UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM
University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

An Unknown Catena on the Pauline Epistles

Parpulov, Georgi

DOI:
10.17879/byzrev-2020-3070

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Citation for published version (Harvard):
Parpulov, G 2020, 'An Unknown Catena on the Pauline Epistles', *The Byzantine Review*, vol. 2, 2, pp. 9-16. https://doi.org/10.17879/byzrev-2020-3070

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

General rights
Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
•Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy
While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

Download date: 26. Apr. 2024

THE BYZANTINE REVIEW
ByzRev 02.2020.N02
doi: 10.17879/byzrev-2020-3070

GEORGI PARPULOV

An Unknown Catena on the Pauline Epistles

Twenty years have passed since YEVHEN CHERNUKHIN described four previously unregistered Greek New Testament manuscripts at the National Library of Ukraine.[1] The first of these was recently assigned the GREGORY/ALAND (GA) census number 2966[2] and consists of two leaves bound into a volume where they did not at first belong.[3] Copied in an early form of *Perlschrift* datable to the second half of the tenth century,[4] these leaves are evidently the sole vestige from a codex which in its original form would have resembled GA 1915.[5] Small though it may be,[6] the Ukranian fragment is not devoid of interest: neither ff. 157–172 in GA 1915 (its closest known counterpart) nor any other surviving manuscript contain quite the same text as it does. We are dealing, therefore, with a section from a previously unknown *catena* on the Pauline Letters.[7] Since this *catena* was certainly less extensive than the one in GA 1915[8] (where four pages of commentary correspond to a biblical passage, Rom 11:25–29, which GA 2966 covers in a mere page and a half), the Ukranian leaves' now-lost 'home' codex is likely to have contained all of St Paul's epistles. In the snippet

1. CHERNUKHIN 2000, cat. I.14, I.21, I.32, I.40.
2. http://ntvmr.uni-muenster.de/liste?docID=32966.
3. CHERNUKHIN 2000, pp. 39 (cat. I.14) and 47–49 (cat. I.23). On the main part of this manuscript, see CHERNUKHIN 2000, cat. I.23; GETOV 2015. The volume comes from the library of Bolesław Starzyński (1834–1917) in Zahiniec (Zahińce, Загінці). Its earlier provenance is unknown.
4. CHERNUKHIN 2000, p. 291 (fig. 43). In reality this photograph shows not f. 162r (as the accompanying caption has it) but f. 161v. For the type of handwriting, cf. D'AGOSTINO – DEGNI 2020.
5. Città del Vaticano, BAV, Vat. gr. 762. Described and analysed in STAAB 1926, pp. 7–11, 23–36, this manuscript is designated *V* in STAAB 1933, p. xlviii *et passim*. See also ZAWADZKI 2020.
6. Since the two leaves of GA 2966 are conjoint, they certainly belonged to a single quire. That quire was most probably a regular quaternion. If the two surviving leaves formed its outermost bifolium, no more than twelve pages could have intervened between them. (I have not examined the manuscript directly, and I owe photographs of it to the kindness of Agamemnon Tselikas and Christine Kossyva.)
7. Cf. GEERARD – NORET 2018, pp. 383–395.
8. GEERARD – NORET 2018, pp. 383–385 (cat. C160). STAAB 1926, p. 7, labels this *catena* 'Typus Vaticanus'.

that has reached us, the apostle's own words are explained mainly by John Chrysostom, Theodoret of Cyrus, Theodore of Mopsuestia, and Gennadius. While Chrysostom's and Theodoret's influential commentaries survive in a significant number of copies,[9] Gennadius's name seldom occurs outside of *catenae*. KARL STAAB has plausibly identified him with Gennadius I, Patriarch of Constantinople from 458 to 471.[10] His floruit is the earliest possible date for the initial compilation of our newly-found *catena*. Here is this *catena*'s fragmentary content:[11]

Kiev, Національна бібліотека України імені В. І. Вернадського (НБУВ), фонд I, № 137,[12] ff. 161–162:

[init. mut.] ἔμπροσθεν Παύλου λέγοντος· «Τί οὖν ἐροῦμεν; Ὅτι ἔθνη, τὰ μὴ διώκοντα δικαιοσύνην, κατέλαβε δικαιοσύνην. Ἰσραὴλ δὲ διώκων νόμον δικαιοσύνης, εἰς νόμον δικαιοσύνης οὐκ ἔφθασε». Τοῦτο καὶ Ἡσαΐας ἐνταῦθα φησί· τὸ γὰρ «εὑρέθην τοῖς ἐμὲ μὴ ζητοῦσι» ταυτόν ἐστι τῷ εἰπεῖν ὅτι ἔθνη τὰ μὴ διώκοντα δικαιοσύνην κατέλαβε δικαιοσύνην. «Ὅλην τὴν ἡμέραν». Ἡμέραν ἐνταῦθα τὸν παρόντα χρόνον λέγων τὸν ἔμπροσθεν, τὸ δὲ ἐκπετάσαι τὰς χεῖρας τὸ παρακαλέσαι καὶ ἐπισπάσασθαι δηλοῖ. Εἶτα δεικνὺς τὸ ἔγκλημα ἅπαν ἐκείνων, φησί, ὅν, φησὶ «πρὸς λαὸν ἀπειθοῦντα καὶ ἀντιλέγοντα». Εἶδες πόση κατηγορία; Οὗτοι μὲν γὰρ οὐδὲ παρακαλοῦντι ἐπείσθησαν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀντεῖπον, οἱ δὲ μηδέποτε ἐπιγνωκότες ἴσχυσαν αὐτὸν ἐπισπάσασθαι. Καθαιρῶν δὲ καὶ τῶν ἐξ ἐθνῶν τὰ φρονήματα καὶ δεικνὺς τὴν αὐτοῦ χάριν τὸ πᾶν ἐργασαμένην, φησὶ «ἐγὼ ἐμφανὴς ἐγενόμην» καὶ «ἐγὼ εὑρήθην». Τὸ δὲ «μενοῦνγε» ἐπὶ λύσει κέχρηται, ὡς μὴ εἶναι ἄδηλον, καὶ ὅτ' ἂν λέγῃ «μενοῦνγε», «ὦ ἄνθρωπε, σὺ τίς εἶ ὁ ἀνταποκρινόμενος τῷ Θεῷ;» λύων τὸ ζητούμενον, οὐκ ἐπιτιμῶν λέγει (CPG 4427.18 / TLG 2062.155).[13]

Λέγω οὖν, μὴ ἀπώσατο ὁ Θεὸς τὸν λαὸν αὐτοῦ; Μὴ γένοιτο· καὶ γὰρ ἐγὼ Ἰσραηλίτης εἰμί, ἐκ σπέρματος Ἀβραάμ, φυλῆς Βενιαμίν. Οὐκ ἀπώ-

9. See most recently MONTORO 2021; LORRAIN 2018, p. 391. On Theodore, see STAAB 1933, pp. xxvi–xxx, 159.

10. STAAB 1933, pp. xxxv–xxxvii.

11. I have introduced modern punctuation but retained the spelling of the manuscript: τουτέστι, ὅτ' ἂν, μύριοι, etc. The scribe's inconsistent rendition of the name Ἠλίας / Ἡλίας might reflect the *catena*'s disparate sources.

12. Diktyon # 37428; https://pinakes.irht.cnrs.fr/notices/cote/37428/.

13. The abbreviations CPG and TLG here and further below refer to the on-line databases *Clavis Clavium* (https://clavis.brepols.net/clacla/) and *Thesaurus Linguae Graecae* (http://stephanus.tlg.uci.edu).

σατο ὁ Θεὸς τὸν λαὸν αὐτοῦ ὃν προέγνω. Ἢ οὐκ οἴδατε ἐν Ἠλίᾳ τί λέγει ἡ γραφή, ὡς ἐντυγχάνει τῷ Θεῷ κατὰ τοῦ Ἰσραὴλ λέγων «Κύριε, τοὺς προφήτας σου ἀπέκτειναν καὶ τὰ θυσιαστήριά σου κατέσκαψαν, κἀγὼ ὑπελείφθην μόνος, καὶ ζητοῦσι τὴν ψυχήν μου»; Ἀλλὰ τί λέγει αὐτῷ ὁ χρηματισμός; Κατέλιπον ἐμαυτῷ ἑπτακισχιλίους ἄνδρας οἵτινες οὐκ ἔκαμψαν γόνυ τῇ Βάαλ. Οὕτως οὖν καὶ ἐν τῷ νῦν καιρῷ λεῖμμα κατ' ἐκλογὴν χάριτος γέγονεν. Εἰ δὲ χάριτι, οὐκ ἔτι ἐξ ἔργων· ἐπεὶ ἡ χάρις οὐκ ἔτι γίνεται χάρις. Εἰ δὲ ἐξ ἔργων, οὐκ ἔτι ἐστὶ χάρις· ἐπεὶ τὸ ἔργον οὐκ ἔτι ἐστὶν ἔργον (Rom 11:1–6).

Γεν(να)δ(ίου)· Τάχ' ἂν οὖν, εἴποι με τίς [sc. μέν τις], οὐδὲν ἕτερον τοῖς λόγοις τούτοις ἢ προδήλως τοῦτο βοᾶν ὅτι τὸν ἑαυτοῦ λαὸν ὁ Θεὸς ἀπεώσατο. Ἐγὼ δὲ οὐ τοῦτο φημί. Πῶς γάρ, ὅς γε καὶ αὐτὸς «γνήσιος Ἰσραηλίτης εἰμί, ἐκ σπέρματος Ἀβραάμ, φυλῆς Βενιαμίν»; «Οὐκ ἀπώσατο ὁ Θεὸς τὸν λαὸν αὐτοῦ ὃν προέγνω»· διὰ τῆς ὃν προέγνω προσθήκης ἐμφήνας οὐδὲ λαὸν εἶναι τοὺς ἄλλους Θεοῦ, κἂν τὸν αὐτὸν τούτοις ἐπιγράφοιντο «κατὰ σάρκα προπάτορα». Παρίστησιν ἐκ τῆς γραφῆς, κἂν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν χρόνοις ἐξ αὐτῶν πολλοὺς ἀποδοκιμασθέντας. «Ἢ οὐκ οἴδατε ἐν Ἠλίᾳ», φησί, «τί λέγει ἡ γραφὴ» καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς. Τουτέστι διὰ τοῦ Ἠλία δείξας δὲ διὰ τούτων τὸ καὶ τότε πάντας ἠσεβηκότας ἀποπεπτωκέναι Θεοῦ πλὴν ἑπτακισχιλίων καίτοι γε τοῦ γένους ὄντας | τοῦ Ἀβραάμ, ἀπὸ τῆς κατέλιπον ἐμαυτῷ λέ- 161v
ξεως τὸν μετὰ ταῦτα λόγον κατασκευάζει. «Οὕτως οὖν καὶ ἐν τῷ νῦν καιρῷ λεῖμμα κατ' ἐκλογὴν χάριτος γέγονεν». Οὐδὲ οὖν ὡς ἔοικε καινόν, οὐδὲ ἐν τῷ παρόντι γεγένηται λειψάνου τινος κατὰ χάριν ἐκλεγέντος καὶ νῦν ἐκ τοῦ παντὸς γένους ἡμῶν· ὥσπερ γὰρ τότε κατὰ τὸν γραφικὸν λόγον οὐδ' ἂν εἷς σέσωστο, μὴ ἑαυτῷ τοὺς «ἑπτακισχιλίους ὑπολειπομένου Θεοῦ», τουτέστι μὴ θείας χάριτος αὐτοὺς ἐπὶ τῆς γνώμης τῆς εὐσεβοῦς διακρατησάσης, οὕτως οἶμαι καὶ νῦν. «Εἰ δὲ χάριτι», φησί, «οὐκ ἔτι ἐξ ἔργων» καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς. Οὐ τὴν ἄλλως ἀδολεσχῆσαι βουλόμενος οὕτω ταῦτα τέθεικεν ὁ ἀπόστολος, ἀλλὰ δεῖξαι σπουδάζων ἀσύμβατον ὄντα παντελῶς τὸν νόμον τῇ χάριτι, καὶ οὐ δυνάμενα κατ' αὐτὸν ἀμφότερα ταῦτα συνελθεῖν, ἀλλ' ἀναγκαίως ἔχον θατέρῳ θάτερον ὑφεξίστασθαι (CPG 5973 / TLG 2762.004).

Χρ(υσοστόμου)· Σχῆμα διαποροῦντος εἰσάγει, ὡς ἐκ τῶν εἰρημένων λαβὸν τὴν ἀρχήν, καὶ τὸ φοβερὸν τοῦτο θείς, τῇ ἀναιρέσει αὐτοῦ τὸ μετ' ἐκεῖνο λοιπὸν εὐπαράδεκτον ποιεῖ, ὃ διὰ τῶν ἔμπροσθεν ἁπάντων ἐσπούδασε δεῖξαι, τοῦτο καὶ ἐνταῦθα κατασκευάζων, ὅτι κἂν ὀλίγοι ὦσιν οἱ διασεσωσμένοι, τὸ τῆς ἐπαγγελίας ἔστηκε. Διατοῦτο οὐδὲ ἁπλῶς εἶπεν «τὸν λαόν», ἀλλὰ προσέθηκεν «ὃν προέγνω». Εἶτα ἐπάγων ἀπόδειξιν τοῦ μὴ ἀπῶσθαι τὸν λαόν, φησί· «καὶ γὰρ ἐγὼ Ἰσραηλίτης εἰμὶ» καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς. Ἐπεὶ

δὲ δοκεῖ τοῦτο ἐναντίον εἶναι τῶν «τίς ἐπίστευσε τῇ ἀκοῇ ἡμῶν» καὶ «ὅλην τὴν ἡμέραν τὰς χεῖρας μου ἐξεπέτασα πρὸς λαὸν ἀπειθοῦντα», οὐκ ἠρκέσθη τῇ ἀπαγορεύσει, οὐδὲ τῷ εἰπεῖν «μὴ γένοιτο», ἀλλὰ καὶ κατασκευάζει αὐτὸ πάλιν ἀναλαμβάνων καὶ λέγων «οὐκ ἀπώσατο ὁ Θεὸς τὸν λαὸν αὐτοῦ». Ἀλλὰ τοῦτο οὐκ ἔστι κατασκευή, φησίν, ἀλλ' ἀπόφασις. Ὅρα οὖν τὴν κατασκευὴν τήν τε προτέραν καὶ τὴν μετ' ἐκείνην. Προτέρα γοῦν ἐστιν τὸ δεῖξαι, ὅτι αὐτὸς ἐκεῖθεν ἦν· οὐκ ἂν δέ, εἰ ἀπωθεῖσθαι αὐτὸν ἔμελλε τὸν τὸ κήρυγμα ἅπαν καὶ τὰ πράγματα τῆς οἰκουμένης ἐμπιστευθέντα, ἐκεῖθεν ἀνεξελέξατο. Δευτέραν δὲ μετ' ἐκείνην, τὸ εἰπεῖν «τὸν λαὸν ὃν προέγνω», τουτέστιν ὃν ᾔδει σαφῶς ἐπιτήδειον καὶ τὴν πίστιν δεχόμενον· καὶ γὰρ τρισχίλιοι καὶ πεντακισχίλιοι καὶ μύριοι ἐξ ἐκείνων ἦσαν πιστεύσαντες. Ἵνα γὰρ μὴ λέγῃ τις «σὺ οὖν ὁ λαὸς εἶ;», ἐπήγαγεν «οὐκ ἀπώσατο τὸν λαὸν αὐτοῦ ὃν προέγνω». Ὡσανεὶ ἔλεγεν «ἔχω μετ' ἐμοῦ τρισχιλίους, μυρίους». «Τί οὖν; Ὁ λαὸς εἰς τρισχιλίους καὶ πεντακισχιλίους καὶ μυρίους περιέστη τὸ σπέρμα ἐκεῖνο τὸ μιμούμενον τὰ ἄστρα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ τῷ πλήθει καὶ τὴν ἄμμον τὴν θαλαττίαν; Καὶ οὕτως ἡμᾶς ἀπατᾷς καὶ παραλογίζῃ;» Ἵνα οὖν μὴ ταῦτα λέγωσι, διὰ τῶν ἑξῆς τὴν λύσιν ἐπάγει, τὴν μὲν ἀντίθεσιν οὐ θείς, πρὸ δὲ τῆς ἀντιθέσεως τὴν λύσιν αὐτῆς ἀπὸ παλαιᾶς ἱστορίας κατασκευάζων καὶ φησίν· «Οὐκ οἴδατε ἐν Ἡ [fine mut.] (CPG 4427.18 / TLG 2062.155).

| **ἀποστρέψει ἀσεβείας ἀπὸ Ἰακὼβ καὶ αὕτη αὐτοῖς ἡ παρ' ἐμοῦ διαθήκη, ὅτ' ἂν ἀφέλωμαι τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτῶν. Κατὰ μὲν τὸ εὐαγγέλιον ἐχθροὶ δι' ὑμᾶς, κατὰ δὲ τὴν ἐκλογὴν ἀγαπητοὶ διὰ τοὺς πατέρας· ἀμεταμέλητα γὰρ τὰ χαρίσματα καὶ ἡ κλῆσις τοῦ Θεοῦ** (Rom 11:26–29). 162r

Γεν(να)δ(ίου)· Ὡς ἂν δέ, φησί, μὴ μέγα τι καὶ θαυμαστὸν ὑπονοοῖτε περὶ ἑαυτῶν, ἀπατώμενοι ὡς ὄντες ὑπὲρ τοὺς ἄλλους ὑμεῖς συνετοί, μάθετε συντόμως· μυστήριον φρικωδέστατον, ἄφατον τοῦ Θεοῦ τὴν περὶ πάντας πρόνοιαν ὑποφαῖνον, τῶν Ἰσραηλιτῶν πλὴν τῆς ἐκλέξεως (τὸ γὰρ «ἀπὸ μέρους» τοῦτο φησί) πωρωθέντων καὶ τὴν σωτηρίαν ἀποθουμένων ἐφ' ὑμᾶς μετήνεγκε ταύτην ὁ Θεός, εἰσποιηθέντων μέντοι πάντων ὑμῶν κακείνους αὖθις ἡ χάρις ἅπαντας περιλήψεται. Μαρτυρεῖ γοῦν αὐτῷ τοῦτο καὶ τὸ τοῦ Ἠσαΐου λόγιον «ἥξει ἐκ Σιὼν ὁ ῥυόμενος» καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς. Ἀφαιρέσεως δὲ καὶ ἀφέσεως αὐτοῖς γινομένης ἁμαρτημάτων, ἡ σωτηρία σαφής τε καὶ ἀναντίρρητος. Τὸ δὲ «κατὰ μὲν τὸ εὐαγγέλιον ἐχθροὶ δι' ὑμᾶς» καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς τοῦτο δηλοῖ, ὅτι εἰ γὰρ καὶ νῦν ἐν τῷ εὐαγγελίῳ προσκρουσάντων αὐτῶν ὑμεῖς ἀντεισήχθητε, ἀλλ' οὖν ἐκ πατέρων κἀκεῖνοι πεφίληνται. Εἶτα τὸ ἀναγκαῖον· «ἀμεταμέλητα γάρ», φησί, «τὰ χαρίσματα τοῦ Θεοῦ». Ὡσεὶ εἶπεν, προσῆκε δὲ δήπου, φησί, ὑπάρχειν ἀψευδῆ τε καὶ βέβαια πάντα τὰ χαρί-

σματα τοῦ Θεοῦ καὶ ἀπὸ τῶν κατ᾽ αὐτοὺς ἐκείνους ἔτι τὸν λόγον πιθανὸν ἐργαζόμενος τὰ ἑξῆς ἐπιφέρει (CPG 5973 / TLG 2762.004).

Χρ(υσοστόμου)· Μυστήριόν ἐστι τὸ μὴ πᾶσι γνώριμον, ἀλλὰ μόνοις τοῖς θαρρουμένοις. Λέγει τοίνυν ὅτι «βούλομαι ὑμᾶς μαθεῖν ὅπερ οἶδα περὶ τῶν προκειμένων μυστήριον, ἵνα μὴ σφόδρα ἑαυτοὺς ἡγούμενοι συνετοὺς ὑψηλοφρονῆτε.» Τί δὲ τὸ μυστήριον; Ὅτι «πώρωσις ἀπὸ μέρους τῷ Ἰσραὴλ γέγονε». Τὸ «ἀπὸ μέρους» τέθεικε διδάσκων, ὡς οὐ πάντες ἠπίστησαν· πολλοὶ γὰρ καὶ ἐξ ἐκείνων ἐπίστευσαν. Παρεγγυᾷ μὴ δὲ τῶν ἄλλων ἀπαγορεῦσαι τὴν σωτηρίαν· τῶν γὰρ ἐθνῶν δεξαμένων τὸ κήρυγμα, πιστεύσουσι κἀκεῖνοι. Ἠλία τοῦ πάνυ παραγινομένου καὶ τῆς πίστεως αὐτοῖς τὴν διδασκαλίαν προσφέροντος, τοῦτο γὰρ καὶ ὁ Κύριος ἔφη· «Ἠλίας ἔρχεται, καὶ ἀποκαταστήσει πάντα» (CPG 6209 / TLG 4089.030). Τὸ γὰρ «πᾶς Ἰσραὴλ» ἵνα εἴπῃ «οἵ τε ἀπὸ τῆς φύσεως τὴν πρὸς τὸν Ἰσραὴλ συγγένειαν ἔχοντες» ἀντὶ τοῦ «οἱ Ἰουδαῖοι», καὶ «οἱ διὰ τῆς πίστεως ἀξίους τῆς τοῦ Ἰσραὴλ προσηγορίας ἑαυτοὺς καταστήσαντες» λέγει δὲ τοὺς ἐξ ἐθνῶν (CPG 3846 / TLG 4135.015). Ἐπεὶ δὲ μέγα ἐπηγγείλατο, φέρει μάρτυρα τὸν προφήτην. Ὅτι μὲν γὰρ πώρωσις γέγονεν, οὐ παράγει μαρτυρίαν (δῆλον γὰρ ἦν ἅπασιν), ὅτι δὲ πιστεύσουσι καὶ σωθήσονται, τὸν Ἡσαΐαν εἰσάγει λέγοντα «ἥξει ἐκ Σιὼν ὁ ῥυόμενος» καὶ ἑξῆς (CPG 4427.19 / TLG 2062.155). Τὸ δὲ «ἀποστρέψει ἀσεβείας ἀπὸ Ἰακὼβ» ἵνα εἴπῃ «ἀποστρέψει μὲν ἐξ ἁμαρτιῶν, ἐπιστρέψει δὲ πρὸς ἑαυτόν» (CPG 1591). | Εἶτα τὸ παράσημον τῆς 162v
σωτηρίας τιθείς, ἵνα μή τις εἰς τοὺς ἔμπροσθεν αὐτὸ ἑλκύσῃ χρόνους, φησὶ «καὶ αὕτη αὐτοῖς ἡ παρ᾽ ἐμοῦ διαθήκη, ὅτ᾽ ἂν ἀφέλωμαι τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτῶν»· οὐχ ὅτ᾽ ἂν περιτμηθῶσιν, οὐχ ὅτ᾽ ἂν θύσωσιν, ἀλλ᾽ ὅτ᾽ ἂν ἁμαρτημάτων ἀφέσεως τύχωσιν. Εἰ τοίνυν τοῦτο ἐπήγγελται, γέγονε δὲ ἐπ᾽ αὐτῶν οὐδέπω, οὐδὲ ἀπέλαυσαν τῆς διὰ τοῦ βαπτίσματος ἀφέσεως, πάντως ἔσται (CPG 4427.18 / TLG 2062.155). «Κατὰ μὲν τὸ εὐαγγέλιον ἐχθροὶ δι᾽ ὑμᾶς». Ὡσεὶ ἔλεγεν, ὅσον μέν, φησί, ἧκεν εἰς τὸ εὐαγγέλιον, δι᾽ ὑμᾶς τοὺς ἐξ ἐθνῶν ἐχθροί εἰσιν οἱ Ἰουδαῖοι, ὅτι ὑμῶν τὴν πίστιν εὐαγγελισθέντων φιλονεικότεροι ἐκεῖνοι γενόμενοι ἀπεσκίρτησαν (PG 118, col. 553D). Ἀλλ᾽ ὅμως οὐδὲ οὕτως ὁ Θεὸς ἀνέκοψεν αὐτῶν τὴν κλῆσιν, εἶτα καὶ ἑτέραν αὐτοῖς χαριζόμενος χάριν. «Κατὰ δὲ τὴν ἐκλογήν», φησί, «ἀγαπητοὶ διὰ τοὺς πατέρας». Καὶ τί τοῦτο; Ἔνθα μὲν ἐχθροί, ἡ κόλασις αὐτῶν· ἔνθα δὲ ἀγαπητοί, οὐδὲν πρὸς αὐτοὺς ἡ τῶν πατέρων ἀρετὴ ἐὰν μὴ πιστεύσωσιν. Ἀλλ᾽ ὅπερ ἔφην, οὐ παύεται ῥήμασιν αὐτοὺς παραμυθούμενος ἵνα ἐφελκύσηται· ἀμεταμέλητος γὰρ ἡ κλῆσις ἡ γενομένη περὶ τὸ ἔθνος, φησί (CPG 4427.19 / TLG 2062.155).

Ὥσπερ γὰρ καὶ ὑμεῖς ποτε ἠπειθήσατε τῷ Θεῷ, νῦν δὲ ἠλεήθητε τῇ τούτων ἀπειθείᾳ, οὕτως καὶ οὗτοι νῦν ἠπείθησαν, τῷ ὑμετέρῳ ἐλέει ἵνα καὶ αὐτοὶ ἐλεηθῶσι· συνέκλεισε γὰρ ὁ Θεὸς τοὺς πάντας εἰς ἀπείθειαν, ἵνα τοὺς πάντας ἐλεήσῃ (Rom 11:30–32).

Γεν(να)δ(ίου)· Συντόμως καὶ διὰ τοῦτο ἀσαφῶς εἴρηται τὸ προκείμενον· ἀνάγκη τοίνυν αὐτὸ σαφηνίσαι. Ὅτι γάρ, φησίν, οὐδὲν ἄπιστον λέγω, καὶ εἰς τὰ καθ' ὑμᾶς αὐτοὺς ἀποβλέψατε· ὑμῶν ἀπειθούντων πάλαι ποτὲ τούτους ἠλεήκει ὁ Θεός, νῦν τὸ ἀνάπαλιν τούτων ἀπειθησάντων ὑμεῖς ἠλεήθητε. Ὥσπερ οὖν τῆς νῦν σωτηρίας ὑμᾶς ἡ πρόσθεν οὐκ ἐκκέκλεικεν ἀπείθεια, τὸν αὐτὸν οἶμαί που τρόπον οὐδὲ τούτοις ἐν καιρῷ τῆς σωτηρίας ἐμποδὼν ἡ νῦν ἀπείθεια κατασταθήσεται. «Συνέκλεισε γὰρ ὁ Θεός», φησί, «τοὺς πάντας εἰς ἀπείθειαν»· οὐδὲ γὰρ ἐνδέχεται τὴν τοῦ Θεοῦ φιλανθρωπίαν ὑπὸ τῆς ἀνθρωπίνης ἀντιλογίας ἐκνικηθῆναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάντων ἀντιτεινόντων αὐτὸς περὶ τοὺς πάντας τὸν οἰκεῖον ἔλεον ἐπιδείξεται. Τούτῳ δὲ παραπλήσιον τὸ «νόμος δὲ παρεισῆλθεν, ἵνα πλεονάσῃ τὸ παράπτωμα». Οὔτε γὰρ ὁ Θεὸς ἀπειθεῖς αὐτοὺς ἐποίησεν, ἀλλὰ σωτήρια δέδωκεν παραγγέλματα καὶ τούτοις ἡμῶν ἀσφαλιζόμενος τὴν φύσιν περιεφράξατο, τῶν δὲ ἀνομησάντων τοῦτο ἐκβέβηκεν· οὔτε διατοῦτο τὰ προστάγματα δέδωκεν ἵνα ἀπειθήσαντας ἐλεήσῃ, ἀλλ' οὕτω τοῦτο διὰ τὴν ἐκείνων ἀποβέβηκεν ἀπείθειαν. Τοῦ δὲ αὐτοῦ τύπου καὶ τἄλλα ὅσα τοιαῦτα τῶν προεκτεθέντων ἐστίν, οἷον τὸ «πώρωσις ἀπὸ μέρους τῷ Ἰσραὴλ γέγονεν ἄχρις οὗ τὸ πλήρωμα τῶν ἐθνῶν εἰσέλθῃ»· οὐ γὰρ ἵνα σωθῶσιν οἱ ἐθνι [fine mut.] (CPG 5973 / TLG 2762.004).

Our *catena* had two direct sources: first, the complete text of Gennadius's commentary (CPG 5973), of which GA 2966 transmits a few previously unattested sentences;[14] second, combined excerpts from the homilies of John Chrysostom (CPG 4427) and from the works of other authors – Theodoret (CPG 6209), Theodore of Mopsuestia (CPG 3846), Dionysius of Alexandria (CPG 1591), *et al.*[15] GA 2966 cites the second, composite source under the single umbrella-name 'Chrysostom'. This same source must have been available to the compiler of the *catena* in GA 1915, where a passage by Theodoret (Μυστήριόν ἐστι τὸ μὴ πᾶσι γνώριμον etc.) is also ascribed, tellingly, to 'John' (f. 170r).[16] The two *catenae*, then, had a common ancestor – a *chaîne chrysostomienne* comparable to those for the Psalms

14. Cf. the fragments collected by Staab 1933, pp. 398–402.
15. Note that one sentence in the Kiev leaves (Ὡσεὶ ἔλεγεν, ὅσον μέν, φησί etc.) is of unknown authorship.
16. See also the observations made by Staab 1926, pp. 32, 35 n.3.

(CPG C30) and for two of the Gospels (CPG C110.1 and C140.1).[17] Fortunately, this ancestor seems to have survived. Unfortunately, it survives in a defective state: its single known copy, GA 1910,[18] lacks Paul's Letter to the Romans and thus cannot be compared to the Kiev leaves. Still, THEODORA PANELLA recently found indirect but nonetheless strong evidence that the *catena* in GA 1910 was a source for that in GA 1915.[19] GA 1910, in other words, presents us with the oldest known *catena* commentary on the Pauline Epistles.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

CHERNUKHIN, YEVHEN (2000). Грецькі рукописи у зібраннях Києва. Kiev.

D'AGOSTINO, MARCO – DEGNI, PAOLA (2020). Considerations on Origin and Development of the Perlschrift. In: CHRISTIAN BROCKMANN – DANIEL DECKERS – DIETER HARLFINGER – STEFANO VALENTE (eds.), Griechisch-byzantinische Handschriftenforschung: Traditionen, Entwicklungen, neue Wege. Berlin, pp. 171–194.

DEVREESSE, ROBERT (1945). Le fonds Coislin (Bibliothèque Nationale, Catalogue des manuscrits grecs 2). Paris.

DORIVAL, GILLES (1992). Les chaînes exégétiques grecques sur les Psaumes : contribution à l'étude d'une forme littéraire. III (Spicilegium sacrum Lovaniense 45). Leuven.

GEERARD, MAURICE – NORET, JACQUES (2018). Clavis patrum Graecorum. Concilia. Catenae (Corpus Christianorum, Clavis Patrum Graecorum 4). 2nd edn. Turnhout.

GETOV, DOROTEI (2015). The Kievan Manuscript of Synopsis Basilicorum major. Scripta & e-Scripta 14/15, pp. 121–129.

LORRAIN, AGNES (2018). Le Commentaire de Théodoret de Cyr sur l' Épître aux Romains : études philologiques et historiques (Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur 179). Berlin.

MONTORO, PETER (2021, forthcoming). Chrysostom's Text of Romans. PhD dissertation, University of Birmingham.

17. Cf. DORIVAL 1992, pp. 1–103; REUSS 1941, pp. 19–21, 154–155, 251, 254.

18. Paris, BNF, Coislin 204, described and analysed by STAAB 1926, pp. 53–70. STAAB calls this *catena* 'Typus Parisinus'; the *Clavis Clavium* designates it CPG C162. See also DEVREESSE 1945, pp. 182–183.

19. PANELLA 2018, pp. 127–128, 145–149; against STAAB 1926, pp. 65–66.

PANELLA, THEODORA (2018). The Pseudo-Oecumenian Catena on Galatians. PhD dissertation, University of Birmingham.

REUSS, JOSEPH (1941). Matthäus-, Markus- und Johanneskatenen nach den handschriftlichen Quellen untersucht (Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen 18, 4/5). Münster.

STAAB, KARL (1926). Die Pauluskatenen nach den handschriftlichen Quellen untersucht. Rome.

—— (1933). Pauluskommentare aus der griechischen Kirche aus Katenenhandschriften gesammelt und herausgegeben (Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen 15). Münster.

ZAWADZKI, KONRAD (2020, in press). Der verlorene Schluss des Codex Vaticanus Graecus 762: eine Rekonstruktion anhand der Codices Pantokratoros 28 und Vaticanus Graecus 692. Museum Helveticum 77.

***

The above note was written while I was employed by the CATENA research project (Department of Theology and Religion, University of Birmingham) funded by the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement no. 770816). I thank my colleague Amy Myshrall for her helpful comments on the text.

Keywords

Bible; *catenae*; exegesis; New Testament