

The potential benefits and harms of universal newborn pulse oximetry screening. Response to the UK National Screening Committee public consultation

Ewer, Andrew; Deshpande, Sanjeev A; Gale, Christopher; Stenson, Benjamin J; Upton, Michele ; Evans, Claire; Oddie, Sam

DOI:

[10.1136/archdischild-2019-317859](https://doi.org/10.1136/archdischild-2019-317859)

License:

Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial (CC BY-NC)

Document Version

Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Ewer, A, Deshpande, SA, Gale, C, Stenson, BJ, Upton, M, Evans, C & Oddie, S 2019, 'The potential benefits and harms of universal newborn pulse oximetry screening. Response to the UK National Screening Committee public consultation', *Archives of Disease in Childhood*. <https://doi.org/10.1136/archdischild-2019-317859>

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](#)

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

Archives of Disease in Childhood

The potential benefits and harms of universal newborn pulse oximetry screening. Response to the UK National Screening Committee public consultation.

Journal:	<i>Archives of Disease in Childhood</i>
Manuscript ID	Draft
Article Type:	Letter (correspondence)
Edition:	not in use
Date Submitted by the Author:	n/a
Complete List of Authors:	Ewer, Andrew; Birmingham Womens Hospital, Neonatal Unit Deshpande, Sanjeev; Shrewsbury and Telford Hospital NHS Trust, Neonatal Unit; Princess Royal Hospital, Neonatal Unit Gale, Chris; Imperial College London, Academic Neonatal Medicine Stenson, Ben; Neonatal Unit, Simpson Centre for Reproductive Health, Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, Neonatology Upton, Michele; NHS Improvement, Patient Safety Lead; NHS England , Patient Safety Evans, Claire; Warrington and Halton Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust Oddie, Sam; Bradford Royal Infirmary, Bradford Neonatology
Keywords:	Newborn, Pulse oximetry, Screening, congenital heart defect

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

1
2
3 Dear Editor
4

5 Pulse oximetry screening for critical congenital heart defects has consistent test accuracy¹, meets
6 the criteria for a universal screening test¹ and reduces mortality.²
7
8

9 In May 2019 the National Screening Committee (NSC) announced a public consultation on its
10 decision not to introduce routine pulse oximetry screening (POS) for critical congenital heart defects
11 (CCHD) in all newborn babies.¹
12
13

14 The main reasons given for the NSC's decision are outlined in the consultation covernote as follows:
15

- 16
17
18 i) *'A positive result from pulse oximetry will generate some harms, including: parental*
19 *anxiety, a longer stay in hospital, possible transfer to the neonatal unit [NNU], further*
20 *tests to assess for non-symptomatic conditions.*
21
22 ii) *For many of these babies the further investigations will be unnecessary and the baby will*
23 *be identified as healthy. This is a false positive result.*
24
25 iii) *For babies with CHD [congenital heart defects] or other non-cardiac condition it is not*
26 *clear that investigations and identification of these conditions will lead to any better*
27 *outcome than a diagnosis at the time the baby becomes symptomatic.'*
28
29
30
31

32 Following the NSC UK PulseOx pilot study³ and in the absence of comparator data, the NSC convened
33 an expert Workgroup to provide a pragmatic consensus view on the questions relating to outcomes,
34 harms and benefits. As clinical members of a Workgroup invited by the NSC to offer expert advice on
35 these issues at a meeting in June 2018,⁴ we are disappointed that the NSC decision not to
36 recommend screening for these same issues does not reflect the conclusions that we reached.
37
38

39 The purpose of the workshop was ...*'to look at [the] conditions [identified by POS] and discuss, with*
40 *an expert group, what would have been the natural history of unscreened babies and whether all*
41 *would have needed treatment and whether there may have been unnecessary harm.'*
42
43
44
45
46

47 Although the NSC decision document does not contain any data on the numbers of babies that
48 would be affected by POS, our discussions - which were based on data from the NSC PulseOx pilot
49 study (2015)³ - considered these in detail.
50
51

52 We identified that out of 32 597 babies screened, 114 babies (0.35%) who tested positive were
53 admitted to NNU, of which 8 had a CCHD (5 babies had non-critical CHD but were not admitted). A
54 further 82 of the babies admitted to NNU (72% of the total admitted) had a significant non-cardiac
55 illness. Although this group are technically false positives for the purposes of screening for CCHD, 8
56 distinct conditions were identified (congenital pneumonia, persistent pulmonary hypertension of the
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 newborn, culture positive and culture negative sepsis, meconium aspiration, pneumothorax,
4 transient tachypnoea of the newborn and respiratory distress syndrome) which required treatment;
5 only 22 babies (0.07% of all babies screened) were healthy (transitional circulation [TC]).⁴
6
7

8
9 We considered the relative benefits and harms in babies who were diagnosed with the eight non-
10 cardiac conditions as a result of POS. We concluded that in six of the eight conditions there was clear
11 benefit to early identification (i.e. highly likely to result in improved outcome). In one condition
12 (culture-negative sepsis) there was the potential for overtreatment but clear benefit to the genuine
13 cases and we concluded '*it is better to treat suspected cases as the outcome of non-treatment of*
14 *sepsis is serious*'. For babies with TC and minor pneumothoraces (Ptx) we concluded that there was
15 no benefit and these babies were subjected to the harms of delayed discharge (12 hours maximum)
16 and unnecessary investigation (blood tests and x-rays) but this accounted for only 23 babies (22 TC
17 and 1 Ptx) - 0.07% of all babies screened.⁴
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

25 In our opinion, these figures demonstrate that there are clear benefits in the majority of those false
26 positives detected by POS who are admitted to NNU, (early detection and timely intervention) and
27 there are modest harms (delayed discharge, overtreatment) in a minority.
28
29

30 These views are not reflected in the NSC's statement and we urge them to review their decision not
31 to introduce routine newborn pulse oximetry screening for critical congenital heart defects in light of
32 our conclusions.
33
34
35

36 Word count 665
37

38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60

References

1. Plana MN, Zamora J, Suresh G, Fernandez-Pineda L, Thangaratinam S, Ewer AK. Pulse oximetry screening for critical congenital heart defects. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews 2018, Issue 2. Art. No.: CD011912. DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD011912.pub2.
2. Abouk R, Grosse SD, Ailes EC, Oster ME. Association of US State Implementation of Newborn Screening Policies for Critical Congenital Heart Disease With Early Infant Cardiac Deaths. *JAMA*. 2017;318(21):2111–2118. doi:10.1001/jama.2017.17627
3. <https://legacyscreening.phe.org.uk/pulse-oximetry>
4. <https://legacyscreening.phe.org.uk/documents/pulse-oximetry/NPOSP%20End%20Project%20Report.pdf>
5. <https://legacyscreening.phe.org.uk/documents/pulse-oximetry/Notes%20of%20workshop%20June%202018.pdf>

1
2
3 Authors
4

5 Andrew Ewer, Professor of Neonatal Medicine, Institute of Metabolism and Systems Research,
6 University of Birmingham and Honorary Consultant Neonatologist, Birmingham Women's and
7 Children's Hospital, Birmingham, UK
8
9

10
11 Sanjeev Deshpande, Consultant Neonatologist, Princess Royal Hospital, Telford, UK
12

13
14 Christopher Gale, Senior Clinical Lecturer in Neonatal Medicine, Imperial College London and
15 Honorary Consultant Neonatologist, Chelsea and Westminster NHS Trust London, UK
16

17
18 Benjamin Stenson, Professor of Neonatal Medicine University of Edinburgh and Consultant
19 Neonatologist Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK
20

21
22 Claire Evans, ANNB Screening Midwife, Warrington and Halton Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust,
23 Warrington, UK.
24

25
26 Michele Upton, NHS Improvement Head of Maternity and Neonatal Transformation Programmes
27

28
29 Sam Oddie, Professor of Neonatal Medicine, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of
30 York and Consultant Neonatologist, Bradford Royal Infirmary, Bradford, UK.
31

32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40 The authors declare no conflict of interest
41

42 AKE was a clinical adviser to the NSC regarding POS and the clinical lead on the PHE pulse oximetry
43 pilot. SD is Hon. Treasurer, British Association of Perinatal Medicine (BAPM). CE was project lead for
44 the PHE pulse oximetry pilot. SO is the Clinical Lead for the National Neonatal Audit Project (NNAP)
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60