

# Dysbiotic subgingival microbial communities in periodontally healthy patients with rheumatoid arthritis

Lopez-Oliva, Isabel; Paropkari, Akshay D; Saraswat, Shweta; Serban, Stefan; Yonel, Zehra; Sharma, Praveen; de Pablo, Paola; Raza, Karim; Filer, Andrew; Chapple, Iain; Dietrich, Thomas; Grant, Melissa M; Kumar, Purnima S

DOI:  
[10.1002/art.40485](https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40485)

License:  
Other (please specify with Rights Statement)

*Document Version*  
Peer reviewed version

*Citation for published version (Harvard):*  
Lopez-Oliva, I, Paropkari, AD, Saraswat, S, Serban, S, Yonel, Z, Sharma, P, de Pablo, P, Raza, K, Filer, A, Chapple, I, Dietrich, T, Grant, MM & Kumar, PS 2018, 'Dysbiotic subgingival microbial communities in periodontally healthy patients with rheumatoid arthritis', *Arthritis and Rheumatology*, vol. 70, no. 7, pp. 1008-1013. <https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40485>

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](#)

## **Publisher Rights Statement:**

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article: Lopez-Oliva, I., Paropkari, A.D., Saraswat, S., Serban, S., Yonel, Z., Sharma, P., de Pablo, P., Raza, K., Filer, A., Chapple, I., Dietrich, T., Grant, M.M. and Kumar, P.S. (2018), Dysbiotic Subgingival Microbial Communities in Periodontally Healthy Patients With Rheumatoid Arthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol*, 70: 1008-1013. doi:10.1002/art.40485., which has been published in final form at: <https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40485>. This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with Wiley Terms and Conditions for Self-Archiving.

## **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

## **Take down policy**

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact [UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk](mailto:UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk) providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

1 **Title:** Dysbiotic subgingival microbial communities in periodontally healthy patients  
2 with rheumatoid arthritis

3  
4 **Authors:** Isabel Lopez-Oliva <sup>1\*</sup> B.D.S

5 Akshay D. Paropkari<sup>2\*</sup>, M.S

6 Shweta Saraswat<sup>2</sup>, B.D.S

7 Stefan Serban<sup>1</sup>,

8 Zehra Yonel<sup>1</sup>,

9 Praveen Sharma<sup>1</sup>, B.D.S

10 Paola de Pablo<sup>3,4</sup>,

11 Karim Raza<sup>3,4</sup>,

12 Andrew Filer<sup>3</sup>,

13 Iain Chapple<sup>1</sup>, B.D.S, PhD

14 Thomas Dietrich<sup>1</sup>, B.D.S, PhD

15 Melissa Grant<sup>1</sup>, PhD

16 Purnima S. Kumar<sup>2</sup> B.D.S, M.S, PhD

17  
18 **\*Co-first authors**

19  
20 **Affiliations:**

21 <sup>1</sup> Periodontal Research Group, School of Dentistry, Institute of Clinical Sciences, The  
22 University of Birmingham, and Birmingham Dental Hospital (Birmingham Community  
23 Healthcare Trust), 5 Mill Pool Way, Edgbaston, Birmingham, B5 7EG, UK

24 <sup>2</sup>Division of Periodontology, College of Dentistry, The Ohio State University,  
25 Columbus, Ohio, USA

26 <sup>3</sup>Rheumatology Research Group, Institute of Inflammation and Ageing, College of  
27 Medical & Dental Sciences, The University of Birmingham (UK)

28 <sup>4</sup>Department of Rheumatology, Sandwell and West Birmingham Hospital NHS Trust,  
29 Birmingham, UK

30  
31  
32 **Corresponding author:**

33 Purnima Kumar

34 4111, Postle Hall

35 305 W 12<sup>th</sup> Avenue

36 Columbus, Ohio 43210

37  
38 **KEY WORDS:** Rheumatoid arthritis, periodontitis, DNA Sequence Analysis, oral  
39 microbiome

40  
41 **Word count:** 1,493

42

1 **Abstract**

2

3 **Objectives**

4 Studies that demonstrate an association between rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and  
5 dysbiotic oral microbiomes are often confounded by the presence of extensive  
6 periodontitis in these individuals. Therefore, the present investigation sought to  
7 investigate the role of RA in modulating the periodontal microbiome by comparing  
8 periodontally healthy individuals with and without RA.

9 **Methods**

10 Subgingival plaque was collected from was collected periodontally healthy individuals  
11 (22 with and 19 without RA), and 16S gene sequenced on the Illumina MiSeq  
12 platform. Bacterial biodiversity and co-occurrence patterns were examined using the  
13 QIIME and PhyloToAST pipelines.

14 **Results**

15 The subgingival microbiomes differed significantly based on both community  
16 membership and as well as the abundance of lineages, with 41.9% of the community  
17 differing in abundance and 19% in membership. In contrast to the sparse and  
18 predominantly congeneric co-occurrence networks seen in controls, RA subjects  
19 revealed a highly connected grid containing a large inter-generic hub anchored by  
20 known periodontal pathogens. Predictive metagenomic analysis (PICRUSt)  
21 demonstrated that arachidonic acid and ester lipid metabolism pathways might partly  
22 explain the robustness of this clustering. As expected from a periodontally healthy  
23 cohort, *Porphyromonas gingivalis* and *Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans* were  
24 not significantly different between groups, however, *Cryptobacterium curtum*, another  
25 organism capable of producing large amounts of citrulline, emerged as a robust  
26 discriminant of the microbiome in individuals with RA.

27 **Conclusions**

28 Our data demonstrates that the oral microbiome in RA is enriched for inflammophilic  
29 and citrulline producing organisms, which may play a role in the production of  
30 autoantigenic citrullinated peptides in RA.

31

32

33

34

1 **INTRODUCTION**

2 Rheumatoid arthritis (RA) has been associated with periodontal disease (PD),  
3 a bacterially initiated chronic inflammation that leads to destruction of tooth-  
4 supporting tissues<sup>1</sup>. Although PD and RA share similar inflammatory pathways as  
5 well as genetic and environmental risk factors, these are insufficient to explain this  
6 connection<sup>1</sup>.

7 While the cause of RA remains unknown, it has been hypothesized that oral  
8 microbiota<sup>2,3</sup> in particular the periodontal pathogens *Porphyromonas gingivalis* and  
9 *Aggregatibacter actinomycetemcomitans*, may play a critical role in its  
10 pathogenesis<sup>4,5</sup>

11 Studies using next generation sequencing methods demonstrate the oral  
12 microbiome is altered in RA<sup>6,7</sup>. However, the majority of these studies included  
13 individuals with moderate to severe periodontitis<sup>7</sup> or individuals whose periodontal  
14 health status was not established<sup>6</sup>. Periodontitis, by itself, is a significant modifier of  
15 the oral microbiome<sup>8</sup>, making it difficult to dissect the relative contributions of  
16 periodontitis and RA to the microbial dysbiosis.

17 Given the potential role of oral bacteria may play in the etiopathogenesis of  
18 RA, we set out to characterize the periodontal microbiome in periodontally healthy  
19 individuals with and without RA, using next generation sequencing.  
20

21  
22 **METHODS**

23  
24 The study sample included patients with RA and non-RA controls. All participants  
25 were periodontally healthy. Subgingival plaque samples were collected and analyzed  
26 using 16S rDNA sequencing. Detailed methods are described in supplementary  
27 information. The sequences are deposited in the Sequence Read Archive of NCBI  
28 (project number: PRJNA391575).  
29

30 **RESULTS**

31 We examined 22 patients with RA and 19 non-RA controls. There was a statistically  
32 significant but clinically inconsequential difference between groups in periodontal  
33 measures, in particular PPD and CAL (Table 1). Principal Coordinate Analysis  
34 (PCoA) of both unweighted and weighted UniFrac distances demonstrated significant  
35 clustering of the microbiomes based on RA status (Figure 1, p=0.001, Adonis test),  
36 indicating that these groups differed both in presence or absence of lineages  
37 (community membership), as well as in the relative abundances of lineages within  
38 communities (community structure).  
39

40  
41 Table 1: Clinical and demographic characteristics in periodontally healthy subjects  
42 with rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and without RA (non-RA). Data represented as mean  
43 (25, 75 percentile) for ordinal data and percentage for categorical data. P values are  
44 calculated using Mann-Whitney test for ordinal data and Fisher's test for categorical  
45 data and significant differences (p<0.05) indicated with an asterisk (\*).  
46 Abbreviations: BMI, body mass index; PPD probing pocket depth; BoP, bleeding on  
47 probing; CAL, clinical attachment loss; ESR, erythrocyte sedimentation rate; VAS,  
48 visual analogue scale for patients global assessment of disease activity; DAS,  
49 disease activity score

	RA n=22	Non-RA n=19
Age in years, mean (IQR)	60 (54.1, 63.4)*	36 (32.9, 41.6)
Gender (% Male)	23	32
<b>Ethnicity (%)</b>		
White	95	89

Asian	5	11
Smoking history (%)		
Never	62	90
Former	29	5
Current	9	5
Alcohol consumption (%)		
Never	11	14
1-4 times/month	73	45
1-4 times/week	16	41
Clinical periodontal characteristics		
PPD in mm, mean (IQR)	2.3 (2.2, 2.4)*	1.6 (1.5, 1.7)
Number of sites with PPD>4mm	1.2 (0, 2)	0.9 (0,3)
Number of sites with BoP, mean (IQR)	6 (0, 19)	4 (1, 16)
Gingival recession in mm, mean (IQR)	0.28 (0.01, 0.26)*	0.13 (0.04, 0.2)
Measures of RA severity		
ESR	8 (8.7, 21.7)	
VAS (global assessment of disease activity)	41 (31.7, 58.5)	
DAS28	3.4 (2.7, 3.9)	

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

Since patients with RA differed from controls in both community membership and structure, we identified species level operational taxonomic units (s-OTUs) that contributed to this difference using an increasingly granular top-down approach. Patients with RA presented had greater abundances of obligate anaerobes (both gram-positive and gram-negative) while facultatives (especially gram-negative) were identified in greater abundance in non-RA controls ( $p < 0.05$  Wilcoxon signed rank test, Figure 1).

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

We then used DESeq2<sup>9</sup> to identify differentially abundant OTUs; with p-values  $< 0.05$  after adjusting for multiple testing, and Fisher's exact test to examine the frequency of detection. We identified 558 OTUs from 3,963,291 classifiable sequences (mean of 107115 sequences per sample, range 69626-182993). Rarefaction curves demonstrated that all samples approached saturation or had plateaued. 229 OTUs (41.9% of the community) differed significantly in structure and 105 OTUs (19%) differed significantly in membership between groups (Figure 1 and supplementary table 1). Certain species were significantly more abundant in patients with RA, including those belonging to the genera *Actinomyces* (odds ratios (OR) varying from 4-9 for each species within the genus), *Cryptobacterium* (OR=36), *Dialister*, *Desulfovibrio* (ORs of 4 and 26), *Fretibacterium* (OR 9 to 12), *Leptotrichia* (OR 7 to 26) *Prevotella* (OR 0.04 to 6), *Selenomonas* (OR 0 to 7), *Treponema* (OR 0 to 7), and *Veillonellaceae [G1]* (OR 0 to 6).

24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30

In contrast, several species belonging to the genera *Aggregatibacter*, *Gemella*, *Granulicatella*, *Hemophilus*, *Neisseria* and *Streptococci* not only demonstrated lower abundances but also were less frequently detected in RA. These significantly abundant species accounted for a median of 28% (range 12-82%) of each individual's microbiome in patients with RA, indicating that these differences are not attributable to the rare biosphere.

31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38

Since the subgingival microbiome is known to be significantly heterogeneous among individuals<sup>10</sup>, we used the core microbiome (suite of species identified in  $\geq 80\%$  of subjects) to compare stable associations between groups. 326 OTUs were identified in the core microbiome of all study participants and 364 in patients with RA. 27.7% of the community (101 OTUs) differed significantly in structure and 10.9% (40 OTUs) in membership, with 38 species unique to the RA core microbiome (Figure 1). Importantly, 157 of the 229 species identified above belonged to the core microbiome.

1  
2 Sparse, congeneric networks were observed in non-RA controls (Figure 2). On the  
3 other hand, the network topology of individuals with RA revealed a highly connected  
4 grid with a robust intergeneric hub. 83 of the 157 core species were incorporated in  
5 this hub, further reinforcing our observation that in subjects with RA, the environment  
6 imposes a selection drive. Importantly, known pathogenic species belonging to  
7 *Treponema*, *Selenomonas*, *Filifactor*, *Campylobacter* and *Fretibacterium* were tightly  
8 interwoven into this hub, and 12 gram-negative species were identified as network  
9 anchors. Interestingly, species traditionally associated with RA, for example,  
10 *P.gingivalis* (*Pg*) and *A.actinomycetemcomitans* (*Aa*), were not part of the network  
11 cluster.

12  
13 Since there is little literature-based information to provide insights into the biological  
14 basis for this tight clustering, we combined predictive metagenomic analysis  
15 (PICRUSt<sup>11</sup>) with network graph theory and core microbiome analysis to explore if  
16 shared functionality could explain co-occurrence (Figure 2). Bacterial arachidonic  
17 acid and ether lipid metabolism genes exhibited the greatest betweenness centrality  
18 (reflecting the amount of control that these node exerts over the interactions of other  
19 nodes in the network<sup>12</sup>), and the highest degree centrality (an indication that they are  
20 the central focal point of the structure).

## 21 22 **DISCUSSION**

23 Gram-negative anaerobes are known to play important roles in initiating periodontitis,  
24 and emerging evidence also implicates them in the etiopathogenesis of RA<sup>6,13</sup>. Our  
25 results show that even in periodontally healthy RA patients, gram-negative  
26 anaerobes are significantly more abundant in RA, consistent with a dysbiotic state.  
27 Such a status might indicate a pre-clinical phase of periodontitis. As expected from a  
28 periodontally healthy adult cohort, *Pg* and *Aa* were neither dominant members of the  
29 microbiome nor significantly different between groups. Taken together with previous  
30 studies<sup>13</sup>, our data implies that gram-negative bacteria other than *Pg* and *Aa* may  
31 play a role in initiation of RA, while the evidence from literature suggests that these  
32 two species may be critical to disease perpetuation.

33  
34 Recent investigations demonstrate that while substantial microbial heterogeneity  
35 exists among healthy individuals, a robust core microbiome is identifiable in  
36 individuals who smoke or are pregnant<sup>14-16</sup>. The findings of the present study parallel  
37 these previous observations and support the ecological plaque hypothesis<sup>17</sup>,  
38 suggesting that RA imposes a habitat filtering on the subgingival environment,  
39 preferentially promoting the growth of certain organisms.

40  
41 Traditional statistical methods assume bacterial presence and abundance to be  
42 independent variables, but in reality bacterial presence in a biofilm is driven by inter-  
43 dependent nutritional and metabolic interactions. Therefore, we combined network  
44 graph theory with DESeq and core microbiome analysis to examine co-occurrence  
45 patterns and identify important community members (network anchors). No network  
46 anchors were identifiable in controls (since betweenness centrality was  
47 homogeneous between species), indicating that this is an ecological niche in  
48 equilibrium. However, the tightly woven hub of anaerobes suggest that a small group  
49 of anaerobic bacteria play an important role controlling the flow of resources in the  
50 RA-influenced microbiome, implying that even small changes in these anchors could  
51 impact upon community assembly in people with RA. These species may be  
52 potential targets for microbial disruption.

53  
54 Arachidonic acid (AA) is essential for cell membrane integrity. It is metabolized to  
55 prostaglandin E2 (PGE<sub>2</sub>) and other pro-inflammatory eicosanoids, which are

1 implicated in the development of RA. The ability to metabolize AA into pro-  
2 inflammatory eicosanoids is an emergent property of opportunistic pathogens<sup>18</sup>. AA  
3 is also known to inhibit the growth and epithelial adhesion of beneficial species in the  
4 gut<sup>19</sup>. Taken together, the data indicate that the subgingival microbiome is both  
5 influenced by, and influences, the inflammatory burden of RA.

6  
7 One of the most intriguing findings was the identification of *Cryptobacterium curtum*  
8 as a predominant member of the RA-influenced periodontal microbiome. This gram-  
9 positive, assacharolytic, anaerobic rod (which was previously misclassified as  
10 *Eubacterium saburreum*) degrades arginine through the arginine deiminase pathway  
11 and produces substantial amounts of citrulline, ornithine and ammonia<sup>20</sup>. We have  
12 previously identified this as a periodontal pathogen<sup>21</sup>, and translocation from oral  
13 sources has been implicated in the etiology of distant infections such as pelvic  
14 abscesses, gynecologic infections, and wounds<sup>22</sup>. More importantly, *C. curtum* is  
15 enriched in the oral and gut microbiomes of early RA cases<sup>6,23</sup>. In line with previous  
16 studies, we observed that this species was a member of the core microbiome in RA  
17 patients. Compared to non-RA controls, this species demonstrated a 100-fold greater  
18 abundance in RA with 39-fold greater odds of detection. While this unusually high  
19 association does not necessarily suggest an etiopathogenic role for *C.curtum*, this  
20 organism is certainly a candidate for further studies. In light of evidence that  
21 antibodies against citrullinated protein and peptides (ACPA) precede the clinical  
22 onset of RA by several years, have high specificity for RA at over 95%<sup>24,25</sup> and that  
23 we previously observed antibodies characteristic of RA, including citrullinated and  
24 uncitrullinated peptides of the RA autoantigens in individuals with periodontitis<sup>3</sup>, the  
25 ability of *C.curtum* to degrade arginine via the arginine deiminase pathway and to  
26 produce substantial amounts of citrulline is of particular interest. Presence of  
27 *C.curtum* in the plaque may therefore be a contributing factor in the development of  
28 RA autoantigens and warrants further investigation.

29  
30 In summary, our data suggest that RA plays a major role in shaping the oral  
31 microbiome. The microbiome in RA is enriched for pro-inflammatory organisms and  
32 those capable of producing substantial amounts of citrulline (pro-antigenic). An ability  
33 to metabolize arachidonic acid and ether lipids appears to be a shared function  
34 among the species observed in individuals with RA. Our findings lend further  
35 credence to a link between the oral microbiome and RA; however, longitudinal  
36 studies are needed to understand directionality and causality, and also to  
37 characterize potentially "driver species" that could serve as biomarkers for RA.  
38

## 1 TABLES AND FIGURES

2  
3 Table 1: Clinical and demographic characteristics in periodontally healthy subjects  
4 with rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and without RA (non-RA). Data represented as mean  
5 (25, 75 percentile) for ordinal data and percentage for categorical data. P values are  
6 calculated using Mann-Whitney test for ordinal data and Fisher's test for categorical  
7 data. Abbreviations: BMI, body mass index; PPD probing pocket depth; BoP,  
8 bleeding on probing; CAL, clinical attachment loss; ESR, erythrocyte sedimentation  
9 rate; VAS, visual analogue scale for patients global assessment of disease activity;  
10 DAS, disease activity score.

11  
12  
13 Figure 1: Differences in alpha and beta diversity metrics between periodontally  
14 healthy subjects with and without rheumatoid arthritis (RA). (A): Principal  
15 Coordinates Analysis (PCoA) plots of unweighted and weighted Unifrac distances  
16 (B): Kernel plots of alpha diversity (Abundance-based Coverage Estimator (ACE)).  
17 The peak indicates the median values for each group. The x-axis indicates the data  
18 range. (C): Distribution of species by gram staining and oxygen requirement  
19 characteristics. Groups that share the same symbol are significantly different from  
20 each other ( $p < 0.05$ , Kruskal Wallis test) (D): Phylogenetic tree representing  
21 normalized mean relative abundance (NMRA, stacked bar chart), core species  
22 (circles represent species present in  $\geq 80\%$  of samples in a group), significant  
23 frequency of detection (stars) and phylum-level taxonomic annotation (colored-strips  
24 and text) for significantly different and differentially abundant species-level OTUs  
25 (tree leaves). Data for figure 1D is presented in supplemental table 1.

26  
27 Figure 2: Co-occurrence networks in periodontally healthy subjects with or without  
28 rheumatoid arthritis (RA): Each network graph contains nodes (circles) and edges  
29 (connections representing Spearman's  $\rho$ ). Edges are colored green for positive  
30 correlation and red for negative correlation. Nodes represent species-level OTUs in  
31 2A and 2B and genes encoding for metabolic functions in 2C; and are sized by  
32 relative abundance. Edges represent significant and robust Spearman's correlation  
33 ( $p < 0.05$ ,  $\rho \geq 0.75$ ). Data for figure 2C is presented in supplemental table 2.

34  
35 Supplemental Table 1: Species level OTU matrix highlighting results of abundance  
36 analysis (mean  $\pm$  standard deviation), differential abundance (DESeq2), differential  
37 detection frequency, and presence in core (observed in  $\geq 80\%$  of samples in a group)  
38 for periodontally healthy subjects with and without rheumatoid arthritis (RA).

39  
40 Supplemental Table 2: Correlation matrix of significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) Spearman's  
41 correlation among metabolism related KEGG level 3 gene functions of periodontally  
42 healthy subjects with rheumatoid arthritis (RA).

43  
44 Supplemental File 1: Methods

## 47 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

48  
49 Sources of Funding: This paper presents independent research partially funded by  
50 the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) under its Research for Patient  
51 Benefit (RfPB) Programme (Grant Reference Number PB-PG-0609-19100), by the  
52 GSK Research award 2016 (Oral & Dental Research Trust) and the Philips oral  
53 healthcare young investigator research grant. Praveen Sharma is funded by an NIHR  
54 Doctoral Research Fellowship (Grant Reference Number DRF-2014-07-109). Paola



1 de Pablo is supported by an NIHR fellowship (Grant Code: NIHR PDF-2014-07-055).  
2 The views expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the NHS,  
3 the NIHR or the Department of Health. The sequencing effort was supported by a  
4 NIDCR grant (R01-DE022579) to Purnima Kumar. Akshay Paropkari is supported by  
5 a grant from the NCI (U01 CA188250).

## 1 REFERENCES

- 2
- 3 1. Kaur S, White S, Bartold M. Periodontal Disease as a Risk Factor for  
4 Rheumatoid Arthritis: A Systematic Review. *JBI library of systematic*  
5 *reviews* 2012;10(42 Suppl):1-12. doi: 10.11124/jbisrir-2012-288  
6 [published Online First: 2012/01/01]
- 7 2. de Pablo P, Chapple IL, Buckley CD, et al. Periodontitis in systemic rheumatic  
8 diseases. *Nat Rev Rheumatol* 2009;5(4):218-24. doi:  
9 10.1038/nrrheum.2009.28 [published Online First: 2009/04/02]
- 10 3. de Pablo P, Dietrich T, Chapple IL, et al. The autoantibody repertoire in  
11 periodontitis: a role in the induction of autoimmunity to citrullinated  
12 proteins in rheumatoid arthritis? *Ann Rheum Dis* 2014;73(3):580-6. doi:  
13 10.1136/annrheumdis-2012-202701
- 14 4. Wegner N, Wait R, Sroka A, et al. Peptidylarginine deiminase from  
15 *Porphyromonas gingivalis* citrullinates human fibrinogen and  $\alpha$  -  
16 enolase: Implications for autoimmunity in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis*  
17 *& Rheumatism* 2010;62(9):2662-72.
- 18 5. Konig MF, Abusleme L, Reinholdt J, et al. *Aggregatibacter*  
19 *actinomycetemcomitans*-induced hypercitrullination links  
20 periodontal infection to autoimmunity in rheumatoid arthritis. *Science*  
21 *translational medicine* 2016;8(369):369ra176-369ra176. doi:  
22 10.1126/scitranslmed.aaj1921
- 23 6. Zhang X, Zhang D, Jia H, et al. The oral and gut microbiomes are perturbed in  
24 rheumatoid arthritis and partly normalized after treatment. *Nature*  
25 *medicine* 2015;21(8):895-905. doi: 10.1038/nm.3914 [published Online  
26 First: 2015/07/28]
- 27 7. Scher JU, Ubeda C, Equinda M, et al. Periodontal disease and the oral  
28 microbiota in new-onset rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis and rheumatism*  
29 2012;64(10):3083-94. doi: 10.1002/art.34539 [published Online First:  
30 2012/05/12]
- 31 8. Griffen AL, Beall CJ, Campbell JH, et al. Distinct and complex bacterial profiles  
32 in human periodontitis and health revealed by 16S pyrosequencing. *The*  
33 *ISME journal* 2012;6(6):1176-85.
- 34 9. Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. Moderated estimation of fold change and  
35 dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol* 2014;15(12):550.  
36 doi: 10.1186/s13059-014-0550-8
- 37 10. Paster BJ, Boches SK, Galvin JL, et al. Bacterial diversity in human subgingival  
38 plaque. *J Bacteriol* 2001;183(12):3770-83. doi: 10.1128/JB.183.12.3770-  
39 3783.2001
- 40 11. Langille MG, Zaneveld J, Caporaso JG, et al. Predictive functional profiling of  
41 microbial communities using 16S rRNA marker gene sequences. *Nature*  
42 *biotechnology* 2013;31(9):814-21. doi: 10.1038/nbt.2676 [published  
43 Online First: 2013/08/27]
- 44 12. Yoon J, Blumer A, Lee K. An algorithm for modularity analysis of directed and  
45 weighted biological networks based on edge-betweenness centrality.  
46 *Bioinformatics* 2006;22(24):3106-8. doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btl533  
47 [published Online First: 2006/10/25]

- 1 13. Mikuls TR, Payne JB, Yu F, et al. Periodontitis and Porphyromonas gingivalis  
2 in Patients with Rheumatoid Arthritis. *Arthritis and rheumatism* 2014 doi:  
3 10.1002/art.38348 [published Online First: 2014/01/10]
- 4 14. Mason M, R, Preshaw P, M, Nagaraja H, N, et al. The subgingival microbiome  
5 of clinically healthy current and never smokers. *Isme Journal*  
6 2015;9(1):268-72. doi: 10.1038/ismej.2014.114
- 7 15. Paropkari AD, Leblebicioglu B, Christian LM, et al. Smoking, pregnancy and  
8 the subgingival microbiome. *Scientific reports* 2016;6:30388. doi:  
9 10.1038/srep30388
- 10 16. Jetté ME, Dill-McFarland KA, Hanshew AS, et al. The human laryngeal  
11 microbiome: effects of cigarette smoke and reflux. *Scientific reports*  
12 2016;6:35882. doi: 10.1038/srep35882  
13 <http://www.nature.com/articles/srep35882 - supplementary-information>
- 14 17. Marsh PD. Microbial ecology of dental plaque and its significance in health  
15 and disease. *Advances in dental research* 1994;8(2):263-71.
- 16 18. Fourie R, Ells R, Swart CW, et al. Candida albicans and Pseudomonas  
17 aeruginosa Interaction, with Focus on the Role of Eicosanoids. *Frontiers in*  
18 *physiology* 2016;7:64. doi: 10.3389/fphys.2016.00064 [published Online  
19 First: 2016/03/10]
- 20 19. Kankaanpaa P, Yang B, Kallio H, et al. Effects of polyunsaturated fatty acids in  
21 growth medium on lipid composition and on physicochemical surface  
22 properties of lactobacilli. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2004;70(1):129-36.  
23 [published Online First: 2004/01/09]
- 24 20. Uematsu H, Sato N, Djais A, et al. Degradation of arginine by Slackia exigua  
25 ATCC 700122 and Cryptobacterium curtum ATCC 700683. *Oral*  
26 *Microbiology and Immunology* 2006;21(6):381-84. doi: 10.1111/j.1399-  
27 302X.2006.00307.x
- 28 21. Kumar P, S, Griffen A, L, Barton J, A, et al. New bacterial species associated  
29 with chronic periodontitis. *J Dent Res* 2003;5(82):338-44.
- 30 22. Brook I, Frazier EH. Significant recovery of nonsporulating anaerobic rods  
31 from clinical specimens. *Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication*  
32 *of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 1993;16(4):476-80.  
33 [published Online First: 1993/04/01]
- 34 23. Vaahtovuori J, Munukka E, Korkeamäki M, et al. Fecal microbiota in early  
35 rheumatoid arthritis. *The Journal of rheumatology* 2008;35(8):1500-5.  
36 [published Online First: 2008/06/06]
- 37 24. Schellekens GA, de Jong BA, van den Hoogen FH, et al. Citrulline is an  
38 essential constituent of antigenic determinants recognized by rheumatoid  
39 arthritis-specific autoantibodies. *J Clin Invest* 1998;101(1):273-81. doi:  
40 10.1172/JCI1316
- 41 25. Schellekens GA, Visser H, de Jong BA, et al. The diagnostic properties of  
42 rheumatoid arthritis antibodies recognizing a cyclic citrullinated peptide.  
43 *Arthritis and rheumatism* 2000;43(1):155-63. doi: 10.1002/1529-  
44 0131(200001)43:1<155::AID-ANR20>3.0.CO;2-3  
45