

University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

Phenotypic Covariance of Longevity, Immunity and Stress Resistance in the Caenorhabditis Nematodes

Amrit, FRG; Boehnisch, Claudia; May, Robin

DOI:

10.1371/journal.pone.0009978

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Amrit, FRG, Boehnisch, C & May, R 2010, 'Phenotypic Covariance of Longevity, Immunity and Stress Resistance in the Caenorhabditis Nematodes', *PLoS ONE*, vol. 5, no. 3, e9978. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0009978

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- •Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- •Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- •User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- •Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

Download date: 26. Apr. 2024

Phenotypic covariance of longevity, immunity and stress resistance in the *Caenorhabditis* nematodes

Francis RG Amrit, Claudia ML Boehnisch, Robin C May§

School of Biosciences, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, West Midlands, United Kingdom

§Corresponding author

Email addresses:

FRGA: frg681@bham.ac.uk

CB: c.m.boehnisch@bham.ac.uk

RCM: <u>r.c.may@bham.ac.uk</u>

1 Abstract

Background

2

3 Ageing, immunity and stresstolerance are inherent characteristics of all 4 organisms. In animals, these traits are regulated, at least in part, by forkhead 5 transcription factors in response to upstream signals from the Insulin/Insulin-6 like growth factor signalling (IIS) pathway. In the nematode Caenorhabditis 7 elegans, these phenotypes are molecularly linked such that activation of the 8 transcription factor DAF-16 both extends forkhead lifespan 9 simultaneously increases immunity and stress resistance. It is known that 10 lifespan varies significantly among the Caenorhabditis species but, although 11 DAF-16 signalling is highly conserved, it is unclear whether this phenotypic 12 Here we investigate this phenotypic linkage occurs in other species. 13 covariance by comparing longevity, stress resistance and immunity in four 14 Caenorhabditis species.

15 Methodology/Principal Findings

16 We show using phenotypic analysis of DAF-16 influenced phenotypes that 17 among four closely related Caenorhabditis nematodes, the gonochoristic 18 species (Caenorhabditis remanei and Caenorhabditis brenneri) have diverged 19 significantly with a longer lifespan, improved stress resistance and higher 20 immunity than the hermaphroditic species (C. elegans and Caenorhabditis 21 briggsae). Interestingly, we also observe significant differences in expression 22 levels between the *daf-16* homologues in these species using Real-Time PCR, 23 which positively correlate with the observed phenotypes. Finally, we provide 24 additional evidence in support of a role for DAF-16 in regulating phenotypic 25 coupling by using a combination of wildtype isolates, constitutively active 26 daf-16 mutants and bioinformatic analysis.

Conclusions

The gonochoristic species display a significantly longer lifespan (p < 0.0001) and more robust immune and stress response (p<0.0001, thermal stress; p<0.01, heavy metal stress; p<0.0001, pathogenic stress) than the hermaphroditic species. Our data suggests that divergence in DAF-16 mediated phenotypes may underlie many of the differences observed between these four species of *Caenorhabditis* nematodes. These findings are further supported by the correlative higher *daf-16* expression levels among the gonochoristic species and significantly higher lifespan, immunity and stress tolerance in the constitutively active *daf-16* hermaphroditic mutants.

Introduction

Longevity is a phenomenon shared by all living organisms but which varies hugely across species and between different sexes of the same species. Several evolutionary theories have been postulated to explain this phenomenon, but the underlying biological regulators of longevity remained largely unknown until pioneering genetic studies using the roundworm *Caenorhabditis elegans* identified the first gene with a substantial role in determining lifespan [1,2,3].

Given that post-reproductive survival cannot evolve under direct selection, diapause (the entry into a semi-dormant state with low metabolic turnover) is generally perceived as being a by-product of a survival strategy triggered by the organism to outlive harsh conditions so that, upon encountering a suitable environment, reproduction can be resumed [4]. One such strategy employed by the *Caenorhabditis* nematodes is to enter into a temporary, developmentally arrested dauer stage. [5,6,7]. In *C. elegans*, this phenomenon is regulated by the IIS (Insulin/Insulin-like growth factor (IGF) signalling) pathway, which

consists of a transmembrane protein DAF-2 [8], several intracellular kinases and the DAF-16 transcription factor [9]. When inactivated, this pathway not only extends lifespan but also regulates resistance to pathogens and abiotic stresses [10,11,12]. Mutations in this pathway, such as inhibitory mutations in *age-1* (a homologue of the mammalian phosphatidylinositol 3-OH kinase) or *daf-2* (a homologue of the mammalian insulin receptor) result in the relocalization of the transcription factor DAF-16 into the nucleus where it regulates a plethora of downstream genes [2,13,14,15,16].

The IIS pathway is highly conserved in organisms ranging from yeast to humans and, in many cases, appears to retain its dual role as a major effector of immunity and longevity [17,18,19,20]. Studies in *C. elegans* have explored this coupling relationship between the *daf-16* determined phenotypes of longevity, immunity and stress tolerance to a great extent, but little is known about the corresponding phenotypes in other nematode species.

Here we provide experimental data to address this question by undertaking a comprehensive analysis of immunity, stress response and longevity phenotypes in several representative isolates of four nematode species within the same genus. We demonstrate that, within this group of closely related animals, there exists a high divergence with regards to traits such as lifespan and stress tolerance and, intriguingly, in the expression of *daf-16*. Furthermore, we investigated conservation in the DAF-16 downstream regulon (target genes) by surveying the three available *Caenorhabditis* genomes (*C. elegans, C. briggsae* and *C. remanei*) for genes containing the known consensus sites for DAF-16. Based on orthologous sets of genes containing the consensus sites, we asked whether certain biological processes are more prevalent in one species than in others (divergent targets) and which processes are shared between all three species. We also tested for adaptive

sequence evolution along the IIS pathway in these species. Finally, we use classical genetics to constitutively activate the DAF-16 pathway in two *Caenorhabditis* species in order to experimentally identify both conserved and divergent downstream phenotypes.

Results

90 Gonochoristic species are longer lived than the hermaphroditic species and

show higher levels of daf-16 expression

We and others have previously demonstrated that different *Caenorhabditis* species exhibit significantly different lifespans [21,22]. Since different laboratory isolates can exhibit variation in lifespan [23], we conducted parallel longevity assays on our isolates of *C. elegans* N2, *C. briggsae* AF16, *C. remanei* EM464 and *C. brenneri* CB5161. As previously reported [22], the two gonochoristic species (*C. remanei* and *C. brenneri*) exhibit a significantly (p<0.0001; see Figure S1 for all p-values) longer lifespan than both hermaphroditic species (*C. elegans* and *C. briggsae*) (Figure 1a). Additional testing confirmed that this trend was highly conserved across multiple wildtype isolates of each species (Figure 1b, Figure S2), as previously reported [22]. The testing of several hermaphroditic wildtype isolates also ruled out the possibility that these observations were due to the fixation of novel mutations

Given the evolutionary conservation and critical role played by DAF-16 in regulating lifespan in *C. elegans*, we quantified *daf-16* mRNA levels in both mixed populations (nematodes at various stages of development) and staged populations (L2-L3, L4 and adult stages) of all strains of the four *Caenorhabditis* species. Whilst *C. briggsae* showed *daf-16* levels similar to those in *C. elegans*, *daf-16* expression in the two gonochoristic species was between

under the force of genetic drift in our laboratory *C.elegans* (N2) line.

seven (*C. brenneri*) and twelve (*C. remanei*) fold higher than *C. elegans* in the mixed populations (Figure 2a). Higher *daf-16* expression levels among the gonochoristic species was also observed throughout development in the staged populations (Figure 2bi, 2bii & 2biii) with the difference being most prominent in the L4 stage (Figure 2bii). Thus higher levels of *daf-16* expression seem to positively correlate with longer lifespan.

We also tested for expression levels of *daf-16* in *C.elegans* males using two independent reference genes (Figure S3) and found no significant transcriptional difference in comparison to *C. elegans* hermaphrodites, indicating that the absence or presence of males in a population has no effect with regards to *daf-16* expression levels. We note that the presence of both males and females within the gonochoristic population could mean that enhanced *daf-16* expression may be restricted to one or other gender, but given that both male and female animals in the gonochoristic species are longer lived than either gender of *C. elegans* or *C. briggsae* [21], we regard it as more likely that *daf-16* is highly expressed in both genders of the gonochoristic species.

Long-lived species are more resistant to abiotic stress than shorter-lived

132 species

In *C. elegans*, DAF-16 activity substantially increases survival following exposure to high temperature or heavy metals [10,24]. To test whether the observed higher levels of *daf-16* in the gonochoristic species also correlate with better survival to abiotic stress, we exposed multiple isolates of all four species to prolonged high temperature of 37°C (Figure 3a) or toxic heavy metals such as CuCl₂ (Figure 3b, Figure S4). In both cases, the gonochoristic species showed significantly (Figure S1) higher survival than either

hermaphroditic species. The correlation of these phenotypes with *daf-16* expression levels, together with prior knowledge from studies in *C. elegans*, suggests that higher DAF-16 levels could potentially be driving both increased lifespan and increased resistance to abiotic stress.

144

145

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

140

141

142

143

Longer-lived species in general are more resistant to biotic stress factors

146 than the shorter-lived species

Numerous human pathogens are now known to be lethal towards *C. elegans* [25,26,27,28,29,30,31]. Since DAF-16 activity contributes towards stress resistance during infection [32], we assessed whether the four Caenorhabditis species varied in resistance to a range of pathogens. Interestingly, type strains of the two long-lived, gonochoristic species (EM464 and CB5161) showed significantly higher resistance to the Gram-negative bacterium 4a), Pseudomonas aeruginosa (Figure the Gram-positive bacterium Staphylococcus aureus (Figure 4b) and the fungus Cryptococcus neoformans [21] than type strains of the two hermaphroditic species (AF16 and N2). However, all four species showed similar sensitivity to the Gram-negative pathogen Salmonella typhimurium (Figure 4c). To ensure that these differences were not isolate dependent, we tested multiple additional isolates of each species for resistance to *S. aureus*. In all cases, gonochoristic isolates exhibit substantially higher resistance to killing by this pathogen (Figure S2 and S5), suggesting that the higher DAF-16 levels in the two gonochoristic species may potentially drive enhanced resistance to some, but not all, pathogens.

163164

165

166

167

Since progeny production and the consequent risk of matricidal killing has previously been shown to shorten *C. elegans* lifespan, particularly when exposed to pathogens, [30,33,34] we considered the possibility that the enhanced survival of gonochoristic species may result from the absence of

matricidal killing. To test this, we exposed feminised (and thus infertile when singled) *C. elegans* animals (BA17, fem-1(hc17)) to the pathogenic bacteria *S. aureus*. As previously reported, feminised *C. elegans* exhibited improved survival under pathogenic conditions (Figure S6), but this increase is nowhere as significant as the increase in lifespan seen in the higher *daf-16* producing gonochoristic species on *S. aureus*. Thus the enhanced survival of gonochoristic species is not attributable to the lack of progeny production.

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

Manipulation of the DAF-16 pathway.

C. elegans DAF-16 activity can be dramatically enhanced by loss-of-function mutations in the upstream insulin-like growth factor receptor DAF-2 [35,36]. We investigated whether this phenomenon is conserved in *C. briggsae*, which, like *C. elegans*, has low basal levels of DAF-16 (Figure 2a), by comparing *daf-*2 loss-of-function mutants in both species. As previously reported [7] we observed that C. briggsae (daf-2) mutants, have increased longevity relative to wildtype animals (Figure 5a). In addition, inactivation of daf-2 in C. briggsae enhances resistance to high temperature (Figure 5b) and heavy metal toxicity (Figure 5c), as it does in *C. elegans* [10,37]. Interestingly, *C. briggsae daf-*2 mutants show enhanced resistance towards S. aureus (p < 0.02, Figure S7) and P. aeruginosa (p < 0.0001, Figure S7), but the magnitude of the increase is substantially smaller than that for *C. elegans daf-2* mutants (Figures 5d and 5e). Finally, loss of *daf-2* did not enhance resistance to *S. typhimuri*um in either *C.* elegans or C. briggsae (Figure 5f). Regrettably, genetic mutants in daf-2 or daf-16 are not available for either gonochoristic species, nor is RNA interference efficient enough in these species to allow direct manipulation of the IIS pathway in a similar manner. However, should such studies become feasible in the future, then our data would predict that loss of daf-2 would likely have

only a minimal effect on lifespan and stress resistance in the gonochoristic species.

Comparative analysis of the DAF-16 regulon in C. elegans, C. briggsae and

199 C. remanei

We considered the possibility that the DAF-16 pathway itself may have become modified during the diversification of the Caenorhabditid nematodes. However, calculation of Ka/Ks ratios for all of the components in the IIS signalling pathway (*daf-2*, *age-1*, *pdk-1*, *akt-1*, and *daf-16*) between *C. elegans*, *C.*

204 briggsae and C. remanei showed no evidence for positive selection in any of the

205 genes (Figure S8).

Given that the IIS pathway itself does not appear to have been modified during the evolution of these species, we next investigated whether the downstream targets of DAF-16 differed between the three sequenced nematode species (*C. elegans*, *C. briggsae* and *C. remanei*). We searched for the presence of perfectly matched DAF-16 canonical consensus sites (ttattac/gtaaataa, ttgtttac/gtaaacaa) in the 3kb upstream of every predicted gene in *C. elegans*, *C. briggsae* and *C. remanei*. In *C. elegans* our approach yielded 6293 genes (31.2% of the genome) containing either one or both of the known sites in their 3kb upstream region. In comparison, only 23.4% (5,150 genes) in *C. briggsae* and 26.7% (8,456 genes) in *C. remanei* contained at least one of the consensus sites. We note that the short length and relative variability of the DAF-16 consensus sequence means that this approach inherently overestimates the number of DAF-16 binding sites in the genome. However, given the absence of experimental techniques (such as chromatin immunoprecipitation) in the non-*elegans* species, such a bioinformatic

222 approach is, at present, the only way of obtaining an approximate estimate of 223 genome-wide differences in the IIS pathway within this group of organisms. 224 Based on this analysis, the number of orthologous genes that contain perfect 225 matches to the DAF-16 consensus binding sites appears similar between C. 226 elegans and C. briggsae (1900 genes), C. elegans and C. remanei (2111 genes) and 227 C. briggsae and C. remanei (2165 genes). However, although C. elegans, C. 228 briggsae and C. remanei have 13,015 genes in common (64.4% of the C. elegans 229 genome) only 913 of these contain the DAF-16 binding elements in all three 230 species, a group that we define as the core DAF-16 regulon (Figure S9). 231 232 Based on these gene sets, we asked whether the core DAF-16 regulon and the 233 species-specific DAF-16 regulons differ in the type of genes they contain by 234 testing whether particular gene ontology (GO) terms (using GOTERM 235 BP_ALL and GOTERM BP_2) are overrepresented (Figure S10 and file S11). 236 The DAF-16 core regulon shows, amongst others, enrichment for genes that 237 are involved in lifespan regulation, immune response and responses to 238 chemical stimuli (including detoxification and stress response) (Figure S10). 239 Intriguingly, whilst both the *C. elegans*-specific and *C. remanei*-specific DAF-16 240 regulons also show overrepresentation of genes involved in immunity (11 241 genes in C. elegans, 13 genes in C. remanei) and stress responses (38 genes in C. 242 elegans, 14 genes in C. remanei) these groups are not overrepresented in the C. 243 *briggsae*-specific DAF-16 regulon (Figure S10). 244 245 In order to reduce the number of false positives in our C. elegans dataset we 246 compared it to a gene list containing all putative DAF-16 targets recently 247 identified in *C. elegans* via a range of other approaches by Oh [38], Murphy

[14], Halaschek-Wiener [39], Lee [16], McElwee

Altogether, 1746 genes were identified as putative DAF-16 targets in at least

one of these other datasets and 678 of these were also identified by our

248

249

250

10

[40] and Dong [41].

approach, a group we refer to as the adjusted dataset. Of the 678 potential *C. elegans* DAF-16 target genes, 283 overlap with the *C. brigssae* dataset and 274 genes were found in the *C. remanei* list. The adjusted DAF-16 core regulon (genes found in all three species) contains 145 genes (Figure 6a).

Partitioning the adjusted DAF-16 core regulon using the GOTERM BP_ALL and GOTERM BP_2 gene categories revealed significant enrichment for genes involved in the regulation of lifespan, stress response, transport, localization and metabolism (Figure 6b and Figure S12). As expected the outcomes of the analyses of the unadjusted and the adjusted datasets differ slightly. However, the overall pattern is the same between the two approaches for both the core regulon as well as the species-specific regulon.

Finally, we compared the list of putative *C. elegans* DAF_16 targets identified by Oh and colleagues via a direct, chromatin immunoprecipitation (ChIP) approach [38] with those identified via microarray or bioinformatic approaches in the other studies (Murphy [14], Halaschek-Wiener [39], Lee [16], McElwee [40] and Dong [41]) or our own dataset. (Table 2). Interestingly, there is very little overlap between DAF-16 targets identified by ChIP and those inferred from microarray or bioinformatic analysis, with the exception of 11 genes shared between Oh et al and McElwee et al and 30 genes shared between Oh et al and our dataset. Thus there is likely to be considerable benefit in combining a range of experimental approaches in order to narrow down the list of true DAF-16 target genes.

Discussion

277 It is now clear that the lifespan of an organism is determined by a 278 combination of environmental conditions, stochastic factors (such as lifestyle) and genetic background. Numerous studies have demonstrated that the evolutionarily conserved transcription factor DAF-16 is a critical gene regulator that controls the transcription of hundreds of genes involved in immunity, stress responses and longevity in *C. elegans* [42]. The homologues of *daf-16* in other organisms have been shown to perform similar functions [18] and yet species differ significantly in terms of lifespan and immunity, raising the question of how such DAF-16 mediated phenotypes have changed through evolutionary time.

Here we show covariance of three DAF-16 mediated phenotypes, longevity, immunity and stress response, across the Caenorhabditis genus. Strikingly, the two gonochoristic species (C. remanei and C. brenneri) show significantly higher basal expression of DAF-16 than the shorter-lived hermaphroditic species *C. elegans* and *C. briggsae*. Thus, enhanced expression and/or activation of DAF-16 may be an important mechanism by which species regulate a combination of phenotypes that enhance resistance to abiotic and biotic stresses and hence favour a longer life. The fact that this pattern is seen in multiple isolates of two gonochoristic species may reflect their need to search for a partner to mate, a lifestyle that increases the chance of encountering stressful conditions (eg. pathogens, high temperature) and is likely to favour the evolution of a longer lifespan in order to increase mating opportunities. In addition, since we know very little about the natural ecology of the Caenorhabditis nematodes [43], it is possible that differences in the niches inhabited by these species may impose extrinsic stresses that have led to the evolution of improved stress tolerance via the over-expression of DAF-16.

It is interesting to note that susceptibility to several pathogens correlates with other DAF-16 mediated effects, with the exception of the Gram-negative bacterium *S. typhimurium*, which shows similar lethality in all four species

and the two *daf-2* mutants. Since *S. typhimurium* is one of the few human pathogens thus far shown to establish a truly persistent infection in the worm due to its resistance towards antimicrobial peptides [25,44], this finding may indicate that DAF-16 plays little or no role in dealing with gut-colonising pathogens.

The insulin-like signalling pathway contributes to both innate immune responses and stress responses in *C. elegans*. Our data suggests that this may also hold true in closely related nematode species. In line with this, we show that the components of this pathway do not show evidence of adaptive sequence evolution during the diversification of these species whereas the complement of putative downstream targets controlled by DAF-16 appear to vary between these species. All three sequenced species share a core DAF-16 regulon comprised of genes functioning in longevity, stress response and other biological processes. However, whilst *C. elegans* and *C. remanei* contain a similar set of target types in their species-specific DAF-16 regulons, the species-specific DAF-16 regulon of *C. briggsae* lacks genes involved in immunity and stress response. Interestingly, in line with this finding, we observed that a *daf-2* mutant in *C. briggsae* is long-lived and resistant to abiotic stress, but only moderately resistant to killing by a range of pathogens.

The majority of enriched genes identified by our approach are associated with other biological processes such as metabolism, transport and other functions, in line with previous studies that have identified downstream targets of DAF-16 in *C. elegans* [14,38,39,40,45,46]. We note, however, that such bioinformatic analyses are susceptible to false positive (due to the chance occurrence of DAF-16 consensus sequences) and false negative (due to its reliance on perfect-match sequence motifs) errors. Indeed, depending on the approach used, others have estimated that up to 78% of *C. elegans* genes might

be potential DAF-16 downstream targets [42]. As such, we would emphasize that our bioinformatic analysis is intended only as a guide for future experimental analyses once tools become available.

In conclusion, we demonstrate covariance of DAF-16 mediated phenotypes in the four most well-characterized species of the *Caenorhabditis* clade. We note that our data are correlative but, as yet, cannot prove a causative influence of *daf-16* expression level on these phenotypes in the gonochoristic species. Currently, demonstrating a direct role for DAF-16 in phenotypic covariance in the gonochoristic nematodes is not technically feasible. Very few genetic mutants have been made in these species, RNA interference is of low efficiency and no antibodies exist for chromatin immunoprecipitation approaches. However, many groups are currently attempting to develop such tools for these species and, as such, we hope that a full mechanistic investigation of the IIS pathway in non-elegans species will be feasible within the next few years.

Materials and Methods

Bacterial strains and growth conditions

Escherichia coli OP50 [47], Salmonella typhimurium SL1344 [48], Pseudomonas aeruginosa PA01 and Staphylococcus aureus NCTC8532 were grown in nutrient rich Luria-Bertani (LB) broth overnight with shaking at 37°. The bacterial culture was then seeded onto standard Nematode Growth agar Medium (NGM[47,49]) plates. These plates were incubated overnight at 37° (~16hrs) followed by storage at 4°. Plates were always equilibrated to room temperature before use.

Worm Strains

Worm strains N2, RC301, CB4856 (wildtype Caenorhabditis elegans), AF16, ED3033, ED3034 (wildtype Caenorhabditis briggsae), EM464, JU1082, JU1084 (wildtype Caenorhabditis remanei), CB5161, LKC28, SB129 (wildtype Caenorhabditis brenneri), CB1370 [C. elegans daf-2(e1370)], PS5531 [C. briggsae daf-2(sy5445)] and BA17 [C.elegans fem-1 (hc17)] were grown on standard NGM plates seeded with OP50 strain of E. coli bacteria as a food source [47,49]. All strains except BA17 (which was grown at 25°C to induce feminisation) were grown at 20°C. Fourth larval stage hermaphrodites from the hermaphroditic species and females from the gonochoristic species were used for all the phenotypic assays performed.

Longevity/Pathogen Assays

The hermaphroditic and gonochoristic strains of worms were bleached [49] to produce age-synchronous L4 molt populations. Between 80 and 250 L4 worms from the hermaphroditic species, or females in the case of gonochoristic species, were transferred onto NGM plates (~30 worms per plate, yielding up to 10 replicates) seeded with OP50 for longevity assays and SL1344, PA01 and NCTC8532 for pathogen assays as food source. Plates with OP50 were incubated at 20°C with the rest being incubated at 25°C. Worms grown at 25°C on OP50 have been shown to have a significantly longer lifespan than those grown on pathogenic bacteria such as *S. typhimurium* [25] which eliminates the negative effects of heat as an experimental determinant. The worms on all these plates were scored for survival every 24hrs. Animals were considered dead when they failed to respond to prodding by a platinum wire. The worms were transferred onto new plates every one to two days until they stopped egg laying, in order to prevent F1 progeny from interfering with the experiment.

393 **Heat Shock Assay** 394 L4 worms from the hermaphroditic species, and females in the case of 395 gonochoristic species, were transferred onto NGM plates with OP50 that had 396 been prewarmed to 37°. These plates were then incubated at 37°C and the 397 worms were scored for survival at hourly intervals. 398 399 Metallotolerance Assay 400 Age synchronous L4 worms were transferred from NGM plates into 24-well 401 tissue culture plates containing copper chloride (7mM) dissolved in K 402 medium (53mM NaCl, 32mM KCl) [10,50]. The plate was incubated at 20°C 403 and the worms were scored for survival every hour. 404 405 **Statistical Analysis** 406 Survival curves were produced based on the Kaplan-Meier method using MS-407 Excel and the significance was calculated using the non-parametric log-rank 408 method. Assays were then corrected for multiple testing using the Bonferroni 409 correction. 410 411 412 413 Preparation of total nematode mRNA and Quantitative RT PCR 414 For qRT-PCR, RNA was isolated from a mixed larval stage population of each 415 of the four species of worms. These worms were grown on NGM plates with 416 OP50 as food source at 20°. Animals were then washed off the plates using 417 M9 buffer, followed by repeated washes again with M9 buffer before being 418 homogenized using the Precellys 24 machine (Stretton Scientific). The RNA 419 was then isolated from these worm samples using the Qiagen RNeasy Mini

kit (cat. No. 74140) using the manufacturer's protocol. RNA was then reverse

421 transcribed into cDNA using Superscript II reverse transcriptase (Invitrogen) 422 according to the manufacturer's instructions. Real-time quantitative RT-PCR 423 was performed (7300 Real Time PCR System; Applied Bio Systems) on this 424 cDNA using the SYBR Green PCR kit (Quantace) to determine the expression 425 levels of daf-16 across the four species. Primers for this were designed 426 manually and tested for maximum efficiency with their respective cDNA 427 prior to qRT-PCR. Primers used include daf-16 primers for C. elegans, C. 428 briggsae, C. remanei and C. brenneri (Table 1).

The RT PCR levels were normalized to the housekeeping gene,

429

430

431 Glyceraldehyde 3-Phosphate Dehydrogenase (*gpd*-3). The primers for this 432 gene were; Primer Fwd - TGAAGGGAATTCTCGCTTACACC and Primer 433 Rev – GAGTATCCGAACTCGTTATCGTAC. We confirmed that our results 434 were not due to variation in gpd-3 by cross checking RT PCR levels against 435 another reference gene, 18sRNA, the primers for which were; Primer Fwd -436 TTCTTCCATGTCCGGGATAG and Primer Rev 437 CCCCACTCTTCTCGAATCAG. To assess the efficacy of the primers and the 438 sensitivity of the qPCR assay, 2-fold dilution series of the template DNA for 439 all the species tested were prepared and subjected to qPCR amplification. The 440 results obtained were extrapolated to produce standard curves by linear 441 regression analysis between threshold cycle (Ct) and sample dilution that 442 gave coefficients of determination (r²) that exceeded 0.95 for all 443 template/primer combinations (Figure S13). Once amplification efficiencies of 444 the target and the reference were determined to be approximately equal, RT 445 PCRs were carried out for all the experimental conditions. These results were 446 analysed using the ΔC_T method with the *gpd-3* and 18S RNA levels as controls 447 for normalization and expressed as fold change compared to *C. elegans* [51].

448

449

Bioinformatic analysis of DAF-16 downstream targets

450 The complete genomes of *C. elegans* (20,189 genes), *C. briggsae* (21,976 genes) 451 and C. remanei (31,614 genes) were downloaded from Wormbase release WS 452 197 (www. wormbase.org). We surveyed a 3000bp upstream flanking region 453 of each gene (upstream of the lead ATG) for the presence of the two known 454 canonical DAF-16 binding sites (ttatttac/gtaaataa, ttgtttac/gtaaacaa; [52]). We 455 applied a perfect match approach using the dna-pattern tool implemented in 456 the freely available software package Regulatory Sequence Analysis Tools 457 (RSAT; http://rsat.bigre.ulb.ac.be/rsat/; [53]). Only genes with upstream 458 flanking region containing one or more perfect matches to the consensus sites 459 were included in further analyses. From this set of genes we then retrieved a 460 subset of genes for each species that are orthologous either between C. elegans 461 and C. briggsae, C. elegans and C. remanei or between all three species. Based on 462 these orthologous gene sets we defined the following classes: i) a species-463 specific DAF-16-regulon, consisting of orthologs that contain the consensus 464 site in only one of the species, ii) the species-shared DAF-16 regulon, 465 consisting of orthologous genes that contain the consensus site in two of the 466 species and iii) the core-DAF-16 regulon, consisting of orthologs that contain 467 the consensus site in all three species. These gene subsets were subsequently 468 analysed in order to identify enriched functional gene groups. This analysis 469 was performed using the functional annotation tools available from the non-470 commercial bioinformatic database DAVID (Database for Annotation, 471 Visualization and Integrated Discovery) [54,55]. 472 Furthermore we compared the resulting *C. elegans* gene list to the available 473 datasets of Oh [38], Murphy [14], Halaschek-Wiener [39], Lee [16], McElwee 474 [40] and Dong [41]. These datasets were combined, duplicates removed and 475 subsequently run against the C. elegans gene list (containing all genes with a 476 perfect match to one of the binding motifs). The resulting gene list was then 477 compared to the lists obtained for C. briggsae and for C. remanei. The three

478 resulting lists were analysed using the functional annotation tools in DAVID.

Finally, we looked whether there was any overlap between the dataset of Oh

and the datasets of Murphy, McElwee, Lee, Halaschek-Wiener, Dong.

We determined the number of genes that were enriched within the functional annotation category Gene Ontology GOTERM BP_ALL and especially enriched in GOTERM BP_2. The results were obtained by using the Functional Annotation Chart tool. The GOTERMS BP are available from the DAVID database. The p-value obtained in this analysis is equivalent to the EASE score, which uses a conservative adjustment of the Fisher's exact probability, and was applied to identify significantly enriched gene categories. DAVID provides several methods to correct for multiple testing which include Bonferroni adjustment of the p-value, and the Benjamini-Hochberg approach to control for family-wide false positive rate. The fold enrichment value measures the magnitude of enrichment and is considered significant if 1.5 or above [54] . For more statistical details and detailed

For all orthologs, the corresponding WormBase IDs of *C. elegans* genes were used as input files. Orthologs between *C. remanei* and *C. briggsae* but not occurring in *C. elegans* could not be addressed with this approach. All orthologous genes with a duplicate output in one of the species were counted only as one gene.

description of the annotation methods used in DAVID please refer to the cited

Adaptive sequence evolution

references above and references therein.

503 Adaptive sequence evolution along the IIS pathway was studied in *C. elegans*,

504 C. briggsae and C. remanei. Protein sequences and DNA sequences of the

505 coding regions ranging from daf-2, age-1, pdk-1, akt-1, and daf-16 were obtained

506 from WormBase WS197 (www.wormbase.org). Protein sequences and DNA 507 coding regions were aligned using ClustalX2 [56]. For each gene of interest, 508 the presence of adaptive sequence evolution (ratio between synonymous [Ks] 509 and non-synonymous [K_A] substitutions) was calculated between a pair of 510 sequences (C. elegans and C. brigssae; C. elegans and C. remanei; C. briggsae and 511 C. remanei) using PAL2NAL [57]. PAL2NAL calculates Ks and KA by the 512 codeml program in PAML. Briefly, pairwise protein alignments in CLUSTAL 513 format and the corresponding DNA sequence alignments in FASTA format 514 were used as input files. The following option settings were used. (i) Codon 515 table: "universal". (ii) Remove gaps and inframe stop codons: "Yes". iii) 516 Calculate Ks and KA: "Yes". (iv) Remove mismatches: "No".

517

518

Acknowledgements

- 519 The authors are grateful to the Caenorhabditis Genetics Center and Paul
- 520 Sternberg for providing worm strains and Laura Piddock for providing
- 521 bacterial isolates.

522

523

References

- 1. Klass MR (1983) A method for the isolation of longevity mutants in the nematode
 Caenorhabditis elegans and initial results. Mechanisms of Ageing and
 Development 22: 279-286.
- 527 2. Friedman DB, Johnson TE (1988) A Mutation in the age-1 Gene in Caenorhabditis
 528 elegans Lengthens Life and Reduces Hermaphrodite Fertility. Genetics 118:
 529 75-86.
- 530 3. Kirkwood TB (2005) Understanding the odd science of aging. Cell 120: 437-447.
- 4. Partridge L, Gems D (2002) The evolution of longevity. Current Biology 12: R544-R546.
- 533 5. Cassada RC, Russell RL (1975) The dauer larva, a post-embryonic developmental 534 variant of the nematode Caenorhabditis elegans. Developmental Biology 46: 535 326-342.
- 6. Fodor A, Riddle DL, Nelson FK, Golden JW (1983) Comparison of a New Wild Type Caenorhabditis briggsae With Laboratory Strains of C. briggsae and C.
 elegans. Nematologica 29: 203-216.
- 7. Inoue T, Ailion M, Poon S, Kim HK, Thomas JH, et al. (2007) Genetic Analysis of Dauer Formation in Caenorhabditis briggsae. Genetics 177: 809-818.

- 8. Riddle DL, Blumenthal T, Meyer BJ, Priess JR (1997) C. Elegans II: Cold Spring
 Harbor Laboratory Press.
- 9. Riddle DL, Swanson MM, Albert PS (1981) Interacting genes in nematode dauer
 larva formation. Nature 290: 668-671.
- 545 10. Barsyte D, Lovejoy DA, Lithgow GJ (2001) Longevity and heavy metal resistance 546 in daf-2 and age-1 long-lived mutants of Caenorhabditis elegans. FASEB J 15: 547 627-634.
- 548 11. Evans EA, Kawli T, Tan M-W (2008) Pseudomonas aeruginosa Suppresses Host
 549 Immunity by Activating the DAF-2 Insulin-Like Signaling Pathway in
 550 Caenorhabditis elegans. PLoS Pathog 4: e1000175.
- 12. Murakami S, Johnson TE (1996) A Genetic Pathway Conferring Life Extension
 and Resistance to UV Stress in Caenorhabditis elegans. Genetics 143: 1207 1218.
- 13. Kenyon C, Chang J, Gensch E, Rudner A, Tabtiang R (1993) A C. elegans mutant that lives twice as long as wild type. Nature 366: 461-464.
- 14. Murphy CT, McCarroll SA, Bargmann CI, Fraser A, Kamath RS, et al. (2003)
 Genes that act downstream of DAF-16 to influence the lifespan of
 Caenorhabditis elegans. Nature 424: 277-284.
- 15. Kimura KD, Tissenbaum HA, Liu Y, Ruvkun G (1997) daf-2, an Insulin
 Receptor-Like Gene That Regulates Longevity and Diapause in
 Caenorhabditis elegans. Science 277: 942-946.

565

- 16. Lee SS, Kennedy S, Tolonen AC, Ruvkun G (2003) DAF-16 Target Genes That Control C. elegans Life-Span and Metabolism. Science 300: 644-647.
 - 17. Clancy DJ, Gems D, Harshman LG, Oldham S, Stocker H, et al. (2001) Extension of Life-Span by Loss of CHICO, a Drosophila Insulin Receptor Substrate Protein. Science 292: 104-106.
- 18. Holzenberger M, Dupont J, Ducos B, Leneuve P, Geloen A, et al. (2003) IGF-1 receptor regulates lifespan and resistance to oxidative stress in mice. Nature 421: 182-187.
- 570 19. Longo VD (2003) The Ras and Sch9 pathways regulate stress resistance and longevity. Experimental Gerontology 38: 807-811.
- 572 20. Tatar M, Bartke A, Antebi A (2003) The Endocrine Regulation of Aging by 573 Insulin-like Signals. Science 299: 1346-1351.
- 21. Berg MCWVD, Woerlee JZ, Ma H, May RC (2006) Sex-dependent resistance to the pathogenic fungus Cryptococcus neoformans. Genetics 173: 677–683.
- 22. McCulloch D, Gems D (2003) Evolution of male longevity bias in nematodes.
 Aging Cell 2: 165-173.
- 23. Patel MN, Knight CG, Karageorgi C, Leroi AM (2002) Evolution of germ-line
 signals that regulate growth and aging in nematodes. Proceedings of the
 National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 99: 769-774.
- 581 24. Galbadage TH, Phil S. (2008) Repeated temperature fluctuation extends the life
 582 span of Caenorhabditis elegans in a daf-16-dependent fashion. Mechanisms of
 583 Ageing and Development 129: 507-514.
- 25. Aballay A, Yorgey P, Ausubel FM (2000) Salmonella typhimurium proliferates
 and establishes a persistent infection in the intestine of Caenorhabditis
 elegans. Current Biology 10: 1539-1542.
- 587 26. Gallagher LA, Manoil C (2001) Pseudomonas aeruginosa PAO1 Kills
 588 Caenorhabditis elegans by Cyanide Poisoning. J Bacteriol 183: 6207-6214.

- 589 27. Joshua GWP, Karlyshev AV, Smith MP, Isherwood KE, Titball RW, et al. (2003) 590 A Caenorhabditis elegans model of Yersinia infection: biofilm formation on a 591 biotic surface. Microbiology 149: 3221-3229.
- 28. Kurz CL, Chauvet S, Andrès E, Aurouze M, Vallet I, Michel GP, Uh M, Celli J,
 Filloux A, De Bentzmann S, Steinmetz I, Hoffmann JA, Finlay BB, Gorvel JP,
 Ferrandon D, Ewbank JJ (2003) Virulence factors of the human opportunistic
 pathogen Serratia marcescens identified by in vivo screening. The EMBO
 Journal 1451–1460.
- 29. Labrousse A, Chauvet S, Couillault C, Léopold Kurz C, Ewbank JJ (2000)
 Caenorhabditis elegans is a model host for Salmonella typhimurium. Current
 Biology 10: 1543-1545.
- 30. Sifri CD, Begun J, Ausubel FM, Calderwood SB (2003) Caenorhabditis elegans as
 a Model Host for Staphylococcus aureus Pathogenesis. Infect Immun 71:
 2208-2217.
- 31. Mylonakis E, Idnurm A, Moreno R, El Khoury J, Rottman JB, et al. (2004)
 Cryptococcus neoformans Kin1 protein kinase homologue, identified through
 a Caenorhabditis elegans screen, promotes virulence in mammals. Molecular
 Microbiology 54: 407-419.
- 32. Garsin DA, Villanueva JM, Begun J, Kim DH, Sifri CD, et al. (2003) Long-Lived
 C. elegans daf-2 Mutants Are Resistant to Bacterial Pathogens. Science 300:
 1921-.
- 33. Aballay A, Yorgey P, Ausubel FM (2000) Salmonella typhimurium proliferates
 and establishes a persistent infection in the intestine of Caenorhabditis
 elegans. Curr Biol 10: 1539-1542.
- 34. O'Quinn AL, Wiegand EM, Jeddeloh JA (2001) Burkholderia pseudomallei kills
 the nematode Caenorhabditis elegans using an endotoxin-mediated paralysis.
 Cell Microbiol 3: 381-393.
 - 35. Henderson ST, Johnson TE (2001) daf-16 integrates developmental and environmental inputs to mediate aging in the nematode Caenorhabditis elegans. Current Biology 11: 1975-1980.

617

- 619 36. Lee RYN, Hench J, Ruvkun G (2001) Regulation of C. elegans DAF-16 and its 620 human ortholog FKHRL1 by the daf-2 insulin-like signaling pathway. Current 621 Biology 11: 1950-1957.
- 37. G J Lithgow TMW, S Melov, and T E Johnson. (1995) Thermotolerance and
 extended life-span conferred by single-gene mutations and induced by thermal
 stress. PNAS 92: 7540–7544. .
- 38. Oh SW, Mukhopadhyay A, Dixit BL, Raha T, Green MR, et al. (2006)
 Identification of direct DAF-16 targets controlling longevity, metabolism and diapause by chromatin immunoprecipitation. Nature Genetics 38: 251-257.
- 39. Halaschek-Wiener J, Khattra JS, McKay S, Pouzyrev A, Stott JM, et al. (2005)
 Analysis of long-lived C. elegans daf-2 mutants using serial analysis of gene expression. Genome Research 15: 603-615.
- 40. McElwee JJ, Schuster E, Blanc E, Piper MD, Thomas JH, et al. (2007)
 Evolutionary conservation of regulated longevity assurance mechanisms.
 Genome Biology 8: -.
- 41. Dong MQ, Venable JD, Au N, Xu T, Park SK, et al. (2007) Quantitative mass
 spectrometry identifies insulin signaling targets in C. elegans. Science 317:
 660-663.
- 42. Murphy CT (2006) The search for DAF-16/FOXO transcriptional targets: Approaches and discoveries. Experimental Gerontology 41: 910-921.

- 43. Kiontke K, Sudhaus W (2006) Ecology of Caenorhabditis species; Fitch DHA, editor.
- 44. Alegado RA, Tan MW (2008) Resistance to antimicrobial peptides contributes to
 persistence of Salmonella typhimurium in the C. elegans intestine. Cell
 Microbiol 10: 1259-1273.
- 45. McElwee J, Bubb K, Thomas JH (2003) Transcriptional outputs of the
 Caenorhabditis elegans forkhead protein DAF-16. Aging Cell 2: 111-121.
- 46. McElwee JJ, Schuster E, Blanc E, Thomas JH, Gems D (2004) Shared
 transcriptional signature in Caenorhabditis elegans dauer larvae and long-lived
 daf-2 mutants implicates detoxification system in longevity assurance. Journal
 of Biological Chemistry 279: 44533-44543.
- 47. Brenner S (1974) The genetics of Caenorhabditis elegans. Genetics 77: 71-94.
- 48. Aballay A, Ausubel FM (2001) Programmed cell death mediated by ced-3 and ced-4 protects Caenorhabditis elegans from Salmonella typhimurium-mediated killing. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 98: 2735-2739.
- 49. Hope IA (1999) C.elegans . A Practical Approach.; Hames BD, editor. Leeds:
 Oxford University Press.
- 50. Dusenbery PLWaDB (1990) Aquatic toxicity testing using the nematode,
 Caenorhabditis elegans. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry 9: pp.
 1285–1290.
- 51. Livak KJ, Schmittgen TD (2001) Analysis of relative gene expression data using real-time quantitative PCR and the 2(T)(-Delta Delta C) method. Methods 25: 402-408.
 - 52. Furuyama T, Nakazawa T, Nakano I, Mori N (2000) Identification of the differential distribution patterns of mRNAs and consensus binding sequences for mouse DAF-16 homologues. Biochem J 349: 629-634.
- 53. Van Helden J, Del Olmo M, Perez-Ortin JE (2000) Statistical analysis of yeast
 genomic downstream sequences reveals putative polyadenylation signals.
 Nucleic Acids Research 28: 1000-1010.
 - 54. Huang DW, Sherman BT, Lempicki RA (2008) Systematic and integrative analysis of large gene lists using DAVID bioinformatics resources. Nat Protocols 4: 44-57.
- 55. Dennis G, Sherman B, Hosack D, Yang J, Gao W, et al. (2003) DAVID: Database
 for Annotation, Visualization, and Integrated Discovery. Genome Biology 4:
 P3.
- 56. Larkin MA BG, Brown NP, Chenna R, McGettigan PA, McWilliam H, Valentin
 F, Wallace IM, Wilm A, Lopez R, Thompson JD, Gibson TJ, Higgins DG.
 (2007) Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. Bioinformatics 23: 2947-2948.
- 57. Suyama M, Torrents D, Bork P (2006) PAL2NAL: robust conversion of protein sequence alignments into the corresponding codon alignments. Nucl Acids Res 34: W609-612.

662

663

664

668

669

670

682

683

692 Figures Legends

693 Figure 1 – Lifespan analysis

- 694 (a) Hermaphrodite (N2, AF16) or female (EM464, CB5161) animals at the
- 695 fourth larval stage (L4) were transferred onto plates pre-seeded with OP50
- and monitored for survival over fifty days. Whilst hermaphrodite animals
- show 100% lethality over this period, survival is significantly higher for both
- 698 gonochoristic species (p < 0.0001, Figure S1), with more than 50% of animals
- 699 surviving longer than twenty days. (b) This effect is conserved across multiple
- 700 wildtype isolates of each species.

701 Figure 2 – Quantitation of *daf-16* gene expression

- 702 (a) mRNA from a mixed population of hermaphroditic (N2, AF16) and
- 703 gonochoristic (EM464, CB5161) animals was extracted and daf-16 gene
- 704 expression was quantified relative to the housekeeping gene gpd-3. Data
- represent the mean of three experiments, error bars show standard deviation.
- 706 (b) daf-16 gene expression for the same species but measured at various stages
- of development that include L2-L3 stage (bi), L4 stage (bii) and the adult stage
- 708 (biii)

709 Figure 3 - Survival analysis following exposure to abiotic stress (heat and

- 710 heavy metal)
- 711 L4 Hermaphrodite (N2, AF16) or female (EM464, CB5161) animals were
- 712 monitored for survival (a) at 37°C or (b) during exposure to 7 mM copper
- 713 chloride. C. elegans and C. briggsae show significantly higher susceptibility to
- both high temperature (p < 0.0001, Figure S1) and heavy metal toxicity (p <
- 715 0.01, Figure S1).

- 716 Figure 4 Survival analysis following exposure to biotic stress (three
- 717 species of pathogenic bacteria)
- 718 Survival of L4-stage hermaphrodites or female animals during exposure to
- 719 pathogenic bacteria. *C. remanei* and *C. brenneri* are significantly more resistant
- 720 to Pseudomonas aeruginosa (Figure 4a, p < 0.0001, Figure S1) and Staphylococcus
- 721 aureus (Figure 4b, p < 0.0001, Figure S1). However, all four species show
- 722 similar susceptibility to Salmonella typhimurium (SL1344) (Figure 4c, p>0.05,
- 723 Figure S1).
- 724 Figure 5 The effect of *daf-2* mutations on lifespan and resistance to abiotic
- 725 and biotic stress.
- 726 daf-2 mutations in C.elegans (CB1370) and C.briggsae (PS5531) result in
- 727 enhanced lifespan (Figure 5a) and resistance to high temperature (37°C,
- 728 Figure 5b) or 7mM copper chloride (Figure 5c). Both mutants also show
- significantly higher resistance to killing by *Staphylococcus aureus* (Figure 5d)
- 730 and Pseudomonas aeruginosa (Figure 5e), although the magnitude of the
- 731 resistance is significantly lower for *C. briggsae daf-*2 than for the equivalent
- mutation in *C. elegans*. In contrast, the *daf-2* mutation does not enhance the
- resistance of either species to Salmonella typhimurium (Figure 5f).
- 734 Figure 6 The DAF-16 regulon based on an adjusted *C. elegans* dataset.
- 735 (a) Venn diagram of putative DAF-16 target genes in the three species. 145
- orthologous genes have an upstream DAF-16 binding site in all three species,
- a group we define as the core DAF-16 regulon. (b) The genes within the core
- 738 DAF-16 regulon were tested for over-representation of particular annotation
- 739 categories within GOTERM BP_2 provided by the database DAVID. In
- 740 brackets are the number of genes in the core DAF-16 regulon which are
- associated with a particular GO term within GOTERM BP_2.

Tables

760 Table 1 - List and sequence of primers used for studying daf-16 expression

levels using Real Time PCR

Gene	Species	Forward Primer 5'	Reverse Primer 3'
daf-16	C. elegans	GCGAATCGGTTCCAGCAATTCCAA	ATCCACGGACACTGTTCAACTCGT
daf-16	C. briggsae	AGAAGGCTACCACTAGAACCAACG	TCCATCCAGCGGAACTGTTCGAAT
daf-16	C. remanei	CGACGGCAATACTCATGTCAATGG	ACGGTTTGAAGTTGGTGCTTGGCA
daf-16	C. brenneri	CCTTAGTAGTGGCCTCAATGGTGT	CACAACCTATCACTTCACTCTCGC
gpd-3	All species	TGAAGGGAATTCTCGCTTACACC	GAGTATCCGAACTCGTTATCGTAC

Table 2 - Overlap of the number of potential DAF-16 targets.

	Lee	Murphy	Wiener	McElwee	Dong	This study
Overlapping with Oh	1/81	2/473	1/317	11/953	1/93	30/6293

This table shows the overlap between the reference dataset of Oh and other datasets obtained by Murphy [14], Halaschek-Wiener [39], Lee [16], McElwee [40] and Dong [41] and the *C. elegans* gene list of this study. The first number gives the number of genes that are shared between Oh and the dataset of comparison. The second number stands for the total number of genes identified as potential downstream targets of DAF-16 in the corresponding study.











