towards a potentially
77 avoidable clinically significant event (and even premature death) and are exposed to multiple tests and
78 therapies - all of which likely causing undesirable health and economic consequences.

79 In order to provide a meaningful understanding of existent data in regards to the beneficial effects of
80 adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS, we sought to conduct a systematic
81 review and meta-analysis with the following objectives: 1) determine the effect of adrenalectomy
82 compared to conservative management on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS and 2)
83 compare the effect of adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS versus those with
84 a NF adrenal tumor.

85 **Methods and Evidence Acquisition**

86 This study was performed based on a protocol that was designed in advance. The results of this review are
87 reported according to the PRISMA statement (Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-
88 analyses)²⁵. We included studies that evaluated adrenalectomy alone or in comparison to other
89 interventions, for the treatment of SCS and/or NF adrenal tumors.

90 **Inclusion and exclusion criteria**

91 The inclusion criteria were specified in the predefined protocol to include original prospective and
92 retrospective comparative and non-comparative studies that enrolled adults with either NF adrenal tumors
93 or adrenal tumors with SCS (as defined by authors), with at least 5 patients undergoing adrenalectomy,
94 and reported outcomes of interest before and after adrenalectomy. We included studies regardless of their
95 publication status or language. We excluded all non-original studies and case reports. Dichotomous
96 outcomes of interest were: hypertension, pre-diabetes or diabetes mellitus, obesity and dyslipidemia.

97 Continuous outcomes were: systolic and diastolic blood pressure, body mass index (BMI), weight,
98 fasting glucose concentrations, glycosylated hemoglobin (HbA1c), total cholesterol, triglycerides, high
99 density lipoprotein (HDL) and low density lipoprotein (LDL) cholesterol.

100 **Data Sources and Search Strategy**

101 A comprehensive search of several databases was conducted from each database's earliest inception to
102 November 17, 2015, in any language and in adults. The databases included Ovid Medline In-Process &
103 Other Non-Indexed Citations, Ovid MEDLINE, Ovid EMBASE, Ovid Cochrane Central Register of
104 Controlled Trials, Ovid Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, and Scopus. The search strategy
105 (Suppl. Table 1) was designed and conducted by an experienced librarian with input from the study's
106 principal investigator. Controlled vocabulary supplemented with keywords was used to search for
107 comparative studies of surgery in patients with adrenal tumors.

108 **Selection of Studies**

109 Initial screening of the identified studies was performed by five independent reviewers (all
110 endocrinologists with adrenal expertise). Titles and abstracts of the identified studies were screened in
111 duplicate, taking into consideration the pre-defined inclusion criteria. Many of the identified studies
112 retrieved by our search were non-relevant or non-original and were excluded at this phase. Full-text
113 screening was then performed in duplicate to assess eligibility for final inclusion and discrepancies were
114 resolved through discussion and consensus.

115 **Data extraction**

116 Reviewers extracted data independently from the included studies in duplicate, using a standardized,
117 piloted, web-based form that was developed based on the protocol. Data extracted included:
118 demographics of participants, patient inclusion criteria, study design, intervention details, and outcomes

119 of interest. Any disagreements or differences in extracted data were resolved by consensus or referral to
120 the full text of the study.

121 **Methodological quality and risk of bias assessment**

122 The quality of each study was assessed in duplicate. Observational studies were evaluated using the
123 Newcastle-Ottawa tool which included assessment of the following (i) how the sample represented the
124 population of interest, (ii) how the comparative group was selected, (iii) how the outcome was assessed,
125 and (iv) the length and adequacy of follow-up when applicable. Randomized trials were evaluated
126 independently by the authors using the Cochrane Risk of Bias assessment tool.

127 **Statistical analysis**

128 We conducted a meta-analysis using the random-effect model to pool estimates from the included studies.
129 A random-effect model was used, rather than a fixed-effects model, in order to account for heterogeneity
130 between studies as well as within-study variability. We used the I^2 statistic to estimate the percentage of
131 total between-study variation due to heterogeneity rather than chance (ranging from 0% to 100%).²⁶ I-
132 square values of 25%, 50%, and 75% are thought to represent low, moderate, and high heterogeneity,
133 respectively. Statistical analyses were conducted through OpenMeta[Analyst].²⁶⁻²⁸ All values were two-
134 tailed and $P < .05$ was set as the threshold for statistical significance.

135 To assess whether the benefit of adrenalectomy was influenced by the definition of SCS, a subgroup
136 analysis was performed in 3 subgroups of patients stratified based on the dexamethasone suppression test
137 (DST) cortisol cutoff (the most common variable used). Subgroup 1 included studies in which the DST
138 cortisol cutoff was $\geq 3 \mu\text{g/dL}$, 83 nmol/L (13 studies, DST cortisol cutoff 3-5 $\mu\text{g/dL}$, 83-138 nmol/L);
139 subgroup 2 included studies using a cortisol cutoff of $<3 \mu\text{g/dL}$, 83 nmol/L (8 studies, DST cortisol
140 cutoff 1-2.5 $\mu\text{g/dL}$, 28-69 nmol/L); and subgroup 3 comprised studies that either did not report a DST
141 cortisol cutoff or did not provide how SCS was defined (5 studies). We selected to perform a subgroup
142 analysis only for outcomes reported for at least 25 patients in each subgroup (HTN and DM2).

143 **Results**

144 **Characteristics of included studies**

145 The search yielded 854 references for abstract screening of which 26 studies^{19-23, 29-49} were included in this
146 systematic review (Figure 1). Eligible studies included 25 cohort studies (16 retrospective and 9
147 prospective studies) and one randomized controlled trial. Studies were mostly from European (n=15) or
148 Asian centers (n=9), and 2 were USA-based (Table 1). A total of 584 patients with SCS (mean age 56 yrs,
149 66.8% women) and 457 patients with NF adrenal tumors (mean age 54.9 yrs, 61.5% women) were
150 included. Patients with SCS presented with high prevalence of cardiovascular risk factors (HTN (68%),
151 DM2 (30%), dyslipidemia (25.6%), and obesity (34.6%)). In patients with NF adrenal tumors, prevalence
152 of HTN was 48.4%, DM2 - 8.2%, dyslipidemia - 22.1%, and obesity - 18.8%.

153 Authors reported on various outcome improvements in patients with SCS before and after adrenalectomy
154 in 24 studies; however only 10 studies provided comparative data for patients with SCS managed
155 conservatively (Table 1). In 6 studies, authors compared the effect of adrenalectomy on outcomes in both
156 SCS and NF adrenal tumor groups. In 3 studies, the effect of adrenalectomy on metabolic parameters in
157 patients with NF was compared to conservative management.

158 As expected, studies used different definitions of SCS (Table 2). Definitions of selected clinical outcomes
159 also varied, as did the definition of outcome “improvement” (Table 3). All patients had assessment at
160 baseline and after either adrenalectomy or a period of conservative management. **Most studies reassessed**
161 **patients at least 6 months after the surgery (n=17, Table 3) with a median follow up of 28 (1-109) months**
162 **(median or mean follow up was reported only in 11 studies).**

163 **Metabolic outcome in patients with SCS comparing before and after adrenalectomy**

164 Patients with SCS undergoing adrenalectomy demonstrated an overall improvement in cardiovascular risk
165 factors (Table 4). Improvement in hypertension was observed in 60.5% of patients with SCS; systolic

166 blood pressure decreased by a mean of 12.7 mm Hg (CI95% 7.1-18.3 mmHg) and diastolic blood
167 pressure decreased by a mean of 9.3 mm Hg (CI 95% 3.85-14.83 mm Hg). Improvement in DM2 was
168 observed in 51.5% of patients. Only 3 studies examined the effect of adrenalectomy on fasting blood
169 glucose and 4 studies reported on HbA1c changes, with mild but significant decreases in both.
170 Improvement in obesity was observed in 45% of patients.; following adrenalectomy, BMI decreased by a
171 mean of 1.96 kg/m² (CI95% 0.59-3.32 kg/m²) after adrenalectomy. Adrenalectomy had the least effect on
172 dyslipidemia (24% of patients improved). In three studies examining the effect of adrenalectomy on
173 triglycerides, LDL and HDL cholesterol, no significant changes following adrenalectomy were noted
174 (Table 4).

175 Subgroup analysis based on DST cortisol cutoff criteria was performed only for the outcomes of HTN and
176 DM2. Patients in subgroup 1 (136 with hypertension, 61 with DM2), subgroup 2 (71 with HTN, 34 with
177 DM2) and subgroup 3 (58 with HTN and 25 with DM2) experienced similar rates of HTN and DM2
178 improvement following adrenalectomy (Supplemental figure 1 and 2). Subgroup analysis of obesity and
179 other outcomes was not performed due to small numbers).

180 **Metabolic outcome in patients with SCS comparing adrenalectomy vs conservative management:**

181 Our search identified 10 studies that included both patients who underwent either adrenalectomy (132
182 patients with SCS) or were conservatively managed (135 patients with SCS). When compared to
183 conservative management, patients with SCS undergoing adrenalectomy experienced a statistically
184 significant improvement in hypertension (RR 11, 95% CI 4.3 - 27.8) and DM2 (RR 3.9, 95% CI 1.5- 9.9),
185 but not dyslipidemia (RR 2.6, 95% CI 0.97 -7.2) or obesity (RR 3.4 (95% CI 0.95-12)), (Figure 2A). Data
186 on continuous outcomes derived only from 4 studies demonstrated a significant decrease of systolic blood
187 pressure (SBP) and diastolic blood pressure (DBP) as well as fasting glucose concentrations in patients
188 with SCS undergoing adrenalectomy when compared to conservative management. No significant
189 change in BMI decrease was noted between groups (Figure 2B).

190 **Patients with NF adrenal tumors:**

191 **Metabolic outcome in patients with NF adrenal tumors comparing before and after adrenalectomy**

192 Our search identified 8 studies reporting on clinical outcomes before and after adrenalectomy in patients
193 with NF adrenal tumors.^{19, 31, 34, 35, 37, 39, 47, 48} In 5 of these studies (54 patients with hypertension), 21
194 patients had improvement of BP control after adrenalectomy (42%, 95% CI 21 to 63%), Supplemental
195 Figure 3. In 4 studies, 3/14 and 3/23 patients with DM2 and dyslipidemia respectively improved after
196 adrenalectomy, Supplemental figure 3.

197 **Metabolic outcome in patients with NF adrenal tumors comparing adrenalectomy vs conservative**
198 **management**

199 In 2 studies, metabolic outcomes of adrenalectomy was compared with conservative management.^{19, 48}
200 Meta-analysis was not performed due to small numbers and studies are discussed individually. When
201 compared to conservative management, the adrenalectomy effect on hypertension was variable among the
202 studies. In the study by Chiodini et al, a statistically significant improvement of systolic blood pressure
203 was found between surgical and non-surgical NF groups (9/30 versus 5/37, $P=0.05$).¹⁹ However, in a
204 larger study by Sereg et al., no differences were found when the prevalence of cardiovascular events,
205 hypertension, obesity, dyslipidemia and DM2 in patients with surgically treated NF adrenal tumors was
206 compared to patients with NF adrenal tumors followed conservatively. Patients also had similar BMIs,
207 cholesterol concentrations and glucose concentrations at follow up assessment.⁴⁸

208 **Metabolic outcome comparing adrenalectomy in patients with SCS versus patients with NF adrenal**
209 **tumors**

210 Only 6 studies aimed to compare the effect of adrenalectomy on comorbidities in both SCS and NF
211 populations.^{19, 31, 35, 37, 39, 47} Taking into consideration the small sample size, we did not find statistically
212 significant differences between patients with SCS vs. NF adrenal tumors with regard to impact of

213 adrenalectomy on HTN (39 SCS and 43 NF patients), DM2 (19 SCS and 14 NF patients), obesity (16
214 SCS and 14 NF patients) and dyslipidemia (22 SCS and 23 NF patients) (data not shown). There were
215 insufficient data to evaluate any difference between patients with SCS vs. patients with NF adrenal
216 tumors on any continuous outcomes.

217 The largest comparative study of both surgical and non-surgical patients with SCS and NF adrenal tumors
218 contained only 16 to 37 patients in each arm.¹⁹ In this study, surgical patients with SCS experienced
219 greater improvements in several outcomes when compared to surgically treated patients with NF adrenal
220 tumors, including more weight loss after surgery (32% vs 10%), improved BP (56% vs 30%) and
221 improved fasting glucose concentrations (48% vs 10%).¹⁹ In a smaller study, more than half of the 13
222 patients with NF adrenal tumors treated with adrenalectomy experienced improvements in BP and DM2
223 control. However, it is important to mention that 4 patients developed postoperative temporary adrenal
224 insufficiency, raising the question of whether these patients were misclassified as having a NF adrenal
225 mass.⁴⁷

226 **Risk of bias assessment**

227 Except for one randomized controlled trial, all of the studies were observational. The observational
228 studies were of moderate risk of bias. Samples were not representative enough in most studies. Most of
229 the included studies had good ascertainment of the exposure but not of the outcome. Additionally, many
230 studies were judged to lack a period of sufficient length of follow up for the change in outcome to occur.

231 **Discussion**

232 This systematic review and meta-analysis summarizes the available evidence of adrenalectomy effects on
233 cardiovascular risk factors in patients with SCS. Based on the limited and heterogeneous published data,
234 we demonstrate that a significant proportion of patients with SCS improve their cardiovascular
235 morbidities (HTN, DM2, dyslipidemia, and obesity) after adrenalectomy. The beneficial effect of
236 adrenalectomy persists for HTN and DM2 in the comparative analysis of patients with SCS treated with

237 adrenalectomy versus conservative management. Notably, the stringency of SCS criteria varied between
238 the studies. Despite the fact that subgroup analysis has not shown higher benefit of adrenalectomy in
239 patients with a DST cortisol of ≥ 3 $\mu\text{g/dL}$, the number of patients in each subgroup was small and could
240 have accounted for the absence of significant differences in the benefit of adrenalectomy in relation to the
241 SCS definition used.

242 Interestingly, we have also found that a proportion of patients with NF adrenal tumors experienced an
243 improvement of HTN after adrenalectomy. One of the likely explanations for this observation could be a
244 potential misclassification of patients; for example, one study described that a significant proportion of
245 patients with NF adrenal tumors developed adrenal insufficiency after surgery, clearly suggesting that
246 glucocorticoid autonomous production was not recognized preoperatively.⁴⁷ Overall glucocorticoid
247 production has been linked to HTN, abnormal glucose tolerance and increased BMI.⁵⁰ Thus, it is also
248 possible that a temporary reduction of the overall glucocorticoid load caused by unilateral adrenalectomy
249 could have contributed to a short-term BP improvement described in patients with NF adrenal tumors.

250 **Limitations and strengths**

251 The strengths of this review include an in-depth and comprehensive literature search, a focused review
252 question, and predefined group and subgroup analyses. Our review includes mainly retrospective cohort
253 studies of small sample size. Our results are limited by the heterogeneous definitions of SCS. One may
254 dispute the legitimacy of combining patients diagnosed with SCS using different criteria. However,
255 comparative analysis showed similar improvement in most cardiovascular factors. Moreover, we have
256 performed a subgroup analysis using different DST cortisol cutoffs. **In contrast to our expectations to find
257 more benefit in the higher DST cortisol cutoff subgroup, no significantly different outcomes from the
258 overall analysis were noted.** Various SCS definitions used in the included studies brings to surface the
259 still-ongoing debate on the best diagnostic cutoffs for diagnosing SCS. Even when the same definition of
260 SCS is used across the studies, differences in assay methods and presence of individual factors

261 contributing to possible false positive or negative results⁵¹ may lead to subsequent misclassification of
262 patients.^{40, 47} Most clinicians do not rely solely on the results of biochemical cutoffs to make a diagnosis,
263 but also on clinical suspicion and existence of comorbidities.

264 A significant limitation of this review stems from the significant differences in how and when the
265 outcomes of interest were assessed (Table 3). Inconsistent definitions of comorbidities as well as degrees
266 of improvement, in many cases applied retrospectively, limit our ability to provide accurate estimates of
267 the benefits resulting from adrenalectomy. It was also unclear how aggressive the conservative
268 management was in non-surgical patients and what factors influenced the decision not to undergo
269 adrenalectomy, with all but one study not applying randomization. **In addition, we were not able to**
270 **perform any analysis of age, gender and tumor size influence on cardiovascular outcomes as these**
271 **variable were inconsistently reported separately for each subgroup of patients.**

272 *Comparison with previous studies*

273 To our knowledge, only one previous systematic review of the literature assessed the effect of
274 adrenalectomy in patients with SCS.⁵² Iacobone et al limited their review of studies to those published in
275 English consisting of at least 10 operated patients, and only including patients with SCS. They identified
276 only 7 publications, which are also reviewed in our work. Our current systematic review provides
277 additional value by including smaller cohort studies, as well as studies published in languages other than
278 English (n=2) allowing for a larger total cohort size. Our current review also includes comparative NF
279 adrenal tumor studies.

280 *Review implications*

281 This review raises several important questions needing further clarification. The first question mirrors the
282 ongoing debate on the best SCS definition. The overnight 1-mg DST is most consistently used among the
283 included studies; however, the best cutoff distinguishing patients with clinically relevant autonomous
284 glucocorticoid production is still undetermined. It could be useful to adopt a retrospective approach and

285 examine only patients with SCS who indeed experienced a predefined degree of improvement in their
286 comorbidities with adrenalectomy to gain more insight, however, this was technically not feasible to
287 perform in the current review. Secondly, conservative management differs in its intensity among the
288 studies included. Data from a well-designed randomized controlled trial comparing adrenalectomy to
289 aggressive management of HTN, DM2 and obesity in patients with SCS is needed. Thirdly, it is unclear
290 whether the improvement in cardiovascular risk factors noted after adrenalectomy in patients with SCS
291 actually persisted (or influenced cardiovascular outcomes and mortality) as most studies had short follow
292 up. Nevertheless, despite many unanswered questions, and bearing in mind the heterogeneity of SCS and
293 outcome definitions, the findings from our review demonstrate improvement of cardiovascular risk
294 factors with adrenalectomy in comparison to conservative management in patients with SCS. Until more
295 data are available, the potential favorable impact of adrenalectomy in patients with SCS should be
296 discussed with the patient in the context of informed medical decision making.

297 **Conclusions**

298 Available low to moderate quality evidence **derived** from heterogeneous studies , **most with at least 6**
299 **months follow up**, suggests a beneficial effect of adrenalectomy on cardiovascular risk factors in patients
300 with SCS overall and as compared to conservative management.

301 **Declaration of interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare. IB, WA, and MT are
302 members of the European Society of Endocrinology and European Network for the Study of Adrenal
303 Tumors Clinical Guideline Panel.

304 **Funding:** This research did not receive any specific grant from any funding agency in the public,
305 commercial or not-for-profit sector. V.C. is a Wellcome Trust Clinical Research Training Fellow (CRTF
306 grant 101671).

307 **Author Contributions:**

308 Data extraction: IB, RKC, VS, DD, DE, NN; Data analysis: IB, FA, MHM; Manuscript writing: IB, FA,
309 RKC, VC, DD, DE, NN, MT, WA, WFY, MHM; Methodology expertise: MHM; Subject matter
310 expertise: MT, WA, WFY; Overall project supervision: IB

311

312 **Acknowledgements:**

313 We would like to acknowledge Larry Prokop for performing a performing a high quality literature search
314 targeted towards this review and Zhen Wang for his help with data extraction of one included study
315 written in Chinese.

316 **Citations:**

- 317 1. Stewart PM. Is subclinical Cushing's syndrome an entity or a statistical fallout from diagnostic
318 testing? Consensus surrounding the diagnosis is required before optimal treatment can be
319 defined. *The Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2010 **95** 2618-2620.
- 320 2. Chiodini I. Clinical review: Diagnosis and treatment of subclinical hypercortisolism. *The Journal*
321 *of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2011 **96** 1223-1236.
- 322 3. Di Dalmazi G, Pasquali R, Beuschlein F & Reincke M. Subclinical hypercortisolism: a state, a
323 syndrome, or a disease? *European journal of endocrinology / European Federation of Endocrine*
324 *Societies* 2015 **173** M61-71.
- 325 4. Nieman LK. Update on subclinical Cushing's syndrome. *Curr Opin Endocrinol Diabetes Obes* 2015
326 **22** 180-184.
- 327 5. Goddard GM, Ravikumar A & Levine AC. Adrenal mild hypercortisolism. *Endocrinol Metab Clin*
328 *North Am* 2015 **44** 371-379.
- 329 6. Starker LF, Kunstman JW & Carling T. Subclinical Cushing syndrome: a review. *Surg Clin North*
330 *Am* 2014 **94** 657-668.

- 331 7. Mantero F, Terzolo M, Arnaldi G, Osella G, Masini AM, Ali A, Giovagnetti M, Opocher G & Angeli
332 A. A survey on adrenal incidentaloma in Italy. Study Group on Adrenal Tumors of the Italian
333 Society of Endocrinology. *The Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2000 **85** 637-644.
- 334 8. Terzolo M, Pia A & Reimondo G. Subclinical Cushing's syndrome: definition and management.
335 *Clinical endocrinology* 2012 **76** 12-18.
- 336 9. Reincke M. Subclinical Cushing's syndrome. *Endocrinology and metabolism clinics of North*
337 *America* 2000 **29** 43-56.
- 338 10. NIH state-of-the-science statement on management of the clinically inapparent adrenal mass
339 ("incidentaloma"). *NIH consensus and state-of-the-science statements* 2002 **19** 1-25.
- 340 11. Tauchmanova L, Rossi R, Biondi B, Pulcrano M, Nuzzo V, Palmieri EA, Fazio S & Lombardi G.
341 Patients with subclinical Cushing's syndrome due to adrenal adenoma have increased
342 cardiovascular risk. *The Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2002 **87** 4872-4878.
- 343 12. Terzolo M, Pia A, Ali A, Osella G, Reimondo G, Bovio S, Daffara F, Procopio M, Paccotti P,
344 Borretta G & Angeli A. Adrenal incidentaloma: a new cause of the metabolic syndrome? *The*
345 *Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2002 **87** 998-1003.
- 346 13. Debono M & Newell-Price J. Subclinical hypercortisolism in adrenal incidentaloma. *Curr Opin*
347 *Endocrinol Diabetes Obes* 2015 **22** 185-192.
- 348 14. Di Dalmazi G, Vicennati V, Rinaldi E, Morselli-Labate AM, Giampalma E, Mosconi C, Pagotto U &
349 Pasquali R. Progressively increased patterns of subclinical cortisol hypersecretion in adrenal
350 incidentalomas differently predict major metabolic and cardiovascular outcomes: a large cross-
351 sectional study. *European journal of endocrinology / European Federation of Endocrine Societies*
352 2012 **166** 669-677.
- 353 15. Morelli V, Reimondo G, Giordano R, Della Casa S, Policola C, Palmieri S, Salcuni AS, Dolci A,
354 Mendola M, Arosio M, Ambrosi B, Scillitani A, Ghigo E, Beck-Peccoz P, Terzolo M & Chiodini I.

- 355 Long-term follow-up in adrenal incidentalomas: an Italian multicenter study. *The Journal of*
356 *clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2014 **99** 827-834.
- 357 16. Di Dalmazi G & Pasquali R. Adrenal adenomas, subclinical hypercortisolism, and cardiovascular
358 outcomes. *Curr Opin Endocrinol Diabetes Obes* 2015 **22** 163-168.
- 359 17. Di Dalmazi G, Vicennati V, Garelli S, Casadio E, Rinaldi E, Giampalma E, Mosconi C, Golfieri R,
360 Paccapelo A, Pagotto U & Pasquali R. Cardiovascular events and mortality in patients with
361 adrenal incidentalomas that are either non-secreting or associated with intermediate phenotype
362 or subclinical Cushing's syndrome: a 15-year retrospective study. *The lancet. Diabetes &*
363 *endocrinology* 2014 **2** 396-405.
- 364 18. Debono M, Bradburn M, Bull M, Harrison B, Ross RJ & Newell-Price J. Cortisol as a marker for
365 increased mortality in patients with incidental adrenocortical adenomas. *The Journal of clinical*
366 *endocrinology and metabolism* 2014 **99** 4462-4470.
- 367 19. Chiodini I, Morelli V, Salcuni AS, Eller-Vainicher C, Torlontano M, Coletti F, Iorio L, Cuttitta A,
368 Ambrosio A, Vicentini L, Pellegrini F, Copetti M, Beck-Peccoz P, Arosio M, Ambrosi B, Trischitta V
369 & Scillitani A. Beneficial metabolic effects of prompt surgical treatment in patients with an
370 adrenal incidentaloma causing biochemical hypercortisolism. *The Journal of clinical*
371 *endocrinology and metabolism* 2010 **95** 2736-2745.
- 372 20. Iacobone M, Citton M, Viel G, Boetto R, Bonadio I, Mondì I, Tropea S, Nitti D & Favia G.
373 Adrenalectomy may improve cardiovascular and metabolic impairment and ameliorate quality
374 of life in patients with adrenal incidentalomas and subclinical Cushing's syndrome. *Surgery* 2012
375 **152** 991-997.
- 376 21. Toniato A, Merante-Boschin I, Opocher G, Pelizzo MR, Schiavi F & Ballotta E. Surgical versus
377 conservative management for subclinical Cushing syndrome in adrenal incidentalomas: a
378 prospective randomized study. *Annals of surgery* 2009 **249** 388-391.

- 379 22. Erbil Y, Ademoglu E, Ozbey N, Barbaros U, Yanik BT, Salmaslioglu A, Bozbora A & Ozarmagan S.
380 Evaluation of the cardiovascular risk in patients with subclinical Cushing syndrome before and
381 after surgery. *World journal of surgery* 2006 **30** 1665-1671.
- 382 23. Giordano R, Marinazzo E, Berardelli R, Picu A, Maccario M, Ghigo E & Arvat E. Long-term
383 morphological, hormonal, and clinical follow-up in a single unit on 118 patients with adrenal
384 incidentalomas. *European journal of endocrinology / European Federation of Endocrine Societies*
385 2010 **162** 779-785.
- 386 24. Di Dalmazi G, Berr CM, Fassnacht M, Beuschlein F & Reincke M. Adrenal function after
387 adrenalectomy for subclinical hypercortisolism and Cushing's syndrome: a systematic review of
388 the literature. *The Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2014 **99** 2637-2645.
- 389 25. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG & Group P. Preferred reporting items for systematic
390 reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *BMJ* 2009 **339** b2535.
- 391 26. DerSimonian R & Laird N. Meta-analysis in clinical trials. *Controlled clinical trials* 1986 **7** 177-188.
- 392 27. Higgins JP & Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. *Statistics in medicine*
393 2002 **21** 1539-1558.
- 394 28. Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ & Altman DG. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. *BMJ*
395 2003 **327** 557-560.
- 396 29. Akaza I, Yoshimoto T, Iwashima F, Nakayama C, Doi M, Izumiyama H & Hirata Y. Clinical outcome
397 of subclinical Cushing's syndrome after surgical and conservative treatment. *Hypertension*
398 *research : official journal of the Japanese Society of Hypertension* 2011 **34** 1111-1115.
- 399 30. Alesina PF, Hommeltenberg S, Meier B, Petersenn S, Lahner H, Schmid KW, Mann K & Walz MK.
400 Posterior retroperitoneoscopic adrenalectomy for clinical and subclinical Cushing's syndrome.
401 *World journal of surgery* 2010 **34** 1391-1397.

- 402 31. Bernini G, Moretti A, Iaconi P, Miccoli P, Nami R, Lucani B & Salvetti A. Anthropometric,
403 haemodynamic, humoral and hormonal evaluation in patients with incidental adrenocortical
404 adenomas before and after surgery. *European journal of endocrinology / European Federation of*
405 *Endocrine Societies* 2003 **148** 213-219.
- 406 32. Feng C, Li HZ, Xiao H, Yan WG, Li YQ & Xu WF. [Subclinical Cushing's syndrome: analysis of
407 diagnosis and surgical effect]. *Zhonghua wai ke za zhi [Chinese journal of surgery]* 2007 **45** 1691-
408 1693.
- 409 33. Guerrieri M, Campagnacci R, Patrizi A, Romiti C, Arnaldi G & Boscaro M. Primary adrenal
410 hypercortisolism: minimally invasive surgical treatment or medical therapy? A retrospective
411 study with long-term follow-up evaluation. *Surgical endoscopy* 2010 **24** 2542-2546.
- 412 34. Izaki H, Fukumori T, Takahashi M, Taue R, Kishimoto T, Tanimoto S, Nishitani MA & Kanayama
413 HO. Indications for laparoscopic adrenalectomy for non-functional adrenal tumor with
414 hypertension: usefulness of adrenocortical scintigraphy. *International journal of urology : official*
415 *journal of the Japanese Urological Association* 2006 **13** 677-681.
- 416 35. Kang T, Gridley A & Richardson WS. Long-term outcomes of laparoscopic adrenalectomy for
417 adrenal masses. *Journal of laparoendoscopic & advanced surgical techniques. Part A* 2015 **25**
418 182-186.
- 419 36. Kawate H, Kohno M, Matsuda Y, Akehi Y, Tanabe M, Horiuchi T, Ohnaka K, Nomura M, Yanase T
420 & Takayanagi R. Long-term study of subclinical Cushing's syndrome shows high prevalence of
421 extra-adrenal malignancy in patients with functioning bilateral adrenal tumors. *Endocrine*
422 *journal* 2014 **61** 1205-1212.
- 423 37. Maehana T, Tanaka T, Itoh N, Masumori N & Tsukamoto T. Clinical outcomes of surgical
424 treatment and longitudinal non-surgical observation of patients with subclinical Cushing's

- 425 syndrome and nonfunctioning adrenocortical adenoma. *Indian journal of urology : IJU : journal*
426 *of the Urological Society of India* 2012 **28** 179-183.
- 427 38. Mauclore-Denost S, Duron-Martinaud S, Nunes M, Gatta B, Fagour C, Rault A, Gosse P & Tabarin
428 A. [Surgical excision of subclinical cortisol secreting incidentalomas: Impact on blood pressure,
429 BMI and glucose metabolism]. *Annales d'endocrinologie* 2009 **70** 211-217.
- 430 39. Midorikawa S, Sanada H, Hashimoto S, Suzuki T & Watanabe T. The improvement of insulin
431 resistance in patients with adrenal incidentaloma by surgical resection. *Clinical endocrinology*
432 2001 **54** 797-804.
- 433 40. Mitchell IC, Auchus RJ, Juneja K, Chang AY, Holt SA, Snyder WH, 3rd & Nwariaku FE. "Subclinical
434 Cushing's syndrome" is not subclinical: improvement after adrenalectomy in 9 patients. *Surgery*
435 2007 **142** 900-905; discussion 905 e901.
- 436 41. Miyazato M, Ishidoya S, Satoh F, Morimoto R, Kaiho Y, Yamada S, Ito A, Nakagawa H, Ito S & Arai
437 Y. Surgical outcomes of laparoscopic adrenalectomy for patients with Cushing's and subclinical
438 Cushing's syndrome: a single center experience. *International urology and nephrology* 2011 **43**
439 975-981.
- 440 42. Morioka M, Fujii T, Matsuki T, Jo Y, Kobayashi T, Tanaka H, Ohashi T & Kondo K. Preclinical
441 Cushing's syndrome: report of seven cases and a review of the literature. *International journal of*
442 *urology : official journal of the Japanese Urological Association* 2000 **7** 126-132.
- 443 43. Papierska L, Cwikla J, Rabijewski M, Glinicki P, Otto M & Kasperlik-Zaluska A. Bilateral adrenal
444 incidentaloma with subclinical hypercortisolemia: indications for surgery. *Polskie Archiwum*
445 *Medycyny Wewnętrznej* 2014 **124** 387-394.
- 446 44. Perysinakis I, Marakaki C, Avlonitis S, Katseli A, Vassilatou E, Papanastasiou L, Piaditis G &
447 Zografos GN. Laparoscopic adrenalectomy in patients with subclinical Cushing syndrome.
448 *Surgical endoscopy* 2013 **27** 2145-2148.

- 449 45. Reincke M, Nieke J, Krestin GP, Saeger W, Allolio B & Winkelmann W. Preclinical Cushing's
450 syndrome in adrenal "incidentalomas": comparison with adrenal Cushing's syndrome. *The*
451 *Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 1992 **75** 826-832.
- 452 46. Ricciato MP, Di Donna V, Perotti G, Pontecorvi A, Bellantone R & Corsello SM. The role of
453 adrenal scintigraphy in the diagnosis of subclinical Cushing's syndrome and the prediction of
454 post-surgical hypoadrenalism. *World journal of surgery* 2014 **38** 1328-1335.
- 455 47. Rossi R, Tauchmanova L, Luciano A, Di Martino M, Battista C, Del Viscovo L, Nuzzo V & Lombardi
456 G. Subclinical Cushing's syndrome in patients with adrenal incidentaloma: clinical and
457 biochemical features. *The Journal of clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2000 **85** 1440-1448.
- 458 48. Sereg M, Szappanos A, Toke J, Karlinger K, Feldman K, Kaszper E, Varga I, Glaz E, Racz K & Toth
459 M. Atherosclerotic risk factors and complications in patients with non-functioning adrenal
460 adenomas treated with or without adrenalectomy: a long-term follow-up study. *European*
461 *journal of endocrinology / European Federation of Endocrine Societies* 2009 **160** 647-655.
- 462 49. Tsuiki M, Tanabe A, Takagi S, Naruse M & Takano K. Cardiovascular risks and their long-term
463 clinical outcome in patients with subclinical Cushing's syndrome. *Endocrine journal* 2008 **55** 737-
464 745.
- 465 50. Crowley RK, Hughes B, Gray J, McCarthy T, Hughes S, Shackleton CH, Crabtree N, Nightingale P,
466 Stewart PM & Tomlinson JW. Longitudinal changes in glucocorticoid metabolism are associated
467 with later development of adverse metabolic phenotype. *European journal of endocrinology /*
468 *European Federation of Endocrine Societies* 2014 **171** 433-442.
- 469 51. Nieman LK, Biller BM, Findling JW, Newell-Price J, Savage MO, Stewart PM & Montori VM. The
470 diagnosis of Cushing's syndrome: an Endocrine Society Clinical Practice Guideline. *The Journal of*
471 *clinical endocrinology and metabolism* 2008 **93** 1526-1540.

472 52. Iacobone M, Citton M, Scarpa M, Viel G, Boscaro M & Nitti D. Systematic review of surgical
473 treatment of subclinical Cushing's syndrome. *The British journal of surgery* 2015 **102** 318-330.

474

475 **Figure Legends:**

476 **Figure 1.** Prisma Flow Diagram.

477 **Figure 2.** Adrenalectomy versus conservative management in patients with Subclinical Cushing
478 Syndrome.

479 **2A** Dichotomous outcomes

480 **2B** Continuous outcomes

481 Grp 1 –Adrenalectomy group

482 Grp 2 – Conservative management group

483 **Supplemental figure 1.** Effect of adrenalectomy on hypertension in patients with SCS (Subgroup
484 analysis)

485 Subgroup 1: DST cortisol of 1-2.5 mcg/dl

486 Subgroup 2: DST cortisol of 3-5 mcg/dl

487 Subgroup 3 – DST cortisol cutoff not reported

488 **Supplemental figure 2.** Effect of adrenalectomy on diabetes mellitus type 2 in patients with SCS
489 (Subgroup analysis)

490 Subgroup 1: DST cortisol of 1-2.5 mcg/dl

491 Subgroup 2: DST cortisol of 3-5 mcg/dl

492 Subgroup 3 – DST cortisol cutoff not reported

493 **Supplemental figure 3.** Effect of adrenalectomy on hypertension, diabetes mellitus and dyslipidemia in
494 patients with NF adrenal tumors

495