# UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

## University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

### Inequality: The Dangers of Meat Haves and Have-Nots in a Nicotinamide-Adenine-Dinucleotide World

Williams, Adrian C; Hill, Lisa J

DOI:

10.5772/intechopen.96748

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Williams, AC & Hill, LJ 2021, Inequality: The Dangers of Meat Haves and Have-Nots in a Nicotinamide-Adenine-Dinucleotide World. in *Meat and Nutrition*. IntechOpen. https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.96748

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)

•Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

Download date: 30. Apr. 2024

#### Inequality: The Dangers of Meat Haves and Have-Nots in a 1

#### Nicotinamide-adenine-dinucleotide World. 2

- 3 Adrian C. Williams & Lisa J. Hill
- Department of Neurology, University Hospitals Birmingham NHS Foundation Trust,
- 4 5 Birmingham, UK
- 6 7 2School of Biomedical Sciences, Institute of Clinical Sciences, University of Birmingham,
- Birmingham, UK

#### Abstract

8

9

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

30

35

Our evolution and recent history can be seen as a "World Hunt" for meat as part of an omnivorous diet. Meat contains key micronutrients namely Nicotinamide (vitamin B<sub>3</sub>) and methyl-donors with deficits causing pellagra, an archetypal disease of poverty. Inequality is a leading ultimate risk factor invoked in the aetiology of common diseases let alone threats from climate change and pandemic triggered catastrophes. We hypothesize that the origin of inequality was our evolutionary and nutritional move from equal to unequal sharing of the meat supply some 10-20 thousand years ago. High meat intake may have bioengineered powerful ruling classes and lower intake the proletariat with higher fertility, but inferior (brain) health. A fairer quantity of a safer meat intake in future should moderate global variances of fertility, height, health, and prosperity. Death rates of acute infections including emergent zoonoses (such as COVID-19) and chronic infections (such as TB) should fall as might the incidence of some diseases of affluence. Meat justice by improving human capital could make redundant superficial markers, such as skin colour, used to discriminate against peoples and heal a divided world.

- 25 words: Disease Transitions; **Demographic** transitions:
- 26 Anthropocene; Nicotinamide; COVID-19; ACE2 receptor; Tryptophan;
- 27 Multiple sclerosis: Tuberculosis.
- 28 **Declaration of conflicting interests:** The author(s) declared no conflicts
- 29 of interest with respect to the research, authorship, or publication of this article.
- 31 **Funding:** The authors disclosed financial support from the QEHB Charity.
- 32 **CORRESPONDING AUTHOR:** Adrian C Williams, Department of Neurology,
- 33 University Hospitals Birmingham, Birmingham, B15 2WB, UK.
- 34 Email:adrian.williams1949@gmail.com

#### 36 Introduction

- 37 Prelapsarian human nature was egalitarian sharing animal products that are the
- 38 main sources of nicotinamide, tryptophan and methyl-donors. The origin of
- inequality was in the Mesolithic with unequal sharing of meat creating phenotypic 39
- variety in a genetically homogeneous population (genomes were later modified by 40
- 41 nutrition and infection<sup>[1]</sup>). A high meat intake allowed for a ruling intellectual
- class and a lower intake a worker class with higher fertility but poorer health. Meat 42
- 43 intake currently manages hundredfold variances within a global annual 300
- 44 million metric tonnes (was 7 million in 1960 and could rise another 75% by 2050).

- 45 Meat inequality is high and for billions their slice of the "meat-loaf" is wafer-thin
- 46 undoubtedly affecting their well-being. Wells (2016) threw down the gauntlet:
- 47 "If we cannot define the link between nutrition and power we will
- 48 never gain the power to resolve global malnutrition and its numerous
- 49 **costs**".

50

65

#### Extreme Meat Inequality: The Forgotten case of Pellagra

- 51 Indeed inequality is generally held to be the pernicious culprit responsible for
- 52 many medical and social ills faced by food-insecure billions that can lead to trade-
- offs between survival with high fertility but poorer health and shorter lives [2, 3] [4, 5].
- 54 [6,7]. As defined by Bellamy(1897) the basis of equality is when "...there are no
- 55 more a-hungered".
- An iconic examples of a nutritional trap is when a low meat intake risks the
- 57 degenerative condition pellagra whose sufferers, with inferior cognitive and social
- 58 intelligence, were ostracised as the "Butterfly caste", and contracted infections
- 59 such as tuberculosis (TB) also closely linked with poverty<sup>[8, 9]</sup>. Terms used to
- stigmatize, shame, blame and pillory pellagrins are still in common usage today to
- 61 keep the poor in their place. Worse was the call for forced sterilization based on
- 62 eugenic and racist policies building on the "myth of the lazy native". Yet there
- turned out to be a biological and trans-generational explanation for this man-
- 64 made layer of destitution preventable by public health means.

#### A Desire for Meat

- 66 Nutritional traps drive a "flight to quality", as noted by Ernst Engel in the 19<sup>th</sup>
- 67 Century<sup>[10]</sup>. As the price of bread falls or when incomes rise people spend less on
- starches but more on meat up to a point. This gastronomic desire extends to
- 69 cannibalism documented in the Magdalen (30,000 years ago) as funerary
- 70 defleshing and later ritualised by states short of meat in Central America or, as
- 71 infanticide or witch-hunting [11, 12]. Cannibalism has proponents for a "materialist"
- 72 theory and the need for protein but it is also a symbol of "savagery" giving many
- an excuse for racism, slavery and "civilising" colonialism<sup>[13]</sup>. In retaliation the
- 74 cattle-based original capitalism and its descendant expropriations of land and
- 75 nature has been convincingly called "cannibal capitalism".
- 76 Rich Americans eat more than their body weight in meat every year whilst many in
- 77 the "Global South" are on negligible amounts. Developed countries are not
- 78 immune as their poor, often children and minorities, fall below "Eat Well Plates"
- 79 as witnessed by the rise of food banks and the recognition of place based food
- as withessed by the rise of food banks and the recognition of place based food
- 80 deserts where good food is unavailable creating (obesogenic)socio-ecological
- 81 environments that argue against neoliberal paternalistic views on the incompetent
- 82 poor having "mismanaged lives" that need to be disciplined or shamed,
- 83 stereotyped as "chavs" and stigmatized as "body fascism" or politicized by
- 84 neoliberals as "deplorables", as were pellagrins in their pathological NAD-deficient
- 85 food-scape in "Foucaultian" fields of lost-power and little choice. More
- 86 geographical meat transitions are still occurring though again not everywhere: in
- 87 1962 the average Chinese was eating 4kg pa but now that figure is 60kg pa and

rising fast towards the American average of 120kg pa. 10 calories of animal feed produce 1 calorie of meat and need enormous quantities water, oil, fertilizers, pesticides, and antibiotics let alone consumption risking dangers from food poisoning and zoonoses with human and economic costs. [14, 15] Given all that, and given animal rights abuses and that meat producers are high contributors to global greenhouse emissions, one would hope that there is a sound biological demand rather than a higher supply on the market or "showing off".

#### **Demography and Subsistence are Key considerations**

95

107

108

109

110111

112113

114

115116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

128

96 Modes of subsistence and demography are the place to start a quest for the source 97 of inequality[16, 17]. Malthus noted that poor parishioners reliant on cereals had 98 high rates of baptisms relative to burials sparking concern that their high fertility 99 led to cycles of deprivation<sup>[18, 19]</sup>. He commented on the sparse numbers of the more carnivorous hunter-gatherers and that population densities increased 100 exponentially with cereal based agriculture. Conversely Boserup suggested 101 population pressure increased agricultural innovation to cope and De Castro's 102 "Geography of Hunger" (1952) pointed out reverse causation was at play in that 103 global epidemiological and experimental data suggested that a degree of 104 105 malnutrition increases fertility and quotes Doubleday's "True Law of Population" 106 (1853) on high meat intake decreasing fertility.

Fertility may have a "U" shaped relationship with meat intake. Low nicotinamide in diet leads to its synthesis "in house" from the degradation of tryptophan. This pathway is an "immune tolerance" mechanism that can welcome foreign antigens such as the foetus or symbionts, but risks dysbiotic and acute infections - and may switch to immune intolerance as the nicotinamide dose increases [13, 14]. Teleologically this allows "baby booms" as diet improves when emerging from famines and for slight changes in fertility compounded over generations to alter trajectories from extinction to strong growth and shifts toward quality over quantity of offspring[20, 21]. Disease inequality could derive from subpar meat intake and nicotinamide related biochemical and epigenetic mechanisms to affect "human capital" with other life-history trade-offs and dietary mismatches over lifetimes then forming the developmental origins of adult disease (DOHaD) and late-life and transgenerational inequality[22, 23]. Current demographic and disease correlations with various factors, such as education, may be hiding a "lurking" variable of food, particularly meat, resource; this systemic dietary inequality was not present in our "deep" history. [24, 25]

#### Meat and Brains: "Planet of the Apes"

- 124 Primordial pecking orders with dominant alpha males or females were more over
- access to mates. At the time of the "Great Divorce" Homo increased meat intake,
- sourced on the savannah, became reproductively isolated ("kissing cousins" on
- forest edges excepted) and at a fork in the road speciated [26, 27]. **Figure 1.**

#### **Food and Fortune**

- 129 Trans-continental food quests with the prosocial and technological skills for
- 130 hunting catalysed the NAD(H) based energy rise required for high general
- intelligence in positive feed-back loops [28, 29]. **Figure 2.** Hunting parties crossed
- the globe extirpating animal, bird, fish, or sea-mammal species in their wake.
- 133 Homo sapiens and Neanderthals independently evolved large brains on high meat
- diets but both species were "thin on the ground" with populations that "tottered"
- with local extinctions and population bottle-necks that led to the exponential
- expansion and cultural flowering of one but the simultaneous extinction of the
- other<sup>[30, 31]</sup>. *Homo sapiens* honed in on the difficult to digest and toxic plant foods
- detoxified by cooking and xenobiotic enzymes in a cultural and genetic co-
- evolutionary approach<sup>[32, 33]</sup>. This move down the food chain along with pro-
- 140 fertility cultural innovations, exemplified by cosmetic ornamentation and
- seductive figurines, perhaps rescued us from extinction [34, 35].

142

163

#### At Human Evolution's Heart was Meat-centred Equality.

- 143 Hunter-gatherer social norms were egalitarian sharing meat with kin and non-kin,
- at least within the reproductive in-group. Land was then a shared "commons".
- Social animals fight for the spoils even when by-standers so this was our "social
- leap". Leaders only existed for time limited tasks. "Stag Hunt" and "Ultimatum"
- games demonstrate a residual sense of fair play in contrast to the misanthropic
- "Homo economicus" depicted in the "Tragedy of the Commons" [36, 37]. This
- redistributive system created the most long lived economy in our history and was
- the dietary evolutionary environment to which we adapted [38]. Adaptations have
- 151 occurred since (such as lactase persistence) but a mismatch with this
- 152 "Palaeolithic" diet may still be relevant to modern day illnesses particularly for
- the poor or the post-reproductive who are of an age when selective pressures to
- adapt are attenuated implying that their metabolism, in particular, would
- perform better on the long-abandoned ancestral diet[39, 40].

#### 156 A more Variable Subsistence Package developed.

- 157 Horticulture emerged in the Mesolithic in marshlands and uplands. Communal
- village "nests" allowed storage, helped by pottery, and pans for vegetable and
- meat stews [41, 42] and veneration of fertility and diet later examples were Ceres,
- Maize, and Bull cults<sup>[43]</sup>. A sexual selection process included language, dance,
- 161 laughter and cooking domesticated and "civilized" us encouraging our
- reproduction and controlling the reproduction of domesticates<sup>[44]</sup>.

#### The "Great Disequalization": Outer Walls Inner Castes.

- There was a lag of some 5000 years between gardening and Neolithic agriculture
- and aquaculture that started in arid zones between rivers suitable for irrigation or
- flood-retreat alluvial zones. Another long gap exists before city and national walls.
- Walls kept out pastoralist egalitarian barbarians and their meat surpluses traded
- or raided for grain and kept in a populace with their cereal surpluses that could
- be taxed by rulers [45]. Cities record social stratification with kings, priests and
- 170 military elites feasting on quality foods and waging wars over meat

- 171 resources. Nobles were taller and healthier and better educated as a "cognitive
- 172 class" not unlike our well-fed "meritocracies" [46, 47]. This disequalization event
- 173 perhaps started earlier in a mosaic such as in the sedentary Nafutian culture but
- wherever it occurred a relative shortage of meat fits the facts well: inequality even
- developed in non-agricultural communities who needed technological advances
- such as ocean-going canoes or horses to hunt new sources of meat as it ran out<sup>[48]</sup>.
- Much has been made of class differentiation in Eurasia being more over the quality
- of food but over the quantity of food in Africa however if meat is the crucial factor,
- and manners, spices and sensuality more superficial, this paradox disappears as
- meat was more of a luxury in equatorial Africa<sup>[49, 44]</sup>. The importance of meat is
- shown by cattle as capital with transfers in "bride-wealth" dowries and as a
- universal central-dish in feasts<sup>[50]</sup>. Crucial determinants of inequality were
- ownership of land and livestock that could be inherited with Gini coefficients as
- low as .25 for foraging hunter-gatherers compared to .5 amongst agriculturalists.

#### Stocks and Trade: An overdue Tribute to "Barbarians".

- 186 Savvy pastoralists at independent sites developed dairy that as a source of
- 187 nicotinamide riboside could explain the convergent genetic evolution of lactose
- tolerance and the cultural evolution of fermented yogurts and cheeses [51, 52].
- Steppe peoples and their ideas spread across Europe around 2500 BCE, replacing
- or amalgamating with agriculturalists as did later mounted pastoralists<sup>[53, 54]</sup>. The
- fall of the Roman Empire on a diet of "bread and circuses" and many pandemics
- 192 allowed Germanic pastoralists with their pedigreed animal husbandry to
- 193 overwhelm a cereal dependant system (with its "agri deserti") and Roman
- deserters<sup>[55]</sup>.

185

195

203

#### See-Saw Cerealization: Meet thy Maker and Breaker

- 196 A Green revolution around 1000 AD with unification of African and Asian crops
- 197 now with rotations and multiple planting seasons during a warm medieval period
- 198 allowed further "Cerealization and Calorie-ization". The social gulf between meat-
- 199 eaters and grain-eaters was a cultural fact of life with social penalties for
- transgressors<sup>[56, 57]</sup>. Populations boomed then busted with the Black Death<sup>[58]</sup> then
- 201 recovered slowly on the higher meat diet available to the survivors whose better
- 202 human capital may explain the rise of Europe.

#### Old and New Worlds: All Things (NAD) were Not Equal.

- 204 American megafauna, as in Australia, had, unlike the "Old World" no prior
- 205 experience of resisting human predators leading to their easy extinction as the
- 206 hunters arrived 10-15 thousand years ago. The New World thus had less animals
- and were unlucky with their limited choice of domesticates, given no sheep, goats
- or cattle. Comparison between Old World social structures and the New World
- shows that the latter were the less stratified with less inherited wealth<sup>[59]</sup>. Old
- 210 Babylonia yields a Gini of .40 whereas near contemporaneous Teotihuacan scores
- a low Gini of .12. Similar observations were made in China with its low level

212 stratification and pigs but no draft animal's supports availability of "food on the

hoof" as the driver rather than animal labour. This all suggests a "U" shaped curve 213

214 with high and low meat intakes favouring egalitarianism and collectivism but

somewhat constrained meat supplies leading to stratification. (Later in North 215

216 America an abundant meat supply was an explanation given for the lack of

socialism and high stratification "on the shoals of roast beef and apple pie" [60] ). 217

- 218 The Columbian exchange exported maize and tubers, east in a non-uniform
- 219 fashion, driving local population explosions. In exchange ungulates were
- introduced to the New World. Breeding rates were extraordinarily high so much 220
- 221 so that ecological damage was caused by often feral "plagues of sheep" (that
- compares with "plagues of corn" in Europe). 17th C Spanish and Portuguese 222
- 223 ranchers maintained herds of 7-10 million animals producing a surfeit of yeal in
- 224 industrial scale pastoralism[61, 62]. However introduced zoonotic diseases, such as
- 225 smallpox, decimated local populations probably immunologically weakened by
- their low meat/high cereal diet as much as lack of "herd resistance". 226
- 227 Observers noted that as meat intake increased Native Americans health improved
- 228 and they became, they thought by Galenic "humoralism" more Spanish, partially
- 229 reversing concerns about racial decline with inter-marriages but still creating new
- 230 castes with the poorest Amerindians displaced to reservations unable to hunt<sup>[63]</sup>.
- 231 One astute writer (1596) presciently noted that "meat generates superfluous
- humours so they now sneeze as we do" suggesting an early switch from infectious 232
- to allergic disease repeated in the late 19th century as meat intake recovered from 233
- 234 an earlier fall in Europe as we discuss later [64, 65].
- Maize went east as an important part of the Columbian exchange but of all the 235
- cereal staples it has the lowest concentration of tryptophan and nicotinamide so 236
- 237 much so that there was an evolutionary drive to cook in a (female)labour intensive
- 238 process with alkali producing "nixtazmel" in Mesoamerica; but this culture or even
- mixed planting and eating with beans was not exported east putting those in the 239
- 240 east at a higher risk of pellagra – despite this maize was popular as it adapts to
- 241 variable altitudes and water supplies with high yields unlike wheat or rice<sup>[66, 67]</sup>.
- 242 By contrast with successful pastoralists then nowadays many herders are poor.
- 243 This reflects changes in the meat market with more advanced societies distancing
- 244 themselves from zoonotic risks and industrializing meat production. Pastoralism
- 245 per se is no advantage unless it allows the owners a higher income or access to
- their own animal source foods free of contamination [68]. 246

#### Meat Elites: NAD "Us and Them" Co-Operations and Conflicts.

- 248 We argue that a sliding rule of meat intake benefits states as well as classes by
- engineering upper "expert" classes with high longevity (adding to their crystallised 249
- intelligence) to the lower classes with their "essential" but often poorly paid and 250
- 251 dangerous front-line jobs, but higher fertility. As Henry George said in 1879 "This
- 252 association of poverty with progress is the great enigma of our times;
- 253 not to answer is to be destroyed."

247

At a more macro- level a latitudinal gradient in food-getting technology to catch prey in the more animal dependant climes exists and once weaponised fuelled northerner's fire-power as perhaps did their more individualistic culture<sup>[69]</sup>. Luminaries such as McNeill and Maddison mention transatlantic meat flows alongside technological nous in their expositions on the rise of Europe [70, 71]. Colonialism and World Wars aimed to ensure enough pastureland for the winners and at the same time cutting off the colonies or enemies food supply inflicting developmental and epigenetic scars on the losers, as documented in the Danish "Hongerwinter" of 1944[72,73].

#### Colour and Nicotinamide.

Variation in human skin pigmentation, whether from genetic polymorphisms or tanning, is the most important physical trait used to instantly categorize human groups and individuals [74, 75]. Pale skin has the adaptive advantage in low UV environments for vitamin D production. Darker skin protects against the rash of pellagra and the closer to the equator the more populations were at risk as the meat/vegetable ratio falls compared with temperate and polar climes. Resistance to the rash is good short-term but as it serves as an early warning to (self-)treat before more serious and harder to spot effects on cognition that may be disadvantageous at a population level and opens a door for discrimination .

The idea of intellectually and morally inferior races based on complexion (that otherwise seems absurd), accelerated with the scramble for Africa and Atlantic with slave-owners conveniently believing whites and blacks were different species views that others did their best to dispel "God hath made of one blood all nations of men". Links with low meat intake go back to Saharan trades with captives turned to slaves from civil wars usually over the meat supply as equatorial pastoralism is harder. Local ungulates resisted domestication and are threatened by large carnivores and year round transmission of vector-borne diseases in the vast tsetse fly belt - and by rapid proliferation of pathogens in food in the heat.

Many believed they were sold for cannibalism but in fact died in droves in the sugar plantations of the Caribbean; in the Americas they were fed somewhat better such that fertility rates allowed for generations to be born in slavery - but were not so well fed as to avoid pellagra particularly after emancipation and neoslavery [76, 77],[78] [79, 80]. Policies directed at indigenous and imported peoples were early assimilation or attempted annihilation if expropriating hunting lands or "Buffalo Bills" executing bison but "last drop of blood" and segregationist policies that allowed reproduction if more after labour - either policy conspired to deliver an inferior diet for many<sup>[81]</sup>. In contrast to the Comanche and their colleagues, cattle now fenced in by barbed wire on ranches and ranges and protected in a "6-shooter colt and cowboy empire" created a beef and red meat republic and industrialized meat processing, as in Chicago, for an international capital market aided by steam railroads and ships with refrigeration.

Confederate cotton states that housed pellagra were in the forefront of supremacist "White privilege" "Klansman" and "America First" thinking. The

297 common interests of this multi-colored underclass were muted by racial tensions encouraged by white elites to divide and rule the workers and even written in to 298 299 national and state constitutions and laws. W.E.B. Du Bois writing after the American Civil War referred to a divisive dignity with being white seen as a 300 301 substitute for inclusive economic policies that could have improved diet for all assembly-line and other workers: degradation of black labour being seen as more 302 303 important than uplift of white labour. Even the 1890s Farmer Alliance bottom-up 304 populist movements were weakened by segregation and racism undermined later 305 "Wars on Poverty".

Others were not immune as poor Italians, Irish and Gypsies or even alcoholics in degenerate "drinking classes", also prone to pellagra, are often considered inferior races [82]. Genocidal thinking against others, such as Jews or the Tutsi tribe, may be because they were thought superior but these are historical exceptions as are those examples of collectivist and communist anti-middle class agendas, such as in China, Russia or the Cambodian Khmer Rouge. Most of the rest are subject to well fed "White Anglo Saxon Protestant (WASPs)" and Western, Educated, Industrialized, Rich and Democratic (WEIRD) people being in charge though this in reality may allow for the mediocre to flourish. Diet and type of agriculture when contemporaneously studied across America or across countries affects cultural norms from "tightness" to a "looseness" that supports a more individualistic and entrepreneurial society with extreme wealth inequality – "tightness" maps closely to former pellagra states or cereal based cultures and collectivism with a high incidence of chronic infections and other signs of poor development [83, 84].

#### Beyond the Pale: Pellagra and the Undeserving Poor

306

307 308

309

310

311312

313 314

315

316

317 318

319

320

- The "undeserving poor" whether amongst white skinned "Hillbilly" rural classes in America or in England (originally noted by Cobbett in 1872) were prominent sufferers from pellagra and like poor blacks attracted the attention of eugenicists and social Darwinism although, to be fair, more positive "social hygiene" ideas targeted diet and education. [85] [85]. Developmental impairments may have spawned the "sciences" of phrenology, physiognomy and craniometrics that helped create myths about black racial groups having deficits in brain capacity.
- 328 Push-back has occurred with peasants, slave ("Black Spartacus"), and many indigenous people's revolts although poor diet may weaken resistance. Pellagrins 329 330 had specialist trade unions and newspapers "Il Pellagrasso" and, driven by 331 "Pellagraphobia", "Pellagrasorium" hospitals. School meals welfare programs have a surprising history for example in being promoted by the activist Black Panthers 332 333 despite attracting heavy opposition from the FBI who perhaps realized those at the 334 knife-edge had got to the heart of the matter of connecting diet to power and the political economy<sup>[86]</sup>. The rise of the middle classes and enlightenment thinking on 335 336 food and the first restaurants insisted on regimens elaborating on meat and 2 vegetable based diet [87, 88]. Frustration such as by the 20th C solidarity movement 337 338 in Poland was driven by annoyance at queueing, often unsuccessfully, for meat that eventually freed them and others of the communist yoke<sup>[89]</sup>. 339

#### **Poor Immigrants Emigrating for Meat**

340

351

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369 370

371372

373

374

375

376

377378

379

380

381 382

"Out of Africa" hunting parties from around 70,000 years ago (and earlier for our 341 hominid ancestors), was driven by the need for meat. Later meat food-ways in the 342 age of migration and the "hungering for America" came from groups known to be 343 pellagra prone such as the Irish, Italians and Mexicans. Once arrived, they ate like 344 the aristocrats they had left behind. Similarly the African-American northern 345 346 "great migration" around 1879 of some 6 million freed "Exodusters" were fleeing 347 from the pellagra-prone southern states. The initial poor state of all such immigrants, that included smallpox outbreaks in slums, 348 contributed to 349 xenophobic discrimination as did their high fertility setting off worries about degeneration and displacement of the local whites<sup>[90]</sup> [91]. 350

#### Gender, Religion and Nicotinamide

352 This overlaps with gender inequality that explores a similarly dark history. Female 353 sex, like colour, is compounding risk factors for pellagra with men, the "bread-354 winner bringing home the bacon" and also the "carver" controlling and rationing 355 the meat amongst family members were given priority over women. This long standing dietary disadvantage and lost privilege over meat rations may have 356 increased fertility but could have spawned much male entitlement including to sex 357 (sometimes traded for meat)[92]. High fertility, as mentioned attracts criticism as 358 "Welfare Oueens" and the attention of eugenicists, family planners, and as a part 359 of "Great replacement theory" these worries intersect with antipathy to rival 360 religions that promote reproduction and rely little on converts. 361

#### Occam's Razor: Real Bias is against the Less Educated.

Intersectional and multiplicative effects of these injustices and many exceptions from superficial markers, that may reflect the cultural schisms and "identity politics" of the day, is compatible with a common more material and tangible cause in diet. Indeed the politics of recognition may at times be at odds with the political and human need for redistribution. Diet induced poor cognition that, if unrecognized, neither allows for equality of opportunity or for society to show solidarity with those who do not rise (even though essential workers), leading to their segregation or even incarceration [93, 94],[95]. Data suggests that the college educated "meritocracy" (usually well-fed), have more bias against less-educated than they do against any other dis-favored group as a "tyranny of merit". This is even true of America's black upper class that originated in freed slaves, or because they worked inside the master's house, had a better diet than field slaves and more access to educational material. Dietary differences could explain disparities between communities given that success differs between black Caribbean's and black Africans with both performing better than poor whites and neither better than rich Asians or rich Whites. Lower IQ, often in the "Imbecile" ran were core features of "pellagra sine pellagra" who frequently failed the very basic tests required to join the military. A good diet was important to the evolution of "WEIRD" people<sup>[96]</sup>. The net track record of such intellectuals realizing they are part of a "meat elite", rather than having a superior genetic or racial endowment,

- 383 or sticking up for the poor or racial groups or believing in an overriding role for
- artificial selection is a classic "trahison des clercs"[97].
- 385 Dietary head starts also define Diamond's milestone hypothesis on global faunal
- inequality with "lucky latitudes" for farming at the onset of the Anthropocene.

#### Meat Inequality: The Climate Link.

- 388 The origin of the climatically benign Holocene heralded the "Anthropocene" that
- 389 consists of a series of horticultural and agricultural developments some even call
- 390 it the "Plantation-ocene" [98, 99]. The Anthropocene influenced climate by
- 391 deforestation and terraforming affecting CO2 and methane emissions from rice
- 392 production and animal domesticates keeping the benign Holocene climate
- rolling<sup>[100]</sup> [101, 102]. These arguably reversed temporarily after the pandemics of the
- 394 Columbian collision as the 1610 "Orbis spike" and a "Little Ice Age". An
- unhomogenised intercontinental meat supply and green agricultural advances has
- ever since driven population explosions of both domesticates and ourselves.
- 397 Alongside the advent of fossil fuels and artificial fertilisers these have conspired to
- 398 become major contributors to climate change with further inequality in ruptured
- 399 "Sacrifice Zones" characterized by low to negligible meat intake variances that
- 400 make for both a "Meat-obscene" and a "Planet under Pressure."

#### 401 Farewell to Alms – One for All and All for One.

- 402 Dietary variances may allow some wanted diversity and plurality but meat became
- 403 the origin of inequality however this was against strong resistance as reflected in a
- fitful history over the right for a balanced diet that we will now summarise<sup>[103]</sup>. As
- 405 has been said "The arc of the moral universe is long but it bends
- 406 towards justice."

387

- 407 Aristotle first proposed that government provide good nutrition by means tested
- 408 communal meals and that private land could be used by people in need so that all
- 409 could flourish. Utopian thinking pleading for public help for paupers such as by
- 410 4thC Saint Ambrose –"the earth has been created in common for all, rich
- 411 and poor" and the 13thC Thomas Aquinas and 16thC Juan Vives and Thomas
- 412 More argued that stealing if hungry was not a criminal act with the latter in his
- 413 Utopia (1516) first suggesting a Universal Basic Income. Later John Locke (1689) a
- 414 strong supporter of the state protecting the sanctity of private property rights
- 415 excluded cases of "pressing Wants" where stealing if hungry could be justified -
- 416 "God hath not left one Man so to the Mercy of another, that he may
- 417 starve him if he please". Thomas Paine (in 1796 irritated by a bishop
- 418 preaching "God made rich and poor") argued for redistribution "not bounty
- 419 **but justice**"- not with scraps, crumbs or handouts but compensation for lost
- 420 farmland to "buy a cow and to cultivate a few acres". Howlett (1781)
- 421 however insightfully felt that opposition came from a gravitational pull to increase
- fertility and create a labourer class<sup>[104]</sup>.
- 423 There was further intellectual support in early "socialist" and (French and
- 424 American) revolutionary thinking of provision as a right not as charity. Thomas

425 Spence's pamphlet ("The Rights of Infants" 1797) and Charles Fourier are good examples -"If the civilised order deprives man of hunting, the class 426 427 that took the land owes to the frustrated class abundant subsistence". Von Humboldt with like-minded agrarians including Goethe and Jefferson and 428 429 Madison in the infant USA understood the effects of colonialism and deforestation and the need for less parasitic approaches to nature bucking the biblical 430 431 "dominion over all the earth and every creeping thing". Many empires encountered local resistance and insurgencies such as the Indian Mutiny of 1857 432 433 with early dissent from universalist thinkers who eschewed biological racism and 434 believed all men to be equal such as Burke, Bentham, Smith and Diderot (1780) 435 were concerned about European explorers, pioneers, and colonialist unjust attitudes "instead of recognising this man as a brother, you see him as 436 437 a slave". This enlightened attitude later lost out to civilising missions of 438 "backward societies" and the frontier spirit, supported by Mill and de Tocqueville, 439 and racial ideas of white superiority mitigated but not solved by Wilberforce and the anti-slavery movement or the American civil war. 440

#### **Enclosures**, Empires and the "Third World".

441

454

455

456 457

458 459

460 461

462

463 464

465 466

467

468

469

442 Oppositions to underhand removals and expropriations of common pastureland 443 from serfs are recorded. Resistance included the Magna Carta (particularly the the Charter of the Forest (1217) that talks about "common herbage") and the 17th 444 Century leveller movement and opposition to the notorious Black Act (1723) [105, 445 <sup>106</sup>]. Poachers and commoners even blackened their faces to disguise their identity 446 and to show solidarity with slaves. Nevertheless Arcadian grasslands got eroded 447 448 by the "enclosure" movement and punitive laws for poaching and the birth of 449 "Enemy of Nature" capitalism with its lack of recycling manure as natural nutrients back to the soil and "metabolic rifts" as first proposed by Marx. 450 451 Enclosure of pastureland is also associated with the concept of "social closure" 452 when scarce resources only get shared with those of the same class such as certain 453 clothing and education – and the rich monopolising a gourmet taste for meat<sup>[63]</sup>.

Dietary ideals sank into oblivion with imperial grabs of land creating "new Europe's" with "cash crops and stocks", mining of bones from Napoleonic battlefields and importing guano for fertiliser, and the "triangular" slave trade. Governments and companies employed armed forces to crush uprisings with "scorched earth" campaigns leading to famines and genocides creating the third world by kyboshing local development and introducing pellagra-genic maize [107, <sup>108]</sup>. **Figure 3.** Imperial interlopers farmed then imported cattle improving their diet at others expense resulting in "slow violence", "long dyings", "zones of abandonments", "necropolitics" and "tristes tropiques" and "Victorian holocausts" with both ruins and ruination<sup>[109]</sup>. Other plunders and blunders include the ugly histories of the Irish famine, the Scottish Clearances, the Soviet war on the Kulaks, the US "dustbowl" and the Chinese Cultural Revolution. Colonial near starvation led to debilitating phenotypic adaptations (in survivors) often acquired in childhood in "metabolic" ghettos, such as by Native Americans and Aboriginal peoples thrown off their hunting lands; or later as in the legacy in the Caribbean of a low meat/high sugar diet followed by a western diet triggering the "double

- 470 burden" pandemic of metabolic ("amputation capitals") and cancerous
- 471 syndromes<sup>[110]</sup>. Slave trade reparations were not given to the to the slaves or to
- 472 their epigenetically affected descendants however there is some history of trying
- 473 to help the poor locally<sup>[111]</sup>.

474

508

#### From Poor Laws to Meat Rations

- 475 Elizabethan poor laws were a reaction to the dissolution of the monasteries and a
- 476 resurgence of "Royal Forests" that reduced common pastureland. The 1834 poor
- 477 law with workhouses and means testing legitimized the concept of the undeserving
- 478 poor and resulted in Edwardian slum-dwellers being no better off than the later
- 479 starving victims of Somalia or Rwanda. Poor diet came to the fore when the state
- 480 of recruits to the Crimean and Boer wars affected the country's defenses with
- 481 hunger marches adding to the pressure.
- 482 Initiatives such as a broader diet in WW2 rations and school milk and meals
- 483 improved health and infant mortality as did "cradle to grave" welfare states.
- 484 Lessons on the primacy of diet still got forgotten and never rolled out
- 485 internationally despite experimental evidence that poor diet influenced
- 486 individual, class, tribal and national success s<sup>[112]</sup>.
- 487 More evidence on diet comes from the Indian caste system as the lowest
- 488 untouchable class (Dalits) in a "metabolic ghetto" were short and unhealthy on rice
- and vegetables compared with Brahmins (who ate nicotinamide rich buffalo milk,
- 490 yogurt and butter) and other castes on wheat and meat. In Kenya the meat and
- 491 blood eating Masai were taller and healthier than the vegetarian Kikuyu tribes,
- 492 who suffered greatly from TB. Specific mention was made of the near impossibility
- 493 of modernising in the Caribbean on a plantain diet yet botanical benevolence, such
- as introducing sago plants and breadfruit, was commoner than promoting meat
- 495 perhaps as the immediate pressure usually seemed to be about bread.
- 496 "Flour wars" have triggered the downfall of empires and aristocracies such as in
- 497 18th C France and early 20th C Russia and along with the British experiences in
- 498 Ireland and Bengal and the recent bread riots in the Arab Spring uprising suggest
- 499 that the food supply chain is an iceberg underlying stable societies and financial
- 500 markets. Governments and commerce should aim higher than avoiding caloric
- starvation[113]. Indeed WW2 rationing was thought to have made class war obsolete
- 502 with a nutritional egalitarianism, that covered meat and milk, and led to a 30
- year upswing in equality lasting long after the normal levelling effect of the
- exigencies of war<sup>[114, 115]</sup>. This temporary upswing included "sharing the prize" with
- 505 black southerners in America helped by the civil rights revolution that had not
- 506 happened with the 1930's New Deal that was, despite some good aspects,
- racialized on housing and jobs and therefore the income to buy meat[116, 117].

#### Tiger Economies - A Unified Field and Food Theory.

- 509 The age of Industrialization increased the gap between the North Atlantic states
- and the rest of the world: the former had high meat intakes with the "laggards"
- 511 being cereal dependent. Japan overcame Buddhist piety that proscribed

 ${\it consumption of four legged animals, imported \ \ beef and altered their class \ system.}$ 

513 Later "Tiger" economies built arcs of food security less hooked on subsidised

514 cereals and more generous on the more elastic need for meat. They realized, or

were advised, to "use it (their land) or lose it" risking become "banana" republics.

The lesson of the 19th C Ireland "meat republic" is apposite as the Irish landowners

exported cattle to the UK whilst their own cottager population boomed on a poor

potato diet until blight led to widespread starvation and emigration<sup>[118, 119]</sup>.

519 China followed suit, after disastrous collectivist experiments when some 45 million people starved, and massively increased meat consumption surging to the 520 521 forefront. India have followed but with lower increases in meat consumption (and lower growth), as has Latin America but not sub-Saharan Africa. Cuba managed 522 523 with modest increases in meat consumption to demonstrate beneficial effects on 524 measures of health and happiness<sup>[15, 120]</sup>. Such countries achieved modernity with 525 no significant aid that usually came as subsidised cereals or the "Green Revolution" unlike much of Africa.[121]. Cereals and sugars along with apartheid 526 527 thinking of Africans being inherently poor unscientific farmers in "cattle complexes" considered as wealth not food in a "malnutrition syndrome" (whilst 528 529 valuable food is exported) has created a vicious cycle leading to "starving on a full 530 stomach" and micronutrient deficiency, including B3/Nicotinamide and pellagra 531 outbreaks particularly amongst refugees from war. The paradox here being that Africa has plenty of sun and enormous land-banks but their agricultural methods 532 533 and utensils would be familiar at the time of Christ creating crop yield chasms with

knock-on effects for animal fodder and meat intake.

Tables have been turned in that food exporters are now in the rich world that subsidises its farmers with the poorest countries off-shoring even grain staples risking international food spikes. "World-making" needs more international effort than expecting self-determination to help with diet and could be seen as a practical reparation<sup>[122]</sup>. After all, the development of a European core was given priority over colonial settlers raising cattle for sale at the centre at prices that excluded the peripheral colony and allowed the industrial "take-off" <sup>[123, 124]</sup>. The rise of Anglo-American hegemony and the current convergence in a predominantly Asian drama correlates with meat intake but could be enacted everywhere to help demographic and disease transitions.

#### Levelling Playing Fields.

517

534

535

536

537

538

539 540

541

542

543

544

545

552

If looking backward to imperial violations provides no traction risk of pandemics

and wars may be the better bargaining tool as poor countries are not, after all,

stationed on Mars  $^{[125]}$ . The history of disease and demographic transitions when

the West was just as poor is instructive as progress correlated then to an increased

meat and milk supply and the colonial "klepto-parasitic" meat-trade [126, 127] [128,

551 124]. As Walter Rodney said in his 1972 book on how Europe underdeveloped Africa

"Pellagra was unknown in South Africa till about 1914".

- Many have commented on the importance of meat and skimmed milk on health
- 554 in particular the incidence of TB and as a cure for Kwashiorkor and is the basis
- of many school milk and meals programmes. These early 20th C programmes often
- driven by fear of TB were sometimes reversed such as in 1950's south Africa for
- African but not European children as they were "white man's food!" [129] [110].

#### Beefed up: Au Revoir "Old Friends" and Plagues.

558

573

585

594

- It is difficult to overestimate the pervasive importance of TB the "White Death" in
- 560 the 19thC that mysteriously vanished (as did other infections ) first in the wealthy
- as Disraeli pointed out "Two nations: as if inhabitants of different planets
- 562 formed by a different breeding and fed by a different food the rich
- and the poor". At this time food imports (the UK at this point accounted for
- 80% of the trans-equatorial meat trade) were aided by lower shipping costs,
- trains and salting then refrigeration<sup>[130, 131]</sup> [117]. **Figure 4.** Better breeding helped
- as did the rise in the use of poultry. The case for nicotinamide intake being causal
- has been that TB excretes and is inhibited by nicotinic acid with many antibiotics
- being analogues and that TB incidence always rises on a poor meat diet[132, 133]. TB's
- toxin, an NAD glycohydrolase, depletes the macrophage of NAD on a cell-death
- 570 pathway that enables replication and dissemination. Over 300 like toxins are
- 571 responsible for other pandemics [134, 135] so NAD levels offers "broad spectrum"
- 572 protection against many organisms that is lost if diet then deteriorates

#### Inflection: Inflammatory Disease in Affluent Geographies.

- As TB, died down a promiscuous range of auto-immune, inflammatory, and mind
- 575 altering "Diseases of Modern Civilisations" took-off alongside infertility, first in
- 576 the upper classes who eat more meat [136, 137]. A less plant based diet affects
- 577 fermentation-derived short-chain fatty acids such as butyrate that interact with the
- 578 nicotinic acid receptor [138, 139]. This flip also relates to the altered education of
- 579 immune systems as "Absent Old Friends" affect the differentiation and migration
- 580 of antigen-specific protective regulatory T cells and the balance with pro-
- 581 inflammatory T helper 17 (with BCG having mitigating effects). The result is
- 582 "immune intolerance" to otherwise harmless antigens and allergic and auto-
- immune disease [140, 141]. As already mentioned a preguel took place in the Spanish
- New World when those on a higher meat diet developed "sneezes".

#### So Long So Much Auto-Immunity – Example of MS

- Less Tryptophan in diet abrogates pathology in models of multiple sclerosis. MS is
- 587 not the only auto-immune disease where one can link diet, microbiomes,
- autoreactive T cells, and IDO- 1 mediated tryptophan breakdown [142, 143]. Risk
- factors include meat, low Vitamin D, genetic pro-inflammatory predispositions,
- 590 and inter-current infections that all affect T cell regulation. Adjusting tryptophan
- and nicotinamide in diet could lead to more resilient Treg/T (17) helper cell ratio –
- the same mechanism that stem-cells or the adoptive transfer of regulatory T cells,
- helminths or microbiomes are thought to work[144, 145].

#### Modern Diseases and the Ageing Stakes – Highs and Lows.

595 NNMT is a detoxification enzyme reducing nicotinamide levels that controls behaviour, neurodegeneration and lifespan by regulating energy, methylome and 596 597 autophagy. NNMT is raised in many diseases of affluence whilst NAD levels fall: enzyme induction could be from high nicotinamide intake [146, 147]. Figure 5. As 598 599 Brenner has said "NAD coenzymes catalyse the conversion of everything we eat in to everything we are and everything we do". High 600 601 nicotinamide dosage from plentiful meat and milk often with supplements may 602 play a part in diseases of affluence as is fairly well established for red or processed 603 meat and cancer, particularly colorectal, and deaths and yet in Japan a 604 "Goldilocks" diet with more meat and dairy is thought to be responsible for a 605 decline in cerebrovascular mortality and their unusual longevity<sup>[148]</sup>.

#### Pellagra: Longevity at a Price

606

626

636

Theories on ageing involve nicotinamide: pellagra was a real world case of 607 premature ageing consistent with rises in life expectancy and lower incidence of 608 dementia when diet improves [149, 150]. Longevity pathways, are activated by NAD 609 booster molecules. NAD- rhythms are lynch-pins that explain circadian clocks and 610 611 physiological states from hunger to fatigue to stress, and even the effects of 612 alcohol. Antagonistic pleiotropy, a popular theory for ageing with genes important 613 in development having adverse effects from relaxed selection in later life or developmental run-on includes NAD-consumer and NNMT genes [151, 152]. 614

- Pellagra comprised of dozens of mimics of neurodegenerative diseases and psychopathology that selectively affect high energy neurones in complex synaptic circuits. Topical explanations invoke proteinopathies, mitochondrial failure, inflammation, oxidant stress, calcium dysregulation, gut dysbioses, and neurotransmitter loss that were downstream events in pellagra [153, 154].
- NAD may be the common denominator and "silver bullet" for cells with competing "mouths to feed" that with genetic or co-existent environmental factors gets channelled to various phenotypes spreading in "vulnerability networks" and prion-like waves. Nicotinamide may need to be adjusted by genome and age to avoid DOHaD, "disposable soma" or antagonistic pleiotropic effects that may only kickin later in life requiring the higher nicotinamide and more ancestral diet [155].

#### Nurture over Nature: NAD World 3.0 - Barometers and Monitors

627 Measuring ourselves embedded in an "NAD World" may be a parsimonious way of 628 emancipating metabolic controls and energy flows to "refresh parts others cannot reach" by optimising nicotinamide dosage [156, 157]. Figure 6. Nicotinamide 629 630 replacement or "Nutraceuticals" in general (often selling "candy" and empty 631 calorie-ization) should not be the sole focus given negative effects on the methylome. Randomised trials varying meat intake are not realistic (first 632 suggested by Daniel at the court of Nebuchadnezzar) but the predicted value, with 633 634 a low ceiling effect, would lie in better cognition, resistance to microbes and "K" 635 style fertility prioritising quality.

#### **Human Right to Respire Right.**

Subpar NAD levels are metabolic headwinds and pseudo-hypoxic states literally taking peoples "breath away" but, unlike meat, oxygen is free. Water is critical as splitting it is at the photosynthetic heart of an NAD World with riparian "hydraulic societies" raising civilizations [158, 159]. Although water can be a flashpoint on the whole cooperation has prevailed (with some high profile exceptions about dams or privatization), as it did over cleaning up water supplies to avoid infections such as cholera - perhaps because it was more obvious that the poor could infect the rich as is also true of air pollution (that now includes rising CO<sub>2</sub>)<sup>[160]</sup>. This danger is just as true for diet where obstacles should be overcome to deliver a "nicotinamide rush" as the platform for human capital, capacities and capabilities and to reduce the danger of zoonotic pandemics [161, 162].

#### Meat Dangers: "X" Diseases, "Y" Plagues and Zoonoses

Desperation for meat and cannibalism is implicated in prion diseases as is feeding meat to herbivores that triggered bovine spongiform encephalopathy and new version Jacob-Creutzfeld disease where NAD depletion has been implicated, consistent with the prion mimics seen in pellagra epidemics [163, 164].

#### Red Flags and Blind Eyes: Something New under the Sun.

Opportunistic zoonoses are prominent (70%) causes of human scourges, a price of the (peri-) domestication of animals [165, 166]. Some think influenza strains and plagues arose and spread in tribes wandering with cattle over lands conquered by Genghis Khan [167, 168]. Recent emergent diseases include Marburg (1967), Ebola (1976), HIV (1981), Nipah (1998), SARS (2003) and other Coronaviruses like COVID-19<sup>[169-171]</sup>. Cauldrons and hot-spots of emergent infections are built in high density populations with land cleared for agriculture encroaching on animal territories or are due to the desire for exotic foods<sup>[172, 173]</sup>. Those that heap opprobrium on current animal markets need to look back to London's 19<sup>th</sup> century costermongers who sold live meat in carnivalesque markets<sup>[174, 175]</sup> [176, 177].

Poor and dangerous meat supplies have been described as "Structural violence" or [178, 179] as for several billion wildlife consumption, or the income from household farming outside industrial "dragonhead" enterprises, is the only way of avoiding the "hidden hunger" of micronutrient deficiencies whether iron or vitamins A, D, B12 and B3 [180, 181]. Campaigns to ban wildlife hunting needs thought if aimed to improve pandemic preparedness without leading to an even poorer diet for the "have-nots". As Lederberg said of viruses this is really a matter of "*Our Wits and their Genes*". Zoonoses can be predicted and could be prevented by stringent surveillance of wildlife consumption with safe-guards including better hygiene with butchers and less exposure of Guano farmers to bat droppings [182, 183].

#### **COVID-19 Exposes an Achilles Heel**

Pathogenic coronaviruses use the inducible angiotensin converting enzyme (ACE2) receptor to invade species that has roles in renin-aldosterone, tryptophan, immune-competence, and the microbiome [184, 185]. ACE2 is a chaperone for the amino acid transporter particularly regulating tryptophan uptake and interacting

with Hartnup mutations that cause a multifactorial pellagra-like disorder. Covid19 may have similar effects to *ace*2 knockouts affecting tryptophan convoys with
loss of T cell homeostasis and Interferon responses affecting reactive and overreactive immune responses [186, 187]. **Figure 7.** Some effective Covid treatments
such as Dexamethasone and Tocilizumab affect this kynurenine pathway [188, 189].
Prominent enteritis and neuropsychiatric complications with (myoclonic)
encephalopathy and "Long Covid" and other delayed complications are
reminiscent of pellagra. As with other microbes being NAD-replete in the first
place should improve host resistance and low initial NAD levels may explain
several risk factors such as age, poverty and disability particularly if then
exacerbated by post-Covid austerity diets as economies fail [190, 140] [191] [192].

#### **Population Matters Redux - Crunch-time for Non-Coercive Measures.**

Earlier we referred to Malthus' observations on a cereal dependant population and introduced meat in to the demographic debate as a quality versus quantity piece of a complex jig-saw<sup>[193]</sup> [194, 195]. Formulae such as Environmental impact = Population x Energy consumed per capita - show that population counts particularly when energy consumed per person is high [196, 197]. Coercive population measures have had mixed results as have state "cash for babies" procreation policies and has stigmatised debate. Cereal supplements increase infant birth weight but reduce time to next pregnancy whereas a diet with adequate meat directly and indirectly (through better education) speeds demographic transitions.

The extremes are striking with population predicted to fall by 50% in rich countries but to increase by 300% in poor African nations, such as "zestful" Nigeria, with consequences for age structure, economic potential, migration and geopolitical power. There is currently little recognition of dietary drivers even though de Castro proposed that malnutrition was the cause not the effect of low quality population explosions 70 years ago<sup>[198]</sup>.

#### Cutting to the Chase: Mean about Meat Means to a Bad End.

A remedy is to retro-shift to the 18th C idea of liberty that imposes state obligations to ensure "bon marche" not basic "bread and circuses". Adam Smith wrote, after observing European induced injustices, "greater wealth may inspire respect for the rights of one another" with a fairer "slice of the pie". Peak meat has surely passed for the rich and needs to be levelled at say 30kg pa reducing food related emissions by a third (or more if switching from beef) and benefitting health. Given the world is home to 5 billion ungulates and 22 billion chickens this should provide an optimal "flexitarian" diet for all - with a role for plant-based meat substitutes and affordable lab-grown meat or tucking into "cricket snacks". Many political systems have accepted the need to supply grain vet none treat meat as a need rather than only for those who have the means. (16th C Henri 1V of France's "chicken in the pot" for peasants was the exception). Rulers, from fascists to socialists, have recognised the power of food as a tool for their territorial ambitions whilst not balking at using it to starve their own people or only supporting equal sustenance for the working classes if linked to productivity[199]. One predicament of modern democracies is that they legitimize and spend large sums on defined disease, much in the last years of life, yet delegitimize those in dietary poverty normalizing their premature deaths. As Kropotkin (1892) said "Well-being for all is not a dream".

If they addressed these dietary issues rulers may find that their citizens are healthier and less likely to reject basic democratic principles or descend in to mono-culturalism, restrictive immigration or insurrections.

726

727

728

729

730 731

732

733

734

735

736

737

738 739

740

741

742

743 744

745

746 747

748

749

750

751

752 753

754

755

756 757

758 759

760 761

762

763 764

765

The ill effects of inequality, austerity and pauperism from "Ancien Regimes" modern times on health, well-being and social mobility are well documented. Most narratives swing between clashes between oppressors and the proud oppressed and how oligarchies have self-perpetuated. The exact mechanism for harm, other than invoking stress or "social determinants" or "weathering", is however unclear. Stress reduction is, after all, convincingly invoked as a reason for pyramids of power and hierarchy<sup>[200]</sup>. Here we spell out how this originally happened in line with ecological and metabolic rift observations on the effects of industrialization allowing food meccas and food ghettos and deserts [201, 202]. We propose that once the meat supply became constrained, we evolved on a dietary spectrum with a high meat to cereal ratio supporting a ruling intellectual elite and a low ratio a fertile proletarian essential (yet disposable) working class - and when there is a surplus of population, an unsupported underclass prone to rebellion [47]. Turchin however also points out that elite overproduction and intra-elite competition in gilded ages (such as the 1920's and now) marked by extremes of income, height and health inequality has often preceded ages of discord and societal collapses before a more progressive new-deal social and ecological revival. Increased equality on a "degrowth" and socio-ecological agenda recognizing that there is an abundance of good food to be shared if better managed rather than acting as if the calorie-ization and empty calorie-ization of the poor has solved the problem rather than becoming a tangible commercial determinant of health also affecting NAD homeostasis. This drive for meat security is more sustainable than continuing with a scenario with an artificial scarcity of meat and other "luxuries" encouraged by capitalist concentrations of power in the mega-merged agri-food "Big Food" profit driven sector that leads to reduced public wealth but private riches, biodiversity loss and excess emissions [203, 204].

Meat elites are now redundant developmental over-runs (not unlike some theories of cancer). Affirmative action needs to correct this dietary discord or actions aimed at the facades fronting inequality will fail. The opposite of inequality in this context is not a Utopian state or a meritocracy of equality but equity of provisions with better metabolic homeostasis and no NAD headwinds for the poor. Hinman and Harris (1939) recognised that the meat eating races and classes have been instrumental to progress and that meatification is a marker and the ladder of class ascension and social mobility. Reframing Aristotle, this corresponds to a hierarchy of needs with a physiologically good diet being met free as a public good (as it basically is already free for the rich) but the equally important self-actualization wants for a good life being left more to an individual's freedom and

766 drive. Redistributing quality food has been modelled from social and economic perspectives in a new "Moral Economy" as "Sitopias" and "Diets for a Small 767 768 Planet" that could now be grounded in the constitution and currency of an "NAD World" and seen more as an investment as it closes innovation gaps, as seen in 769 770 China, as well as reducing risks from pandemics or "superbug" antibiotic resistance [205-207] [208, 209]. Families may be the place to start as they already have 771 772 "Burkian" style covenants between the dead, the living and those yet to be born. 773 Enough family income to provide meat reflected in more shapely Engel Curves 774 locked in to a top-down international governance structure could work as a 775 "Gramscian" common-sense counter-hegenomic bloc and cry from those stuck in the basement[210]. Gramsci's words ring true "The old is dying and the new cannot 776 be born; in this interregnum a great variety of morbid symptoms appear". 777

#### Conclusion.

778

779 780

781

782 783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791 792

793 794

795

796

797

798 799

800

801

802 803

804

805

806

As Thoreau said with capitalism and its attendant inequalities in mind "Icarian thoughts returned to ground; and we went to heaven, the long way round" Our solution speaks for an algorithm that opens secure and safe meat larders derived from agro-ecological farming regimes that respect the best of the organic and food sovereign movements without forsaking scientific or commercial approaches shorn of soil degeneration from high tillage, excess fertilisers and pesticides and monocrops [211]. [212]. New meat technology should help but at the least cleaned up meat production from grass-and even fed-lot grain based farms to tables will help and are unlikely to become "stranded" assets any time soon[213].

Quixotic quests for preventive causes for every known complication of poverty could be avoided by moving the dial to find a "sweet-spot" to avoid nicotinamide under-and over-load. Fair reform could happen without imposing widespread vegetarianism - a vaunted solution that would not benefit the needs of the nicotinamide have-not-half. Discrimination, we say, piggy-backs on meat extremes and could dissolve as it did for the pellagra-ridden "Butterfly caste", with meat justice leading at the least to a new chapter in the history of inequality by abolishing "Precariats and Proletariats". Black Egyptian educators were after all the sparks of modern Europe not the blonde races or the later Anglosphere. Condorcet (1795) divided history into ten periods, the last of which permitted "the abolition of inequality between nations, the progress of equality within each nation, and the true perfection of mankind". A global overhaul that enables NAD equity would return us to our "other regarding" roots that, after some detours to boost population, began with meat and land equality as well as showing that we can rise above Kant's "self-incurred immaturity" in a new enlightenment movement that this time round is fair to all and might solve a more general syndemic crisis.

#### References\*

- 807 1. Prohaska A, Racimo F, Schork AJ, Sikora M, Stern AJ, Ilardo M, Allentoft
- 808 ME, Folkersen L, Buil A, Moreno-Mayar JV. Human disease variation in the light of
- 809 population genomics. Cell. 2019;177(1):115-131.
- 810 2. Atkinson AB. Inequality: What can be done?: Harvard University Press;
- 811 2015.
- 812 3. Kohler TA, Smith ME. Ten Thousand Years of Inequality: The Archaeology
- of Wealth Differences: University of Arizona Press; 2018.
- 814 4. Milanovic B. Global Inequality: A New Approach for the Age of
- 815 Globalization: Harvard University Press; 2016.
- 816 5. O'Connor C. The Origins of Unfairness: Social Categories and Cultural
- 817 Evolution: Oxford University Press; 2019.
- 818 6. Norberg J. Open: The Story of Human Progress: Atlantic Books; 2020.
- 819 7. Sachs JD. The Ages of Globalization: Geography, Technology, and
- 820 Institutions: Columbia University Press; 2020.
- 821 8. Williams AC, Hill LJ. The 4 D's of Pellagra and Progress. International
- 822 Journal of Tryptophan Research. 2020;13:1178646920910159.
- 823 9. Williams AC, Ramsden DB. Pellagra: A clue as to why energy failure
- 824 causes diseases? Med Hypotheses. 2007;69(3):618-628.
- 825 10. Prais SJ, Houthakker HS. The Analysis of Family Budgets: Cambridge
- 826 University Press; 1971.
- 827 11. Bello SM, Wallduck R, Dimitrijevic V, Zivaljevic I, Stringer CB. Cannibalism
- 828 versus funerary defleshing and disarticulation after a period of decay:
- 829 comparisons of bone modifications from four prehistoric sites. Am J Phys
- 830 Anthropol. 2016;161(4):722-743.
- 831 12. Cole J. Assessing the calorific significance of episodes of human
- cannibalism in the Palaeolithic. Sci Rep. 2017;7:44707.
- 833 13. Barker F, Hulme P, BARKER FD, Iversen M, Hulme PLP, Arens WF,
- 834 Obeyeskere G, Maduriera L, Huggan G, Kraniauskas J. Cannibalism and the
- 835 Colonial World: Cambridge University Press; 1998.
- 836 14. Lang T. Feeding Britain: Our Food Problems and How to Fix Them:
- 837 Penguin Books Limited: 2020.
- 838 15. McMahon P. Feeding Frenzy: The New Politics of Food: Profile; 2013.
- 839 16. Harper S. Demography: A Very Short Introduction: Oxford University
- 840 Press; 2018.
- 841 17. Livi-Bacci M. Population and Nutrition: An Essay on European
- 842 Demographic History: Cambridge University Press; 1991.
- \*A comprehensive reference list can be obtained from the authors
- 844 18. Bashford A, Chaplin JE. The New Worlds of Thomas Robert Malthus:
- 845 Rereading the Principle of Population: Princeton University Press; 2016.
- 846 19. Eversley DEC. Social Theories of Fertility and the Malthusian Debate:
- 847 Greenwood Press; 1975.
- 848 20. Jasienska G, Bribiescas RG, Furberg AS, Helle S, Nunez-de la Mora A.
- 849 Human reproduction and health: an evolutionary perspective. Lancet.
- 850 2017;390(10093):510-520.

- 851 21. Kaptijn R, Thomese F, Liefbroer AC, Van Poppel F, Van Bodegom D,
- 852 Westendorp RGJ. The Trade-Off between Female Fertility and Longevity during
- 853 the Epidemiological Transition in the Netherlands. PLoS One.
- 854 2015;10(12):e0144353.
- 855 22. Ear PH, Chadda A, Gumusoglu SB, Schmidt MS, Vogeler S, Malicoat J,
- 856 Kadel J, Moore MM, Migaud ME, Stevens HE, et al. Maternal Nicotinamide
- 857 Riboside Enhances Postpartum Weight Loss, Juvenile Offspring Development, and
- 858 Neurogenesis of Adult Offspring. Cell Rep. 2019;26(4):969-983.e964.
- 859 23. Nenko I, Hayward AD, Simons MJP, Lummaa V. Early-life environment
- and differences in costs of reproduction in a preindustrial human population.
- 861 PLoS One. 2018;13(12):e0207236.
- 862 24. Dyson T. Population and Development: The Demographic Transition: Zed
- 863 Books; 2013.
- 864 25. North DC, Thomas RP. The Rise of the Western World: A New Economic
- 865 History: Cambridge University Press; 1973.
- 866 26. Dartnell L. Origins: How The Earth Made Us: Random House; 2019.
- 867 27. Lemke A. Foraging in the Past: Archaeological Studies of Hunter-Gatherer
- 868 Diversity: University Press of Colorado; 2019.
- 869 28. Deary IJ. Intelligence: A very short introduction: Oxford University Press;
- 870 2020.
- 871 29. Kaplan H, Hill K, Lancaster J, Hurtado AM. A theory of human life history
- 872 evolution: diet, intelligence, and longevity. Evolutionary Anthropology: Issues,
- 873 News, and Reviews. 2000;9(4):156-185.
- 874 30. Downey SS, Haas WR, Jr., Shennan SJ. European Neolithic societies
- showed early warning signals of population collapse. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A.
- 876 2016;113(35):9751-9756.
- 877 31. Mellars P, French JC. Tenfold population increase in western europe at
- the neandertal-to-modern human transition. Science. 2011;333(6042):623-627.
- 879 32. Harris S. What Have Plants Ever Done for Us?: Western Civilization in Fifty
- 880 Plants: Bodleian Library; 2015.
- 881 33. Le S. 100 Million Years of Food: What Our Ancestors Ate and Why It
- 882 Matters Today: Picador; 2016.
- 883 34. El Zaatari S, Grine FE, Ungar PS, Hublin J-J. Neandertal versus modern
- 884 human dietary responses to climatic fluctuations. PLoS One.
- 885 2016;11(4):e0153277.
- 886 35. Page AE, Chaudhary N, Viguier S, Dyble M, Thompson J, Smith D, Salali
- 887 GD, Mace R, Migliano AB. Hunter-gatherer social networks and reproductive
- 888 success. Sci Rep. 2017;7(1):1153.
- 889 36. Hood B. The Domesticated Brain: A Pelican Introduction: Penguin Books
- 890 Limited; 2014.
- 891 37. Maslow AH. Toward a Psychology of Being: Start Publishing LLC; 2013.
- 892 38. Suzman J. Work: A History of How We Spend Our Time: Bloomsbury
- 893 Publishing; 2020.
- 894 39. Eaton SB, Konner M. Paleolithic nutrition. A consideration of its nature
- and current implications. N Engl J Med. 1985;312(5):283-289.

- 896 40. Rutledge GA, Cabral LG, Kuey BJ, Lee JD, Mueller LD, Rose MR.
- 897 Hamiltonian patterns of age-dependent adaptation to novel environments. PLoS
- 898 One. 2020;15(10):e0240132.
- 899 41. Fuller DQ, Stevens CJ. Between domestication and civilization: the role of
- agriculture and arboriculture in the emergence of the first urban societies. Veg
- 901 Hist Archaeobot. 2019;28(3):263-282.
- 902 42. Scott JC. Against the Grain: A Deep History of the Earliest States: Yale
- 903 University Press; 2017.
- 904 43. Blake M. Maize for the Gods: Unearthing the 9,000-Year History of Corn:
- 905 University of California Press; 2015.
- 906 44. Miller G. The Mating Mind: How Sexual Choice Shaped the Evolution of
- 907 Human Nature: Vintage; 2001.
- 908 45. Collingham L. The Biscuit: The History of a Very British Indulgence:
- 909 Random House: 2020.
- 910 46. DiAngelo R. White Fragility: Why It's So Hard for White People to Talk
- 911 About Racism: Penguin Books Limited; 2019.
- 912 47. Kara S. Modern Slavery: A Global Perspective: Columbia University Press;
- 913 2017.
- 914 48. Scheidel W. The Great Leveler: Violence and the History of Inequality
- 915 from the Stone Age to the Twenty-First Century: Princeton University Press; 2018.
- 916 49. Goody J, Goody JR, Press CU, Dunn J, Hawthorn G. Cooking, Cuisine and
- 917 Class: A Study in Comparative Sociology: Cambridge University Press; 1982.
- 918 50. Jones M. Feast: Why Humans Share Food: OUP Oxford; 2008.
- 919 51. Amorim CEG, Vai S, Posth C, Modi A, Koncz I, Hakenbeck S, La Rocca MC,
- 920 Mende B, Bobo D, Pohl W, et al. Understanding 6th-century barbarian social
- 921 organization and migration through paleogenomics. Nat Commun.
- 922 2018;9(1):3547.
- 923 52. Piketty T. Capital in the 21st Century. 2014.
- 924 53. Nielsen R, Akey JM, Jakobsson M, Pritchard JK, Tishkoff S, Willerslev E.
- 925 Tracing the peopling of the world through genomics. Nature.
- 926 2017;541(7637):302-310.
- 927 54. Reich D. Who We Are and How We Got Here: Ancient DNA and the New
- 928 Science of the Human Past: Oxford University Press; 2018.
- 929 55. Harper K. The Fate of Rome: Climate, Disease, and the End of an Empire:
- 930 Princeton University Press; 2017.
- 931 56. Hansen V. The Year 1000: When Explorers Connected the World and
- 932 Globalization Began: Penguin Books Limited; 2020.
- 933 57. Moore RI. The First European Revolution: 970-1215: Wiley; 2000.
- 934 58. Cohn SK. The Black Death Transformed: Disease and Culture in Early
- 935 Renaissance Europe: Arnold; 2002.
- 936 59. Kohler TA, Smith ME, Bogaard A, Feinman GM, Peterson CE,
- 937 Betzenhauser A, Pailes M, Stone EC, Marie Prentiss A, Dennehy TJ, et al. Greater
- 938 post-Neolithic wealth disparities in Eurasia than in North America and
- 939 Mesoamerica. Nature. 2017;551(7682):619-622.
- 940 60. Sombart W, Atterbury AP. Socialism and the Social Movement in the 19th
- 941 Century: Creative Media Partners, LLC; 2018.

- 942 61. Crosby AW. The Columbian exchange: biological and cultural
- consequences of 1492: Greenwood Publishing Group; 2003.
- 944 62. Richards JF. The Unending Frontier: An Environmental History of the Early
- 945 Modern World: University of California Press; 2005.
- 946 63. Colas A. Food, Politics, and Society: Social Theory and the Modern Food
- 947 System: University of California Press; 2018.
- 948 64. Collingham EM. Imperial Bodies: The Physical Experience of the Raj,
- 949 C.1800-1947: Wiley; 2001.
- 950 65. Earle R. The Body of the Conquistador: Cambridge University Press; 2014.
- 951 66. MAZUMDAR S. The Impact of New World Food Crops on the Diet and
- 952 Economy of China and India, 1600-1900. IN GREW, R.(Ed.) Food in Global History.
- 953 Boulder, Colorado. Westview Press; 1999.
- 954 67. Warman A. Corn and capitalism: How a botanical bastard grew to global
- 955 dominance: Univ of North Carolina Press; 2003.
- 956 68. Grace D, Lindahl J, Wanyoike F, Bett B, Randolph T, Rich KM. Poor
- 957 livestock keepers: ecosystem-poverty-health interactions. Philos Trans R Soc Lond
- 958 B Biol Sci. 2017;372(1725).
- 959 69. Collared M, Kemery M, Banks S. Causes of toolkit variation among
- 960 hunter-gatherers: a test of four competing hypotheses. Canadian Journal of
- 961 Archaeology/Journal Canadien D'Archéologie. 2005:1-19.
- 962 70. Langer WL. Europe's initial population explosion. The American Historical
- 963 Review. 1963;69(1):1-17.
- 964 71. McNeill W. Plagues and Peoples: Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group;
- 965 2010.
- 966 72. Bohstedt J. The Politics of Provisions: Food Riots, Moral Economy, and
- 967 Market Transition in England, c. 1550–1850: Taylor & Francis; 2016.
- 968 73. Midlarsky MI. The Evolution of Inequality: War, State Survival, and
- Democracy in Comparative Perspective: Stanford University Press; 1999.
- 970 74. Jablonski NG, Chaplin G. The colours of humanity: the evolution of
- 971 pigmentation in the human lineage. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci.
- 972 2017;372(1724).
- 973 75. Quillen EE, Norton HL, Parra EJ, Lona-Durazo F, Ang KC, Illiescu FM,
- 974 Pearson LN, Shriver MD, Lasisi T, Gokcumen O, et al. Shades of complexity: New
- 975 perspectives on the evolution and genetic architecture of human skin. Am J Phys
- 976 Anthropol. 2019;168 Suppl 67:4-26.
- 977 76. Du Bois Center at the University of Massachusetts TWEB, Battle-Baptiste
- 978 W, Rusert B. W. E. B. Du Bois's Data Portraits: Visualizing Black America:
- 979 Princeton Architectural Press; 2018.
- 980 77. Green T. A Fistful of Shells: West Africa from the Rise of the Slave Trade
- to the Age of Revolution: Penguin Books Limited; 2019.
- 982 78. Fogel RW, Engerman SL. Time on the Cross: The Economics of American
- 983 Negro Slavery: Norton; 1995.
- 984 79. Daniel P. Breaking the Land: The Transformation of Cotton, Tobacco, and
- 985 Rice Cultures Since 1880: University of Illinois Press; 1986.
- 986 80. Graham LO. Our Kind of People: Inside America's Black Upper Class:
- 987 HarperCollins e-books; 2009.

- 988 81. Estes N. Our History Is the Future: Standing Rock Versus the Dakota
- 989 Access Pipeline, and the Long Tradition of Indigenous Resistance: Verso Books;
- 990 2019.
- 991 82. DINER HR. Hungering for America: Harvard University Press; 2009.
- 992 83. Harrington JR, Gelfand MJ. Tightness-looseness across the 50 united
- 993 states. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences. 2014;111(22):7990-
- 994 7995.
- 995 84. Talhelm T, English AS. Historically rice-farming societies have tighter
- 996 social norms in China and worldwide. Proceedings of the National Academy of
- 997 Sciences. 2020;117(33):19816-19824.
- 998 85. Shilliam R. Race and the Undeserving Poor: From Abolition to Brexit:
- 999 Agenda Publishing; 2018.
- 1000 86. Levine S. School Lunch Politics: The Surprising History of America's
- 1001 Favorite Welfare Program: Princeton University Press; 2011.
- 1002 87. Appelbaum R. Aguecheek's Beef, Belch's Hiccup, and Other Gastronomic
- 1003 Interjections: Literature, Culture, and Food Among the Early Moderns: University
- 1004 of Chicago Press; 2008.
- 1005 88. Spang RL. The Invention of the Restaurant: Paris and Modern
- 1006 Gastronomic Culture: Harvard University Press; 2020.
- 1007 89. Ash TG. Polish Revolution: HarperCollins Publishers Limited; 1998.
- 1008 90. Churchwell S. Behold, America: A History of America First and the
- 1009 American Dream: Bloomsbury Publishing; 2018.
- 1010 91. Johnson W. River of Dark Dreams: Harvard University Press; 2013.
- 1011 92. Manne K. Entitled: How Male Privilege Hurts Women: Penguin Books
- 1012 Limited; 2020.
- 1013 93. Sperling G. Economic Dignity: Penguin Publishing Group; 2020.
- 1014 94. Wilkerson I. Caste: The International Bestseller: Penguin Books Limited;
- 1015 2020.
- 1016 95. Collins PH, Bilge S. Intersectionality: Wiley; 2020.
- 1017 96. Henrich J. The Weirdest People in the World: How the West Became
- 1018 Psychologically Peculiar and Particularly Prosperous: Penguin Books Limited;
- 1019 2020.
- 1020 97. Sowell T. Intellectuals and Society: Basic Books; 2012.
- 1021 98. Ellis EC, Ellis EC. Anthropocene: A Very Short Introduction: Oxford
- 1022 University Press; 2018.
- 1023 99. Piperno DR, McMichael C, Bush MB. Amazonia and the Anthropocene:
- 1024 What was the spatial extent and intensity of human landscape modification in the
- 1025 Amazon Basin at the end of prehistory? The Holocene. 2015;25(10):1588-1597.
- 1026 100. Fagan B. The Little Ice Age: How Climate Made History 1300-1850: Basic
- 1027 Books; 2019.
- 1028 101. Lewis SL, Maslin MA. The Human Planet: How We Created the
- 1029 Anthropocene: Penguin Books Limited; 2018.
- 1030 102. Steffen W, Rockstrom J, Richardson K, Lenton TM, Folke C, Liverman D,
- 1031 Summerhayes CP, Barnosky AD, Cornell SE, Crucifix M, et al. Trajectories of the
- 1032 Earth System in the Anthropocene. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2018;115(33):8252-
- 1033 8259.

- 1034 103. Caparros M. Hunger: The Oldest Problem: Melville House; 2020.
- 1035 104. Howlett J. An examination of Dr. Price's Essay on The Population of
- 1036 England and Wales London. 1781;91.
- 1037 105. Linebaugh P. Stop, Thief!: The Commons, Enclosures, and Resistance: PM
- 1038 Press; 2014.
- 1039 106. Macfarlane A. The Origins of English Individualism: The Family Property
- and Social Transition: Wiley; 1978.
- 1041 107. Davis M. Late Victorian Holocausts: El Nino Famines and the Making of
- the Third World: Verso Books; 2002.
- 1043 108. Weaver JC. Great Land Rush and the Making of the Modern World, 1650-
- 1044 1900: MQUP; 2003.
- 1045 109. Stoler AL. Imperial Debris: On Ruins and Ruination: Duke University Press;
- 1046 2013.
- 1047 110. Wylie D. Starving on a Full Stomach: Hunger and the Triumph of Cultural
- 1048 Racism in Modern South Africa: University Press of Virginia; 2001.
- 1049 111. Taylor M. The Interest: How the British Establishment Resisted the
- 1050 Abolition of Slavery: Random House; 2020.
- 1051 112. Timmins N. The Five Giants [New Edition]: A Biography of the Welfare
- 1052 State: HarperCollins Publishers; 2017.
- 1053 113. Pilcher JM. Food in World History: Taylor & Francis; 2017.
- 1054 114. Lindert PH, Williamson JG. Unequal Gains: American Growth and
- 1055 Inequality since 1700: Princeton University Press; 2017.
- 1056 115. Putnam RD, Garrett SR. The Upswing: How America Came Together a
- 1057 Century Ago and How We Can Do It Again: Simon & Schuster; 2020.
- 1058 116. Hennessy MB, Deak T, Schiml PA. Sociality and sickness: have cytokines
- 1059 evolved to serve social functions beyond times of pathogen exposure? Brain
- 1060 Behav Immun. 2014;37:15-20.
- 1061 117. Watts SJ. Epidemics and History: Disease, Power, and Imperialism: Yale
- 1062 University Press; 1999.
- 1063 118. Coogan TP. The Famine Plot: England's Role in Ireland's Greatest Tragedy:
- 1064 St. Martin's Publishing Group; 2012.
- 1065 119. Johnston BF, Mellor JW. The role of agriculture in economic
- development. The American Economic Review. 1961;51(4):566-593.
- 1067 120. Zotor FB, Ellahi B, Amuna P. Applying the food multimix concept for
- sustainable and nutritious diets. Proc Nutr Soc. 2015;74(4):505-516.
- 1069 121. Easterly W, Easterly WR. The White Man's Burden: Why the West's
- 1070 Efforts to Aid the Rest Have Done So Much III and So Little Good: Penguin Press;
- 1071 2006.
- 1072 122. Getachew A. Worldmaking After Empire: The Rise and Fall of Self-
- 1073 Determination: Princeton University Press; 2020.
- 1074 123. Arboleda M. Planetary Mine: Territories of Extraction under Late
- 1075 Capitalism: Verso Books; 2020.
- 1076 124. Rodney W, Davis A. How Europe Underdeveloped Africa: Verso Books;
- 1077 2018.
- 1078 125. Caballero B. The Nutrition Transition: Diet and Disease in the Developing
- 1079 World: Elsevier Science; 2002.

- 1080 126. Marcus E. Meat Market: Animals, Ethics, & Money: Brio Press; 2005.
- 1081 127. Perren R. The Meat Trade in Britain, 1840-1914. London: Routledge and
- 1082 Kegan Paul; 1978.
- 1083 128. de Castro J. Geography of Hunger: Gollancz; 1952.
- 1084 129. Peffer N. The White Man's Dilemma: Climax of the Age of Imperialism:
- 1085 John Day Company; 1927.
- 1086 130. Harrison M. Disease and the Modern World: 1500 to the Present Day:
- 1087 Wilev: 2013.
- 1088 131. Porter R. The Greatest Benefit to Mankind: A Medical History of
- 1089 Humanity (The Norton History of Science): W. W. Norton; 1999.
- 1090 132. Mc KD, Malone L, et al. The effect of nicotinic acid amide on
- 1091 experimental tuberculosis of white mice. J Lab Clin Med. 1948;33(10):1249-1253.
- 1092 133. Simmons JD, Peterson GJ, Campo M, Lohmiller J, Skerrett SJ, Tunaru S,
- 1093 Offermanns S, Sherman DR, Hawn TR. Nicotinamide limits replication of
- 1094 Mycobacterium tuberculosis and BCG within macrophages. J Infect Dis. 2019.
- 1095 134. Henkel JS, Baldwin MR, Barbieri JT. Toxins from bacteria. Molecular,
- 1096 Clinical and Environmental Toxicology: Springer; 2010. p. 1-29.
- 1097 135. Mahon RN, Hafner R. Immune Cell Regulatory Pathways Unexplored as
- 1098 Host-Directed Therapeutic Targets for Mycobacterium tuberculosis: An
- 1099 Opportunity to Apply Precision Medicine Innovations to Infectious Diseases. Clin
- 1100 Infect Dis. 2015;61Suppl 3:S200-216.
- 1101 136. Daschner A, Gonzalez Fernandez J. Allergy in an Evolutionary Framework.
- 1102 J Mol Evol. 2020;88(1):66-76.
- 1103 137. Trowell HC, Burkitt DP. Western Diseases, Their Emergence and
- 1104 Prevention. London: Edward Arnold; 1981.
- 1105 138. Munn DH, Zhou M, Attwood JT, Bondarev I, Conway SJ, Marshall B,
- 1106 Brown C, Mellor AL. Prevention of allogeneic fetal rejection by tryptophan
- 1107 catabolism. Science. 1998;281(5380):1191-1193.
- 1108 139. Sonnenburg JL, Backhed F. Diet-microbiota interactions as moderators of
- 1109 human metabolism. Nature. 2016;535(7610):56-64.
- 1110 140. Hashimoto T, Perlot T, Rehman A, Trichereau J, Ishiguro H, Paolino M, Sigl
- 1111 V, Hanada T, Hanada R, Lipinski S, et al. ACE2 links amino acid malnutrition to
- microbial ecology and intestinal inflammation. Nature. 2012;487(7408):477-481.
- 1113 141. Spinelli P, Latchney SE, Reed JM, Fields A, Baier BS, Lu X, McCall MN,
- 1114 Murphy SP, Mak W, Susiarjo M. Identification of the novel Ido1 imprinted locus
- 1115 and its potential epigenetic role in pregnancy loss. Hum Mol Genet.
- 1116 2019;28(4):662-674.
- 1117 142. Swank RL, Lerstad O, Strom A, Backer J. Multiple sclerosis in rural Norway
- 1118 its geographic and occupational incidence in relation to nutrition. N Engl J Med.
- 1119 1952;246(19):722-728.
- 1120 143. Taylor BV. The major cause of multiple sclerosis is environmental:
- 1121 genetics has a minor role--yes. Mult Scler. 2011;17(10):1171-1173.
- 1122 144. Correale J, Ysrraelit MC, Gaitan MI. Immunomodulatory effects of
- 1123 Vitamin D in multiple sclerosis. Brain. 2009;132(Pt 5):1146-1160.
- 1124 145. Wekerle H. Brain Autoimmunity and Intestinal Microbiota: 100 Trillion
- 1125 Game Changers. Trends Immunol. 2017;38(7):483-497.

- 1126 146. Clement J, Wong M, Poljak A, Sachdev P, Braidy N. The Plasma NAD(+)
- 1127 Metabolome Is Dysregulated in "Normal" Aging. Rejuvenation Res. 2018.
- 1128 147. Neelakantan H, Brightwell CR, Graber TG, Maroto R, Wang HL, McHardy
- 1129 SF, Papaconstantinou J, Fry CS, Watowich SJ. Small molecule nicotinamide N-
- 1130 methyltransferase inhibitor activates senescent muscle stem cells and improves
- 1131 regenerative capacity of aged skeletal muscle. Biochem Pharmacol. 2019.
- 1132 148. Wolk A. Potential health hazards of eating red meat. J Intern Med.
- 1133 2017:281(2):106-122.
- 1134 149. Jasienska G. Reproduction and lifespan: Trade-offs, overall energy
- budgets, intergenerational costs, and costs neglected by research. American
- 1136 Journal of Human Biology. 2009;21(4):524-532.
- 1137 150. Westendorp RG. Are we becoming less disposable?: Evolution has
- 1138 programmed us for early survival and reproduction but has left us vulnerable to
- 1139 disease in old age. In our present affluent environment, we are better adapting to
- these improved conditions. EMBO reports. 2004;5(1):2-6.
- 1141 151. Austad SN, Hoffman JM. Is antagonistic pleiotropy ubiquitous in aging
- 1142 biology? Evol Med Public Health. 2018;2018(1):287-294.
- 1143 152. Kanakkanthara A, Kurmi K, Ekstrom TL, Hou X, Purfeerst ER, Heinzen EP,
- 1144 Correia C, Huntoon CJ, O'Brien D, Wahner Hendrickson AE, et al. BRCA1
- 1145 Deficiency Upregulates NNMT, Which Reprograms Metabolism and Sensitizes
- 1146 Ovarian Cancer Cells to Mitochondrial Metabolic Targeting Agents. Cancer Res.
- 1147 2019;79(23):5920-5929.
- 1148 153. Fu H, Hardy J, Duff KE. Selective vulnerability in neurodegenerative
- 1149 diseases. Nature neuroscience. 2018;21(10):1350-1358.
- 1150 154. Mattsson N, Schott JM, Hardy J, Turner MR, Zetterberg H. Selective
- 1151 vulnerability in neurodegeneration: insights from clinical variants of Alzheimer's
- disease. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry. 2016;87(9):1000-1004.
- 1153 155. Hou Y, Lautrup S, Cordonnier S, Wang Y, Croteau DL, Zavala E, Zhang Y,
- 1154 Moritoh K, O'Connell JF, Baptiste BA. NAD+ supplementation normalizes key
- 1155 Alzheimer's features and DNA damage responses in a new AD mouse model with
- 1156 introduced DNA repair deficiency. Proceedings of the National Academy of
- 1157 Sciences. 2018:201718819.
- 1158 156. Elhassan YS, Philp AA, Lavery GG. Targeting NAD+ in metabolic disease;
- new insights into an old molecule. Journal of the Endocrine Society. 2017.
- 1160 157. Poddar SK, Sifat AE, Haque S, Nahid NA, Chowdhury S, Mehedi I.
- 1161 Nicotinamide Mononucleotide: Exploration of Diverse Therapeutic Applications
- of a Potential Molecule. Biomolecules. 2019;9(1).
- 1163 158. Cook GC. Disease and Sanitation in Victorian Britain: Lessons for the Third
- 1164 World: Melrose Books; 2015.
- 1165 159. Smith LC. Rivers of Power: How a Natural Force Raised Kingdoms,
- Destroyed Civilizations, and Shapes Our World: Penguin Books Limited; 2020.
- 1167 160. Stern M. Evidence that a mitochondrial death spiral underlies
- antagonistic pleiotropy. Aging Cell. 2017;16(3):435-443.
- 1169 161. Cochran G, Harpending H. The 10,000 Year Explosion: How Civilization
- 1170 Accelerated Human Evolution: Basic Books; 2009.
- 1171 162. Esping-Andersen G. The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism: Wiley; 2013.

- 1172 163. Haik S, Brandel JP. Infectious prion diseases in humans: cannibalism,
- iatrogenicity and zoonoses. Infect Genet Evol. 2014;26:303-312.
- 1174 164. Zhou M. Ottenberg G. Sferrazza GF, Hubbs C, Fallahi M, Rumbaugh G,
- 1175 Brantley AF, Lasmezas CI. Neuronal death induced by misfolded prion protein is
- 1176 due to NAD+ depletion and can be relieved in vitro and in vivo by NAD+
- 1177 replenishment. Brain. 2015;138(Pt 4):992-1008.
- 1178 165. Izcue A, Powrie F. Immunology: Malnutrition promotes rogue bacteria.
- 1179 Nature. 2012;487(7408):437-439.
- 1180 166. Morens DM, Folkers GK, Fauci AS. The challenge of emerging and re-
- 1181 emerging infectious diseases. Nature. 2004;430(6996):242-249.
- 1182 167. Dasgupta P, Ray D. Inequality as a Determinant of Malnutrition and
- 1183 Unemployment: Theory. The Economic Journal. 1986;96(384):1011-1034.
- 1184 168. Pearce-Duvet JM. The origin of human pathogens: evaluating the role of
- 1185 agriculture and domestic animals in the evolution of human disease. Biological
- 1186 Reviews. 2006;81(3):369-382.
- 1187 169. Andiman WA. Animals Viruses and Humans, A Narrow Divide: How Lethal
- 200 Zoonotic Viruses Spill Over and Threaten Us: Paul Dry Books; 2018.
- 1189 170. Honigsbaum M. The Pandemic Century: A History of Global Contagion
- from the Spanish Flu to Covid-19: Ebury Publishing; 2020.
- 1191 171. Spinney L. Pale Rider: The Spanish Flu of 1918 and How it Changed the
- 1192 World: Random House; 2017.
- 1193 172. Valitutto MT, Aung O, Tun KYN, Vodzak ME, Zimmerman D, Yu JH, Win
- 1194 YT, Maw MT, Thein WZ, Win HH. Detection of novel coronaviruses in bats in
- 1195 Myanmar. PLoS One. 2020;15(4):e0230802.
- 1196 173. Volpato G, Fontefrancesco MF, Gruppuso P, Zocchi DM, Pieroni A. Baby
- 1197 pangolins on my plate: possible lessons to learn from the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 1198 Springer; 2020.
- 1199 174. Münch O. Henry Mayhew and the street traders of Victorian London—a
- 1200 cultural exchange with material consequences. The London Journal.
- 1201 2018;43(1):53-71.
- 1202 175. Smith C. The wholesale and retail markets of London, 1660–1840. The
- 1203 Economic History Review. 2002;55(1):31-50.
- 1204 176. Mayhew H. London Labour and the London Poor: A Cyclopaedia of the
- 1205 Condition and Earnings of Those that Will Work, Those that Cannot Work, and
- 1206 Those that Will Not Work: G. Woodfall; 1851.
- 1207 177. Winter J. London's Teeming Streets, 1830-1914: Taylor & Francis; 2013.
- 1208 178. Farmer P, Sen A, Sen M. Pathologies of Power: Health, Human Rights, and
- the New War on the Poor: University of California Press; 2005.
- 1210 179. Greenfeld KT. China Syndrome: The True Story of the 21st Century's First
- 1211 Great Epidemic: HarperCollins; 2007.
- 1212 180. Friant S, Ayambem WA, Alobi AO, Ifebueme NM, Otukpa OM, Ogar DA,
- 1213 Alawa CBI, Goldberg TL, Jacka JK, Rothman JM. Eating Bushmeat Improves Food
- 1214 Security in a Biodiversity and Infectious Disease "Hotspot". Ecohealth.
- 1215 2020;17(1):125-138.

- 1216 181. Golden CD, Fernald LC, Brashares JS, Rasolofoniaina BR, Kremen C.
- 1217 Benefits of wildlife consumption to child nutrition in a biodiversity hotspot.
- 1218 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences. 2011;108(49):19653-19656.
- 1219 182. Kucharski A. The Rules of Contagion: Why Things Spread and Why They
- 1220 Stop: Profile; 2020.
- 1221 183. Senthilingam M. Outbreaks and Epidemics: Battling infection from
- measles to coronavirus: Icon Books Limited; 2020.
- 1223 184. Hoffmann M, Kleine-Weber H, Schroeder S, Krüger N, Herrler T, Erichsen
- 1224 S, Schiergens TS, Herrler G, Wu N-H, Nitsche A. SARS-CoV-2 cell entry depends on
- 1225 ACE2 and TMPRSS2 and is blocked by a clinically proven protease inhibitor. Cell.
- 1226 2020.
- 1227 185. Yan T, Xiao R, Lin G. Angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 in severe acute
- 1228 respiratory syndrome coronavirus and SARS-CoV-2: A double-edged sword? The
- 1229 FASEB Journal. 2020;34(5):6017-6026.
- 1230 186. Alenina N, Bader M. ACE2 in brain physiology and pathophysiology:
- 1231 Evidence from transgenic animal models. Neurochem Res. 2019;44(6):1323-1329.
- 1232 187. Singer D, Camargo SM, Ramadan T, Schafer M, Mariotta L, Herzog B,
- 1233 Huggel K, Wolfer D, Werner S, Penninger JM, et al. Defective intestinal amino acid
- 1234 absorption in Ace2 null mice. Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol.
- 1235 2012;303(6):G686-695.
- 1236 188. Belladonna ML, Orabona C. Potential Benefits of Tryptophan Metabolism
- 1237 to the Efficacy of Tocilizumab in COVID-19. Frontiers in Pharmacology.
- 1238 2020;11(959).
- 1239 189. Tian J, Zhang B, Rui K, Wang S. The Role of GITR/GITRL Interaction in
- 1240 Autoimmune Diseases. Front Immunol. 2020;11:588682-588682.
- 1241 190. Fischer DD, Kandasamy S, Paim FC, Langel SN, Alhamo MA, Shao L,
- 1242 Chepngeno J, Miyazaki A, Huang HC, Kumar A, et al. Protein Malnutrition Alters
- 1243 Tryptophan and Angiotensin-Converting Enzyme 2 Homeostasis and Adaptive
- 1244 Immune Responses in Human Rotavirus-Infected Gnotobiotic Pigs with Human
- 1245 Infant Fecal Microbiota Transplant. Clin Vaccine Immunol. 2017;24(8).
- 1246 191. Wallace R. Dead Epidemiologists: On the Origins of COVID-19: Monthly
- 1247 Review Press; 2020.
- 1248 192. A. W. Adv Clin Neurosci Rehabil 2020; Pellagra: 4 D's and 8 Points. 2020.
- 1249 193. Williams AC, Hill LJ. Nicotinamide and Demographic and Disease
- 1250 transitions: Moderation is Best. International Journal of Tryptophan Research.
- 1251 2019;12:1178646919855940.
- 1252 194. Kaufmann EP. Shall the Religious Inherit the Earth?: Demography and
- 1253 Politics in the Twenty-first Century: Profile Books; 2010.
- 1254 195. Pearson CS. On the Cusp: From Population Boom to Bust: Oxford
- 1255 University Press; 2015.
- 1256 196. Hartmann B. Reproductive Rights and Wrongs: The Global Politics of
- 1257 Population Control: Haymarket Books; 2016.
- 1258 197. Smil V. How many people can the earth feed? Population and
- 1259 Development Review. 1994:255-292.

- 1260 198. Collaborators GPaF. Population and fertility by age and sex for 195
- 1261 countries and territories, 1950-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden
- 1262 of Disease Study 2017. Lancet. 2018;392(10159):1995-2051.
- 1263 199. Rees L. Hitler and Stalin: The Tyrants and the Second World War: Penguin
- 1264 Books Limited; 2020.
- 1265 200. Perret C, Hart E, Powers ST. From disorganized equality to efficient
- hierarchy: how group size drives the evolution of hierarchy in human societies.
- 1267 Proc Biol Sci. 2020;287(1928):20200693.
- 1268 201. Hanieh S, High H, Boulton J. Nutrition Justice: Uncovering Invisible
- 1269 Pathways to Malnutrition. Front Endocrinol (Lausanne). 2020;11:150.
- 1270 202. Wells JCK. The Metabolic Ghetto: An Evolutionary Perspective on
- 1271 Nutrition, Power Relations and Chronic Disease: Cambridge University Press;
- 1272 2016.
- 1273 203. Finley E. Beyond the Limits of Nature: A Social-ecological Perspective on
- 1274 Degrowth as a Political Ideology. Capitalism Nature Socialism. 2019;30(2):244-
- 1275 250.
- 1276 204. Hickel J. Less is More: How Degrowth Will Save the World: Random
- 1277 House; 2020.
- 1278 205. Lowrey A. Give People Money: How a Universal Basic Income Would End
- 1279 Poverty, Revolutionize Work, and Remake the World: Crown; 2018.
- 1280 206. Patel R. The Value of Nothing: How to Reshape Market Society and
- 1281 Redefine Democracy: Portobello; 2011.
- 1282 207. Vollrath D. Fully Grown: Why a Stagnant Economy Is a Sign of Success:
- 1283 University of Chicago Press; 2020.
- 1284 208. Holt-Giménez E. Capitalism, food, and social movements: The political
- 1285 economy of food system transformation. Journal of Agriculture, Food Systems,
- 1286 and Community Development. 2019;9(A):23-35.
- 1287 209. Lappe FM, Lappé FM. Diet for a Small Planet: Ballantine Books; 1991.
- 1288 210. Vogler P. Scoff: A History of Food and Class in Britain: Atlantic Books;
- 1289 2020.
- 1290 211. Denison RF. Darwinian Agriculture: How Understanding Evolution Can
- 1291 Improve Agriculture: Princeton University Press; 2016.
- 1292 212. Chai A, Moneta A. Retrospectives: engel curves. Journal of Economic
- 1293 Perspectives. 2010;24(1):225-240.
- 1294 213. Mellon J. Moo's Law: An Investor's Guide to the New Agrarian
- 1295 Revolution: Fruitful Publications; 2020.

#### 1296 Figure Legends

- 1297 **Figure 1.** Meat and Nicotinamide dosage steadily increased during out evolution
- 1298 up until the time that we became behaviourally modern. Human brain size
- 1299 increased and got more globular with Broca's and pre-frontal and parietal areas
- 1300 becoming prominent and better connected using newfound neurotransmitter and
- 1301 neuroendocrine facilities. However fertility and population sizes were low, with
- 1302 several extinctions. The advent of a more plant based, and lower nicotinamide
- dosage, diet led to populations expanding but brain and body size got smaller and
- infectious diseases emerged.

- Figure 2. NAD is the crucial carrier for our high energy Hydrogen based needs 1305
- 1306 for optimal brain function in a "NAD World".
- Figure 3. GDP falls as a % of British GDP became extreme in colonial times. Low 1307
- 1308 meat diets in China, India and Africa compared to Europe and North America
- created the "third world". This dietary inequity is unravelling in places with the 1309
- 1310 "tiger economies" undergoing "meat transitions" developing the fastest.
- Figure 4. TB, the "White Death," mortality shown using London data for 1850, 1311
- 1312 TB vanished as meat intake increased - chiefly from imports (in exchange for
- 1313 cotton goods) that in effect exported infectious diseases to the poorly fed and low
- 1314 meat tropics.
- 1315 Figure 5. NAD declines with age whereas NNMT levels rise in affluent
- geographies. Amongst the poor NAD levels would be low at all ages. Major 1316
- 1317 preventive windows of opportunity present themselves for both rich and poor.
- 1318 Figure 6. This version of an "NAD World" has the dietary and social milieu,
- symbionts and pathogens all interacting with biochemical internal affairs. NAD 1319
- 1320 has a "finger in every pie" affecting circadian rhythms, appetite, exercise alongside
- 1321 detoxification pathways for plant (and now drug) toxins and oxidant and other
- 1322 shocks from microbial pathogens and viruses that require resistance and (DNA)
- 1323 repair.

#### **Abbreviations** 1324

- 1325 NMN=Nicotinamide mononucleotide; NAMPT= Nicotinamide phosphoribosyl-
- 1326 transferase; IDO= Indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase; NNMT= Nicotinamide N-
- 1327 methyl-transferase; NRK= Nicotinamide riboside-kinase; PARP=Poly ADP-ribose
- polymerases; SIRTs=Sirtuins; CD38= Cyclic ADP ribose-hydrolase; AhR= Aryl 1328
- hydrocarbon receptor. 1329
- 1330 Figure 7. Pleiotropic ACE-2 receptor and some overlooked interactions. ACE-2
- affects Tryptophan uptake and the BoAT1 neutral amino-acid system and therefore 1331
- 1332 the kynurenine and the T cell and interferon dependant "immune tolerance"
- pathway and exacerbates lost NAD homeostasis from pre-existing conditions (such 1333
- 1334 as age or poverty and poor diet) or infection induced oxidative stress and its repair.
- 1335 Coronaviruses could, like ACE-2 knock-downs or the BoAT1 mutations that lead to
- 1336 the Hartnup pellagrous phenotype, reduce tryptophan and therefore serotonin
- 1337 levels and cause pellagra-like symptomatology both in the acute phase and as "long
- 1338 Covid" if not corrected. The renin- angiotensin system also involved in the
- pathophysiology could be affected by other vitamins such as Vitamin D. 1339