A groundwork case of Lebanese Education Policy sociohistorical analysis from World War II, 1945 to the dissolution of the government in 2020

Baldwin, Mayssa; Taysum, Alison

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal]

Title A groundwork case of Lebanese Education Policy sociohistorical analysis from World War II, 1945 to the dissolution of the government in 2020

Mayssa Haidar-Baldwin and Alison Taysum

Abstract

Lebanese Education Policy has not empowered all citizens with competences for critical thinking skills, and ability to work collaboratively with good communication to problem solve. An objectives based curriculum has been disrupted in delivery due to ongoing civil war and the horrific impacts of war on the mental health and well being of the people of Lebanon. The curriculum has been overloaded with subjects that must be memorised causing cognitive overload and further mental health problems for Lebanese students. The dissolved Lebanese Ministry for Education and Higher Education (MEHE) has 'Nothing to Display' on the website. Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking reveals the principle of being critical is important, but is not scripted in Lebanese education policy. Education Policy should be implemented by an Interim Government with and for the people with transparent financial accountability of funds from the Lebanese tax payer and from tax payers from other benefactor states including the US and the UK to eliminate fraud and corruption and to support the most vulnerable in Lebanon including over 1.5 million refugees. Evidence Informed Theories of Change need to be developed through grassroots up Professional Educators' and Administrators' Committees for Evolution (PEACE) and implemented to develop formative and summative Assessment for Personal and Social Learning. These need to be mapped to a national Competence-Based Assessment Framework. Data of what works empirically, logically and ethically to optimise students' learning, supported by international networks and amplified by this journal needs to be disseminated as groundwork cases, benchmarked and mainstreamed to optimise reach and impact of what readers can decide for themselves is good faculty of judgement and what tools they need to make this decision.

Introduction

The professional challenge this social and historical (sociohistorical) policy analysis addresses is since World War II the Lebanese Education Policy has not empowered all citizens with competences for critical thinking skills to ask good questions and problem solve collaboratively with good communication. These competences are required to make good decisions with good faculty of judgement that can be critically evaluated to strengthen good faculty of judgement progressively. Further, without parents' development of these competences for critical thinking to inform good decision making and good faculty of judgement, Lebanese people cannot advocate for their children's equitable access to pathways to engage successfully with: a) the labour market to contribute to sustainable growth of Lebanese Gross Domestic Product, b) to build community cohesion in a diverse nation with changing demographics and in recovery from civil war and ongoing conflicts, and c) full and free participation in the social contract ratified by the elected government with and for the people.

The Research Objectives are presented

First, to map a social and historical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy with a particular focus on how policy as text scripts for developing Lebanese citizens' competences for critical thinking; ask questions and problem

solve collaboratively with good communication skills with good decision making and good faculty of judgement. Second, to establish if the presence, or lack thereof, of these Intended Learning Outcomes, or competences has or has not empowered all citizens with equitable access to pathways to engaging successfully with a) the labour market to contribute to sustainable growth of Lebanese Gross Domestic Product, b) to build community cohesion in a diverse nation with changing demographics and in recovery from civil war and ongoing conflicts, and c) full and free participation in the social contract ratified by the elected government with and for the people.

The Research Questions are presented with a rationale

First, how and in what ways does mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveal policy as text scripts for developing Lebanese citizens' critical thinking competences by first, ability to ask good questions? Second, how and in what ways does mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveal policy as text scripts for developing Lebanese citizens to problem solve collaboratively? Third, how and in what ways does mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveal policy as text scripts for developing Lebanese citizens' with good communication skills? Fourth, how and in what ways does mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveal policy as text scripts for developing Lebanese citizens' good decision making and good faculty of judgement to problem solve on a personal and on a social level? Finally, how and in what ways does mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveal policy as text scripts for empowering all citizens with equitable access to pathways to engaging successfully with: a) the labour market to contribute to sustainable growth of Lebanese Gross Domestic Product, b) personal and social relationships that engender community cohesion in a diverse nation with changing demographics and in recovery from civil war and ongoing conflicts, and c) full and free participation in the social contract ratified by the elected government with and for the people?

The Policy Context

The Lebanese education system is highly influenced by its political system and historic events. It was initially modelled by the French education system when it was almost exclusively managed by religious communities. Later, the education system was subjected directly and indirectly to the sectarian structure of the Lebanese political system for more than four decades (Baytiyeh, 2017). An overview of the policy context that impacted the Lebanese education system is presented in

Table 1.1 Overview of policy context to impact Lebanese education system

1920	France colonial powers
1940	Ottomans: Jamal Pasha military occupies Lebanon
1943	France takes over Lebanese territory after which Lebanon takes its independence on the 22nd of November, 1943.
1948	Israeli-Arab War where Palestinians take refuge in Lebanon
1958	Lebanese First Civil War caused by political and religious tensions in the country (Christians vs Muslims) where reconciliation government formed

1975	Lebanese Second Civil War (CNN, 2020)- Civil war breaks out in Lebanon, pitting Palestinians and pro-Palestinian Lebanese militias against Lebanon's Christian militias. The war would last nearly 15 years, officially ending in 1990.)
1976	Syrian Occupation Military Occupation of Lebanon (Ibid Syria sends military peacekeepers during the early months of the civil war to help end it. The troops would remain there nearly 30 years, until April 2005.)
1978	Israel invades Lebanon to hinder Palestinian activities (Ibid- Israel prompts Israeli military forces to move into Lebanon to push the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) back from the border after A PLO attack on a bus in northern Israel)
1985	Ibid Israel withdraws from most of Lebanon but keeps control of the 12-mile-wide security zone in the south. Israel remains there until May 2000.
1989	Taif Agreement that ended the Lebanese Second Civil War
1992	Assassination of Prime Minister Rafic Hariri
1996	Airstrike on a village on South Lebanon by Israeli Airforce that resulted in Qana Massacre
2000	Israel withdraws from parts of Lebanon while Israeli troops remain southern Lebanon (Ibid- Israeli troops withdraw from southern Lebanon, and the United Nations establishes the "Blue Line" as a border between the two countries. he completeness of the withdrawal is still disputed as Lebanese Government and Hezbollah claim Israel still holds, Shebaa Farms, a small piece of territory on the Lebanon-Israel-Syria border, with disputed sovereignty)
2006	The 2006 Israel-Hezbollah also known as the 'July War' was a 34-day conflict with Israel.
2007	Nahr EL-Bared Conflict: Armed fighting between Fatah al-Islam and Lebanese Armed forces at the Palestinian refugee camp called Nahr El-Bared
2013	Syrian Refugee Crisis – Syrian Civil War spilled over into Lebanon
2020	Mass protests against economic stagnation and Beirut Explosion

Since the 1900s, Lebanon underwent a series of wars caused by political and religious tensions at the national level and the Israeli-Arab conflict at the international level that had a powerful disintegrative effect on the country and its people (Ibid). The education system suffered heavy damage during the civil war. After the Taif agreement in (Lebanon Government, 1989) an agreement which ended the civil war in Lebanon, was negotiated in Ta'if, Saudi Arabia, in September 1989 and approved by the Lebanese parliament on 4 November 1989. the Lebanese political system's policy as text aimed to build a consociational model framed within a power-sharing paradigm (Fakhoury, 2014). This did not happen as policy as discourse and current political literature does not regard Lebanon as a democratic state yet, due to 'the curse of sectarianism' (Kota 2012; Hajjar 2009; Makdisi et al 2011; Salloukh 2009; Weiss, 2009). Kota (2012, pp.103-104) states: 'Lebanese political elites such as za'im, warlords, and party leaders are so self-contained or egoistic that they often give highest priority to the sectarian interest rather than the national interest…so Lebanon today is just between authoritarianism and democracy'. Taysum (2019, p.9) argues:

> Education policy now needs to shift to offer differentiated levels of learning to meet students' talents and gifts, and interests by merit, justice and hard work with what Kesebir (2014) calls a quiet ego. A quiet ego enables a

person to glory in their strength. Egotism glorifies in a person's superior status won through individual competition without recognition of the different starting points (Kesebir, 2014).

Vulnerability of humans is arguably the construct of egotistical predators whereas a collaborator seeks to create new partnerships to identify and optimise the talents of all, recognising that all in society have an important contribution to make in the social contract (United Nations, 2016).

Taysum (2019, p. 9) continues:

> Sherman (1977) draws on Dewey's methods to propose teachers can facilitate learning by giving students opportunities to learn how to learn in meaningful and worthwhile ways. Such pedagogies empower students to discover their gifts, skills and interests which can ignite their passion for optimizing learning which in turn may optimize their well-being.

Curriculums may empower communities to examine the impact of policy contexts on societal infrastructures, and their sociohistorical origins (Arar and Taysum, 2019). These examinations could benefit from a focus on: contemporary culture, popularism and fake news; trends in international testing industries; how fear is being developed in institutions whilst tax payers and their children are disconnected from institutions, their economy and a social contract that does not promote the principle of inclusion (Taysum, 2019). Baytiyeh, H. (2017, p.546) confirms 'public and religious schools in the country have reinforced sectarian divisions in the Lebanese society'.

The Lebanese education system, as far as the schooling structure is concerned, is split in 3 phases (divided into 5 cycles): Pre-school Education, Basic Education, and Secondary Education as shown in the table 1.2. Pre-school Education, or cycle one, which is also known as Kindergarten Cycle starts for children at age 3 and who are below the age required by the Lebanese government which is six years old.
Public schools have not paid attention to the preschool phase whilst private schools have always had a preschool phase and have accepted students as young as three-years-old. In 2010, the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) added a third year to Kindergarten thus children begin KG1 at 3 years old, KG2 at 4 years old, and KG3 at 5 years old.

The Basic Education phase includes the Elementary cycle and Intermediate cycle: the elementary, or cycle two and three, is between the ages six and 12 (from Grade 1 to 6) and the intermediate, or cycle four, ranges from the age of 12 to 15 (from Grade 7 to Grade 9).
The secondary education, which is Secondary Cycle, or cycle five, pertains to those aged 15 to 18 (Grade 10 to 12) followed by the higher education cycle.

Table 1.2 School Structure in the Lebanese Education system

Phases	Pre-school Education	Basic Education			Secondary Education
Cycle Name	Kindergarten Cycle	Elementary Cycle	Intermediate Cycle		Secondary Cycle
Cycle Number	Cycle 1	Cycle 2	Cycle 3	Cycle 4	Cycle 5
Grades/Levels	KG1 KG2 KG3	Grade 1 Grade 2 Grade 3	Grade 4 Grade 5 Grade 6	Grade 7 Grade 8 Grade 9	Grade 10 Grade 11 Grade 12

Since 1998 the Lebanese government adopted a policy according to Lebanon's Legislative Act 686 of 1998 (Article 49) dated 16/03/1998 that guarantees compulsory/mandatory and free public education for children below the age of 12 (Lebanon, Refworld). In 2011, this Act was amended to increase the age limit to 15. It is at this age that primary-age children should have successfully completed both the elementary and intermediate levels of primary education. The education system develops the identities for Lebanese people to a) engage with the Lebanese social contract or not and b) to challenge the faculty of judgement in the decisions shaped by the Lebanese governance systems, the independent adjudicator (implementing the law built through groundwork case (Taysum, 2019)) and the force of the whole of society with an embedded or disembedded economy.

Corruption is deeply seeded in the Lebanese government due to aging authoritarianism, ongoing violence in the region, lack of dynamic engines for economic growth, lack of political freedom, lack of employment, and lack of state legitimacy (Adwan, 2004; Leenders, 2012). State legitimacy can be amplified by an Higher Education System as a hub of knowledge creation informing innovation across all sectors of the society with new partnerships in the quadruple helix. Here the Higher Education system needs to be focused on principles that realise sustainable human evolution with strategies and partnerships kind to people and planet for peace and prosperity (United Nations, 2016; Taysum, 2019).

Abdelnour (2001) compares corruption to cancer that infects the entire government hierarchy that trickles down to the citizens. For example, Wasta, a structural problem, is the most prevalent form of corruption in Lebanon that undermined trust in the government. Wasta is an Arabic word that loosely translates into nepotism, 'clout' or 'who you know' which involves the use of personal connections (or za'im connections) that favour some individuals to get access to services they need. These services include schools, universities, jobs, promotions, etc (Egan and Tabar, 2016). Other citizens without Wasta are denied access to opportunities and basic needs. Students sitting for official exams who have Wasta are given opportunities to cheat during tests. People who have Wasta are assigned to leadership and managerial positions in schools (Makhoul and Harrison, 2004). This form of corruption is a serious threat to social and economic equality in the education. sector and prevents propelling entrepreneurial economies with sustainable business models, aligned with achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (United Nations, 2016). Wasta impacts citizens' by putting their education, future, health and security at risk.

The corruption caused by the Lebanese authorities has brought the economy to its knees and along with the political class impoverished the local Lebanese and expats who invested in Lebanon. Lebanese politicians partner directly or indirectly with militias for personal and sectarian gains (Baumann, 2016). These gains such as stocking weapons and ammunition include some 2750 tons of ammonium nitrate explosives which were left for six years in a hangar at the port of Beirut in the

heart of the city. On the 4th of August 2020, the 2750 tons of ammonium nitrate at the port of Beirut exploded, killing 220 innocent people, with 100 people unaccounted for, injuring thousands, and making 300,000 homeless (BBC News, 2020). The Lebanese people who did not sustain physical injury are at risk for long-term effects including post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) which can lead to chronic conditions including addiction, depression, anxiety, and negative coping mechanisms which all seriously limit a person's potential and quality of life (Giovetti, 2020). The Lebanese government knew about the dangerous ammonium nitrate explosives at the port of Beirut and did not take the necessary emergency security measures to protect the Lebanese people (CNN, 2020). The explosion gave a message to the world that the corrupted political government is a serious threat to the Lebanese people and humanity since warnings from law firms and Port Officials of the enormous risk were ignored (Ibid). The Lebanese Government, after 30 years of continuing rule, holds the responsibility for governance, policy formation, and curriculum development and planning for the education sector and delivery of educational services in Lebanon.

Prior to the explosion, in an unprecedented event, on the 17th of October 2019, Lebanon 'rises' saw widespread protests engulfing the country in response to endemic corruption, poor governance and austerity (Guardian, 2020). Lebanese revolted against the 'entire' corrupt and criminal political class of incapable and corrupt politicians. On the 22nd of November 2019, teachers, students and their families protested against an outdated curriculum and burned textbooks outside the Education Ministry (The Lebanon Daily Star, 2019). The revolution brought down two governments in less than a year. Before and after the explosion, the government, aided by the same incompatible politicians, were violently oppressing the revolution, killing and maiming citizens in cold blood (Amnesty International, 2020). All these reasons indicate that the political system is the major deterrent to the education system in Lebanon optimising students' wellbeing and learning.

In this special edition journal each paper identifies the Crisis of Contemporary Culture and Popularism (Taysum, 2019) and in the Lebanese context the bullying and corruption within and between governance systems powerfully spotlights the urgency for a paradigm shift. Education systems, in a paradigm shift, can offer opportunities to develop citizens' identities for peace, and prosperity with new partnerships that are kind to people and planet (United Nations, 2016).
These new partnerships include parents and an approach that promotes parents' advocacy for their children's success measured by access to middle class benefits. This means developing new partnerships in the quadruple helix between schools, trade and Industry, health and social care for Sustainable Development. This can be achieved using Mayssa's Framework presented in this special edition journal that draws on John Dewey to identify the importance of curriculums with competences that students must achieve to: ask good questions (that contain half the answer); use these questions to stimulate critical reflection to problem solve; work collaboratively; develop good communication skills. Mayssa's Framework identifies how citizens transitioning from immaturity to maturity with these competences can achieve the Sustainable Development Goals that align with sustainable business models and an embedded economy within a social contract all explicitly understand and could have written themselves, (Kant, 1785; Taysum, 2019). These competences that empower citizens to engage with philosophical inquiry engender democratic deliberation so voices are heard which enables human evolution through the discovery of new knowledge that empowers the exchange of misconceptions for truth (Pring, 2007; Stuart-Mill, 1859; Taysum, 2012).

Methodology of Policy analysis.

This education policy analysis methodology is used for all papers in this special edition journal that focuses on how policy as text develops citizens identities for achieving the Sustainable Development Goals that align with commercial interests and health, social care, law and governance systems in a participatory social contract with sustainable ethical, logical and moral business models (Taysum, 2019). Education policy is arguably a future roadmap of a nation for provision of resources in an education sector. However, where an education state is going and where it is now, is informed by where it has come from (Taysum and Iqbal, 2012). Therefore mapping shifts in educational policy has the potential to reveal economic policies and how these were coupled to the social and moral values according to the cultural aspirations of the region at the time. Stasz and Wright (2007) make a case that policies are designed in a political environment, and shaped by ideology, interests of particular groups, constituent pressures and a variety of fiscal and institutional constraints. Decisions in policy making may be reached through compromises that ensure legislative commitments are met, whilst meeting the demands of other policy areas because resources, and funding in these matters are finite. As governments change the policy memory of what works gets lost in a plurality of readings (Codd, 1998) and as policy agents change (Bangs et al. (2011). Hodgson and Spours (2006) identify that if policy is not grounded on what has gone before 'policy amnesia' exists and possibilities for building on the wisdom of what works is lost. Plato (2017) some 2000 years ago in Timaeus, p. 16376:

> Thereupon one of the priests, who was of a very great age, said: O Solon, Solon, you Hellenes are never anything but children, and there is not an old man among you. Solon in return asked him what he meant. I mean to say, he replied, that in mind you are all young; there is no old opinion handed down among you by ancient tradition, nor any science which is hoary with age…

And by Plato (2017) in Critias, p. 17765:

> By such reflections and by the continuance in them of a divine nature, Like the qualities which we have described grew and increased among them; but when the divine portion began to fade away, and became diluted too often and too much with the mortal admixture, and the human nature got the upper hand, they then, being unable to bear their fortune, behaved unseemly, and to him who had an eye to see grew visibly debased, for they were losing the fairest of their precious gifts (their virtue); those who had no eye to see the true happiness (found through right), they appeared glorious and blessed at the very time when they were full of avarice and unrighteous power.

Taysum (2019, p. 32) states:

> Having lost their virtue, the greedy Hellenes, full of extra entitlement, sought material wealth because with unrighteous power the value of the immaterial or what Plato seems to call the 'divine portion' began to fade away. Dewey (1916) suggests the common interests of a debase or criminal group may be few, indeed limited only in their interests to plunder. To achieve stripping others' assets and opportunities to live a virtuous life the debased can isolate groups by dividing them and giving them different levels of power. The slave owners, 'full of avarice and unrighteous power' as identified by Plato were acting against human rights when enslaving people and disempowering them of the ability to, as merchants. Segregating different groups based on their different

levels of power can be related to the different kinds of funds of capital they have. Indeed, this may be part of a policy context that is perpetuated by an education system that calls students, the children of taxpayers, 'failures'.

Marshall (2017) identified that the bloody Indian rebellion in 1857 against the East Indian Trading Company was caused because the colonisers had deposed Indian rulers in the Kingdom of Awadh whose colonised subjects were forced to pay high taxes with few opportunities to start their own Small and Medium Enterprises as liberal merchants. The monopoly of the East Indian Trading Corporation in putting the Indian citizens into debt without opportunity to work themselves out of it was taking their economic freedom, their political freedom and Hindus and Muslims feared their religious freedoms would be taken too with an unwelcome intrusion of Christian missionaries and the threat of forced conversions.

Critical reflection may reveal policy strengths and areas for development which may at the same time affirm and subvert policy in a constructive way to bring about coherence and improvement in delivery or provision. However, governments made up of agents from elite networks may develop policy, and even policy amnesia, to ensure they keep their elite extra entitlement and may even be able to package this as attractive to the people they call 'failures' who they are exploiting. As Woodson (1992, p. 18) states:

> If you can control a man's thinking you do not have to worry about his action. When you determine what a man shall think you do not have to concern yourself about what he will do. If you make a man feel that he is inferior, you do not have to compel him to accept an inferior status, for he will seek it himself. If you make a man think that he is justly an outcast, you do not have to order him to the back door. He will go without being told; and if there is no back door, his very nature will demand one.

In this way voters vote for the elite rulers like turkeys vote for Christmas, without realising that the elites' policies ensure examinations' success mapped to curriculums is biased in favour of the elite, whilst regulatory systems ensure citizens recognise they are failures. The constant fear of failure coupled with debt and poverty fills people with fear and adds to poor mental health and mental illness. Not being able to think clearly assures the poor are unable to build collaborative networks and develop action plans to work themselves out of poverty and their access to the elites' networks of extra entitlement is prevented. Ball (2006) suggests the advocates and technicians of policy change may find themselves the beneficiaries of new power relations, and how power is defined and critiqued is important when analysing policy.

Stasz and Wright (2007) argue that policies fail for three reasons. First, they are not evidence informed. Second, they are shaped by deeply held beliefs or ideologies of, for example, the elite that wish to perpetuate their elite status by creating examinations and curriculums to ensure the elite have smooth passage to elite Higher Education Institutions. Third, there is poor alignment between the policy problem and a particular policy instrument. With a change in Government may come a change in education policies underpinned by different ideologies. The strengths of education policies from previous governments may be abandoned and forgotten leaving the educational professionals to make sense of how their professional practice aligns with what they have done before and what they are required to do now.

The argument is therefore presented that unless education policy is discursive, the possibilities for thinking 'otherwise' with an enquiring mind are limited. This affirms Hong Qian's (2019) statement that populist opinions always contain broad

fallacies, half-truths, and generalizations. Without critique of policy in transparent ways reported to voters, policy can smuggle through populism and fake news with biased strategies that perpetuate the status of the elite. Further the chances for building coherent education policies that build on what worked before and transparently challenge what did not work are limited, if not totally removed. Populism therefore perpetuates the government's scientific denialism to promote strategies of the elite for the elite[1]. The only way to address this is to take a credible national evidence based, logical and ethical policy for curriculums. The curriculums need national Assessment for Learning Frameworks that professional educators agree with. Committees need to be able to ask the government to explain why they disagree with the Professional Educators and Administrators' Committees proposals for evidence informed, logical and evidence based policy and Assessment for Learning Frameworks. The Government needs to be able to address these questions line by line mapping back to the theories of change and using the literature to support their responses. Thus, educational policy and its implications need to be understood by all affected by it, in a language that is understood by all with terms defined and progressed in forums that are committed to facilitating civic engagement where participation is facilitated (Shields, 2007).

Conceptualising policy in this way means it is necessary to think through issues of power, and the balance of power in terms of making sense of policy 'from above' and 'below' (Taysum and Gunter, 2008). Dowding (1996) suggests: "power to" can be described as outcome power which "is the ability of an actor to bring about or help to bring about outcomes" (1996, p. 5). Power to may involve cooperation and power over seems to involve conflict (Dowding, 1996). Change has the potential to undermine existing practices and common sense views. Values may be challenged and this is not neutral since there will be winners and losers. The notion of power balance and the underlying ideological position of the political arena at any given time needs to be unravelled when trying to understand the production of policy text and its subsequent interpretation through practice.

Lebanese Education Policy as text analysis 1945-1973

The end of World War I brought Lebanon under the French Mandate (1920-1943) in accordance with the Sykes-Picot agreement in 1916 (Gaith and Shabaan, 1996, Kurani, 1936) ref). Consequently, the French Government played a key role in the educational legislations and sponsored a new system of public education and a system of official public examinations modelled on the French system. The Arabic and French languages were declared as the official languages in Lebanon and core subjects such as mathematics and sciences were taught only in French (Sbaiti, 2009). The curriculum was identical to the study programmes of the French Brevet and Baccaluareate certificates acquired at the end Grade 9 and Grade 12 respectively. As a result, all schools in Lebanon were held accountable to the French High Commission rather than to the Lebanese Government. Even though, Lebanon achieved independence from France in 1943, the Lebanese authorities continued to adopt the French system of education with minor modifications. The decree #7004 stated that students can sit for the official exams (Brevet and Baccaluareate) for mathematics and sciences in French, English and Arabic. However, Arabic Language was declared as the only official language in Lebanon. Nonetheless, this decree was improvised and triggered by national pride following the independence without sufficiently considering the realities of the job market and

---

[1] Taysum (2019; 2017a; 2017b) explains in detail how this strategy of the elites perpetuating the strategies of the 'dark Satanic mills' (Blake, 2804) of colonialism throughout ages is perpetuated more recently by neo-liberalism.

the socioeconomic and educational objectives of knowing foreign languages (Diab, 2000; Gaith and Shabaan, 1996). Ghaith and Shabaan (1996) argue that policy makers overlooked the extent to which French and English are deeply rooted in the Lebanese education system which made teaching mathematics and sciences utilising the Arabic language as an instructional language extremely difficult for teachers and students. They further stated that:

> 'The Lebanese people started to feel the importance of English as the language of science and technology shortly after the end of World War II and the growing international influence of the United States of America. Furthermore, the discovery of oil in the Arabian Gulf and Saudi Arabia motivated the Lebanese to learn English as the language of international business' (Ghaith and Shabaan, 1996, p.102).

The oil crisis for the West hit with OPEC and in 1979 a huge shift to neo-liberalism began which I argue was in response to the Western Colonists losing money/power and needed to grab it back by attacking the good business corporations enjoying the golden age – they slashed them, took the business (manufacturing base) away and put it in another country where there was cheap/slave labour and reduced the reserves (the money that companies keep back after declaring profits for research and development and to ride out any unexpected problems that could threaten the end of the company) and hit the unions and increased work hours and slashed the workforce (please read Chapter 6 of Education policy as a road map to achieving the sustainable development goals if you want to understand this further) – so in effect neo-liberalism argubaly replaced money lost from being asked to leave the middle east which ended lucrative oil profits.

The main problem with the Lebanese education system post-independence and World War II was mainly the use of instructional language in teaching different subjects. In addition to that, the curriculum taught at schools was still directed and authorised by the French education system and the official examinations are still modelled on the French system up to this date. What is lacking in the education system is the offer of competences to students who are transitioning from immaturity to maturity identified in Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking [1]:

B1 Good Questioning Skill
B2 Problem Solving Skill
B3 Communication Skills
B4 Collaborative Skills

Which aligns with 1994 International Committee on the Rights of the Child (Hamdan and Balasz, 2020) to offer an education system that empowers citizens with competences to participate fully and freely in their social contract (Kant, 1785).

Curriculum Reforms 1994 to 2009

Since the civil war in 1975, the quality of the Lebanese education system has suffered from a huge chaotic situation. The fierce civil war took a toll on the public educational system when it nearly collapsed by the end of the war in 1990 (Frayha,

---

[1] Please see the article in this special edition journal for full deconstruction, and reconstruction in application to the real world of Mayssa's Framework.

2009) where school facilities were destroyed that resulted in loss of instructional time and loss of qualified educators (Ghaith and Shabaan, 1996). Lebanon witnessed two education reforms since the Taif Agreement in 1989. The formal starting point for the education reform process in Lebanon was the adoption by the members of Parliament of the Document of National Accord (the Taif Agreement) in 1989, which put to an end the civil war that had lasted for fifteen years (Shuayb, 2019). However, this was an educational reform that took place under a peace agreement. Fontana (2018) highlights, in her multi-methods study 'Mapping the Relationship between Education Reform and Power-Sharing in and after Intrastate Peace Agreements' that focuses on Lebanon, Northern Ireland, and Macedonia, that education reform is a very complex process in the aftermath of civil wars. Fontana (2018, p. 99) states 'inconsistency of peace agreements complicates the implementation of specific reforms, and that the type of political system established at the end of a conflict can constrain the implementation of syncretistic educational provisions. This links to Taysum's (2020) identification of the epistemologies of education systems and their role in creating identities in the first paper of this journal 'Generous or Harsh Post-war Economies, Epistemologies of Education Systems and creating identities for war or peace'.

Syncretism is the amalgamation or attempted amalgamation of different religions, cultures, or schools of thought, which constructive intercultural dialogues striving for a provisional consensus on a social contract for peace may slip into (Taysum, 2019). As Arar and Taysum (2019) argue there is a significant difference between a) hierarchical top down coercion to agree with elite policy makers (overt or covert) with no chance of authentic dialogue and talk back, and b) participatory flatter structures of power sharing in authentic dialogue that seeks, step by step, provisional consensus in a win-win solution to the problem of making peace after a civil war (Taysum, 20200). Frayha argues (2012a, p.99):

> The mechanism for curriculum development and its implementation in Lebanon is extremely complicated, which generally speaking is just the opposite of how curricula should be. Indeed, changing the content of academic subject matter, or part of the subject matter, requires a study covering many stages and many educational and non-educational institutions (i.e. lobby groups) before being submitted to parliament which can eventually issue legislation on the matter. On average, the curricula are modified only once every thirty years, whereas educationalists generally agree that curriculum reform should be a continuous process.

Article 10 of the Taif (Government of Lebanon, 1989) agreement stipulated the need to develop a new curriculum that contributes to citizenship. The 1989 education reform (Lebanon Government, 1989) included several goals such as providing access to education for all and reviewing the curricula and their development in order to reinforce a national unity among citizens. Hamdan and Balasz (2020, p.6) identify:

> In 1991, Lebanon ratified the International Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which states among other things the following: "Children have the right to education. Primary Education should be free and all children should be required to attend. Secondary Education should be accessible to every child." The convention also makes clear that "Education should develop the child's personality, talents, mental and physical abilities." To date Lebanon has submitted three reports to the International Committee on the Rights of the Child on its progress in realising the CRC. The response from the Committee has been mixed. Its concluding observations to the first report highlighted a number of areas of concern, specifically in health education, the teaching of

values and the teaching about environmental issues. The Committee also recommended that Lebanon do more to prioritise "public education and the social welfare system," in view of the "growing role of private educational and health institutions" in the country.

As a result, The Centre for Education Research and Development (CERD), a public institution under the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education, initiated the Plan for Educational Reform in 1994 (Shuayb, 2019). The old curricula and teaching programmes that were issued between 1968-1971 were suspended for lacking substance, national direction, new teaching methodologies and technological development (Frayha 2012a; MEHE, 1994).

A plan was completed in 1994 under the title 'A Plan for Educational Reform in Lebanon' (Republic of Lebanon Ministry of National Education, Youth and Sports, 1994) identified education policy should develop the Intellectual and Humanistic Dimensions. This connects with the Human Development Index; Methodology and Measurement (Anand and Sen, 1994) published after the first Human Development Report in 1990. The Plan scoped to improve the Social Dimensions through the General Educational Objectives that focused on developing an humanistic society and co-existence with religious loyalty to the 'heavenly religions' to create a democratic society. However the Framework of Educational Policy as policy as text was not realised through policy as discourse, even when the reform was finally established in 1997. The Reforms Plan introduced subjects such as computer studies, technology, social studies, economics, a second foreign language in addition to mathematics, sciences (physics, chemistry, biology), Arabic language and first foreign language. The curriculum reform resulted in adding more subjects totalling 14, rather than identifying and addressing academic gaps, redundancies, and misalignments for purposes of improving the overall coherence of a course of study and, by extension, its effectiveness. As a result, the current curricula is manifested in the lack of alignment among its stated general goals, special objectives and cycle objectives and is not focused on the Intended Learning Outcomes/competences of Mayssa's Framework (above) that map to developing the identities needed for citizens to develop identities to create peace and fully and freely participate in the social contract.

The limited scope for developing the competences for creating democratic identities (Taysum, 2019) resulted in heavy content using memorization as the only learning strategy (Lebanese Association for Educational Studies (LAES, 2006)), the result was cognitive overload (Sweller et al, 2011). The memorisation of facts causes cognitive overload and prevents students from optimising their learning of disciplinary knowledge and applying it in the real world with the four competences from Mayssa's Framework for Competences for Critical Thinking (see above). The lack of concordance between curriculum objectives and competence assessment systems mapped to levelling statements prevents development of students' narrative capital. Reading the narratives of others, that does not write the self into the narrative, may be causing internal conflict and angst (Taysum, 2019) which a) damages good mental health and wellbeing and b) results in an unsatisfactory transition of immature citizen to mature autonomous citizen who has good faculty of judgement to participate fully and freely with the quadruple helix of society to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (UN, 2016) and work for peace and prosperity for all.

The 1994 reform plan restructured the educational system with the objective of giving more choice to students in the secondary phase as well as providing vocational students with the opportunity to join mainstream higher education (Shuayb, 2016). A comprehensive assessment of the 1997 curriculum conducted by Lebanese Association for Educational Studies

(LAES), 1999) provided incontestable evidence of myriad weaknesses that stymied the successful implantation of the curriculum (Kirdar and Brock 2017, p. 68). The CERD was assigned to carry out curriculum development and reform, however the LAES (2006, p.15) Vision Document reported that:

> Although the bold step taken [by CERD] to develop school textbooks for all educational cycles has contributed to making the national textbook available to all, the quality of these textbooks suffers from: 1) absence of a single independent authority for developing and monitoring textbooks in accordance with pre-determined criteria, and 2) the stagnation of the school textbooks.

In comparison to previous curricula, the educational curricula issued in 1997 represented a significant qualitative change, especially in: 1) their development on the basis of objectives; 2) introduction of new subject matter areas; 3) updating knowledge base; and 4) the adoption of active methodologies. However, studies carried out on the curricula showed many weaknesses in quality, as in 1) Internal inconsistency in the curricula where 1.1) the different subject matter areas differed in the manner in which they were organized, 1.2) in the way general and specific objectives were formulated, and 1.3) in the organization of tables of content sequence; 2) the low degree of alignment between general curriculum goals on the one hand, and 2.1) general and specific objectives of subject matter areas as well as the content, on the other; 3) weakness in developing a scope and sequence that fits the subject matter, 3.1) the time allowed, and 3.2) the learning process; 4) problems with the appropriateness and validity of content; and 5) problems in formulation related to accuracy in using technical terms and in translation which resulted in discrepancies among the Arabic, English, and French versions of the curricula.

The Second Education Reform 2010

The development of a new educational strategy began in 2005 and finally saw the light in 2010. The UNDP Policy Advisor and Project Implementation Unit were established at MEHE, since February 10, to support the realization of the objectives of the MEHE Education Sector Development Plan (ESDP) (2010) and its five priorities that mapped to the United Nations Development Plan (2013).

Priority 1 Education Available on the Basis of Equal Opportunity
Priority 2 Quality Education that Contributes to Building a Knowledge Society
Priority 3 Education that Contributes to Social Integration
Priority 4 Education that Contributes to Economic Development
Priority 5 Governance of Education

The Government of Lebanon approved in October 2012, the World Bank USD 40 million loan for MEHE to be utilized for the implementation of the Education Development Plan (United Nations Development Report, 2013) available via the Portal of Education Plans and Policies (full selection available by nation state and year) (United Nations, 2021) .

This included a joint project between the U.S. Agency for International Development and MEHE in 2009 where it was then approved to secure a grant of about U.S. $45 million after which the ministry was able to persuade the agency to increase

the grant to $75 million following the development of the five-year ESDP United Nations Development Plan (2013). The UK Secretary of State for International Development announced the UK's delivery on its commitment to invest £160 million over 4 years in quality education in Lebanon. The focus was to get 147,000 more children into public schools with free enrolment for all. The funding supports the London Conference Goal of reaching all children with education by 2016/17, provide over 3 million textbooks and renew at least 10 schools to meet standards and:

> support at least 75% of teachers to meet the proposed new national professional standards and support the Ministry of Education's reform priorities including on use of data and a national learning assessment framework… DFID provided UNICEF £60m for non-formal education and child protection to ensure 'No Lost Generation' as a result of the Syria crisis, announced by the Secretary of State in summer 2016. This programme is designed to support the most vulnerable out of school refugee children (Syrian, Palestinian and Iraqi) and the poorest Lebanese children and will provide non-formal education for up to 100,000 children cumulatively over four years. It will also address the urgent child protection needs of an estimated 287,000 girls, boys and caregivers, providing them with access to services aimed at preventing and responding to violence and exploitation and helping promote positive practices around issues like child marriage and child labour. (UK, Government, 2017, p.1).

Work has continued with UNESCO delivering workshops to develop conceptual understandings of Formative Assessment for Learning in the classroom that has education alignment and uses a stock-take approach of different initiatives to understand what works and why (UNESCO, 2019). This can use Assessment for Personal and Social Learning (Taysum, 2019) and a Needs Assessment for developing the thinking tools to be able to successfully implement Assessment for Personal and Social Learning that UNESCO calls Formative Classroom Based Assessment (UNESCO, 2019). Taysum (2019) identifies that such assessment should be benchmarked to Intended Learning Outcomes that are competence based with clear levelling statements so that students can use their feedback on assessments to know where they are in their learning journeys at Key Stages of their learning that can be called 'Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). These KPIs provide clear levelling statements of where students are on their pathways to success. They can therefore use the competence based approach to learning with formative assessment for learning as a road map to achieving their personal ambitions that align to logical, moral and empirical full and free participation with the social contract in the realisation of making their narrative capital a reality and living a good life with a happy ending (Plato, 2017; Kant, 1785, Dewey, 1916; Pring, 2007; Taysum, 2019; UNESCO, 2019).

Recent Lebanese protests and events of 2020 'Schools of Sand' have been exposed by the private investigative journalist television station Al Jadeed TV that broadcasts in Arabic. The protests accused the successive governments, the recent (resigned) government and specifically the Ministry of Education and Higher Education of misappropriating the aid funds that were for educating Lebanese students and Syrian refugees in Lebanon Al Jadeed TV (2020) This is affirmed by Kobeissi (2020, p.1) who states.

> accused successive Lebanese governments of misappropriating foreign aid funds provided by donor countries to educate Syrian refugees in Lebanon. The amount of money missing is estimated at up to $9 million annually

since 2014. "There is an unreal increase of at least 15,000 Syrian refugee students over the actual numbers enrolled in schools," said Riad Kobaissi, the reporter who conducted the investigation.

According to Kobeissi (2020. P.1) 'International and regional donors have helped Lebanon cope with the challenge, providing more than $7 billion to the Lebanon Crisis Response Plan between 2012 and 2018'. United Nations Refugee Agency (2020. P.1) identifies 'Lebanon remains the country hosting the largest number of refugees per capita. There are, an estimated 1.5 million Syrian refugees, and some 16,000 refugees of Ethiopian, Iraqi, Sudanese and other origins, in addition to over 200,000 Palestinian refugees under UNRWA's mandate'.

The Human Rights Watch Report, titled 'Following the Money: Lack of Transparency in Donor Funding for Syrian Refugee Education' published in 2017 shows that there was a lack of information about the allocation of projects donors' funding, and their timing (Human Rights Watch, 2017). Dhaybi (2020, p.1) identifies:

> Besides the inflated student count, Kobaissi and his team also found that the 11,000 teachers who contracted with the Ministry of Education to teach Syrian students have not been paid their salaries in full. The ministry pays them for the hours they teach in Lebanese pounds, not in U.S. dollars. The government is taking advantage of the huge difference in the exchange rate "without anyone knowing where the currency exchange difference of hundreds of thousands of dollars goes," he said (On paper, the official exchange rate remains at 1,500 Lebanese pounds to the dollar, but at the street exchange rate available to ordinary Lebanese citizens, it would take about 4,000 Lebanese pounds to equal one dollar.

In 2019, hundreds of students were banned from sitting official exams after corrupt employees of schools failed to register them at the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education (Astih, 2019). This exposed a new structural problem called 'fake schools' that shook the educational sector in Lebanon during the recent years of what is so called 'The 2010 Education Reform' (Astih, 2019). Astih (2019) reported that this has led a student called Hanan Kerbaj, who was prevented from taking her exam, to pour fuel on her clothes and face in an attempt to set her body on fire in front of the MEHE. In addition to that the country witnessed another scandal during the same year by some private universities selling counterfeit diplomas which exposed another case of corruption under the title of 'University Shops' (Astih, 2019).

The investigation of the empirical evidence on the Ministry of Education Higher Education (MEHE) website https://www.mehe.gov.lb/en found on 29th October 2020:

Subheading: Latest News.   Nothing to display.
Subheading: Our Services. Nothing to display.
Subheading: Programs and Projects. Nothing to display.

We are unable to conduct any research on current education policy as text in Lebanon because there is 'nothing to display'.

The education system is in crisis and in the middle of a pandemic. Education needs an Empirical Teacher Leadership Model for example The Iraq Empirical Teacher Leadership Model presented in this Special Edition Journal mapped to Empowering Young Societal Innovators for Equity and Renewal (Taysum, 2019).

Conclusions

Mapping a sociohistorical policy analysis since World War II of Lebanese Education Policy reveals policy as text does not script for developing Lebanese citizens' critical thinking and there is no competence based Assessment for Personal and Social Learning with Clear Levelling Statements that map to Formative Classroom Based Assessment processes and practices that inform planning of learning to meet the Intended Learning Outcomes. These Competences such as being able to ask good questions, working collaboratively, having good communication skills and developing good faculty of judgement that has proof of concept for problem solving is not developing democratic identities for peace as identified in the other articles in this special edition journal by Mayssa et al, Taysum, and Altae and Taysum.

The conclusions identify that war has impacted the way in which education creates the identities of citizens who memorise content knowledge of many subjects but have not competences to fully and freely engage with a social contract that prevents perpetuating civil war, stops fraud, and builds Lebanon's economic base and Gross Domestic Product aligned to the Sustainable Development Goals and transparent and fair business models.

There is 'nothing to display' on the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education Website and the education system is in crisis, recovering from an horrific explosion and in a Covid-19 pandemic. Lebanese people cannot engage with grassroots up participatory processes and practices to impact the Lebanese strategic social contract that they elect the government to implement prudently within a spirit of trust. The Lebanese people cannot advocate for their children's equitable access to pathways to engage successfully with: a) creating opportunities within or participating with the labour market to contribute to sustainable growth of Lebanese Gross Domestic Product, b) to build community cohesion in a diverse nation with changing demographics and in recovery from civil wars and ongoing conflicts in a context of international wars, and c) full and free participation in the social contract ratified by the elected government with and for the people.

Principles to emerge from this Groundwork Case of Lebanese Education Policy to facilitate Faculty of Judgement

Prime moral principles for developing a groundwork case in Lebanon to develop faculty of judgement through the education system should be presented as objectives with clear National Competence-Based Assessment Frameworks. However the Lebanese MEHE has 'Nothing to Display'. Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking reveals the principle of being critical is important, but is not scripted in Lebanese education policy. Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking reveals the principle of being collaborative and inclusionary for community cohesion is important but is not scripted in Lebanese education policy. Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking reveals the principle of communicating and agreeing to disagree as provisional consensus is reached (or in other words being tolerant of opposing views) is important but is not scripted in Lebanese education policy. Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking (Mayssa et al, this special edition journal) reveals the principle of generating new knowledge to problem solve in innovative ways and testing out personal good faculty of judgement in the social sphere that can create a more perfect union of peace that celebrates diversity and propels entrepreneurial economies but is not scripted in Lebanese education policy. Education Policy should be implemented by an Interim Government with and for the people with transparent financial accountability of funds from the Lebanese taxpayer and from taxpayers from other benefactor states including the US and the UK to eliminate fraud and corruption and to support the most vulnerable in Lebanon. Evidence Informed Theories of Change need to be developed

through grassroots up Professional Educators and Administrators Committees for Evolution (PEACE) and implemented to develop formative and summative Assessment for Personal and Social Learning. These need to be mapped to a national Competence-Based Assessment Framework (Canfarotta et al (2020). Data of what works to optimise students' learning has a forum to be distributed within and between clusters, supported by international networks amplified by this journal. What works with empirical, logical and ethical proof of concept of what works (Taysum and Collins-Ayanlaja, 2020) can then be fed up to policy makers for critical evaluation and potential mainstreaming to optimise reach and impact. Principles of the Theories of Practical Excellence for Organisational Effectiveness, Improvement and Change can then be published in this Open Access Journal 'Groundwork Case and Faculty of Judgement' to optimise reach and impact.

Knowledge to Action Strategies

Knowledge to action strategies emerge that

A. Education Policy should be implemented by an Interim Government with and for the people with transparent financial accountability of funds from the Lebanese tax payer and from taxpayers from other benefactor states including the US and the UK.

B. Education policy, drawing on the existing education system structures includes Mayssa's Competences for Critical Thinking.

> B1 Good Questioning Skill - implemented within one year as part of a 5 year plan, with Key Performance Indicators using the Iraq Empirical Teacher Leader Model for each Key Stage subject to critical evaluation and interventions at the end of each year.

> B2 Problem Solving Skill - implemented within one year as part of a 5 year plan, with Key Performance Indicators using the Iraq Empirical Teacher Leader Model for each Key Stage subject to critical evaluation and interventions at the end of each year.

> B3 Communication Skills - implemented within one year as part of a 5 year plan, with Key Performance Indicators using the Iraq Empirical Teacher Leader Model for each Key Stage subject to critical evaluation and interventions at the end of each year.

> B4 Collaborative Skills - implemented within one year as part of a 5 year plan, with Key Performance Indicators using the Iraq Empirical Teacher Leader Model for each Key Stage subject to critical evaluation and interventions at the end of each year.

C. Lebanese Grassroots up professional learning networks made up from each school in clusters with a Committee representing each cluster and a revolving Chair (taking it in turns to be Chair to build capacity for leadership) are linked Virtually within Lebanon and with International benchmarking partners (United Nations, 2016) to share progress of the Knowledge to Action Strategy mapped to Key Performance Indicators using Professional Educators and Educators Committees for Empowerment (PEACE) (Taysum et al, 2019) and the Iraq Teacher Leadership Model from this Special Edition Journal.

D. Evidence Informed Theories of Change are implemented for proof of concept within and between clusters of teachers to develop formative and summative Assessment for Personal and Social Learning mapped to a national Competence-Based Assessment Framework (Canfarotta et al (2020) and data of what works to

optimise students' learning is distributed within and between clusters and fed up to policy makers for critical evaluation and potential mainstreaming to optimise reach and impact.

E. Principles of the Theories of Practical Excellence for Organisational Effectiveness, Improvement and Change are published with the case in 'Journal Groundwork Cases and Faculty of Judgement (Taysum, 2019).

References

Abdelnour, R. (2001) *Ice Booms In Rivers; Lessons Learned and the Development of Reliable Solutions*.11th Workshop on river Ice, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada, May 14 – 16. Vailable online at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/242252041_Ice_Booms_in_Rivers_Lessons_Learned_and_the_Development_of_Reliable_Solutions downloaded 28th December 2020.

Adwan, S. (2004) Peace Building in Violent Conflict: Israeli-Palestinian Post-Oslo People-to-People Activities in *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society*, 17 563–574 Available online at: https://link.springer.com/article/10.1023/B:IJPS.0000019619.70068.9f downloaded 28th December 2020.

Al Jadeed TV (2020) *Schools of Sand*. Report available online at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2bEZusgS4PM downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Amnesty International (2020) *Lebanon Protests Explained* available online at: https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2019/11/lebanon-protests-explained/ downloaded 28th December 2020.

Amnesty International (2016) *Lebanon's Submission to the UN Committee on the Elimination of all forms of racial discrimination; Lebanon's Legislative Act 686 of 1998 (Article 49)* dated 16/03/1998 available online at: https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/5790d8c04.pdf downloaded 28th December 2020.

Anand, S. and Sen, A. (1994) *The Human Development Index; Methodology and Measurement.* New York: Human Development Report Office.

Arar, K. and Taysum, A. (2019) From hierarchical leadership to a mark of distributed leadership by whole school inquiry in partnership with Higher Education Institutions: comparing the Arab education in Israel with the education system in England in International Journal of Leadership in Education. In *International Journal of Education Administration* 23 (6) 755-774. Available online at: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13603124.2019.1591513 downloaded 28th December 2020.

Asthi, P. (2019) Lebanon: Hundreds of Students Victims of Corrupt Employees, 'Fake' Schools in Arab World News available online at: https://english.aawsat.com/home/article/1765721/lebanon-hundreds-students-victims-corrupt-employees-fake-schools downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Ball, S.J. (2006) Education Policy and Social Class. London: Routledge.

Bangs, J., Macbeath, J. & Galton, M. (2011). Reinventing Schools, Reforming Teaching. From political visions to classroom reality. London: Routledge.

Baumann, H. (2016) Social protest and the political economy of sectarianism in Lebanon in An Interdisciplinary Journal of Current Affairs and Applied Contemporary Thought, 6 (4) 634-649.

BBC News (2020) *Beirut Explosion; what we know so far*. Available online at: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-53668493 downloaded 28th December 2020.

Baytiyeh, H. (2017) Why School Resilience Should Be Critical for the Post-Earthquake Recovery of Communities in Divided Societies in *Education and Urban Society* 51 (5) 693-711.

Canfarotta, D., Taysum, A., Casado-Muñoz, R., Ruşitoru, M. (Accepted) 'Applying ABCDE and Assessment for Personal and Social Learning To Studying The Classics To Gain Self-Knowledge For Self-Governance in a Social Contract mapped to the Sustainable Development Goals, their Moral Principles and the European Qualification Framework Competences' in European Journal of Social Sciences Education and Research, 7 (2) 58-77. Available here http://journals.euser.org/index.php/ejser/article/view/4783.

Codd, J. (1988). The construction and deconstruction of education policy documents. *Journal of Education Policy*, 3(3), 235-47.

CNN (2020) Timeline: Decades of conflict in Lebanon, Israel Available online at: https://edition.cnn.com/2006/WORLD/meast/07/14/israel.lebanon.timeline/index.html downloaded 28th December 2020.

Dhaybi, J. (2020) *Report Alleges Gross Misuse of Donor Funds for Refugee Education in Lebanon.* Al-Fanar Media Covering Education, Research and Culture available online at: https://www.al-fanarmedia.org/2020/06/report-alleges-gross-misuse-of-donor-funds-for-refugee-education-in-lebanon/ downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Dewey, J. (1916). Democracy and Education. New York, NY: Macmillan.

Dowding, K. (1996) *Power.* Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Egan and Tabar, (2016) Bourdieu in Beirut: Wasta, the State and Social Reproduction in Lebanon in *Middle East Critique* 25 (3) 249-270.

Fakhoury, T. (2014) The EU and Lebanon in the Wake of the Arab Uprisings In *Middle East Policy* 21 (1) 133-143.

Guardian (2020) Lebanon's mass revolt against corruption and poverty continues. Available online at: https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/oct/20/lebanons-mass-revolt-against-corruption-and-poverty-continues downloaded 28th December 2020.

Giovetti, O. (2020) *The Humanitarian Impact of the Beirut explosion.* Available online at: https://www.concern.org.uk/news/humanitarian-impact-beirut-explosion downloaded 28th December 2020.

Hajjar L (2009) Does Torture Work? A Sociolegal Assessment of the Practice in Historical and Global Perspective in *Annual Review of Law and Social Science* 5 311-345.

Hodgson, A. & Spours, K. (2006). An analytical framework for policy engagement: "the contested case of 14-19 reforms in England. In Journal of Education Policy , 21(6), 679-696.

Human Rights Watch Report (2017) *Following the Money; Lack of Transparency in Donor Funding For Syrian Refugee Education* available online at: https://www.hrw.org/report/2017/09/14/following-money/lack-transparency-donor-funding-syrian-refugee-education downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Kant, I. (1785). Groundwork of the metaphysics of morals. London: HarperCollins.

Kesibir, P. (2014) A Quiet Ego Quiets Death Anxiety: Humility as an Existential Anxiety Buffer in *American Psychological Association's Journal of personality and social psychology* 106 (4) 610-623.

Kobeissi, R. (2020) Riad Kobeissi Exposes Scandal Linked to Education Ministry's Program Management Unit Program. available online at: https://blogbaladi.com/riad-kobeissi-exposes-scandal-linked-to-education-ministrys-pmu-program/ downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Kota, S. (2012) *Undemocratic Lebanon?: The Power-Sharing Arrangements after the 2005 Independence intifada* available online at: http://www.ritsumei.ac.jp/acd/re/k-rsc/hss/book/pdf/vol04_06.pdf downloaded 28th December 2020.

Lebanon Government (1989) The Taif Agreement. Available online at: https://www.un.int/lebanon/sites/www.un.int/files/Lebanon/the_taif_agreement_english_version_.pdf downloaded 1st January 2021.

Lebanese Association for Educational Studies (LAES) (1999) The New Curricula in Lebanon: Evaluation Review. Available online here: http://www.laes.org/_publications.php?lang=en&id=73 downloaded 1st January 2021.

Leenders, R. and Heyderman, S. (2012) Popular Mobilization in Syria: Opportunity and Threat, and the Social Networks of the Early Risers in Mediterranean Politics 17 (2) 139-159

Makdisi, K. (2011) in Constructing Security Council Resolution 1701 for Lebanon in the Shadow of the 'War on Terror' in International Peace Keeping 1 4:20.

Makhoul, J. and Harrison, L. (2004) Intercessory Wasta and Village Development in Lebanon In Arab Studies Quarterly 24 (3) 25-41.

Majzoub, A. and Jeannerod, B (2020) Increase pressure on Corrupt Lebanese Politicians in Human Rights Watch Available online at: https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/11/30/increase-pressure-corrupt-lebanese-politicians downloaded 28th December 2020.

Marshall, P. (2017) British India and the 'Great Rebellion' BBC Available online at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/history/british/victorians/indian_rebellion_01.shtml downloaded 1st January 2021.

Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) (2010) available online at http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/planipolis/files/ressources/lebanon_esdp_2010-2015.pdf downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Ministry of Education and Higher Education (2013) Education Sector Development Plan SDP available online at: http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/planipolis/files/ressources/eritrea-education-sector-development-plan_2013-02.pdf downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Ministry of Education and Higher Education (2013) Education Sector Development Plan SDP available online at: http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/planipolis/files/ressources/eritrea-education-sector-development-plan_2013-02.pdf downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Plato. (2017, reprinted). Timaeu/Crilas. London: CreateSpace Independent Publishing.

Pring, R. (2007). John Dewey. London: Bloomsbury.

Qian. H. (2020) The Development of Critical Thinking in the Academic Writing of Chinese Students: Case Study in a UK University. University Leicester, PhD Supervisor, Dr Alison Taysum available online at: https://leicester.figshare.com/articles/thesis/The_Development_of_Critical_Thinking_in_the_Academic_Writing_of_Chinese_Students_Case_Study_in_a_UK_University/13322837 downloaded 28th December 2020.

Republic of Lebanon Ministry of National Education, Youth and Sports (1994) A Plan for Educational Reform in Lebanon Beirut: The National Center for Educational Research and Development available online at https://www.crdp.org/sites/default/files/2020-11/A%20plan%20for%20educational%20reform%20in%20lebanon%201.pdf downloaded 1st January 2021.

Salloukh, B., and Veheij, R. (2009) Transforming Power Sharing: From Corporate to Hybrid Consociation in Postwar Lebanon In Middle East Law and Governance 9(2):147-17

Shields, C. (2007). A Failed Initiative: Democracy has Spoken - or has it? Journal of cases in educational leadership, 10(1), 14-21.

The Lebanese Daily Star (2019) Lebanese students protest against 'outdated' curriculum available at: https://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2019/Nov-22/496083-lebanese-students-protest-against-outdated-curriculum.ashx downloaded 28th November 2020.

Stasz, C. & Wright, S. (2007). A framework for understanding and comparing 14-19 education policies in United Kingdom. In D. Raffe, and K. Spours (Eds.), Policy-making and Policy Learning in 14-19 Education (pp. 157-185). London: Institute of Education University of London.

Stuart Mill, J. (1859). On liberty. Retrieved from http://www.utilitarianism.com/ol/two.html. Accessed on August 30, 2016.

Taysum, A. (2019) Education Policy as a Road Map to Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals. Scarborogh: Emerald.

Taysum, A. and Collins Ayanlaja, C. (2020) Commonalities in schools, education policy, and education systems around the world in neoliberalism; are the kids okay? in Neoliberalism and Education Systems in Conflict: Exploring Challenges Across the Globe for Routledge Book Series Educational Leadership and Policy Decision-Making in Neoliberal Times.

Taysum, A., Beutner, M., Kallioniemi, A., Canfarotta, D., Casado Muñoz, R., Ruşitoru, M., Hysa, F., Pathak, R., Mynbayeva, A., Yelbayeva, Z., Timchenko, V. Trapitsin, S., Pogosian, V., Tropinova, E., Ueda, M., Newton, P., Saboor, A., McGuinness, S. (2020) 'EYSIER Charter Mark with ABCDE and Assessment for Personal and Social Learning; a bottom-up approach to building faculty of judgement with an Open Access knowledge base of Science with and for Society (SwafS)', in European Journal of Social Sciences Education and Research 3 (2) 129-150 available at: http://journals.euser.org/index.php/ejed/article/view/4704 .

Taysum, A., Ruşitoru, M., and Kallioniemi, A. (2019) Empowering Young Societal Innovators for Equity and Renewal using ABCDE, European Journal of Social Sciences Education and Research 6, (2) pp. 6-16 available at: https://journals.euser.org/index.php/ejser/article/view/4519

Taysum, A. and Arar, K. (2018) Turbulence, Empowerment and Marginalised Groups in International Education Governance Systems. Scarborough Emerald.

Taysum, A. (2019) Education Policy as a Road Map to Achieve the Sustainable Development Goals. Scarborough: Emerald.

Taysum, A. and Iqbal, M. (2012) What counts as meaningful and worthwhile policy analysis in Italian Journal of Sociology of Education. 4 (1) pp. 11- 28.

Taysum, A. and Gunter, H. (2008) "A critical approach to researching social justice and school leadership in England in Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 3 (2) pp.183 –199.

United Nations. (2016) Sustainable Development Goals Available online at: https://sdgs.un.org/goals downloaded 27th December 2020.

UK Government (2017) *UK invests £160 million for education in Lebanon* available online at:
https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-invests-160m-for-education-in-lebanon downloaded 2nd January 2021.

United Nations Development Report (2013) The Rise of the South. Available online at: http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/reports/14/hdr2013_en_complete.pdf downloaded 2nd January 2021.

United Nations Development Plan for Lebanon (2013) Available online at: http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/planipolis/files/ressources/lebanon_mdg_2013-2014.pdf downloaded 2nd January 2021.

United Nations Refugee Agency (2020) *Global Focus* available online at: https://reporting.unhcr.org/lebanon accessed 2nd January 2021.

United Nations (2021) *Portal of Education Plans and Policies* Available online at: http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/en/search/site?f%5B0%5D=im_field_ressource_type%3A1252 downloaded 2nd January 2021.

Weiss K. (2009) "Boys Will Be Boys" and Other Gendered Accounts: An Exploration of Victims' Excuses and Justifications for Unwanted Sexual Contact and Coercion, in *Violence Against Women* 15 (7) 810-834.

Woodson, C. G. (1992). *The Negro in our history*. Cambridge, MA: The Associated Publishers Inc.

Mayssa Haidar-Baldwin Email: mayssahaidar@gmail.com
Alison Taysum Email: alisontaysum@yahoo.com