# UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

## University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

## 'Game over'? Abiy Ahmed, the Tigrayan People's Liberation Front and Ethiopia's political crisis

Fisher, Jonathan; Tsehaye Gebrewahd, Meressa

DOI:

10.1093/afraf/ady056

License.

Other (please specify with Rights Statement)

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Fisher, J & Tsehaye Gebrewahd, M 2018, "Game over"? Abiy Ahmed, the Tigrayan People's Liberation Front and Ethiopia's political crisis', *African Affairs*, pp. 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/ady056

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

**Publisher Rights Statement:** 

This is a pre-copyedited, author-produced PDF of an article accepted for publication in African Affairs following peer review. The version of record Jonathan Fisher, Meressa Tsehaye Gebrewahd; 'Game over'? Abiy Ahmed, the Tigrayan People's Liberation Front and Ethiopia's political crisis, African Affairs, , ady056, https://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/ady056 is available online at: https://doi.org/10.1093/afraf/ady056

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)

•Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

Download date: 23. Apr. 2024



### African Affairs

## 'Game over'? Abiy Ahmed, the Tigrayan People's Liberation Front and Ethiopia's political crisis

Journal:	African Affairs
Manuscript ID	AfricAff-2018-198.R2
Manuscript Type:	Briefing
Keywords:	Ethiopia, Ethnic federalism, Ethiopian politics

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts

#### **BRIEFING**

## 'GAME OVER'? ABIY AHMED, THE TIGRAYAN PEOPLE'S LIBERATION FRONT AND ETHIOPIA'S POLITICAL CRISIS

#### JONATHAN FISHER AND MERESSA TSEHAYE GEBREWAHD\*

ON 15 FEBRUARY 2018, HAILEMARIAM DESALEGN, Ethiopia's beleaguered prime minister, resigned. Bowing to pressure from within his own party<sup>1</sup>, the Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front (EPRDF), Hailemariam declared that he hoped to facilitate an end to 'unrest and political crisis' in the country by leaving the national stage.<sup>2</sup> If Hailemariam's departure had taken observers by surprise, however, what was to follow would defy all predictions. His successor, Abiy Ahmed – whose elevation was unanticipated even by many within the EPRDF Politburo itself<sup>3</sup> – has, since his April 2018 inauguration, presided over a dramatic set of iconoclastic policy shifts. Perhaps most high profile amongst these has been the securing of a *rapprochement* with Eritrea, Ethiopia's most bitter regional nemesis since the outbreak of a border war in May 1998.

It is in the domestic sphere, however, where Abiy's reform agenda – or, at least, its stated ambitions – has been most radical. In particular, Abiy has sought to distance

<sup>\*</sup> Jonathan Fisher (j.fisher@bham.ac.uk) is Reader in African Politics in the International Development Department of the University of Birmingham. He is also a Research Fellow in the Centre for Gender and Africa Studies at the University of the Free State. Meressa Tsehaye Gebrewahd (meressa21t@gmail.com) is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science and Strategic Studies at Mekelle University. He is also Director of the Gebrehiwot Baykedagn Center for Strategic Studies, also at Mekelle University. The authors are very grateful to Cedric Barnes, Jason Mosley an anonymous reviewer and the editors of African Affairs for helpful comments received on an earlier draft of this Briefing. They are also grateful to the School of Government and Society at the University of Birmingham for funding fieldwork which this Briefing draws upon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Al-Jazeera, 'Ethiopia prime minister Hailemariam Desalegn resigns', 15 February 2018, < <a href="https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/02/ethiopia-prime-minister-hailemariam-desalegn-resigns-180215115215988.html">https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/02/ethiopia-prime-minister-hailemariam-desalegn-resigns-180215115215988.html</a> > (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

himself from the past 27 years of EPRDF rule (or, at least, core dimensions of it), condemning his immediate predecessors within weeks of coming to office as overseers of 'terrorist acts...and using force just to stay in power' and announcing a range of plans to overturn longstanding EPRDF positions on, for example, the role of the state in the economy and multi-party politics.<sup>4</sup> Leader of the recently-renamed Oromo Democratic Party (ODP – formerly the Oromo People's Democratic Organisation (OPDO)) within the four-member EPRDF coalition, Abiy has also looked to underline the 'new broom' character of his movement by rebuking the Tigrayan People's Liberation Front (TPLF), the onetime senior partner within the EPRDF, and rolling back their influence and place within the Ethiopian polity.<sup>5</sup>

More concretely, in June 2018 Abiy unexpectedly replaced perhaps the two most powerful TPLF figures in Ethiopia since the death of long-serving TPLF chair and prime minister Meles Zenawi (president and later premier from 1991 onwards) in August 2012: Samora Yunis, army chief of staff, and Getachew Assefa, intelligence chief.<sup>6</sup> Indeed, it is the departure of Samora and Getachew – the latter removed in a much more unceremonious manner than the former – that reportedly persuaded Eritrean president Isaias Afwerki that the TPLF elite, Asmara's enemy for two decades, was being increasingly side-lined.<sup>7</sup> In a speech twelve days later, Isaias announced that he would respond to Abiy's peace overtures by sending a delegation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Al-Jazeera, 'Ethiopia PM: Security agencies committed 'terrorist acts'', 19 June 2018, < https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/06/ethiopia-pm-security-agencies-committed-terrorist-acts-180619051321984.html > (5 October 2018); Maggie Fick, 'Ethiopia prime minister calls for multiparty democracy – chief of staff', Reuters, 22 July 2018, < https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-ethiopia-politics/ethiopia-prime-minister-calls-for-multiparty-democracy-chief-of-staff-idUKKBN1KC0MX > (5 October 2018). It is worth noting that some of these issues had also been raised under the premiership of Hailemariam although Hailemariam lacked the mandate to move further forward with such discussions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Argaw Ashine, 'Cracks emerge in Ethiopian ruling coalition', The East African, 14 June 2018, < http://www.theeastafrican.co.ke/news/africa/Cracks-in-Ethiopian-ruling-coalition/4552902-4611768-x71xd9z/index.html > (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Aaron Masho, 'Ethiopia's prime minister replaces security chiefs as part of reforms', Reuters, 8 June 2018, < https://www.reuters.com/article/us-ethiopia-military/ethiopias-prime-minister-replaces-commanders-in-security-reshuffle-idUSKCN1J40PU > (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Interview, Senior Eritrean policy official, Asmara, 20 June 2018.

to Ethiopia, noting gleefully that 'the people [of Ethiopia] said "enough is enough". 8 This in turn precipitated the end of the TPLF's shenanigans; which was aptly described as "Game Over". 9

This Briefing takes a step back to place current, fast-moving political developments in Ethiopia within a broader context. For while the pace and imagery of 'Ethiopia's quiet revolution' owes much to Abiy Ahmed's personality and approach to politics, its wider trajectory was set in motion long before his premiership. Abiy was not the architect of the situation that led to his ascendancy. We argue that Ethiopia's current political dynamics derive from two longer-term phenomena. The first is the maturing and solidification of the EPRDF's ethnic federalism project, and the federal government's blunt engagement with this process. The second is the disintegration of the TPLF into factionalism and self-criticism since the death of Meles. Both processes have been brokered by political elites within the ODP/OPDO – and another EPRDF coalition member, the Amhara National Democratic Movement (ANDM)<sup>10</sup> – to rebalance relationships within the EPRDF, and between federal and regional governments.

Ethnic federalism and Ethiopia's 'prison of nationalities'

Ethiopia's ruling EPRDF regime, in power since May 1991, emerged out of the TPLF, a Marxist-Leninist ethno-nationalist liberation movement founded in Tigray during 1974-1975. Established during the dying months of emperor Haile Selassie's reign, the TPLF attacked the historical Ethiopian state as a 'prison of nationalities'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Ministry of Information, Eritrea, 'President Isaias' speech on Martyrs' Day', 20 June 2018, < http://www.shabait.com/news/local-news/26520-president-isaias-speech-on-martyrs-day > (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ihid.

As discussed below, the ANDM, like the OPDO, changed the name of their party in September 2018
 to Amhara Democratic Party (ADP).

whereby the country's diverse ethnic communities had long been subjugated and exploited by just one – the Amhara group of the imperial family and its military *junta* successor, the *Derg* (in power 1974-1991). After a brief flirtation with the idea of an independent Tigray, the TPLF soon committed itself to fighting for 'self-determination' for all of Ethiopia's different nationalities *within* a united Ethiopia. Having defeated a range of competitor rebel organizations by 1979, TPLF fighters turned their full force onto the *Derg* army, securing full control of Tigray by 1988.<sup>11</sup>

Tigray, however, was home to only 7 percent of the then Ethiopian population and the province covered only one-seventeenth of the country's land mass. <sup>12</sup> The TPLF had limited reach beyond Tigray and little profile or legitimacy among Ethiopia's two largest ethnic groups – the Oromo and Amhara – which together represented (and continue to represent) over half of the Ethiopian populace. For both normative and pragmatic reasons, therefore, the TPLF set about constructing a coalition of similarly-minded ethno-nationalist movements from across the country's disparate nationalities, inaugurated as the EPRDF in 1989.

Where such ethno-nationalist movements did not exist (as was largely the case) or where bilateral relations were already rocky (as with the Oromo Liberation Front), the TPLF instead brought them into existence. The ANDM was formed from the remnants of a splinter group of a rival rebel movement neutralized by the TPLF in 1978, while the OPDO was built around Oromo prisoners-of-war captured by the TPLF from the *Derg* army.<sup>13</sup> The fourth and final member of the EPRDF coalition –

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Gebru Tareke, *The Ethiopian revolution: War in the Horn of Africa* (Yale University Press, New Haven, CT, 2009), pp. 76-110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> John Young, *Peasant revolution in Ethiopia: The Tigray People's Liberation Front, 1975-1991* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1997), p. 67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> John Markakis, *Ethiopia: The last two frontiers* (James Currey, Oxford, 2011), pp. 243-244; Young, *Peasant revolution*, pp. 166-167; Interview, former senior OPDO official, Addis Ababa, 17 July 2018.

the Southern Ethiopian People's Democratic Movement (SEPDM)<sup>14</sup> – was also 'recruited from the prisoner-of-war camps' and, like the OPDO, 'received political training' from TPLF cadres.<sup>15</sup> The artificiality of these early political movements is attested to by one former OPDO leader who recalls visiting an EPRDF camp soon after the fall of the *Derg* and 'seeing only Tigrayans wall-to-wall; the fighters were all Tigrayan, they all spoke Tigrinya'.<sup>16</sup>

The four EPRDF members, and the coalition's associate ethno-nationalist parties, nonetheless became the governing parties of the nine regional states established in Ethiopia by the EPRDF between 1991 and 1995, the building blocks of the country's new ethnic federal system. This system was designed to limit and curtail the power of the centre and provide relative autonomy and self-government to the regions. In Ethiopia, however, these states corresponded not only, or primarily, to regional identity but, rather, to ethnic identity. This was undertaken, notionally, to ensure that all the country's major nationalities could exercise 'self-determination' 17 at the regional political level, and avoid subjugation by whichever groups dominated at the centre. This resulted in a very diverse range of regional states – from the comparatively tiny Gambella in the west (population less than half a million) to the sprawling Oromia, a vast region nearly ten times the size of Gambella in terms of area, and over sixty times the size in terms of population.

Moreover, while ethnic federalism aimed at weakening central control over the regions in theory, in reality the federal government's influence remained very strong throughout the 1990s and 2000s. During the 1990s, this was partly because regional

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The SEPDM was formally founded in 1992, a year after the EPRDF had captured power.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Interview, former TPLF political education coordinator, Addis Ababa, 4 May 2016; Interview, former senior OPDO official, Addis Ababa, 17 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Interview, former senior OPDO official, Addis Ababa, 17 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Semahagn Gashu Abebe, *The last post-Cold War socialist federation: Ethnicity, ideology and democracy in Ethiopia* (Ashgate Publishing, Farnham, 2014), pp. 167-173.

governance structures were so nascent beyond Tigray, having been gutted during the Ethiopian civil war in many places, and recalibrated by the EPRDF in the aftermath of victory. As one former senior OPDO official recalls, 'when the regions were being established, mass recruitment took place for the OPDO but...we didn't have enough intellectuals for the bureaucracy of Oromia...TPLF had enough manpower to place bureaucrats in [the Tigray state] administration...the others did not'. 18

The new regime was also reluctant to permit the emergence of genuine autonomy in regions where its own writ had barely been established, intervening at will to replace troublesome regional administrations on a number of occasions. Moreover, in the aftermath of a 2001 split within the TPLF which nearly saw his removal, Meles launched a comprehensive *tehadso*, or renewal, of the EPRDF machinery throughout the country, simultaneously building the capacity of regional bureaucracies while strengthening their dependence upon the centre. <sup>19</sup> Indeed Jon Abbink suggested in 2011 that, 'the actual power and interference of the federal government in regional and local affairs has become stronger than under any previous regime'. <sup>20</sup>

The situation today, however, is rather different – at least in the most populous and ethnically coherent regions: Amhara, Oromia, Somali and Tigray. As Sarah Vaughan notes, following an unexpectedly poor showing in the 2005 Ethiopian general election, the EPRDF sought to 'win back the population' who, they feared, viewed ethnic federalism as little more than a smokescreen for EPRDF – or TPLF – national domination. This was undertaken through building formerly shunned community leaders into local governance mechanisms, pressuring local EPRDF leaders to extend

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Interview, former senior OPDO official, Addis Ababa, 17 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Jon Abbink 'Ethnic-based federalism and ethnicity in Ethiopia: Reassessing the experiment after 20 years', *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 5, 4 (2011), pp. 596-618, p. 604; Sarah Vaughan, 'Revolutionary democratic state-building: Party, state and people in the EPRDF's Ethiopia', *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 5, 4 (2011), pp. 619-640, pp. 629-631.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Jon Abbink 'Ethnic-based federalism and ethnicity in Ethiopia: Reassessing the experiment after 20 years', *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 5, 4 (2011), p. 604.

their mobilization networks and strengthening the voice of regional representatives in a range of fora, including those of Oromia in Addis Ababa (constitutionally, a chartered city surrounded by Oromia Regional State).<sup>21</sup>

This process continued and took on a dynamic of its own after Meles' death in August 2012, the 'strongman' leader of Ethiopia for 21 years being succeeded by a man with limited clout even within his own party. Viewed by many EPRDF cadres as a 'legacy maintainer' and by his own admission 'considered a neutral person', Hailemariam Desalegn assumed the premiership as a compromise candidate and sought to govern more collectively than Meles, in part because he had little alternative.<sup>22</sup> Coupled with the outbreak of renewed factionalism and introspection within the formerly dominant TPLF, this relative power vacuum at the federal level accelerated processes of regional-level regime-building already underway.

With Meles gone, however, there existed no clear presence at the centre to tether regional proxy leaders such as Abdi Mohamoud Omar ('Abdi Iley'), president of Somali Regional State (SRS) between 2010 and 2018, to a broader federal state-building project – no presence, that is, beyond the Ethiopian National Defence Force (ENDF). Indeed, SRS's recent political history is revealing of the shifting power balance occurring more broadly between Ethiopia's federal and regional levels over the last decade. In 2004, for example, the Region's ruling party – and EPRDF satellite – the Somali People's Democratic Party (SPDP) could dismiss its leader, regional

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Vaughan, 'Revolutionary democratic state-building'. pp. 632-634.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Meressa Tsehaye Gebrewahd, 'Assessments of the political and security dynamics in Ethiopia since 2015 and emerging windows of opportunity', paper presented at 'Ethiopian Defence Day', organized in collaboration with Mekelle City Council, Mekelle, 13 February 13 2018; Greg Mills, 'Ethiopia's need for "deep renewal", *Daily Maverick*, 14 August 2018, <a href="https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2018-08-14-ethiopias-need-for-deep-renewal">https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2018-08-14-ethiopias-need-for-deep-renewal</a> > (5 October 2018).

president Abdirashid Dulane, only after securing permission from Addis Ababa.<sup>23</sup> By 2012, however, Abdi Iley, who had been head of security in SRS during the two years prior to becoming president, was able to outmanoeuvre federal attempts to remove him by aligning with ENDF officers.<sup>24</sup>

By August 2018, Iley's hold on power within SRS had become so comprehensive that the federal government opted for brute force to remove him – sending in heavy artillery to apprehend and arrest him after Iley's paramilitary (*liyu*) forces disrupted a meeting being held in Dire Dawa.<sup>25</sup> Dire Dawa, like Addis Ababa, is a chartered city and, therefore, under federal authority. Tweeting in the midst of the crisis, Somali Affairs analyst and *Voice of America* journalist Harun Maruf noted that 'relations between the federal Government of Ethiopia and leaders of the Somali Region are said to be at "breaking point" and mused at 'the likelihood of the region cutting ties with the Federal Government'.<sup>26</sup>

#### Protest and emergency in Oromia and Amhara

Somali Region has not, however, been the primary flashpoint in Ethiopian federal-regional relations in recent years. The country's two largest states – Oromia and Amhara – erupted in protest during 2015 and 2016 with thousands demonstrating against, *inter alia*, perceived political and economic marginalization, human rights abuses by the federal military and police, federal encroachment into regional affairs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Tobias Hagmann, 'Beyond clannishness and colonialism: Understanding political disorder in Ethiopia's Somali region, 1991-2004', *Journal of Modern African Studies* 43, 4 (2005), pp. 509-536, p. 522

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Tobias Hagmann, *Talking peace in the Ogaden: The search for an end to conflict in the Somali Regional State in Ethiopia* (Rift Valley Institute, Nairobi, 2014), p. 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Addis Standard, 'Talks between federal and Somali Region authorities underway after weekend violence leaves trail of casualties, destruction', 6 August 2018, < https://addisstandard.com/news-talks-between-federal-and-somali-region-authorities-underway-after-weekend-violence-leaves-trail-of-causalities-destruction > (5 October 2018).

 $<sup>^{26}</sup>$  Harun Maruf Twitter page, see < https://twitter.com/HarunMaruf/status/1025543749932396544 > (9 August 2018) and < https://twitter.com/HarunMaruf/status/1025661142595719169 > (5 October 2018).

and the perceived seizure of Amhara or Oromo territories by another state, or the federal government itself. The government's heavy-handed response, which included police shooting protestors dead and arresting thousands as well as the declaration of two states of emergency, not only failed to quell the unrest, but vindicated the arguments of those protesting.<sup>27</sup>

While these and later protests across the two regions have come to encompass broader political and economic concerns, their origins are firmly located within identity politics and ethno-nationalist territorial grievances against Addis Ababa.<sup>28</sup> The Oromia protests begun initially in response to the so-called 'Addis Ababa master plan', a federal developmental initiative announced in 2014 which aimed to expand the Ethiopian capital into Oromia territory.<sup>29</sup> Protests in Amhara were based in similar ethno-territorial sentiments: they followed the July 2016 arrest of Demeke Zewdu, a leading member of the Welkait Identity and Self-Determination Committee (WISC), an Amhara organization opposed to the 1995 allocation of the Welkait Tegede region to Tigray Region. The arrest of Demeke and, soon after, of activist Nigist Yirga precipitated large-scale protests from Amhara communities who resented the federal government's reluctance to engage in the Welkait Tegede issue.

The Addis Ababa master plan was abandoned in January 2016, while Nigist and Demeke were released in February 2018. The damage had, however, already been done. The two issues – and the federal government's violent reaction to both – had acted as catalysts in the two regions, mobilizing Oromo and Amhara communities in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Organizers of the Grand Oromia Rally, 'The Grand Oromia Rally for freedom, justice, voice and peace', 5 August 2016, < https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B\_2O980GNOg5dkRWbGNtVlFpQkU/view > (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Tom Lavers, 'Responding to land-based conflict in Ethiopia: The land rights of ethnic minorities under federalism', *African Affairs* 117, 468 (2018), pp. 462-484, p. 464.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Endalk Chala, 'Violent clashes in Ethiopia over "master plan" to expand Addis', Guardian, 11 December 2015, < https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/11/ethiopia-protests-master-plan-addis-ababa-students > (5 October 2018) and 'Ethiopia scraps "master plan" after protests kill 140', Guardian, 14 January 2016, < https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/jan/14/ethiopia-addis-master-plan-abandoned > (1 August 2018).

defence of an ethno-territorial identity which has become an increasingly potent and central driver of state-society relations in contemporary Ethiopia.<sup>30</sup> As Yonatan Tesfaye Fessha notes, 'the decision that each major ethnic group [in Ethiopia] should be dominant in one and only subnational unit has elevated ethnic identity to a primary political identity...doing so can radicalise ethnic allegiance, cause continuous tension and puts [sic] a strain on inter-ethnic relations'.<sup>31</sup> The state's brutal crackdowns also, however, led protest movements in Amhara and Oromo to increasingly associate their struggles with each other's. In Amhara region, for example, slogans such as 'we are all Oromos' and 'the blood flowing in Oromia is our blood too' became progressively more commonplace in rallies and demonstrations, particularly in the aftermath of the regime's bloody response to a major protest in Gonder in July 2016.<sup>32</sup>

In Oromia and Amhara – as in the rest of Ethiopia – these processes of political mobilization have, since 1991, evolved in parallel with processes of subnational state-building by the OPDO and ANDM. However basic regional administrative structures may have been during the 1990s, the last two decades has seen, as discussed above, a comprehensive expansion and strengthening of regional political networks and administrative structures, placing OPDO and ANDM regional leaders between the federal level and ordinary citizens as the *de facto* defenders of Oromo and Amhara interests. This is not, of course, how the two parties have historically been viewed by their notional constituents; both have often been dismissed by commentators and citizens as puppets or proxies of the TPLF, their effective creator.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Lavers, 'Responding to land-based conflict', pp. 482-483.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Yonatan Tesfaye Fessha, 'The original sin of Ethiopian federalism', *Ethnopolitics* 16, 3 (June 2017), pp. 232-245, pp. 232 and 243.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Awol Allo, "The blood flowing in Oromia is our blood too": Why Oromo-Amhara solidarity is the greatest threat to the Ethiopian government, *African Arguments*, 27 September 2018, <a href="https://africanarguments.org/2016/09/27/the-blood-flowing-in-oromia-is-our-blood-too-why-oromo-amhara-solidarity-is-the-greatest-threat-to-the-ethiopian-government/">https://africanarguments.org/2016/09/27/the-blood-flowing-in-oromia-is-our-blood-too-why-oromo-amhara-solidarity-is-the-greatest-threat-to-the-ethiopian-government/</a> (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Abebe, *The last post-Cold War socialist federation*, p. 168; Interview, former senior OPDO official, Addis Ababa, 17 July 2018, Addis Ababa.

The 2015-2016 protests, however, presented the two parties with a dilemma regarding how to proceed: continue to defend and implement the policies of the federal government (of which they were core members), or present themselves as more sympathetic to the protestors' grievances, even if this meant opening themselves up to charges of hypocrisy. Both chose the latter route, with the OPDO in particular dramatically re-framing itself as an internal critic of the federal government on issues as diverse as federal working languages, distribution of wealth and federal encroachment upon Oromo interests in Addis Ababa.<sup>34</sup>

Instrumental in this realignment of the OPDO with Oromo protest movements has been Lemma Megersa, former speaker of Oromia's state assembly, who became an early and outspoken opponent of the Addis Ababa master plan and federal military involvement — and killing of civilians — within Oromia. Elected president of the Oromia region by the OPDO in this context in October 2016, Lemma became a leading contender for the premiership following Hailemariam's 2018 resignation. Lacking a seat in parliament, however, Lemma was technically disqualified from being nominated for this post. Consequently, a week after Hailemariam's announcement, the OPDO's Central Committee voted for Lemma to take the post of deputy chair and to elevate the head of the OPDO Secretariat to the chair, to ensure that there was a viable OPDO candidate for prime minister. The OPDO Secretariat chief, an enthusiastic member of what had become known in the Ethiopian press by that point as 'Team Lemma', was Abiy Ahmed.

The ANDM leadership has been less forthright – at least until recently<sup>35</sup>, and indeed has historically been viewed as a more reliable TPLF ally, siding with Meles

<sup>35</sup> Indian Ocean Newsletter, 'Purge underway among the Amhara', Issue 1480, 31 August 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Tsegaye R Arrarssa, 'The Lemma Mergessa moment and the Oromo dilemma: Between resistance and governing', Addis Standard, 10 January 2018, < http://addisstandard.com/opinion-the-lemma-megerssa-moment-and-the-oromo-dilemma-between-resistance-and-governing > (5 October 2018).

after members of his own party turned against him in 2001 (see below).<sup>36</sup> A critical development since the start of the protests has nonetheless been the emergence of a *de facto* alliance between ANDM and OPDO ruling elite.<sup>37</sup> This has been demonstrated in a range of symbolic moves including both parties' MPs boycotting parliament – robbing it of a *quorum* – in December 2017.<sup>38</sup> Both also renamed their organisations simultaneously in September 2018, adopting names clearly intended to suggest mutual sympathies and shared visions, with the OPDO becoming the Oromo Democratic Party and the ANDM becoming the Amhara Democratic Party.

It is in the March 2018 election of Abiy Ahmed to the EPRDF chairmanship (and thus the Ethiopian premiership) where the alliance has proven to be most significant and most indicative of a more profound realignment in Ethiopian politics. At the start of the March EPRDF Executive Committee meeting, TPLF cadres had hoped for an ANDM-OPDO-SEPDM contest for the leadership in which the more reliable ANDM would triumph; only three of the four coalition party chairs can go forward to the final ballot to prevent a deadlock. The TPLF therefore nominated ANDM chairman, and EPRDF deputy, Demeke Mekonnen for the chairmanship. Demeke, however, unexpectedly declined the nomination, saying that he preferred to retain the deputy position. The ANDM then nominated TPLF chair Debretsion Gebremichael, ensuring that the selection would be between the OPDO, TPLF and SEPDM leaders. Abiy's victory – secured with 108 votes (compared with Debretsion's two and SEPDM chair Shiferaw Shigute's 58) – was not in doubt once it became clear that the ANDM would

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Medhane Tedasse and John Young, 'TPLF: Reform or decline?', *Review of African Political Economy* 30, 97 (2003), pp. 389-403, pp. 390 and 402.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Recent criticisms of ANDM leaders by Abiy – including in a September 2018 EPRDF Executive meeting – would suggest that this alliance has not been further consolidated since Abiy's election as EPRDF chair, Personal interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 16 September 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Mary Harper, 'Ethiopian MPs' boycott over ethnic unrest', BBC World Service Africa, 21 December 2017, < https://www.bbc.com/news/live/world-africa-42420474?ns\_mchannel=social&ns\_source=twitter&ns\_campaign=bbc\_live&ns\_linkname=5a3bae44e 4b0e9a433c1edab%26Ethiopian%20MPs%27%20boycott%20over%20ethnic%20unrest%26&ns\_fee= 0#post\_5a3bae44e4b0e9a433c1edab > (5 October 2018).

not be fielding a candidate.<sup>39</sup> TPLF members of the Executive Committee reportedly understood Demeke's decision to be a calculated result of 'conspiring' between the OPDO and ANDM.<sup>40</sup>

Whither the TPLF? Crisis and critique in a post-liberation movement

Ultimately, however, the TPLF's position going into the Executive Committee was far from coherent – an indication of the wider factionalism that has overtaken the movement since Meles' death. Together with a prolonged period of self-critique and growing concerns regarding its unpopularity in its Tigray heartland, these divisions have significantly reduced the movement's influence within the ruling coalition and allowed other member parties, notably the OPDO, to seize the wider initiative and to paint the Tigrayan Front as the authors of Ethiopia's political crisis.

This characterization of the TPLF as the long-time dominant power within the Ethiopian government is certainly not without accuracy, particularly with regard to the management of the country's vast economic parastatals and military-security complex.<sup>41</sup> It is important, however, to recognize the extent to which EPRDF structures themselves – which assign a 25 percent voting share to each of the four member parties – have served to curtail the influence of divided constituent movements.

A 2001 split within the TPLF, for example, imperilled Meles' hold on power and the then prime minister survived only by negotiating – and, to some extent, compelling – support from the ANDM, SEPDM and eventually the OPDO.<sup>42</sup> Having

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> TPLF cadres argue this to be an external perception and prefer the language of 'contribution' (Interviews with two former senior TPLF official, Mekelle, 19 July 2018 and Addis Ababa, 21 July 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Medhane and Young, 'TPLF'.

purged many TPLF cadres who opposed him, Meles held the movement together during the next decade through a range of authoritarian and top-down 'renewal' processes (see above). Following his death, however, the party quickly splintered between Meles loyalists (including many 'old guard' cadres notionally retired several years previously), a younger generation of technocrats based in Addis Ababa and party apparatchiks based in Mekelle, Tigray. As René Lefort has noted, these factions have since taken different positions on a range of core issues, including how best to respond to the protests, paralysing the TPLF.<sup>43</sup>

This points to a broader structural challenge the TPLF has long faced and which Meles largely kept in check between 2001 and 2012: its commitment to *gim gima*, a practice of collective, critical evaluation of individual and group practices developed during the liberation struggle and aimed at debating policies at length and holding cadres to account.<sup>44</sup> This attribute derives from the Front's Marxist-Leninist origins and traditions of democratic centralism, and while many senior TPLF officials feel that periodic self-evaluations of movement progress 'creates more strengths than not'45, in reality such processes tend to solidify divisions within the Front and weaken its ability to act strategically. This is particularly the case within the EPRDF coalition, where the three other member parties are much less inclined to excoriate their records in semi-public fora in such a manner.

During the EPRDF self-evaluation process that preceded Abiy's election, for example, senior TPLF members reportedly assigned blame for many of Ethiopia's core challenges to their own organization, while OPDO members conducted a much

René Lefort, 'Ethiopia's crisis', openDemocracy, 19 November 2016, <a href="https://www.opendemocracy.net/ren-lefort/ethiopia-s-crisis">https://www.opendemocracy.net/ren-lefort/ethiopia-s-crisis</a> > (1 August 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Young, *Peasant revolution in Ethiopia*, pp. 143-144. In the post-1991 era, *gim gima* has increasingly been criticized for its use within the civil service to humiliate 'those who promote [d] alternative viewpoints' to senior officials (Vaughan, 'Revolutionary, democratic state-building', p. 628).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Interview with former senior TPLF official, Addis Ababa, 21 July 2018.

less comprehensive review, focusing instead on consolidating their own position.<sup>46</sup> Indeed some of Abiy's most pointed recent public criticisms of the EPRDF and TPLF's records were arguably made more forcefully first by TPLF cadres themselves. In a June 18, 2018 address to parliament, for example, Abiy implored spectators to 'not say TPLF and the people of Tigray are one and the same, the people of Tigray still face a lack of good governance – there are many poor people there'.<sup>47</sup> Four years previously a number of TPLF elders had toured Tigray to assess local views of the Front's record in the state. Their respondents heavily criticized the Front's performance and the delegation's report back to the TPLF (much of which was made public) pulled far fewer punches than Abiy's words in parliament.<sup>48</sup>

Indeed, in explaining the TPLF's decline in influence in Addis Ababa in recent years one should not focus solely upon 'push factors'. The movement's declining reputation among Tigrayans themselves has perturbed many current and former party officials and led, particularly since Abiy's election, to a re-prioritization of Tigray by the Front. Indications of the latter include the April 2018 appointment of Getachew Reda, an influential minister under Hailemariam, to the post of deputy head of the TPLF Secretariat in Mekelle. TPLF chair Debretsion Gebremichael has also come to rhetorically position the party anew as the defender of Tigrayan identity, promoting a range of slogans aimed at the federal government in July 2018 rallies included 'stop targeting Tigrayans' and 'justice for Tigrayans'.

Abiy Ahmed: Painkiller, placebo or cure?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Abiy Ahmed speech to the Ethiopian Parliament, 18 June 2018, < <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wJnC2aX4jP8&t=6119s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wJnC2aX4jP8&t=6119s</a> > (1 August 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Personal interview, aide to senior TPLF cadre, Addis Ababa, 27 April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Dr. Debretsion Gebremicheal speech on Tigray People's Rally in Mekelle, 28 July 2018, < <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B9iKRXw6UT0">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B9iKRXw6UT0</a> > (1 August 2018). Author's own translations from Tigrinya.

In a July 2018 interview, while reflecting on Ethiopia's political crisis, TPLF cofounder Sebhat Nega argued that 'the national question is already solved in practice:
the Oromo and Amhara, you do not have one dominating over the other'. From one
perspective this is true: the maturing of ethnic federalism has provided unprecedented
degrees of recognition and self-governance to many of Ethiopia's once-ignored
nationalities. Recent events nonetheless raise the question of the place of the 'federal'
within Ethiopian ethnic federalism. The medium- and longer-term dynamics
described in this Briefing have created a situation where political actors are best
served by mobilizing along ethno-territorial lines *against* federal structures and,
indeed, against other states.

To date, Abiy Ahmed and his advisers have sought to walk this tightrope by publicly defending the Ethiopian project, while also distancing themselves from the TPLF and, to some extent, the wider EPRDF; 'we live as Ethiopia and as Ethiopians, as we die', declared Abiy at his inauguration.<sup>51</sup> His first few months in office have also focused around conciliatory and much publicized visits to communities across the country, where an Ethiopia of self-governing nationalities has been played-down in favour of the more pan-Ethiopian and vague vision of *medemer* (Amharic for summation, or addition), which Abiy defines as 'tender love instead of abject cruelty, peace instead of conflict, love over hate, forgiveness over holding a grudge, pulling instead of pushing'.<sup>52</sup>

It remains to be seen, however, how durable this approach will be, and how far it embeds itself within Ethiopia's political fabric once Abiy's honeymoon has ended.

The August 2018 crisis in Somali Regional State indicates perhaps the limited

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Interview, Sebhat Nega, Mekelle, 19 July 2018.

Abiy Ahmed speech to the Ethiopian Parliament 2 April 2018, <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Ulc17714uh4">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Ulc17714uh4</a> > (5 October 2018).

<sup>52</sup> Abiy Ahmed speech to the Ethiopian Parliament, 18 June 2018, <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wJnC2aX4jP8&t=6119s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wJnC2aX4jP8&t=6119s</a> > (5 October 2018).

practical purchase of *medemer* for resolving the more intractable governance challenges that Ethiopia faces and provides support to the claims of some commentators that Abiy represents only a 'painkiller, not a cure'. Moreover, Abiy came to power by virtue of his role within the EPRDF and, particularly, the OPDO; he remains vulnerable to changing dynamics within his party and the wider coalition, which controls every seat in the Ethiopian parliament. A renewed TPLF or recalibrated 'Team Lemma' could plausibly challenge his position through the party's internal structures in the coming months and years.

Moreover, Abiy's July 2018 call for multi-party democracy, which has been accompanied by the release of political prisoners and legalization of long criminalized opposition movements, holds its own challenges. For some, including Abiy's supporters, it represents an opportunity to free the premier's emerging movement from the organizational constraints of the OPDO/ODP and EPRDF, though even in Oromia itself an independent Abiy movement would face serious competition from the now decriminalized Oromo Liberation Front.<sup>54</sup> For others, particularly within the TPLF, Abiys presidential, populist style is 'at best, naïve'.<sup>55</sup> The wider concern, though, relates to the growing gap between aspirational discourses at the top and unresolved ethno-nationalist conflicts on the ground. As Wolde Tadesse, Jason Mosley and Angela Raven-Roberts have noted in relation to continuing violence around Oromia's southern border with the Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region (SNNPR), '[Abiy]'s and his party's positioning as reformers have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Hamza Mohamed, 'Abiy Ahmed a "painkiller, not a cure" for Ethiopia's problems', Al-Jazeera, 5 July 2018, < <a href="https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/07/abiy-ahmed-pain-killer-cure-ethiopia-problems-180705073956209.html">https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/07/abiy-ahmed-pain-killer-cure-ethiopia-problems-180705073956209.html</a> (5 October 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Fick, 'Ethiopia prime minister calls for multiparty democracy'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Interview, EPRDF Politburo member, Mekelle, 20 July 2018.

raised expectations...across the country'. 56 These expectations may well be difficult for Ethiopian policy-makers to meet, particularly since core EPRDF coalition partners and associates, including SNNPR's SEPDM, are now struggling to redefine themselves and their relationships with the centre and the populace within a rapidly evolving and unpredictable political climate.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Wolde Tadesse, Jason Mosley and Angela Raven-Roberts, 'Strains down south: Ethiopia's national reforms rouse local tensions', *African Arguments*, 19 June 2018, < <a href="https://africanarguments.org/2018/06/19/strains-south-ethiopia-national-reforms-rouse-local-tensions-snnpr/">https://africanarguments.org/2018/06/19/strains-south-ethiopia-national-reforms-rouse-local-tensions-snnpr/</a> > (5 October 2018).