# UNIVERSITY<sup>OF</sup> BIRMINGHAM University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

## Brominated flame retardants in Irish waste polymers: Concentrations, legislative compliance, and treatment options

Drage, Daniel S.; Sharkey, Martin; Abdallah, Mohamed Abou Elwafa; Abdallah, Mohamed Abou Elwafa; Berresheim, Harald; Harrad, Stuart

DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.01.076

*License:* Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND)

Document Version Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Drage, DS, Sharkey, M, Abdallah, MAÉ, Abdallah, MAE, Berresheim, H & Harrad, S 2018, 'Brominated flame retardants in Irish waste polymers: Concentrations, legislative compliance, and treatment options', *Science of the Total Environment*, vol. 625, pp. 1535-1543. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.01.076

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

Publisher Rights Statement: Checked for eligibility: 22/01/2018

#### **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?) •Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

#### Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

1	Brominated Flame Retardants in Irish Waste Polymers: Concentrations,
2	Legislative Compliance, and Treatment Options
3	Daniel S Drage* <sup>a</sup> , Martin Sharkey <sup>b</sup> , Mohamed Abou-Elwafa Abdallah <sup>a,c</sup> , Harald
4	Berresheim <sup>b</sup> , Stuart Harrad <sup>a</sup>
5	
6	<sup>a</sup> School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham,
7	Edgbaston, West Midlands, B15 2TT
8	<sup>b</sup> School of Physics, National University of Ireland Galway
9	° Department of Analytical Chemistry, Faculty of Pharmacy, Assiut University, 71526 Assiut
10	*Corresponding Author
11	<u>d.s.drage@bham.ac.uk</u>
12	

#### 13 Abstract:

A comprehensive survey was performed to construct an inventory of polybrominated 14 diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) and hexabromocyclododecane (HBCDD) associated with waste 15 polymers in Ireland. Based on our data, ~2,200 t/yr of waste generated in Ireland exceeds 16 17 "Low POP Concentration Limits" (LPCLs) set by the European Commission, of 1,000 mg/kg of PBDEs (BDE-209 excluded) and HBCDD – collectively referred to as POP-BFRs. Waste 18 articles containing concentrations exceeding the LPCL values require special treatment to 19 20 remove POP-BFRs before they can be recycled. Waste articles exceeding LPCLs in our study consist primarily of expanded polystyrene used as building insulation (44 %), waste furniture 21 22 foams and fabrics (41 %), with waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) accounting for 13 % and end of life vehicle waste contributing 1.7 %. The recent listing of Deca-BDE 23 under the Stockholm Convention means that a similar LPCL for its principal congener (BDE-24 209) is likely. Our data show that enforcement of an LPCL of 1,000 mg/kg for BDE-209 25 would result in a further 1,650 t/year of waste articles requiring special treatment. Our data 26 show there to be 17,125 kg of POP-BFRs associated with waste polymers generated annually 27 28 in Ireland. Enforcement of current LPCL values would prevent approximately 98 % of these 29 POP-BFRs from entering recycled goods. Introduction and enforcement of a similar LPCL for BDE-209 would prevent 93 % of the 15,518 kg/yr of BDE-209 associated with Irish 30 31 waste polymers from entering the recycling stream.

32

#### 34 **1.0 Introduction**

35

polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) have found extensive use worldwide as flame 36 retardants (FRs) in a wide variety of commercial, domestic and industrial applications. There 37 are three main commercial PBDE formulations, namely Penta-, Octa- and DecaBDE. 38 Applications of PBDEs include electrical and electronic equipment (EEE - such as TVs, PCs 39 and small domestic appliances (SDAs)) and soft furnishings (such as sofas, mattresses, 40 curtains, and pillows etc.). The primary use of HBCDD is as a FR in expanded and extruded 41 polystyrene (EPS/XPS) used in building insulation foam (European Chemicals Agency, 42 2009). As of 2001 (the last reliable figures publicly available), Europe accounted for 2 %, 16 43 %, 14 % and 57 % of the annual global demand for Penta-, Octa-, DecaBDE and HBCDD 44 respectively (Bromine Science and Environmental Forum (BSEF), 2003). 45 In Europe, approximately 95 % of PentaBDE was used in flexible polyurethane foam (PUF), 46 47 mainly used for furniture and automotive applications (European Chemicals Bureau, 2000). Depending on the source, it is estimated that treated PUF contains ~3-18 % by weight of 48 PentaBDE for upholstery, cushions, mattresses and carpet padding (European Commission, 49 50 2011, United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), 2010). PentaBDE has had extensive use in cars, in particular in seating PUF. Approximately 5 % of European vehicles built from 51 1975 - 2004 were treated with PentaBDE (Morf et al., 2003). In 2012, 102,073 end-of-life 52 vehicles (ELVs) were generated in Ireland, suggesting that approximately 16.3 t of PentaBDE 53 entered the waste stream in Ireland 2012 from ELV alone (Expert Team to Support Waste 54 55 Implementation (ESWI), 2011).

Brominated flame retardants (BFRs) such as hexabromocyclododecane (HBCDD) and

Historically, around 95 % of OctaBDE supplied in the EU was used in acrylonitrile butadiene
styrene (ABS) (predominantly in housings of EEE, particularly for cathode ray tube (CRT)

58 housing (e.g. PC monitors and TVs) and office equipment (e.g. copying machines and business printers). It was typically added to ABS at concentrations between 10-18 % by 59 weight (European Commission, 2011). Minor uses of OctaBDE (< 5 %) were in high impact 60 61 polystyrene (HIPS), polybutylene terephthalate (PBT), and polyamide polymers, with typical concentrations of 12-15 % by weight. Other possible uses were in nylon, low density 62 polyethylene, polycarbonate, phenolformaldehyde resins, and unsaturated polyesters, as well 63 as in adhesives and coatings (United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), 2010). 64 DecaBDE was employed in HIPS associated with EEE, and as a back-coating on a wide 65 range of fabrics, including: nylon, polypropylene, acrylics, and many other blends such as 66 polyester-cotton (Weil and Levchik, 2008). Typically, DecaBDE was added to products at 67 about 10-25 % by weight with important fabric applications in: automotive upholstery, 68 draperies for hotels and public buildings and institutional (e.g. office) upholstered furniture 69 70 (Weil and Levchik, 2008).

71 The principal use of HBCDD (>95 %) is in the building industry, typically added at 2 % or 0.7 % by weight into EPS and XPS foam respectively in rigid insulation panels/boards. It has 72 a relatively minor application (~2%) as an FR in HIPS used for EEE (European Commission, 73 74 2011). HBCDD is also used as a textile coating agent in polymer dispersions applied to cotton or cotton/synthetic blends for upholstery fabrics, e.g. residential and commercial 75 upholstered furniture and transportation seating, bed mattress ticking, draperies and wall 76 coverings, interior textiles, e.g. roller blinds and vehicle interior textiles. HBCDD can also be 77 used in treatment of polyester, polypropylene and nylon fabrics, where it is applied as an 78 79 aqueous suspension or emulsion at a loading of 8-11 % by weight (Weil and Levchik, 2008). Over the last decade, the widespread use of PBDEs and HBCDDs has been the subject of 80 concern, owing to their documented presence in the environment, including human tissues, 81

82 coupled with evidence of their toxicity. At a global level, this concern is exemplified by the listing of HBCDD and those PBDE congeners that constitute the Penta- and OctaBDE 83 commercial formulations as "POP-BFRs" under the UNEP Stockholm Convention on 84 85 Persistent Organic Pollutants (Health and Environment Alliance, 2013, Stockholm Convention, 2009). However, there is currently a derogation that permits HBCDD use within 86 the EU in EPS and XPS for building insulation (European Commission, 2016). The same 87 convention has recently agreed to add the DecaBDE formulation, although this is likely to 88 contain a large list of exemptions, allowing for its continued use until suitable alternatives are 89 90 found (Chemical Watch, 2017).

91 It is clear that there has been extensive global use of PBDEs and HBCDD in a wide range of applications. There is thus a growing inventory of materials containing POP-BFRs that have 92 or will shortly enter the waste stream with consequent implications for their sustainable 93 94 management. The potential scale of this issue is illustrated by UNEP estimates that currently 20-50 million t of waste EEE (WEEE) is generated globally every year (Robinson, 2009). 95 96 The EU POPs regulation (EC) No 850/2004 addresses this situation, stipulating that wastes 97 containing POP-BFRs must be treated in such a way as to ensure the POP-BFR content is destroyed or irreversibly transformed so that the POP-BFR content is below the limit value 98 specified in Annex IV "low POP concentration limit (LPCL)" (1,000 mg/kg for HBCDD and 99 100 1,000 mg/kg for the sum of all PBDEs representative of the Penta- and/or OctaBDE formulations). The LPCLs define the threshold concentration above which wastes are 101 classified POP waste and subject to the management regime of the POP regulation (European 102 103 Commission, 2016) – i.e. whether a waste item will have to be specially treated in order to remove its POP-BFR content prior to disposal/recycling. For compliance with this regulation, 104 105 the concentrations of POP-BFRs within waste consumer products need to be known. Furthermore, with DecaBDE recently being listed as a POP under the Stockholm Convention, 106

107 a similar LPCL will likely be enforced for its principal congener, BDE-209. With this in mind, it is important to gather evidence about the proportion of the volume of consumer 108 products entering the waste stream that contains concentrations of restricted BFRs that 109 exceed LPCLs (and theoretical LPCLs (tLPCLs) for DecaBDE). Therefore, the aims of the 110 current study are to: (i) measure the concentrations of PBDEs and HBCDD in samples of 111 waste EEE (WEEE), soft furnishings, construction and demolition waste EPS and XPS, as 112 well as fabrics and PUF from ELVs in Ireland; (ii) use these concentration data to estimate 113 the mass of PBDEs and HBCDD contained within relevant waste-streams in Ireland, 114 115 including the proportion of individual items within such waste streams that exceed LPCLs; (iii) estimate the mass of waste material and associated POP-BFRs that would be removed 116 from circulation by effective enforcement of current LPCLs and thus require special 117 118 treatment to destroy the POP-BFRs thus isolated, and (iv) evaluate the options available for such special treatment to destroy this reservoir of POP-BFRs. To our knowledge, this is the 119 first comprehensive survey of BFR concentrations in waste items. 120

#### 121 2.0 Materials & Methods

#### 122 2.1 Sample Collection

123 The sampling campaign addressed those waste streams considered most likely to contain

124 products treated with POP-BFRs. A total of 538 samples were collected from 4 broad

125 categories of waste stream: construction and demolition (C&D) EPS/XPS (n = 62); ELV

fabrics and PUF (n = 135); soft furnishings (n = 123); and WEEE (n = 239). These categories

127 were further divided as detailed in Table 1. It should be noted that whilst carpet samples were

- 128 collected, we were unable to obtain samples of carpet underlay.
- 129 C&D EPS/XPS samples were collected from three main sources: (i) recently demolished
- 130 buildings (samples taken directly from the source of waste); (ii) a demolition company which

stockpiles re-usable waste insulation for future construction operations; and (iii) a
construction and demolition waste collection site (specifically collecting waste from
demolished buildings). All ELV waste samples were collected from a single vehicle scrap
site. All WEEE and soft furnishing samples were collected from various household waste
centres located in Ireland.

Sub-samples of waste items in each of our 4 waste categories were obtained using tin snips, 136 hammer and scissors. Sub-samples selected for chemical analysis comprised: plastic housing 137 from large WEEE items (e.g. fridges and TVs), with preference given to areas encasing 138 electronic components or near power cords; in the case of fabric and polystyrene items, sub-139 samples were taken from the centre of each article, with PUF sub-samples taken from the 140 surface in contact with the fabric covering. To help select relevant sub-samples, all items 141 were scanned at several points for bromine content using a hand-held XRF analyser (Niton 142 143 GOLDDXL3t 900) with preference given to areas of high bromine content.

144 2.1 Chemicals and standards

All solvents used for extraction and analytical procedures for GC/MS and LC-MS/MS were
of HPLC grade quality (Fisher Scientific, Loughborough, UK). Silica (70-130 mesh), with
concentrated sulfuric acid was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St Louis, MA, USA).

148 Native  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma$ -HBCDD standards, <sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma$ -HBCDD, d<sub>18</sub>- $\gamma$ -HBCDD individual

standards of native BDEs -28, -47, -99, -100, -153, -154, -183, -196, -197, -209, -77 and -

150 128, <sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>-BDE 209, and native PCB-129 were obtained from Wellington Laboratories

151 (Guelph, ON, Canada).

152 Certified reference materials for polyethylene (ERM-EC590) and polypropylene (ERM-

153 EC591) were purchased from IRMM (Brussels, Belgium).

#### 154 2.3 Sample Extraction & Clean-up

Full extraction and clean-up parameters have been reported previously (Abdallah et al., 155 2017). Briefly, aliquots of samples (10-100 mg) were accurately weighed into a 15 mL glass 156 tube and spiked with internal standards (30 ng of BDE-77, BDE-128,  ${}^{13}C_{12}$ - $\alpha$ -HBCDD,  ${}^{13$ 157  $\beta$ -HBCDD, <sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>- $\gamma$ -HBCDD and 60 ng of <sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>-BDE-209). Samples were extracted using a 158 combination of vortexing and ultrasonication with dichloromethane (DCM), followed by 159 precipitation of polymer matrix by addition of hexane. Sample extracts were then purified by 160 washing with concentrated sulfuric acid. Cleaned extracts were concentrated and solvent 161 exchanged into 100 µL isooctane (containing 0.2 ng/µL PCB-129 as a recovery standard) and 162 transferred into inserted autosampler vials ready for instrumental analysis. After analysis of 163 PBDEs via GC/MS, samples were solvent exchanged into 100 µL methanol (containing 0.2 164  $ng/\mu L d_{18}$ -  $\gamma$ -HBCDD as a recovery standard) for HBCDD analysis. 165

#### 166 2.4 Instrumental Analysis

Quantitative analysis of PBDEs (BDEs -17, -28, 47, -99, -100, -153, -154, -183, -196, -197, 167 and -209) was performed on a Thermo Fisher Trace 1310 gas chromatograph coupled to a 168 Thermo Fisher ISQ mass spectrometer (MS). The MS was operated in electron ionisation 169 mode using selective ion monitoring (SIM). Full details of ions monitored are provided in 170 Abdallah et al. (2017). One  $\mu$ L of the purified extract was injected for analysis using a 171 programmable temperature vaporiser (PTV) onto a Restek Rxi-5Sil MS column (15 m x 0.25 172 mm x 0.25 µm film thickness). Helium was used as the carrier gas at a flow rate of 1.5 173 174 mL/min.

175 HBCDDs were measured using a Shimadzu LC-20AB Prominence binary pump liquid

176 chromatograph, equipped with a SIL-20A autosampler, a DGU-20A3 vacuum degasser

177 coupled to an AB Sciex API 2000 triple quadrupole MS. Separation of  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma$ - HBCDD

178	was achieved using a Varian Pursuit XRS3 $C_{18}$ analytical column (150 x 2 mm I.D. 3 $\mu$ m	

179 particle size). Full LC-MS/MS details have been reported previously (Abdallah et al., 2008).

180 2.5 Quality Control

A reagent blank consisting of 100 mg of anhydrous sodium sulfate was analysed with every 181 11 samples. "Negative Control" samples were created using plastics and textiles that contain 182 no BFRs and were also analysed throughout the study. Three such control samples were 183 assessed for each matrix. None of the target compounds were found above the limits of 184 detection in the blanks. Therefore results were not corrected for blank residues and method 185 limits of detection (LOD) and quantification (LOQ) were estimated based on a signal to noise 186 ratio (S/N) of 3:1 and 10:1 respectively. LOQs for target compounds ranged from 0.8 - 1.5 187 ng/g for PBDEs and were 0.3 ng/g for  $\alpha$ -,  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma$ - HBCDD. 188

189 Method accuracy and precision was assessed via repeated analysis of certified reference

190 materials (CRMs) ERM-EC591 (polypropylene), ERM-EC590 (polyethylene) in addition to

191 textiles (polyester fabrics), extruded polystyrene and expanded polystyrene that have been

192 previously measured by this laboratory and another. All values were found to be close to

193 certified or indicative levels, with a relative standard deviation of <15 %. Full details of

method precision and accuracy can be found in Abdallah et al. (2017)

195 2.6 Statistical Analysis

- 196 All statistics were performed using Microsoft Excel 2013 and IBM SPSS Statistics for
- 197 Windows Version 22. A significance level of 95 % ( $p \le 0.05$ ) was applied.
- 198 **3.0 Results & Discussion**
- 199 *3.1 Concentrations of BFRs in Irish Waste Samples*

HBCDDs and PBDEs indicative of the Penta- and Octa- formulations ( $\sum_{9}$ PBDE = BDEs -28, -47, -99, -100, -153, -154, -183, -196 and -197) and BDE-209 were detected in 33 %, 56 % and 65 % respectively of all samples. The mean concentrations measured were 580 mg/kg (range: <0.0003 – 51,000 mg/kg), 8.1 mg/kg (range: <0.0003 – 1,400 mg/kg) and 730 mg/kg (range <0.0008 – 73,000 mg/kg) for HBCDDs,  $\sum_{9}$ PBDEs and BDE-209 respectively (Table 2).

#### 206 *C&D EPS/XPS Waste*

HBCDD was detected in 100 % of EPS samples at concentrations ranging between 0.08 and
10,000 mg/kg and in 100 % of XPS samples at concentrations between <0.34 and 94 mg/kg.</li>
Median concentrations were 100 mg/kg and 19 mg/kg for EPS and XPS respectively. No
PBDEs (including BDE-209) were detected in any of the C&D samples.

211 Out of 60 C&D EPS/XPS samples 14 (all EPS) contained HBCDDs above the LPCL of 1,000 mg/kg. Notwithstanding this, median concentrations of HBCDD in our C&D EPS/XPS 212 waste samples were substantially lower than suggested previously (HBCDD was reported to 213 be added to new EPS and XPS insulation panels at concentrations of 20,000 and 7,000 mg/kg 214 respectively (European Commission, 2011, Marvin et al., 2011) raising the possibility that 215 much of the HBCDD originally present in the EPS/XPS samples we analysed, will have been 216 emitted into the surrounding environment during the lifespan of the product. Surprisingly, no 217 EPS/XPS samples contained HBCDD at concentrations close to their reported treatment 218 levels. It was expected that "newly treated" EPS/XPS would be present to some extent in the 219 220 waste stream, from off-cuts and waste materials from recent construction work. However this is likely to form a represent a very small proportion of the total volume of waste EPS/XPS 221 222 and therefore would require a larger sampling campaign to detect this. It is also plausible that EPS and XPS were treated at lower HBCDD concentrations, than previously reported. In EPS 223

and XPS samples where HBCDD was not detected, it is most likely that they were installed
prior to the use of HBCDD to treat EPS/XPS insulation. An alternative scenario is that they
had been treated with PolyFR – a replacement for HBCDD, however this is unlikely as
PolyFR did not begin replacing HBCDD in the EU until 2013, with a planned phase-out by
2015 (Plastics Today, 2014) meaning that it is unlikely that this will form a noticeable
proportion of currently-generated end of life EPS/XPS.

230 *ELV Waste* 

234

HBCDD,  $\sum PBDE_{28:197}$  and BDE-209 were all detected in ELV samples analysed. HBCDD

was detected in 36 out of 119 ELV samples. The median concentration was <0.0003 mg/kg

233 (range: <0.0003 - 3,300 mg/kg) with only two exceedances of the LPCL.  $\sum PBDE_{28:197}$  was

detected in 98 out of 119 samples with a median concentration of 0.09 mg/kg (range: <0.0008

-740 mg/kg). There were no exceedances of the LPCL for PBDEs.

BDE-209 (the principal congener in the DecaBDE formulation) was detected in 105 samples 236 with a median concentration of 1.6 mg/kg (range: <0.0008-31,000 mg/kg). From this point 237 onwards a tLPCL of 1,000 mg/kg is assumed for DecaBDE. DecaBDE exceeded the tLPCL 238 in only five ELV samples, whilst it was just below the tLPCL in one sample (980 mg/kg). All 239 exceedances of the tLPCL for DecaBDE were in upholstery (roof trim, seat covers, and floor 240 mats) rather than PUF. This is consistent with DecaBDE's use as back-coating on a variety of 241 fabrics (Weil and Levchik, 2008). Interestingly, of the five samples that exceeded the tLPCL, 242 four were from vehicles manufactured by companies based in Asia (Japan (Mazda, n=2) and 243 244 Hyundai (South Korea, n=2) with an mean concentration of 27,000 mg/kg (22,000-31,000 mg/kg). The remaining sample contained 4,000 mg/kg and was from a manufacturer based in 245 246 Germany (BMW). Unfortunately data on vehicle model and age was not always available and therefore it was not always possible to determine when and where vehicles were 247

manufactured. The vehicle with the highest BDE-209 concentration (Hyundai I-20, 31,000
mg/kg) was registered in 2012 demonstrating that products containing DecaBDE were still
entering the European market, several years after the introduction of restrictions on its use in
2008. Interestingly, a PUF sample was also taken from a seat in this car and found to contain
2.8 mg/kg of BDE-209 and trace levels of other POP-BFRs. This may imply transfer of BDE209 from the fabric covering to the foam within.

#### 254 Soft Furnishings

HBCDD was detected in 32 out of 122 soft furnishing samples. The median concentration 255 was <0.0003 mg/kg (range: <0.0003-51,000 mg/kg). It exceeded the HBCDD LPCL in 11 256 samples (6 upholstery and 5 furniture foam samples. In all other samples where HBCDDs 257 258 were found above the detection limits, but below the LPCL (range: 1 - 400 mg/kg, median: 4 mg/kg) it is likely to be due to migration out of other treated products during contact and/or 259 the result of using recycled products during the manufacturing process that have previously 260 261 been treated with HBCDD. This argument is supported by the fact that 83 % of furniture upholstery samples exceeding the LPCL contain substantially higher levels than the PUF 262 sample from the same item. No mattresses (foam or upholstery), carpets or curtains contained 263 HBCDDs above LPCLs. 264

∑<sub>9</sub>PBDEs was detected in 93 out of 122 soft furnishing samples with a median concentration
of 0.058 mg/kg (range: <0.0003 – 160 mg/kg). No soft furnishing samples exceeded current</li>
LPCLs for PBDEs. BDE-209 was detected in 75 samples with a median concentration of 5.4
mg/kg (range: <0.0008 – 73,000 mg/kg). In total, there were 10 tLPCL exceedances,</li>
specifically in: 6/22 furniture fabrics, 3/20 furniture foam, and 1/31 carpet samples. As with
ELV samples, the four with the highest BDE-209 concentrations were fabric covers,
however, three foam samples and one carpet sample exceeded the tLPCL for BDE-209. Of

these three foam samples, two exceeded the tLPCL in the corresponding upholstered fabric
sample collected from the same item of furniture. As there is no known treatment of PUF
with DecaBDE, this suggests migration of BDE-209 from back-coated fabric to underlying
foam via direct contact. No curtains, mattress foams, or mattress upholstery samples
exceeded tLPCLs for BDE-209.

277 *WEEE* 

HBCDD was detected in 25 out of 237 WEEE samples. The median concentration was 278 <0.0003 mg/kg (range: <0.0003 – 1,600 mg/kg). It only exceeded the HBCDD LPCL in one 279 sample (a computer CD player). Moreover, two samples from the same display item (a CRT 280 TV/DVD combination) contained 210 and 330 mg/kg of HBCDD. HBCDD has previously 281 282 been detected in dust collected from inside a CRT TV at a highly elevated concentration, demonstrating its application in HIPS (Harrad et al., 2009). This suggests that whilst a small 283 proportion of HBCDD has been used to treat electronics items, it has not been widely used 284 285 for this purpose. However, contamination may occur through the use of recycled plastics. This is consistent with the literature that only a minor proportion (<1 %) of the globally 286 produced HBCDD was used in the treatment of HIPS for electronic items (European 287 288 Commission, 2011). It is possible, however, that since usage data was last reported for HBCDD that its use in EEE could have increased. This is due to the development of a more 289 thermally stable HBCDD commercial formulation meaning it could meet flame retardancy 290 standards (e.g. UL94-HB in Europe) for TVs and other audio visual equipment (Weil and 291 Levchik, 2008). 292

293  $\sum_{9}$ PBDEs was detected in 110 out of 237 samples. The median concentration was <0.0003 294 mg/kg (range: <0.0003 – 1400 mg/kg). The LPCL was exceeded for PBDEs in only one 295 sample (the front panel of a CRT television). BDE-183 was responsible for the majority (75

296 %) of  $\sum_{9}$  PBDEs content in this sample, with smaller quantities also coming from BDEs -197 (9.1 %), -196 (7.7 %), -153 (7.0%) and -154 (1.5 %). These congeners are representative of 297 Octa-BDE commercial formulations - especially given the absence of BDEs -47, -99 and -298 100, which were not detected. However, it is likely the LPCL exceedance for this sample is 299 due to treatment with the DecaBDE formulation which was found in the same sample at 300 60,000 mg/kg. This could be due to one or more of the following: (i) OctaBDE impurities in 301 one of the commercial mixtures (Bromkal 82-0DE), which has been reported to contain 302 OctaBDE impurities at 5-10 % (La Guardia et al., 2006); (ii) debromination of BDE-209 at 303 304 the high temperatures experienced during the process of incorporating it into the molten polymer and (iii) debromination at high temperatures during use of the treated product. 305 BDE-209 was detected in 151 out of 237 WEEE samples with a median concentration of 0.43 306 mg/kg (range: <0.005-60,000 mg/kg). It exceeded the tLPCL in 8 samples (4 IT, 2 display, 307 308 and 2 SDAs (1 electric heater and 1 power drill). It was also close to the tLPCL (>500 -1,000 mg/kg) in 2 further samples (1 IT and 1 SDA (a kettle)). All LHAs and fridges 309 310 contained <170 mg/kg BDE-209. The majority of samples exceeding tLPCLs for BDE-209 311 were IT samples (5.2 % > tLPCL), display units (4.7% > tLPCL) and SDAs (6.9% > tLPCL). 312 3.2 Preliminary estimation of mass of products exceeding LPCLs and mass of POP-BFRs annually entering the waste streams studied in Ireland 313 Using publicly available data (Table 3) the mass of waste materials in Ireland that are 314 currently exceeding LPCLs and tLPCLs (and would therefore require treatment in order to 315 316 comply with EU regulation) were estimated for each category (Figure 1). In addition, we

- combined the data in Table 3 with our concentration data to generate preliminary estimates of
- the mass of POP-BFRs annually entering the waste streams studied in Ireland. The

uncertainties inherent in these estimates are acknowledged, and their preliminary natureunderlined; nevertheless we believe them to be informative.

321 *C&D Waste* 

322 In 2011, approximately 3 million t of C&D waste was produced in Ireland (Environmental

323 Protection Agency (EPA), 2014). There is no specific data for C&D waste in Ireland,

however the UK estimates that around 2.8 % of its C&D waste is likely to be EPS and XPS

325 (DEFRA, 2010) which would lead to approximately 4,200 t/yr of waste EPS/XPS generated

in Ireland in 2011. Assuming the mean HBCDD concentration from all EPS/XPS in this

study (1,313 mg/kg), approximately 5,500 kg of HBCDD is entering the Irish waste stream

via C&D waste. With 23 % of waste EPS/XPS exceeding the LPCL for HBCDDs, this

equates to 966 t of waste EPS/XPS that could not be recycled or landfilled (Figure 1). With

the current EU exemptions in place for HBCDD to still be used in EPS/XPS insulation until a

suitable alternative can be found, this is likely to be a long term issue. It is therefore

imperative that viable treatment options are established.

#### 333 End of Life Vehicles & Soft Furnishings

In 2012, Ireland produced 102,373 t of end of life vehicles, with an mean vehicle weight of 334 335 1,069 kg (Environmental Protection Agency, 2013). Automotive shredder residue data from the UK was used to estimate that 2.4 % of ELV waste is PUF and textiles (based on 27,222 t 336 of 1,123,873 t ELV generated in the UK (WRc, 2012a). This equates to approximately 2,651 337 t of PUF and upholstery associated with ELV waste generated in Ireland in 2012. Using the 338 mean concentrations from this study of  $\sum_{9}$  PBDEs = 7.5 mg/kg, DecaBDE = 950 mg/kg 339 HBCDD = 45 mg/kg), approximately 20 kg  $\Sigma_9$ PBDEs, 2,500 kg of DecaBDE and 119 kg of 340 HBCDD are entering the waste stream through end of life vehicles. Until an LPCL for BDE-341 209 is introduced, only 1.5 % (39 t) of this waste, courtesy of its HBCDD content, requires 342

special treatment to remove POPs. However, were an LPCL of 1,000 mg/kg to be introduced
for Deca-BDE, this will rise to 5.2 % (137 t) of ELV waste requiring hazardous waste
treatment.

Soft furnishings followed a similar trend to ELV waste with a mixture of POP-BFRs and BDE-209 detected. However, it should be noted that there were no LPCL exceedances in curtains (maximum concentrations: HBCDD = 56 mg/kg,  $\sum_{9}$ PBDEs = 2 mg/kg, BDE-209 = 52 mg/kg), mattress foams (maximum concentrations: HBCDD = not detected,  $\sum_{9}$ PBDEs = 1 mg/kg, BDE-209 = 870 mg/kg), and mattress upholstery (maximum concentrations: HBCDD

 $12 \text{ mg/kg}, \sum_9 \text{PBDEs} = 1 \text{ mg/kg}, BDE-209 = 49 \text{ mg/kg}$ . Therefore, it is likely that no

352 treatment is necessary for these waste materials.

353 There were no exceedances of current LPCLs for carpet samples (maximum HBCDD = 26

mg/kg,  $\sum_{9}PBDEs = 13 mg/kg$ ). However, 3.2 % (1/31) of carpet samples exceeded the tLPCL

for DecaBDE. Based on our data, under current legislation, it is not necessary to treat carpets

prior to disposal or recycling, however if an LPCL for DecaBDE of 1,000 mg/kg is

introduced, then approximately 250 t/yr of waste carpet would require treatment.

358 Currently, there are no published data regarding the volume of furniture entering the waste

359 stream in Ireland. However, assuming an identical *per capita* rate of generation of such waste

to that in the UK in 2010/11 (i.e. 237,516 t/yr of sofas, armchairs and chairs combined

361 (WRAP, 2012)); ~17,900 t/yr of waste furniture are generated in Ireland. Therefore it is

362 estimated that 2,685 t/yr of PUF and 895 t/yr upholstery fabrics are produced in Ireland

- 363 (assuming that sofa is 15 % foam, and 5 % fabrics by weight). Whilst there were no
- 364 exceedances of LPCLs for  $\sum_{9}$ PBDEs, both furniture foam and upholstery samples had
- multiple LPCL exceedances for HBCDD. 25 % (5/20) of our furniture foam samples
- 366 contained HBCDDs at a concentration range of 1,000 8,000 mg/kg. Meanwhile, a further

25 % (6/24) of our furniture upholstery samples exceeded HBCDD LPCLs at a concentration
range of 21,000 – 51,000 mg/kg – up to 51 times the LPCL. This equates to 671 t/yr of
furniture foam and 242 t/yr of furniture upholstery in Ireland requiring removal of BFRs. In
the event of an LPCL being enforced for BDE-209, the percentage of LPCL exceedances
would increase to 35 % (940 t/yr) and 38 % (366 t/yr) of furniture foam and upholstery,
respectively.

373 *WEEE* 

In 2012, an estimated 40,818 t of WEEE was produced in Ireland (Environmental Protection 374 Agency (EPA), 2014). However a full breakdown of this was not available; instead a 375 breakdown from the 2011 National Waste Report for Ireland (Environmental Protection 376 Agency, 2013) was used. There are clear differences in the BFR content of different WEEE 377 378 sub-categories. There were no LPCL exceedances for samples of either large household appliances (LHA), or cooling appliances (fridges/freezers), with only low levels of POP-379 BFRs measured (<10 mg/kg). Furthermore, only low levels (<200 mg/kg) of BDE-209 were 380 measured in LHA and cooling appliances. Therefore, treatment of LHA and cooling 381 appliances to remove BFRs appears unlikely to be necessary. 382

A similar pattern was seen for small domestic appliances (SDA) and IT samples, with no

exceedances for  $\sum_{9}$  PBDEs. However, as mentioned above, one IT sample also exceeded the

385 LPCL for HBCDDs. Therefore, under current legislation it is estimated that approximately

386 127 t/yr of SDA and IT waste would require treatment for POP-BFR removal. When

including samples that exceeded the tLPCL for DecaBDE, this figure would rise to 929 t/yr.

As 2 % (1/45) display samples exceeded current LPCLs, this means that 153 t/yr display item

389 waste requires treatment to remove its POP-BFR content. When including tLPCLs for

390 DecaBDE, an estimated 306 t/yr of display waste requires POP-BFR removal.

Based on the above information it is estimated that 2,198 t/yr of waste in Ireland exceeds current LPCLs and therefore requires treatment to remove POP-BFRs prior to disposal or recycling. In the event of an LPCL of 1,000 mg/kg DecaBDE being enforced, this figure would rise to 3,894 t/yr.

395 *3.3 Potential waste treatment options* 

All waste items that contain PBDEs and/or HBCDDs above the LPCLs require treatment to 396 397 remove BFRs before they can be legally recycled or disposed of. An investigation into treatment options by the German UBA (Federal Environment Office) examined waste 398 399 incineration as a potential pathway to meeting LPCL requirements (Umwelt Bundesamt, 400 2015). The study found that when EPS/XPS is co-incinerated (up to 2 % of total content) with other waste (using best available techniques (BAT) - i.e. Total Energy Recovery) 401 HBCDDs are destroyed with 99.99 % efficiency. Furthermore, the process does not increase 402 the risk of releasing other POPs (such as PBDEs, polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins/furans 403 (PCDD/Fs), polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins/furans (PBDD/Fs), mixed halogenated 404 405 dioxins/furans (PXDD/Fs) and polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs)), whilst the process also removes ozone-depleting substances (Umwelt Bundesamt, 2015). Treating waste 406 407 plastics/textiles in this way will not only destroy the HBCDD content at a far greater efficiency than is required by EU law, but it would also be used as a "renewable" fuel source. 408 However, this "solution" requires substantial capacity for incineration as BFR-containing 409 waste plastics can only make up to 2 % of each incineration to avoid risk of corrosion due to 410 formation of HBr (Umwelt Bundesamt, 2015). A further issue is that increased levels of 411 bromine in the incinerator feedstock arising from other waste containing elevated BFR 412 413 concentrations could potentially cause increased corrosion through the production of hydrobromic acid (HBr) (Tange and Drohmann, 2003). However, it has been determined by 414 previous experiments reported by the European Brominated Flame Retardant Industry Panel 415

416 (EBFRIP) that corrosion by HBr formation is only a risk when BFRs are in excess of 3 % of the total weight present in the incinerator (Tange and Drohmann, 2005). In the EPS/XPS 417 samples measured in this study, the highest concentration of HBCDD measured was 10,000 418 419 pm (1 % of total weight), therefore the risk of corrosion by HBr formation is considered extremely low. In contrast, the POP-BFR concentrations in soft furnishings and ELV waste 420 were considerably higher than in EPS/XPS (up to 5 % HBCDD content). There is also the 421 additional issue of the high concentrations of BDE-209 in multiple waste streams (up to 3 % 422 in ELV, 7 % soft furnishings and 6 % in WEEE). Moreover, tetrabromobisphenol A 423 424 (TBBPA), (a BFR widely used in EEE without any current restrictions) was also measured in WEEE in concentrations up to 12 % by weight (not reported here). Therefore ELV, furniture 425 426 waste and WEEE would require considerable dilution with other (BFR-free) waste to ensure 427 that there is no corrosion as a result of HBr formation. This is likely to raise the cost of disposing of these waste streams. Furthermore, BDE-209 and PBDEs are considered potential 428 precursors to more toxic compounds such as polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins/furans 429 430 (PBDD/Fs), which have been seen to form in thermal processes (Wang and Chang-Chien, 2007) although in controlled combustion systems (such as Total Energy Recovery waste 431 incineration) the risk of this is considered low, with precursor compounds, such as PBDEs, 432 destroyed with high efficiency (Weber and Kuch, 2003). 433

Whilst incineration currently appears the best available treatment option for waste exceeding LPCLs, it is likely to be expensive with operators charging up to  $\notin$ 1,000 per tonne (Creacycle, 2016). Over the last decade industries and governments have attempted to improve and modify a technique that removes BFRs from WEEE based plastics. It has been demonstrated that it can effectively remove BFRs from WEEE-based styrene plastics, as well as EPS/XPS with >99.7 % efficiency (Schlummer et al. 2006, Schlummer et al. 2017). This technique is thus a potentially viable treatment option for the huge volumes of WEEE and

EPS/XPS generated each year as it would allow much of the waste to be recycled – thereby 441 allowing some of the treatment costs to be recovered/subsidised. A demonstration plant with 442 a capacity of 3,000 t/year is currently on track to be opened in 2018 Terneuzen (The 443 Netherlands). This will go some way to coping with waste EPS/XPS across Europe 444 (Creacycle 2016). However, it is to our knowledge not currently a commercially viable 445 option, and at the current time it appears that total energy recovery incineration is currently 446 the best available treatment option for all waste exceeding LPCL values, with the caveat that 447 such waste articles will require dilution with other "BFR-free" waste to minimise formation 448 449 of corrosive HBr during the treatment process.

#### 450 *3.4 Effectiveness of LPCL enforcement*

Using the concentrations measured from this study, and estimates of the annual masses of 451 452 impacted waste streams generated in Ireland of impacted waste streams (Table 3), the mass of POP-BFRs and BDE-209 entering the Irish waste stream each year were estimated (Table 4). 453 In total, an estimated 32,524 kg/year of waste 5POP-BFRs+BDE-209 are generated in Ireland 454 (121, 17,005, and 15,519 kg/year for  $\sum_{9}$  PBDEs, HBCDD, and BDE-209 respectively). By 455 enforcing existing LPCLs, it is estimated that 98 % of SPOP-BFRs would be diverted from 456 the Irish waste stream – 43 % of  $\sum_{9}$  PBDEs, 99 % of HBCDD (Figure 2). This demonstrates 457 that enforcement of current LPCLs would result in the interception of a significant proportion 458 459 of POP-BFRs and BDE-209 re-entering the environment through disposal and/or recycling. Furthermore, under current LPCLs, approximately 22 % of all BDE-209 would also be 460 intercepted through diversion of the exact same waste products. Taking into account the 461 recent listing of DecaBDE as a POP under the Stockholm Convention, it is likely that an 462 LPCL for its principal congener (BDE-209) will be imposed. If a similar LPCL of 1,000 463 mg/kg is applied for BDE-209 then ~99 % of waste POP-BFRs would be intercepted along 464 with ~93 % of all waste BDE-209 (96 % of 5POP-BFRs+BDE-209). Even if a higher LPCL 465

466	of 5,000 mg/kg is imposed for BDE-209, ~91 % of BDE-209 associated with waste articles
467	(~95 % of waste $\Sigma$ POP-BFRs+BDE-209) would be prevented from re-entering the
468	environment, demonstrating the effectiveness of LPCLs.
469	Conclusions
470	• A comprehensive survey of POP-BFRs and BDE-209 entering the waste stream in
471	Ireland identified that there is a large volume of waste (~2,200 t/yr) that requires
472	treatment to meet current legislation (Annex IV of EU POPs regulation (EC) No
473	850/2004)
474	• Enforcement of current LPCL legislation would result in removal of 98 % of POP-
475	BFRs from re-entering environment
476	• Waste EPS from the C&D industry is likely to produce the highest volume of waste
477	requiring treatment in Ireland (966 t/yr), with waste furniture closely behind (913 t/yr)
478	under existing LPCLs
479	• The likely implementation of a similar LPCL for BDE-209 will cause a 75 % increase
480	in waste requiring treatment in Ireland, with waste furniture the biggest contributor
481	under this scenario (1,306 t/yr)
482	• Only 280 t/year of WEEE exceeds existing LPCLs in Ireland – however, introduction
483	of an LPCL of 1,000 mg/kg for BDE-209 would increase this to 1,235 t/year
484	• Current treatment options to destroy or remove POP-BFRs from waste articles
485	exceeding LPCLs are limited, with total energy recovery waste incineration as the
486	most realistically viable option. However, due to its high Br content, LPCL-exceeding
487	waste treated by this process requires dilution with "low-BFR" articles to avoid
488	corrosion of the incinerator by HBr.

## 490 Acknowledgements

- 491 Funding for this study was provided by the Environmental Protection Agency of Ireland
- 492 Project Reference 2014-RE-MS-2

#### References

ABDALLAH, M. A.-E., DRAGE, D. S., SHARKEY, M., BERRESHEIM, H. & HARRAD,
 S. 2017. A rapid method for the determination of brominated flame retardant
 concentrations in plastics and textiles entering the waste stream. *Journal of Separation Science*, 40, 3749-3922.

ABDALLAH, M. A., HARRAD, S. & COVACI, A. 2008. Hexabromocyclododecanes and tetrabromobisphenol-A in indoor air and dust in Birmingham, U.K: implications for human exposure. *Environ Sci Technol*, 42, 6855-61.

Bromine Science Environmental Forum (2003). Major Brominated Flame Retardants Volume

- Estimates. Total Market Demand By Region in 2001. <u>http://www.bsef.com</u> 21/1/2003. [Accessed 12<sup>th</sup> December 2006].
- CHEMICAL WATCH. 2017. POPs Convention set to ban two more substances: DecaBDE and short-chain chlorinated paraffins poised for listing [Online]. Available: https://chemicalwatch.com/55636/pops-convention-set-to-ban-two-more-substances [Accessed 7 June 2017].
- CREACYCLE. 2016. Polytstyrene Loop [Online]. Available:

http://www.creacycle.de/en/projects/recycling-of-expanded-poly-styreneeps/polystyrene-loop-2016.html [Accessed 24 January 2017].

- DEFRA. 2010. Key facts about waste and recycling: Construction and demolition waste management: 1999 to 2005 [Online]. Available: www.defra.gov.uk/evidence/statistics/environment/waste/kf/wrkf09.htm [Accessed 04 April 2017].
- ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, Ireland 2014. National Waste Report for 2012.

#### ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, Ireland 2013. National Waste Report for

2011

European Chemicals Agency (ECHA) (2009). Background document for

hexabromocyclododecane and all major diastereoisomers identified (HBCDD). Available at:

https://echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/9b8562be-30e9-4017-981b-1976fc1b8b56

[Accessed 4 August 2017]

EUROPEAN CHEMICALS BUREAU 2000. European Union Risk Assessment Report, diphenyl ether, pentabromo derivative (Pentabromodiphenylether). *In:* PROTECTION, I. F. H. A. C. (ed.).

European Commission (2011) Final Report: Study on waste related issues of newly listed POPs and candidate POPs.

http://ec.europa.eu/environment/waste/studies/pdf/POP\_Waste\_2011.pdf [Accessed 4 August 2017]

EUROPEAN COMMISSION 2016. Commission regulation (EU) 2016/460 of 30 March 2016 amending Annexes IV and V to regulation No 850/2004 of the European

Parliament and of the Council on persistent organic pollutants. Off. J. Eur. Commun.

EXPERT TEAM TO SUPPORT WASTE IMPLEMENTATION (ESWI) 2011. Study on waste related issues of newly listed POPs and candidate POPs. *European Commission final report no. ENV.G.4/FRA/2007/0066*.

HARRAD, S., ABDALLAH, M. A.-E. & COVACI, A. 2009. Causes of variability in concentrations and diastereomer patterns of hexabromocyclododecanes in indoor dust. *Environment International*, 35, 573-579.

HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENT ALLIANCE. 2013. *Global ban of flame retardant HBCD* [Online]. Available: http://www.env-health.org/news/latest-news/article/global-banof-flame-retardant-hbcd [Accessed 06 June 2014].

- LA GUARDIA, M. J., HALE, R. C. & HARVEY, E. 2006. Detailed Polybrominated Diphenyl Ether (PBDE) Congener Composition of the Widely Used Penta-, Octa-, and Deca-PBDE Technical Flame-retardant Mixtures. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 40, 6247-6254.
- MARVIN, C. H., TOMY, G. T., ARMITAGE, J. M., ARNOT, J. A., MCCARTY, L.,
  COVACI, A. & PALACE, V. 2011. Hexabromocyclododecane: Current
  Understanding of Chemistry, Environmental Fate and Toxicology and Implications
  for Global Management. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 45, 8613-8623.
- MORF, L., SMUTNY, R., TAVERNA, R. & DAXBECK, H. 2003. Selected polybrominated flame retardants PBDEs and TBBPA. Substance flow analysis. *Environmental Series*.
- ROBINSON, B. H. 2009. E-waste: An assessment of global production and environmental impacts. *Science of The Total Environment*, 408, 183-191.
- Schlummer, M.; Mäurer, A.; Leitner, T.; Spruzina, W. Report: Recycling of flame-retarded plastics from waste electric and electronic equipment (WEEE). Waste Manag. Res. 2006, 24, 573-583.
- Schlummer, M., Maurer, A., Wagner, S., Berrang, A., Fell, T., Knappich, F. 2017. Recycling of flame retarded waste polystyrene foams (EPS and XPS) to PS granules free of hexabromocyclododecane (HBCDD). Advances in Recycling & Waste Management. 2017, 2:2. DOI: 10.4172/2475-7675.1000131
- STOCKHOLM CONVENTION. 2009. The 9 new POPs [Online]. Available: http://chm.pops.int/Programmes/NewPOPs/The9newPOPs/tabid/672/language/en-US/Default.aspx [Accessed 11 January 2010].
- TANGE, L. & DROHMANN, D. 2003. Waste Management Concept for WEEE Plastics Containing Brominated Flame Retardants, Including Bromine Recycling and Energy Recovery. *Belgian Plastics and Rubber Institute*. Brussels. Available at:

http://www.cefic-

efra.com/images/stories/Press\_Release/tange\_drohmann\_bpri\_paper\_weee\_2003.pdf [Accessed 4 August 2017]

TANGE, L. & DROHMANN, D. 2005. Waste electrical and electronic equipment plastics with brominated flame retardants – from legislation to separate treatment – thermal processes. *Polymer Degradation and Stability*, 88, 35-40.

Umwelt Bundseamt, 2015, Identification of potentially POP-containing Wastes and

Recyclates - Derivation of Limit Values,

https://www.umweltbundesamt.de/publikationen/identification-of-potentially-pop-containing-

wastes [Accessed 21 November 2016].

UNITED NATIONS ENVIRONMENT PROGRAMME (UNEP). 2010. Technical review of the implications of recycling commercial Penta and Octabromodiphenyl ethers. Stockholm Convention document for 6th POP Reviewing Committee meeting (UNEP/POPS/POPRC.6/2). [Online]. Available:

http://chm.pops.int/Portals/0/Repository/POPRC6/UNEP-POPS-POPRC.6-

2.English.pdf [Accessed 05 April 2017].

 WANG, L.-C. & CHANG-CHIEN, G.-P. 2007. Characterizing the Emissions of Polybrominated Dibenzo-p-dioxins and Dibenzofurans from Municipal and Industrial Waste Incinerators. *Environmental Science & Technology*, 41, 1159-1165.

WEBER, R. & KUCH, B. 2003. Relevance of BFRs and thermal conditions on the formation pathways of brominated and brominated-chlorinated dibenzodioxins and dibenzofurans. *Environment International*, 29, 699-710.

WEIL, E. D. & LEVCHIK, S. V. 2008. Journal of Fire Sciences, 26, 243-281.

WRAP, 2006. Develop a process to separate brominated flame retardants from WEEE polymers. Available at:

http://www.wrap.org.uk/sites/files/wrap/BrominatedWithAppendices.3712.pdf [Accessed 4

August 2017]

WRAP, 2012. Composition of kerbside and HWRC bulky waste. Waste & Resources Action Programme. Project MDP006-002. Available at: <u>http://www.wrap.org.uk/content/study-re-</u> <u>use-potential-household-bulky-waste</u> [Accessed 4 August 2017]

WRC 2012a. Analysis of PBDEs in UK Waste Streams: PBDEs in end of life vehicles.

WRc (2012b) Analysis of Poly-Brominated Diphenyl Ethers (PBDEs) in Selected UK Waste

Streams: PBDEs in waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) and end of life

vehicles (ELV) WRc Ref: UC8720.05

### **Figures and Tables**

Class	Sub-class	Number of
		Samples
	EPS	40
Construction and Demolition	XPS	20
Find of Life Makinlay (FLM)	Foam	38
End of Life vehicles (ELV)	Fabrics	81
	Carpets	31
	Curtains	15
Soft Furnishings	Furniture Fabrics	22
	Furniture Foam Filling	20
	Mattresses	34
	Large Household Appliances	57
	Cooling Appliances	30
Waste Electrical and Electronic Equipment	Display	43
	Small Domestic Appliances	29
	It and Telecommunications	78

### Table 1 Classes and subclasses of waste products analysed for POP-BFRs

 Table 2 Mean, median, minimum and maximum concentrations (mg/kg) of POP-BFRs and BDE-209

in samples from waste streams in Ireland

Waste Stream	Sub-Category	Statistical parameter	∑HBCDD	∑₅PBDEs	BDE-209
		mean	2100	<0.0003	<0.0008
	EPS	median	100	<0.0003	<0.0008
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
Construction &		тах	10000	<0.0003	<0.0008
Demolition		mean	27	<0.0003	<0.0008
	VDC	median	19	<0.0003	<0.0008
	XPS	min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	94	<0.0003	<0.0008
		mean	<0.0003	20	10
		median	<0.0003	0.05	0.73
	ELV FOAMS	min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
End of Life		max	2	740	120
Vehicles		mean	67	1.4	1400
	EIV/ Unholstony	median	<0.0003	0.095	3.6
	ELV Opholstery	min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	3300	20	31000
	Connete	mean	1	0.77	240
		median	<0.0003	<0.0003	0.008
	curpets	min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	26	13	7000
	Curtains	mean	3.8	0.2	3.7
		median	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	56	1.7	52
	Furniture Fabrics	mean	9200	21	6800
Soft Eurnishings		median	1.1	0.26	12
Sojt i uniisiniigs		min	0.005	0.00014	<0.0008
		тах	51000	160	73000
		mean	1100	0.79	660
	Furniture Foam	median	0.27	0.17	15
	Filling	min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	8000	7.2	7800
		mean	1.1	0.1	45
	Mattresses	median	<0.0003	0.056	6.8
		min	<0.0003	0.0035	<0.0008
		тах	12	0.87	870
	Large Household Appliances	mean	<0.0003	0.15	19
WEEE		median	<0.0003	<0.0003	0.036
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008

		max	<0.0003	2.6	190
	Cooling Appliances	mean	<0.0003	0.017	0.46
		median	<0.000001	<0.0003	<0.0008
		min	<0.000001	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	<0.0003	0.16	3.6
		mean	14	38	1900
	Display	median	0.014	<0.0003	<0.0008
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	330	1400	60000
	Small Domestic Appliances	mean	<0.0003	0.106	170
		median	<0.0003	0.016	0.019
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
		тах	<0.0003	0.84	1600
		mean	20	17	260
	It and Telecommunicati	median	<0.0003	0.089	0.21
		min	<0.0003	<0.0003	<0.0008
	0115	max	1600	890	7600

\*when calculating means sampled below limit of quantification were assumed to be equal to zero

# *Table 3: Estimated* annual masses (t/year) generated in Ireland for each waste category examined in this study

Waste Category	Estimated Annual Mass Generated in Ireland (t/year)	Source
C&D EPS/XPS	4,200	In 2011 ~ 3 million t of C&D waste was produced in Ireland (EPA, 2014). There are no specific data for C&D waste in Ireland, however the UK estimates that around 2.8 % of its C&D waste is insulation material, 5 % of which is EPS and XPS (Defra, 2010) which would lead to ~ 4,200 t/yr of waste EPS/XPS generated in Ireland.
LHA	13,604	EPA (2013)
Display	6,651	EPA (2013)
Fridges/Freezers	5,971	EPA (2013)
SDA and other IT	14,202	As separate estimates for arisings of SDA and items included in the "IT items" category are unavailable, we derived an estimate for combined arisings of these categories by assuming it to be equivalent to the figure cited for "Other WEEE" (e.g. stereos, phones, toys, vacuum cleaners, toasters, computers etc.) (EPA, 2013)
ELV foam & fabrics	2,651	Assuming 102,373 ELVs generated in 2012 (EPA, 2014), and an average vehicle weight of 1,069 kg (EPA, 2013). We then assumed that ELV foam and fabrics were identical to light ASR which WRc (2012a) reported represented 27,222 t of the 1,123,873 t ELV generated annually in the UK – i.e. 2.4 %
Carpets	7,834	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 arisings of 103,972 t (WRAP, 2012)
Furniture foam	2,685	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 waste arisings for sofas, armchairs and chairs combined of 237,516 t (WRAP, 2012) and authors' own estimate that of this 15 % is foam
Furniture fabrics	895	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 waste arisings for sofas, armchairs and chairs combined of 237,516 t (WRAP, 2012) and authors' own estimate that of this 5 % is fabrics
Curtains	754	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 arisings of 20,000 t for "all other bulky textiles" (WRAP, 2012) and authors' own estimate that 50 % of this is curtains
Mattress foam	6,272	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 arisings of 166,474 t (WRAP, 2012) and authors' own estimate that 50 % of this is foam
Mattress fabrics	2,509	Assuming Irish mass pro-rata <sup>a</sup> to UK 2010-11 arisings of 103,972 t (WRAP, 2012) and authors' own estimate that 20 % of this is fabrics

<sup>a</sup>pro-rata calculations based on 2011 Census data for UK population of 63,182,000 and 2016 Irish Census data for the population of Ireland of 4,761,185

Table 4: Estimated annual mass (kg/year) of POP-BDEs, HBCDD, and BDE-209 associated with Irish waste categories

Annual Mass (kg/year)						
Waste Category	POP- BDEs	HBCDD	ΣPOP- BFRs	BDE- 209	ΣPOP-BFRs + BDE- 209	
C&D	0	5,515	5,515	0	5,515	
LHAs <sup>a</sup>	0.058	0	0.058	0.71	0.730	
Display <sup>b</sup>	45.2	16.6	61.8	2,265	2,327	
Fridges/Freezers <sup>c</sup>	0.01	0	0.01	0.28	0.29	
SDAs & other IT equipment <sup>d</sup>	28.1	34	62.1	531	593	
ELV foam & fabrics	20	119	139	2,517	2,656	
Carpets	6.0	8.3	14	1,854	1,868	
Furniture Foam	2.1	3,079	3,081	1,776	4,857	
Furniture Fabrics	18.5	8,224	8,243	6,048	14,291	
Curtains	0.15	2.9	3.1	2.8	5.9	
Mattress Foam	0.88	0	0.88	498	499	
Mattress Fabrics	0.27	5.5	5.8	25.6	31.4	
Total	121	17,004	17,125	15,518	32,643	

<sup>a</sup>Assuming 0.29 % w/w of LHA is Br-containing plastic (WRc, 2012b)

<sup>b</sup>Assuming 18 % w/w of Display waste is Br-containing plastic (WRc, 2012b)

<sup>c</sup>Assuming 10 % w/w of Waste Fridges and Freezers is Br-containing plastic (WRc, 2012b)

<sup>d</sup>Assuming 16.1 % w/w of SDAs and other IT equipment is Br-containing plastic (WRc, 2012b). This based on estimates cited in WRc (2012b) that 0.75 % and 18 % of SDA and IT equipment respectively are Br-containing plastic and WRc (2012b) data for the UK that show mass of waste IT equipment is 8.21 times that of SDA

Figure 1 – Estimated mass (t/yr) of waste requiring POP-BFR treatment prior to disposal/recycling with and without the tLPCL for DecaBDE



Figure 2 Proportion (%) of total mass of POP-BFRs and DecaBDE diverted from Irish waste stream as a result of enforcement of existing LPCLs (for



HBCDD, Penta- and Octa-BDE) and tLPCL for DecaBDE