

Rethinking borders and boundaries for a mobile history of education

Myers, Kevin; Ramsey, Paul; Proctor, Helen

DOI:

[10.1080/00309230.2018.1521452](https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2018.1521452)

License:

None: All rights reserved

Document Version

Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Myers, K, Ramsey, P & Proctor, H 2018, 'Rethinking borders and boundaries for a mobile history of education', *Paedagogica Historica*, vol. 54, no. 6, pp. 677-690. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2018.1521452>

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](#)

Publisher Rights Statement:

This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Taylor & Francis in *Paedagogica Historica* on 07/11/2018, available online: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00309230.2018.1521452>

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.



Rethinking borders and boundaries for a mobile history of education.

Journal:	<i>Paedagogica Historica: International Journal of the History of Education</i>
Manuscript ID	PH-2018-0914.R1
Manuscript Type:	Introduction to Special Issue
Keywords:	Migration, Mobility, Culture, education

SCHOLARONETM
Manuscripts

Rethinking borders and boundaries for a mobile history of education.

Kevin Myers^a, Paul J. Ramsey^b and Helen Proctor^c

^aUniversity of Birmingham, UK, ^bEastern Michigan University, ^cUniversity of Sydney, Australia

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 8 January 2018

Accepted 20 August 2018

I

Migration has been a constant feature of human history. People have always moved seeking sustenance, safety, advancement and adventure. Migrations, as Castle and Miller argue, 'have been part of human history from the earliest times'.¹ Yet the routine fact of migration, its very normality across continents and periods of time, is not necessarily reflected very well in the modern social, human or behavioural sciences. Individual disciplines characterise and explain this tendency in different ways but it has become commonplace to trace the intellectual origins of modern social sciences to projects of nation building and to identify methodological nationalism, with its naturalisation of nation states and reification of national borders, as enduring and problematic legacies.² Even if a good deal of this literature is rather abstract, and some of it glibly pejorative, it has helped to challenge a sedentary bias in the social sciences that had traditionally understood migrants in reductive and linear narratives of arrival, struggle and settlement.³

This collection of papers has its origins in a specially convened meeting in Chicago 2016 of scholars interested in migration and working in the history of education. That meeting was the

¹ S. Castles and M.J. Miller, *The Age of Migration* (New York: Guildford Press, 2003), 4; Michael H. Fisher, *Migration: A World History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014); "Migration," in *International Encyclopaedia of the Social Sciences*, ed. William A. Darity, Jr., 2nd ed. (Detroit: Macmillan Reference, 2008), 156-159

² See, for example, Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller, 'Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences, and the Study of Migration: An Essay in Historical Epistemology', *International Migration Review*, 37, 3 (2003) and Susan L. Robertson and Roger Dale, 'Researching Education in a Globalising Era: Beyond Methodological Nationalism, Methodological Statism, Methodological Educationism and Spatial Fetishism', Centre for Globalisation, Education and Societies, University of Bristol, Bristol.
<http://susanleerobertson.com/publications>. For a balanced and critical discussion of understanding and applying methodological nationalism in different disciplines see Daniel Chernilo (2011) 'The critique of methodological nationalism: Theory and history', *Theses Eleven*, 106 (1): 98-117.

³ Sager A. (2018) 'Toward a Cosmopolitan Ethics of Mobility', *Mobility & Politics*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, chapter 3.

CONTACT Kevin Myers k.p.myers@bham.ac.uk

URL: <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/cpdh> Email: phadmin@contacts.bham.ac.uk

catalyst for the formation of a new Standing Working Group, hosted by the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, entitled Migrants, Migration and Education. Our broad aim is to write migrants, migration and human mobility into the history of education. As well as developing empirical projects that cast new light on migrants, migration and mobility in the history of education, we aim to provide a supportive forum for scholarly discussion and debate. This collection of papers presents some initial results from our endeavour. It begins with some brief definitional observations before introducing the collection by focusing on three important themes, and levels of analysis, in English language publications focused especially, but not exclusively, on the United Kingdom, Australia and the United States; states and empires; communities; and individuals.

II

The term migration, as it is deployed here, entails crossing the boundary of a political, administrative or cultural unit for a certain minimum period of time.⁴ This is a deliberately flexible and inclusive definition and, as historian Barbara Luthi has noted, it allows for a wide range of migrant 'trajectories, time spans, directions and destinations'.⁵ It includes voluntary, forced, temporary, long-term, cyclical and mono-directional migration and it brings within its remit a broad range of people, including, for example, missionaries, teachers, students and tourists, who have not traditionally, or primarily, been categorised as migrants.⁶ This expanded definition is adopted here for three reasons.

Firstly, this definition does not depend on the existence, nor the dominance, of the modern nation-state. The work of migration historians has made clear that migration is a global and universal phenomenon that preceded the formation of nation states, and can take place within and between cities, regions, empires and continents. Scholars continue to debate the periodization of migration over millennia but their work moves us away from the traditional,

⁴ Leah D. Adams and Anna Kirova, eds., *Global Migration and Education: Schools, Children, and Families* (Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2006), 1-12; Michael H. Fisher, *Migration: A World History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014); "Migration," in *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*, ed. William A. Darity, Jr., 2nd ed. (Detroit: Macmillan Reference, 2008), 156-159.

⁵ Barbara Lüthi, Migration and Migration History, Version: 1.0, in: Docupedia-Zeitgeschichte, 28.9.2010, URL: http://docupedia.de/zg/Migration_and_Migration_History?oldid=123616
Versions: 1.0

⁶ See the argument in Leo Lucassen and Aniek X. Smit (2015) The Repugnant Other: Soldiers, Missionaries, and Aid Workers as Organizational Migrants, *Journal of World History*, 26:1, 1-39 and an indication of its potential in Maria Patricia Williams (2015) Mobilising Mother Cabrini's educational practice: the transnational context of the London school of the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Jesus 1898-1911, *History of Education*, 44:5, 631-650

and nation-based dichotomy of emigration – immigration, and an associated policy lexicon of assimilation, integration, multiculturalism and cohesion.⁷

Secondly, the definition adds the crossing of cultural boundaries to more classical notions of movement across political or geographical territories. Cross-cultural migrations are, according to historians Jan and Leo Lucassen, 'moves that bring migrants in contact with people and communities with a different cultural outlook, ranging from language, family systems, religion or worldviews, to technologies, the extent of civil society, public sphere and labour relations'.⁸ Such moves were much more common than classical migration history has suggested and their ubiquity has resulted in calls for a 'mobility turn' in historical, social and educational studies.⁹ For many scholars, Donna Gabaccia, the potential and distinctive contribution of historians to this interdisciplinary turn is their interest in culture and their 'clear preference for explanations that feature human migrants as thinkers, historical agents and culture-bearers'.¹⁰

Thirdly, and relatedly, migrant cultures, or the realms of beliefs, values, reflection and communication, are emphasised in a model that is precisely interested in the dynamic situations that arise through processes of cultural exchange. Cross cultural migrations necessarily distance or remove individuals and groups from the societies in which they have been socialised and whose traditions, habits and guides for action are likely to be of declining value in the changed contexts that result from migration. Indeed, to be a migrant is necessarily to embark upon a process of cultural learning.¹¹ Migrants do not exist in familiar worlds. Instead, they experience and confront novel situations which must be considered, may be discussed and which demand responses. However, a full account of these responses, and the processes that lead to them, requires an agent-centred analysis and one capable of exploring what Karin Priem has identified as the 'sensory, emotional and didactic-epistemic foundations of educational processes'.¹²

⁷ See, for example, Christiane Harzig and Dirk Hoerder with Donna Gabaccia *What is migration history?* Cambridge, Polity, 2009; Patrick Manning, *Migration in world history*. London : Routledge, 2013 2nd edn; Hoerder, D. (2016). Migration studies: Deep time and global approaches. *Journal of Global History*, 11(3), 473-480.

⁸ Leo Lucassen, Jan Lucassen, Rick de Jong & Mark van de Water, 'Cross-cultural migration in Western Europe 1901-2000: A preliminary estimate'. *International Institute History of Social History*, Research Paper No. 52. Available at: https://socialhistory.org/sites/default/files/docs/publications/researchpaper-52-lucassen-lucassen-et.al-versie_voor_web140801.pdf

⁹ Finkelstein, B. (2013). Teaching Outside the Lines: Education History for a World in Motion. *History of Education Quarterly*, 53(2), 126-138. doi:10.1111/hoeq.12011

¹⁰ Migration theory : talking across disciplines / edited by Caroline B. Brettell and James F. Hollifield. New York, N.Y. ; London : Routledge, 2008 2nd ed.; Christiane Harzig/Dirk Hoerder, with Donna Gabaccia, *What is Migration History*, p. 3; Finkelstein, B. (2013). Teaching Outside the Lines, p.128.

¹¹ Kevin Myers and Ian Grosvenor, Cultural learning and historical memory: A research agenda *Encounters/Encuentros/Rencontres on Education* Vol. 15, 2014, 3-21

¹² Karin Priem (2016) Seeing, hearing, reading, writing, speaking and things: on silences, senses and emotions during the "zero hour" in Germany, *Paedagogica Historica*, 52:3, 286-299 (p.298)

Moreover, it is one that, as the next section shows, both requires, but also goes beyond, the views and languages of states and empires, to explore meso and micro levels of mobility.

II

The five papers collated here range from the late seventeenth century to the present. In doing so their chronology roughly, and perhaps not coincidentally, mirrors the emergence and development of nation states, and their empires. As modern nation-states developed, these “imagined communities” sought to delineate and impose national cultures on their often diverse populations, utilizing the newly created public schools for such purposes.¹³ The state schools of the Germanic principalities, notably Prussia, served as a sort of educational model for many nations - gaining the acceptance of numerous scholars and reformers from Europe, the United States and Japan during the early-nineteenth century - because the German educational system emphasized the skills and attributes many believed were essential for the creation of a homogenous citizenry.¹⁴ This educational model, focused on the basic academic skills and moral characteristics thought to cultivate nationalism, was adapted and adopted in many colonies and nations during the nineteenth century, especially in those experiencing great waves of both internal and external migration. In Australia, Western Europe, the United States, and Latin America, for instance, state schools promoted cultural and linguistic cohesion in order to bolster post-colonial nation building. Explicitly using European educational models, Carlos Newland notes, schooling in Latin America was “employed to achieve a mental (and even physical) uniformity in the population.” In colonial holdings—from Britain’s South Africa to Japan’s Taiwan - colonial schools sought to subordinate native populations, while a separate elite educational system was offered to migrant colonists.¹⁵ In Australia, schooling provision

¹³ Ana Bravo-Moreno, “Transnational Mobilities: Migrants and Education,” *Comparative Education* 45, no. 3 (2009): 421-424; Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, revised ed. (New York: Verso, 1991), 47-65; Eric Hobsbawm, *The Age of Capital, 1848-1875* (New York: Vintage Books, 1996), 309-311

¹⁴ Paul J. Ramsey, “Toiling Together for Social Cohesion: International Influences on the Development of Teacher Education in the United States,” *Paedagogica Historica* 50, nos. 1-2 (2014): 111-116; Karl-Ernst Jeismann, “American Observations Concerning the Prussian Educational System in the Nineteenth Century,” in *German Influences on Education in the United States to 1917*, ed. Henry Geitz, Jürgen Heideking, and Jürgen Herbst (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 21-41. Green, Andy. “Education and State Formation in Europe and Asia.” In *Education, Globalization and the Nation State*, edited by Andy Green, 29-51. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK, 1997. http://dx.doi.org/10.1057/9780230371132_3.

¹⁵ Ramsey, “Toiling Together for Social Cohesion,” 111-116; Sophie Rudolph (2018) To “uplift the Aborigine” or to “uphold” Aboriginal dignity and pride? Indigenous educational debates in 1960s Australia, *Paedagogica Historica*, G. Antonio Espinoza, *Education and the State in Modern Peru: Primary Schooling in Lima, 1821-c. 1921* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 3-17; Bravo-Moreno, “Transnational Mobilities,” 421-423; Hobart A. Spalding, Jr., “Education in Argentina, 1890-1914: The Limits of Oligarchical Reform,” *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 3, no. 1 (1972): 33-36; Carlos Newland, “The Estado Docente and its Expansion:

expressed complex intersections of social class, ethno-religious heritage, gender and race, including the frequent segregation of Catholic from Protestant settler children and the widespread exclusion or marginalisation of Aboriginal children.¹⁶

The close relationship between nation-states, empires and education is not, of course, a new story. Historians have long interpreted the development of popular education, and mass schooling in particular, as sites in which national cultures were to be distributed, protected and celebrated. The traditional sources for these messages, legislative and policy enactments evident in ‘acts and facts’ approaches to the history of education, are, however, now used in conjunction with new concepts and new contexts that have transformed our understanding of educational philosophies, policies and practices. Conceptually, historians of education have drawn on an eclectic set of set of tools, notably but by no means only associated with postcolonial or post structural approaches to history writing, that made educational ideas, practices and institutions central to governmentality. Schooling features prominently in a literature that describes the nation building capacities of schools, the pastoral power of teachers that disciplined and moralised children, and by the contribution such processes made to the orderly functioning of national and imperial communities.¹⁷ *Order in Progress*, as the pithy title

Spanish American Elementary Education, 1900-1950,” *Journal of Latin American Studies* 26, no. 2 (1994): 454; Mark D. Szuchman, “In Search of Deference: Education and Civic Formation in Nineteenth-Century Buenos Aires,” in *Molding the Hearts and Minds: Education, Communications, and Social Change in Latin America*, ed. John A. Britton (Wilmington, DE: Scholarly Resources Inc., 1994), 1-18; Ines Dussel and Marcelo Caruso, “Dewey Under South American Skies: Some Readings from Argentina,” in *Latin American Education: Comparative Perspectives*, ed. Carlos Alberto Torres and Adriana Puiggrós (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997), 106; David N. Plank, *The Means of Our Salvation: Public Education in Brazil, 1930-1995* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1996), 63-66; Simphiwe A. Hlatshwayo, *Education and Independence: Education in South Africa, 1658-1988* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2000), 30-35; E. Patricia Tsurumi, *Japanese Colonial Education in Taiwan, 1895-1945* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1977), 18-22; B. Edward McClellan, *Moral Education in America: Schools and the Shaping of Character from Colonial Times to the Present* (New York: Teachers College Press, 1999), 15-33; Paul J. Ramsey, “Education and Migration,” in the *Oxford Handbook of the History of Education*, eds. John Rury and Eileen Tamura (Oxford: Oxford University Press, forthcoming).

¹⁶ Quentin Beresford and Gary Partington (eds). *Reform and Resistance in Aboriginal Education* (Perth: University of Western Australia Press, 2003); Geoffrey Sherington, ‘Families and state schooling in the Illawarra, 1840-1940’ in M. R. Theobald, M. R., and R. J. W. Selleck (eds.), *Family, school and state in Australian history*, (Sydney: Allen and Unwin, 1990) 114-133; Craig Campbell and Helen Proctor, *A History of Australian Schooling* (Sydney: Allen and Unwin 2014).

¹⁷ Marc Depaepe and Paul Smeyers, ‘Educationalization as an ongoing modernization process’, *Educational Theory*, 58, no.4 (2008): 379-389; Marc Depaepe and Karen Hulstaert, Creating Cultural Hybridity by Exporting Metropolitan Structures and Cultures of Schooling and Educationalisation? The Emergence of a Congolese ‘Elite’ in the 1950s as a Starting Point for Further Research’ *European Educational Research Journal*, 2013, Vol.12(2), pp.201-214 For a detailed historiographical analysis of this issue in the US context see Milton Gaither, *American Educational History Revisited: A Critique of Progress* (New York, Teachers College, 2003) and for Latin America, and its relationship with the Iberian peninsula, see the judgements of Gabriela Ossenbach & María del Mar del Pozo (2011) Postcolonial models, cultural transfers and transnational perspectives in Latin America: a research agenda, *Paedagogica Historica*, 47:5, 579-600

of one of the most theoretically sophisticated and empirically detailed version of this story puts it.¹⁸

Immersed in national archives, reading bureaucratic documents and fascinated with the remains of the material cultures of schools it is perhaps not surprising that historians of education have often appeared to have been persuaded by the power of state schooling to inculcate national identities. Yet if the contexts for research leave the boundaries of the state school and head out into the wider world, and if they follow the movement of peoples around the globe, the historiographical picture becomes much less stable and much more dynamic. In James Belich's rich and provocative survey, for example, settler migrants, and their shared culture of enterprise, emotion and affection, become the central actors in global change.¹⁹ In this reading it was not science, politics, or capital accumulation that underpinned processes of state formation but a sea change in attitude and sentiment, a new collective psychology, among British migrants and their ancestors that learnt to see in the settlement of 'new lands' opportunities for restoration and transformation in the frontier lands. Even if the reasons for this revolution in the mentalities of migrants is something of a mystery, and even if Belich's ambitious work has inevitably been subjected to extensive critique, his emphasis on the agency of migrants is consistent with the now commonly expressed aim to decentre national accounts of state formation in favour of global or world histories where movement, appropriation and hybridization are key themes.²⁰

The papers published in this collection help to demonstrate that migrants and migration were central to the educational project of creating and sustaining imagined communities and to the associated practices of state formation. It matters, for example, to Olivier Esteves' analysis of educational dispersal in the 1960s that a foundational element in the multinational British state was an ethnic populism, developed and promoted by migrant settlers first to Ireland but later to Australia, Canada and the American West, in which an imagined racial whiteness became a

¹⁸ Marc Depaepe et al., *Order in progress : everyday educational practice in primary schools, Belgium, 1880-1970*. Leuven : Leuven University Press, 2000 Tröhler D. (2017) Educationalization of Social Problems and the Educationalization of the Modern World. In: Peters M.A. (eds) *Encyclopedia of Educational Philosophy and Theory*. Springer, Singapore

¹⁹ James Belich, *Replenishing the Earth: The Settler Revolution and the Rise of the Angloworld*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009

²⁰ For a summary of the reception of Belich's work see Stephen Howe (2012), British Worlds, Settler Worlds, World Systems and Killing Fields, *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 40:4, 691-725. Important historical and educational studies of hybridization include Heike Niedrig and Christian Ydesen (eds) *Writing Postcolonial Histories of Intercultural Education* (Frankfurt a.M.: Peter Lang Verlag, 2011); Barnita Bagchi, Eckhardt Fuchs and Kate Rousmaniere (eds) *Connecting Histories of Education: Transnational Exchanges and Cross-Cultural Transfers in (Post) – Colonial Education* (Berghahn, 2014)

central and learnt feature of Britishness.²¹ It did so because of the fluid networks of people, especially perhaps academics, civil servants, pedagogues, missionaries, teachers, political activists, students and child migrants, contributed to developing affective bonds of belonging in the Anglo World.²² For some historians at least, this populism not only helps to explain the atrocities, and the physical and symbolic violence visited on native and slave populations on the frontier, but also the memories of Empire that could be stimulated by the simple act of children from specifically New Commonwealth countries attending schools in England three centuries later.²³

The existence of an Anglo world settler ideology challenges the tendency in historical writing to see nations, and their discrete paths of development, as natural cases for explanation and analysis. Instead, the racist and eugenic thinking that became so prominent in the USA was an integral part of settler ideology and a key part of its westward drive from the Eastern seaboard of North America. Yet, unlike the United Kingdom, central government in the United States would remain relatively weak and, in the absence of an exclusive state sponsored nationalism, it became possible for millions of Russians, Poles, Germans, Italians and Irish to both valorise the memory of European homes but also feel they belonged in the United States. They were also, of course, mostly identified as white but the explanatory significance of colour, and associated terminologies of race, racism and whiteness, remain both open to debate and in needs of location in specific historical and cultural contexts. In the United States, as Paul J. Ramsey's paper demonstrates, the weakness of the central state, and the rhetorical invocation of the

²¹ For analysis that locates this process at the centre of British state formation and which identifies domestic colonialism, see Mary J. Hickman, 'The Impact of Britain's Historical Legacy on the Contemporary Ethno-Racial Regime' in G Loury, T Modood and S Teles (eds), *Ethnicity, Social Mobility and Public Policy. Comparing the US and UK*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

²² McLeod, J., & Paisley, F. (2016). The Modernization of Colonialism and the Educability of the "Native": Transpacific Knowledge Networks and Education in the Interwar Years. *History of Education Quarterly*, 56(3), 473-502; Lake, M. & Reynolds, H., *Drawing the global colour line: white men's countries and the international challenge of racial equality*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge; Helen Proctor, (forthcoming) History-writing, migration and colonialism. Nicole Anae " 'Among the Boer Children': Australian women teachers in South African concentration camp schools, 1901-1904" *History of Education Review* 2016 45:1 , 28-53; Shirleene Robinson and Simon Sleight (eds) *Children, Childhood and Youth in the British World* (London, Palgrave Macmillan, 2016); Emmanuelle Saada. *Empire's Children: Race, Filiation, and Citizenship in the French Colonies*. Trans. Arthur Goldhammer. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012. Ellen Boucher. *Empire's Children: Child Emigrants, Welfare, and the Decline of the British World, 1869-1967*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

²³ On the significance of imperial memory for decolonising cultures in Britain and Europe see, for example, Bill Schwarz: *Memories of Empire, Volume I. The White Man's World*. Oxford 2011 Kalypto Nicolaidis, Berny Sèbe, and Gabrielle Maas (eds.): *Echoes of Empire. Memory, Identity and Colonial Legacies*. London 2015. The continued significance of the bussing debate is also explored in Brett Bebbler, "We Were Just Unwanted": Bussing, Migrant Dispersal, and South Asians in London *Journal of Social History*, 48, 3, Spring 2015, pp. 635-661.

nation of immigrants, created an educational space for the construction of ethnic memories that were, more or less explicitly, white.

The polyglot Russian empire of Peter the Great was a patchwork of local patriotisms with distinctive patterns of cultural and religious belief across vast expanses of land. Its transformation to a nation state was, too, partly stimulated by migration and by the encounter with Napoleon's armies that mobilised the Russian peasantry in defence of a more sharply delineated Russia. This emergence of an exclusive nationalist sentiment in the 19th century posed a series of dilemmas for ruling elites with important consequences for the provision of education. Vladislav Rjeoutski's paper documents some of these dilemmas in his analysis of the employment of western European teachers in the upper class colleges of Moscow and St Petersburg, during the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. These travelling teachers, the majority of whom were German speakers, and some of whom were recruited directly by government authorities, are a good example of Hoerder's strategic migrants. International traders in the strategic linguistic skills required for imperial programs of modernisation and westernisation, the teachers movement and employment underpins Rjeoutski's analysis of the cultural significance of 'national' and 'international' languages during a period of immense social and political change. In the elite schools of Moscow and St Petersburg, and in the expanding nobility of the Russian Empire—including the newly appropriated nobility of the conquered Baltic states—language repertoires facilitated ruling class communication in a multi-ethnic empire and entrée to European expertise. They also mediated social, occupational and cultural hierarchies that reinforced some social distinctions (class) but cut across others (religion). Later in the period decisions about 'foreign' or Russian language use in educational institutions—and the national identification of teachers— became the focus of nativist, nationalist reform movements.

III

Assimilationist narratives may accurately reflect the ideology of nation states but they have a persistent tendency to exclude or marginalise the agency of groups and communities that either opposed or reworked the aims of early state schools. Migrant groups sometimes developed parallel educational institutions that sought to maintain cultural traditions. Private education often constituted a particularly salient alternative to the assimilationist state schools. Migrants in Australia, Latin America, and the United States, for instance, established a number of Catholic, Old Lutheran, Hebrew, and "ethnic" schools to maintain their religious and/or cultural

1
2
3 customs.²⁴ In the United States, the famed Irish author Mary Anne Sadlier rejected the pan-
4 Protestant assimilationist agenda of the public schools, stating in the 1850s, “The [educational]
5 evil became, finally, so great, that no alternative was left for Catholic parents, but, either to
6 prevent their children from attending the Schools at all, or to cause an entire change to be made
7 in the system.”²⁵ Irish migrants did both. Many Irish parents kept their children out of the
8 public schools and, simultaneously, worked to create a parallel educational system, particularly
9 after the U.S. Catholic Church’s Third Plenary Council in 1884. The council decreed “[t]hat near
10 every church a parish school . . . is to be built and maintained” and “[t]hat all Catholic parents
11 should be bound to send their children to the parish school.”²⁶
12
13
14
15
16

17 In addition to parochial and private schools, migrants sometimes opposed the assimilationist
18 aims by advocating for their cultural traditions to be included in state school curriculum,
19 particularly in nations without a centralized system of education, such as Argentina, Mexico, and
20 the United States. In developing areas of the United States, especially west of the original
21 colonies, Norwegian, Swedish, and German migrants developed local public schools that aimed
22 to maintain linguistic, religious, and cultural traditions. As Paul J. Ramsey explains in his paper
23 in this collection, the liberal German Forty-eighters were particularly successful at maintaining
24 their ethnic identity by establishing public bilingual schools in Cincinnati (as well as in
25 Cleveland, Indianapolis, Milwaukee, and numerous small towns). In 1886, for instance, the
26 German Department in Cincinnati, which offered a half-German half-English curriculum and
27 served over 18,000 students, noted that dual-language instruction was “better for the
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39

40
41 ²⁴ Thomas A. O’Donoghue. (2001) *Upholding the Faith: The Process of Education in Catholic Schools in*
42 *Australia, 1922-65* (New York: Peter Lang); Remy Low. (2014). ‘A genealogy of the religious versus secular
43 schooling debate in New South Wales (Part II): populism and patriotism’. *Journal of Religious Education*, 62, 53-
44 64; Paul J. Ramsey, *Bilingual Public Schooling in the United States: A History of America’s “Polyglot*
45 *Boardinghouse”* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 18-34; James W. Fraser, *Between Church and State:*
46 *Religion and Public Education in a Multicultural America* (New York: St. Martin’s Griffin, 2000), 49-65; Stephan
47 F. Brumberg, *Going to America, Going to School: The Jewish Immigrant Public School Encounter in Turn-of-the-*
48 *Century New York City* (New York: Praeger, 1986), 64-69; Spalding, Jr., “Education in Argentina, 1890-1914,”
49 42-44; Eileen H. Tamura, “The English-Only Effort, the Anti-Japanese Campaign, and Language Acquisition in
50 the Education of Japanese Americans in Hawaii, 1915-40,” *History of Education Quarterly* 33, no. 1 (1993): 37-
51 58; Adolf Douai and John Straubenmueller, “German Schools in the United States,” in *The Bilingual School in*
52 *the United States: A Documentary History*, ed. Paul J. Ramsey (Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing,
53 2012), 9-10; Ramsey, “Education and Migration,” forthcoming.
54 ²⁵ Mrs. James Sadlier, *The Blakes and Flanagans: A Tale Illustrative of Irish Life in the United States* (New York:
55 P.J. Kenedy and Sons, 1858), 250, 255; Nasaw, *Schooled to Order*, 69-79.
56 ²⁶ “Third Plenary Council of Baltimore, 1884,” in *The School in the United States: A Documentary History*, ed.
57 James W. Fraser (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2001), 145; Lloyd P. Jorgenson, *The State and the Non-Public School,*
58 *1825-1925* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1987), 70-136; Fraser, *Between Church and State*, 57-65.
59
60

intellectual development of our pupils” than the standard monolingual, assimilationist course of study in the U.S.²⁷

Yet the capacity of migrants to affect the provision and practices of schools was conditioned both by local circumstances and by existing ideologies that attributed migrants with different properties and identities. It is significant, for example, that it was German language instruction and schooling that was sustained for generations both within and outside areas of original settler colonies. German migrants, possibly because of their assumed racial relationship with white settlers, acquired a sort of elevated status in the U.S. and, as a result, were able to embed and sustain cultural traditions within state schools. The same cannot be said, or not to the same extent at least, of the non-European migrants and their children who arrived at roughly the same historical period, notably the Chinese immigrants²⁸.

Perhaps some of the most salient examples of the intersection of race/ethnicity and “mis-education”—as historian Carter G. Woodson has called it—were those of African Americans and indigenous peoples, who were often forced internal migrants. These groups, deemed inferior by the racial and ethnic stereotypes developed in the West and actively promoted by settler communities, were often forced into segregated schools that imposed a rabid form of assimilation upon them. African Americans, who had forcibly been moved during the colonial era, attended schools that prepared them for a second-class citizenship. Indigenous children, who were regularly forced to migrate as colonizers claimed their ancestral lands, encountered a form of schooling that focused on total assimilation. To minimize parental influences, native children in Australia, Canada, and the United States were taken from their families in order to attend boarding schools, which emphasized subordination and Western “civilization.” In the United States, the goal, as historian David Wallace Adams has argued, was cultural “extinction,” while Australia also pursued a form of biological extermination through its genetic “absorption” policies.²⁹

²⁷ Newland, “The Estado Docente and its Expansion,” 457-458; Paul J. Ramsey, “In the Region of Babel: Public Bilingual Schooling in the Midwest, 1840s-1880s,” *History of Education Quarterly* 49, no. 3 (2009): 267-290; Common Schools of Cincinnati, “Annual Report,” in *The Bilingual School in the United States*, 19-21; Ramsey, “Education and Migration,” forthcoming.

²⁸ Victor Low, *The Unimpressible Race: A Century of Educational Struggle by the Chinese in San Francisco* (San Francisco: East/West Publishing Company, Inc., 1982), 6-37, 54-84; Ronald Takaki, *Strangers from a Different Shore: A History of Asian Americans* (Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1989), 79-131.

²⁹ Woodson, Carter Godwin (1990). *The Mis-education of the Negro*. Trenton, N.J: Africa World Press. James D. Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South, 1860-1935* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988), 33-78; Ramsey, *Bilingual Public Schooling in the United States*, 77-94; Katherine Ellinghaus, “Assimilation and Absorption in the United States and Australia,” *Pacific Historical Review* 75, no. 4 (2006): 563-585; Mark Francis, “The ‘Civilizing’ of Indigenous People in Nineteenth-Century Canada,” *Journal of World History* 9, no. 1 (1998): 51-87; David Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction: American Indians and the*

In attempting to trace responses to state sponsored programmes of assimilation some historians of education have focused on the provision of parallel or alternative forms of schooling designed to keep cultural or ethnic traditions, or race identities, alive. This strand of work has arguably been strongest in the United States where a national identity formed around idea of a ‘nation of immigrants’, and the particular history of plantation slavery and racism, created a material and symbolic space for alternative forms of schooling. Yet for countries where a flat denial of migrant histories has been the norm (Germany and Switzerland may be apposite examples), and for those that “show limited interest in migrants once they have become citizens” (such as Argentina, Brazil and France that), this body of work is much more patchy.³⁰

This is one reason to particularly welcome the paper by Alberto Barausse and Terciane Luchese published in this collection. It focuses on the use of ethnic Italian schools in the Brazilian state of Rio Grande do Sul as tools of post-unification Italian nationalist foreign policy in the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The policy to promote Italianità or Italianness, was enacted by Italian consular officers, supported by Italian societies and associations in Brazil, and aimed at the children of the large number of economic migrants who had sailed to Brazil in the nineteenth century. Through the supply of objects such as flags and royal portraits, and the invention of a new calendar of patriotic commemoration, the children in Italian schools were encouraged to think of themselves as Italian, rather than Venetian, Friulian or Lombardian (for example) and to learn the national Italian dialect in place of the regional languages of their family heritage. The patriotic routines and rituals of the schools are theorised by the authors as “memory practices”, intended to influence identity formation and thereby create a culturally cohesive diaspora sympathetic to Italian national interests.

The early form of diaspora governance identified by Barausse and Luchese suggests, at the very least, that the claims of social scientists regarding the novelty of state-diaspora relations are in need of modification.³¹ State governance was already extra territorial by the late-nineteenth century but it is also clear that it had to work through and with civil society organisations that had their own distinctive resources and interests. These organisations appear to have been

Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928 (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1995), 28-59. Haebich, Anna. 2000, *Broken Circles: Fragmenting Indigenous families 1800-2000*, Fremantle Arts Centre Press, Fremantle. Beth Marsden (2018 in press) *The system of compulsory education is failing’: Assimilation, mobility and Aboriginal students in Victorian State schools, 1961-1968* *History of Education Review* 47:2.

³⁰ Donna R. Gabaccia, “Is Everywhere Nowhere?: Nomads, Nations, and the Immigrant Paradigm of the United States,” in *Race and Immigration in the United States: New Histories*, ed. Paul Spickard (New York: Routledge, 2012), 30-52; Eigenmann, Philipp (2015). *Schooling for two futures: Italian Associations on the Education of Italian Children in Switzerland (1960-1980)*. *History of Education Researcher*, 96:55-63;

³¹ N. Sigona, A. Gamlen, G. Liberatore and H. Neveu Kringelbach (eds) *Diasporas Reimagined: Spaces, Practices and Belonging*, Oxford Diasporas Programme, Oxford, 2015

important mediators of Italian national identities and their ability to inflect or invert the intended messages of memory practices remains an open question that, at this distance and with these sources, is difficult to answer. The personal and psychological aspects of identification are, as we shall see in the next section, elusive but suggestive possibilities for historians of education. Yet what this research does achieve is to challenge a conventional trope that characterises the experience of international migration as dominated by a two-way struggle between the authentic national cultures of home and destination. Instead, as well as having their own interests and motivations, migrants have often been the subject of competing educational projects that have variously sought to erase, accommodate or remember migrant origins. One legacy of these contested processes is a wide array of cultural resources which can be deployed in unpredictable ways over long stretches of time. The existence of schools and curricula, the introduction or the persistence of languages, memories, sport and a wide range of artefacts are one of the reasons why it is difficult, and sometimes plainly inadequate, to confidently identify processes of assimilation or ethnic fade for migrant groups. Instead, these resources might be considered a rich vein of documentary, visual and material evidence of the educational work involved in the construction and negotiation of symbolic boundaries. They help open up for analysis the processes by which cross cultural migrants, who might be internal or international, access, eschew or are excluded from national communities.³² Finally, they have the potential to illuminate how migrant experiences, or constructing, distributing and mobilising the memory of them, could inform educational and political projects for social change.³³

That process of analysis may, paradoxically, have been delayed by the fact that migrant histories are widely associated with traditions of scholarship that have sought to democratise historical knowledge. Rediscovering the histories of migrants, especially those attributed ethnic minority status, helped to give this work a distinctive ethos of 'democratic inclusiveness'. Identifying and recovering the agency and voice of marginalised people was often presented as part of a diverse but broadly democratic, often egalitarian, political movement in which the ethical, didactic and

³² See, for example, the discussion on the limitations of ethnic fade and the idiom of diaspora in Rogers Brubaker (2005), 'The "diaspora" diaspora', *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 28:1, 1-19. Sophie Rudolph (2018) To "uplift the Aborigine" or to "uphold" Aboriginal dignity and pride? Indigenous educational debates in 1960s Australia, *Paedagogica Historica*, DOI: 10.1080/00309230.2018.1472112

³³ Jessica Gerrard, *Radical childhoods: schooling and the struggle for social change*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014; Kevin Myers, *Struggles for a Past: Migrants and their histories, 1951-2000*. (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015); Ian Grosvenor & Kevin Myers (2017) Questioning difference: bodies, (re-)presentation, and the development of "multicultural Britain", *Paedagogica Historica*, 53:6, 730-750, DOI: 10.1080/00309230.2017.1349157

political functions of historical representation feature prominently.³⁴ Inserting immigrants and minorities into national narratives was, for example, seen as tools for the promotion of new social identities, and new ways of being citizens, in many societies across the globe.³⁵ While there is no doubt that such work was important empirically, methodologically and didactically, it remains firmly within the framework of the nation state, rarely critically engages with processes of education and learning and often ended up falling victim to celebratory histories where the historical exploration of particular locations or experiences obscured points of commonality and difference with other regions of the world. In short, and in this work, the epistemological certainties of the nation remained intact and its consolidated narratives, with or without migrants, are not so much challenged as reproduced.³⁶

IV

Immigration history, and the closely associated studies of ethnic minority histories, sought to promote more inclusive and distinctively accessible accounts of the past. They were, therefore, also often characterised by a degree of methodological innovation. Official sources were increasingly regarded as suspect, historians aware of their elisions and agendas, and conscious of the need to ‘read against the grain’. One response was to offer the voices of migrants and ethnic minorities, presented in the form of both autobiographical testimony and oral histories, as a means of supplementing or opposing national histories. Authentic voices, on television and radio, in museums and latterly in multiple digital forms, became popular as mechanisms for telling the story of migration and for understanding contemporary social relations. The consequences of this autobiographical turn in the public sphere is a topic that awaits sustained and critical attention. Some scholars have argued that testimonies of individual migrants, almost

³⁴ Geoff Eley, *A Crooked Line: From Cultural History to the History of Society* (Ann. Arbor, Mich: University of Michigan, 2005)

³⁵ Accounts of curricula change and textbook revision have been particularly rich topics for historians of education. See, for example, Christiane Hintermann and Christina Johansson (eds), *Migration and Memory: Representations of Migration in Europe since 1960* (Innsbruck: Studienverlag, 2010) and, for a summary of research patterns, Eckhardt Fuchs, (2011), “Current trends in history and social studies textbook research”, *Journal of International Cooperation in Education* 14:2, 17-34

³⁶ A timely review of European practices notes that notions of interculturalism are becoming widespread in compulsory schooling but ‘current policies and practices seldom address deep political roots’. See Pier-Luc Dupont ‘Theorising the (de)construction of ethnic stigma in compulsory education’, University of Oxford: Centre on Migration Policy and Society Working Paper No.132. <https://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/media/WP-2016-132-DuPont-Ethnic-Stigma.pdf>

always offered as representative of particular ethnic minority groups, risk becoming bland and scripted.³⁷

A critical version of autobiographical practice has, of course, been evident for some time in some historical and sociological studies and in pedagogical theory and practice too.³⁸ Autobiographical memory and voice have been widely regarded as important pedagogical tools that could be excavated in the pursuit of both functional skills (such as reading and writing) and the positive personal dispositions that have come to be widely regarded as the foundation for the healthy development and psychological well-being of individuals. Ego histories have accumulated in a variety of formats and media ranging across family genealogies, autobiographies, oral histories, courtroom and official testimony, documentary and feature film to poetry and prose novels, and a whole range of performative genres ranging from visual arts to dance and song.³⁹ In what some scholars have called the age of testimony migrants, including those forcibly removed from families, homes. Communities and nations, are amongst those actively engaged in historical storytelling.⁴⁰ The papers from Olivier Esteves and Pia Pannula Toft, Merja Paksuniemi and Johannes Westberg, both examining episodes in twentieth century migration, are partially located in this testimonial milieu. They address issues of private and public memories and are indicative of research approaches that combine political with affective accounts of traumatic migrant experience at the intersection of the personal and the social.

Drawing together diverse sources including oral history interviews, policy texts and anti-bussing activist archives, Esteves's paper in this collection documents the contested policy of the forced "dispersal" or "bussing" of the school-aged children of "New Commonwealth" migrants in English cities during the 1960s and 1970s, whereby young immigrant children were taken from suburbs that were categorised as having "concentrations" of immigrant populations

³⁷ Jennifer Jensen Wallach, Building a Bridge Of Words: The Literary Autobiography as Historical Source Material. *Biography*, 29, 3, Summer 2006, pp. 446-461; Kevin Myers; 'Historical Practice in the Age of Pluralism: Educating and Celebrating identities' in P. Panayi and K. Burrell (eds.) *Histories and Memories: Immigrants and their History in Britain since 1800* (I.B. Tauris, 2006), pp.35-53; Tony Kushner, Selling racism: history, heritage, gender and the (re)production of prejudice. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 33, 4 (1999), 67-86.

³⁸ Ben Rogaly (2015) Disrupting migration stories: reading life histories through the lens of mobility and fixity. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 33 (3). pp. 528-544 Naomi Norquay (1990) 'Life History Research: memory, schooling and social difference', *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 20:3, 291-300, DOI: 10.1080/ Tom Woodin " 'Chuck out the teacher': radical pedagogy in the community" *International Journal of Lifelong Education* . 26, 1, 2007; Mahoney, M. A., & Yngvesson, B. (1992). The construction of subjectivity and the paradox of resistance: Reintegrating feminist anthropology and psychology. *Signs*, 18(1), 44

³⁹ Ian Grosvenor & Kevin Myers (2017) Questioning difference: bodies, (re-)presentation, and the development of "multicultural Britain", *Paedagogica Historica*, 53:6, 730-750, DOI: 10.1080/00309230.2017.1349157. Stuart Hall and Mark Sealy, *Different. A Historical Context* (London: Phaidon, 2001).

⁴⁰ Bain Attwood, 'In the Age of Testimony: The Stolen Generations Narrative, "Distance," and Public History' *Public Culture* (2008) 20 : 1 p.75 – 95; Christine Nicholls (2010) 'Embodying Affect: The Stolen Generations, the History Wars and Poles Apart by Indigenous New Media Artist r e a', Information Visualisation (IV), 2010 14th International Conference, p.415 - 421

to majority white areas for their daily schooling. The ostensible purpose was to avoid “social strain” and promote “integration”—and to facilitate English language proficiency, but Eteves argues that for the British Education Department of the 1960s, “immigrant children” [embodied] a public policy problem to be solved from the vantage point of a national British / English culture’. The children affected appear to have been from non-Anglophone south Asian families but the detailed operation of policy in different local boroughs is a topic that awaits its historian. That the policy was racist in intention and effect was argued by a broad range of critics at the time, some of whom mounted challenges under new anti-racial discrimination legislation. Esteves’ paper draws attention to important connections between racism, migration and colonialism in the case of Britain. In reporting the recollections of people who were subject to the policy as children, the paper also raises questions about the longer term effects of racist violence (verbal, physical and/ or symbolic), as some interviewees explained that they were reconsidering their interpretation of their experiences in the 1960s and 1970s in the light of the debates about nation and entitlement that were part of the anti-European Union campaigns in Britain and the election of President Trump in the United States.

The paper by Pia Pannula Toft, Merja Paksuniemi and Johannes Westberg reports an interviewing study of the Finnebørn (Sotalapset in Finnish), young Finnish children evacuated to Denmark during the Finnish territorial wars of 1939 to 1945. The paper compares two moments of dislocation: the first when the children arrived in Denmark and the second when they were returned to Finland. The authors find that the first transition was in some ways easier because the children were recognised to be vulnerable. Difficulties for the returning children included the loss of Finnish language skills and of family attachment. Moreover, in a country devastated by years of bitter fighting there was limited sympathy for the children who had been spared. In both instances, however, argue the authors, schools were significant institutions and schoolteachers significant individuals in moderating the experience. Among the notable features of this paper is its use of historical data to explore and illuminate psychological processes and consequences of migration. Its model of subjectivity appears quite different to the Foucauldian inspired self that has been influential among historians of education. The psychological construct resilience is explicitly utilised and the whole paper implicitly addresses the psychological processes through which history is lived by individuals who are capable of locating themselves in sociohistorical processes and reflecting on and reworking constructions of that process.⁴¹ Here, the interviewees’ interpretations of their wartime experiences functions not simple as only an episode in the past but also a formative experience with lifelong

⁴¹ Kevin Myers and Ian Grosvenor, Cultural learning and historical memory: A research agenda *Encounters/Encuentros/Rencontres on Education* Vol. 15, 2014, 3-21

significance for psychological health. These oral accounts, often characterised by their engagement with the feelings and emotions of the individual, and located within therapeutic or pedagogical settings, have frequently been overlooked or marginalised by historians trained to be distrustful of the universal claims of psychology and wary of its record of cultural conservatism. Yet there are many different ways of telling the stories of the past and, because psychological ideas or frameworks have been an illuminating presence in the analysis of migration history, it may be wise to reconsider their utility for the study of educational practices and processes.⁴²

This review article has sketched some possible themes for a mobile history of education in which movement, of people, ideas and artefacts, might become central to new histories and historiographies. It is a research agenda that might beneficially start from 'the bottom up', from the educational histories and experiences of migrants themselves and with the distinctive forms of agency they deployed in negotiating new cultural spaces. These practices, the forms of memory they invoked and constructed, the technologies they deployed and mediated, the forms of civil, religious and associational life they gave rise to, remain major topics for investigation. They also have much to reveal about changing practices of the self in the informal spaces of education that still do not feature prominently in the history of education. These practices matter not only because they stimulated the foundation of schools for distinct ethnic or cultural groups but, more fundamentally, because they underpinned the processes of subjectification and belonging.⁴³ The educational histories and experiences of migrants and their descendants, how they interacted with race and faith, with gender and sexuality and with class and economics, were a key part in both the construction and experience of difference. That sense of difference, which could be constructed through the process of cultural learning, and attributed, through official policy, was an often intangible but crucial symbolic presence, not just for individuals or groups, but for states and societies too. Identifying difference thus has much to tell us about educational inequalities both in the past and in the present.

⁴² See, for example, Elliot West, *Growing Up with the Country: Childhood on the Far Western Frontier* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1989).

⁴³ McLeod, Julie (2018) 'Belonging as pedagogical, practical and political', in C. Halse (ed) *Interrogating Belonging of Young People in Schools*, Palgrave, London, 367–380; Savage, M. (2008). "Histories, belongings, communities." *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 11(2): 151-162.; Nira Yuval-Davis, (2000). *The politics of belonging: Intersectional contestations*. Los Angeles & London: Sage.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

For Peer Review Only